MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS OF THE SITTING OF THURSDAY, 11 MARCH 1993

(93/C 115/04)

PART I

Proceedings of the sitting

IN THE CHAIR: Mrs MAGNANI NOYA

Vice-President

(The sitting was opened at 10 a.m.)

1. Approval of Minutes

The following spoke:

- Mr Titley, who noted that Mr Martin had addressed a question to Mr Pinheiro, Member of the Commission, during the Commission's communication on action taken on Parliament's opinions (Part I, Item 22) and that, in the absence of Mr Pinheiro, Mr Millan had replied that Mr Martin would receive a written reply. Mr Titley asked the Presidency to protest to the President of the Commission about what, in his view, was insulting behaviour towards Parliament: since Mr Pinheiro was responsible for relations with Parliament, he should have been present to answer the question (the President of Parliament but reminded Members that the Commission was a collegiate body and all its members were therefore authorized to answer questions);
- Mrs Ewing who, with reference to the vote on the De Gucht report (Part I, Item 20), protested at the fact that the report had not been put to the vote in the order originally laid down in the agenda, that the President had not sought Parliament's approval before putting am. 49, as amended orally, to the vote, that the provisions of Rule 70(1) had been improperly applied to am. 6, that the President had refused to give the floor to Members wishing to speak on points of order, and that the order in which the amendments were voted had been changed without the House's consent. She asked firstly for these matters to be referred to the Rules Committee and secondly, for the vote to be considered invalid (the President replied that she would indeed refer these matters to the Rules Committee);
- Mr Anastassopoulos, who noted there had been a lot of confusion during the vote and, with reference to procedure, thought that while the Chair had been entitled by Rule 92(3) to put am. 49 to the vote first, it should have applied Rule 69(6) to the rapporteur's oral amendment to this amendment (the President noted these comments, adding that he would refer them to the Rules Committee);

- Mr Landa Mendibe, on a letter he had sent to the Presidency (the President cut him off as his remarks were not to do with the Minutes);
- Mr Paisley, who supported Mrs Ewing's remarks and protested in particular at the change in voting order for the reports;
- Mr Morris, who noted he had on two occasions called for the Commission to make its statement on the fisheries market the previous day: he insisted that this statement be made the same morning;
- Mrs Crawley, on the President's reply to Mr Titley;
- Mr Kellett-Bowman, who supported Mr Paisley's remarks, arguing that the agenda did not include the vote on the De Gucht report (the President pointed out that it was included by virtue of the item 'vote on the motions for resolutions on which the debate is closed');
- Mr De Gucht, who pointed out that his report had been included in voting time and that the change in the voting order had been decided by Parliament; he did not think that the fact that British Members disapproved of this change gave them an excuse for explaining their vote:
- Mr Kostopoulos, who asked when Mr Landa Mendibe would be able to explain his problem, since he had been cut off by the President, and Mr Landa Mendibe (the President informed the latter that he could speak after the Minutes had been approved);
- Mr Howell, who seconded Mr Morris' request (the President replied that that day's agenda was already overcrowded but that the matter would be considered at the appropriate time);
- Mrs Daly who, in the course of a personal statement, protested at Mr De Gucht's remarks concerning British Members which she felt were offensive and insisted that he withdraw them (the President replied that there was no evidence that Mr De Gucht had intended to offend British Members: she added that the voting order could always be changed if the House so decided);
- Mr Lane, who also called on Mr De Gucht to apologize and who deplored the confusion surrounding the vote;

— Mr Morris, who reiterated his request (the President replied that it was unlikely that it could be granted);

— Mr Price, on the vote on the Bindi report, to argue that while Part I of the Minutes (Item 10) was correct, Part II (Item 1) was not; he called for the text in Part II to be removed (the President replied that the matter would be considered);

— Mr De Gucht, who declined to withdraw his previous remarks;

— Mr Vázquez Fouz, who supported the request by Mr Morris and Mr Howell (the President replied that it would be met if at all possible);

— Mrⁱ Ford, who opposed the change requested by Mr Price to Part II of the Minutes (the President replied that the matter would be considered).

The Minutes of the previous sitting were approved.

The following spoke:

— Mr Landa Mendibe, who referred to his previous remarks, and pointed out that, on 28 January and 9 February, he had written to the Presidency requesting the necessary protection by the Presidency of Parliament to enable him to carry out his duties as a Member, since the Bureau of the Spanish Parliament had refused to pay to members of his party the electoral allowance to which they were entitled, but that he had not yet received any reply (the President replied that the matter would be looked into);

— Mr Planas Puchades, on Mr Landa Mendibe's remarks.

TOPICAL AND URGENT DEBATE

The next item was the topical and urgent debate (for titles and authors of motions for resolutions, see Minutes of 9.3.1993, Part I, Item 5).

2. Violation of human rights (debate)

The next item was the joint debate on 20 motions for resolutions (B3-0374, 0399, 0412, 0430, 0363, 0376, 0386, 0394, 0411, 0420, 0362, 0367, 0422, 0361, 0426, 0372, 0423, 0378, 0381 and 0405/93).

The following introduced the motions for resolutions: Mrs Crawley, Mr Blot, Mrs van den Brink, Mrs Bjørnvig, Mrs André, Mr Arbeloa Muru, Mrs Daly, Mrs Ernst de la Graete, Mr Bertens, Mr Robles Piquer, Mr Telkämper, Mr Brito, Mr Maher, Mrs Dury, Mr Newens, Mr Staes, Mr Canavarro, Mr Capucho and Mrs Belo.

The following spoke: Mrs Van Hemeldonck, on behalf of the SOC Group, Mrs Pack, on behalf of the EPP Group, Mrs Larive, on behalf of the LDR Group, Mrs Tazdaït, on behalf of the Green Group, Mr Lane, on behalf of the EDA Group, Mr Sánchez García, on behalf of the RB Group, Mr Alavanos, on behalf of the LU Group, Mrs González Alvarez, Mrs Ceci, Mr Carvalho Cardoso, Mrs Veil, Mrs Roth, Mr Nianias, Mr Ribeiro, Mrs Grund, Mr Cabezón Alonso, Mr Lucas Pires, Mr Mendes Bota, Mr Telkämper, Mr Kostopoulos, Mrs Dury and Mr Van den Broek, Member of the Commission.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr CAPUCHO Vice-President

The President declared the joint debate closed.

Vote: Item 7.

3. South Africa (debate)

The next item was the joint debate on six motions for resolutions (B3-0360, 0365, 0375, 0404, 0410 and 0421/93)

The following introduced the motions for resolutions: Mr Bertens, Mr Robles Piquer, Mr Dillen and Mr Telkämper.

The following spoke: Mr P. Beazley, Mr Verhagen, Mr van der Waal, Mr Van den Broek, Member of the Commission, and Mr Ford.

The President declared the joint debate closed.

Vote: Item 8.

4. Nuclear tests (debate)

The next item was the joint debate on five motions for resolutions (B3-0364, 0373, 0379, 0387 and 0390/93).

The following introduced the motions for resolutions Mr Crampton, Mr Vandemeulebroucke and Mr Pöttering.

The following spoke: Mr Welsh, Mr Morris on Mr Welsh's remarks, Mr Van den Broek, Member of the Commission, Mrs Ernst de la Graete who noted that she was down to speak in the debate and therefore asked for the floor (the President refused, pointing out that she had not been present in the Chamber when her turn for the floor came).

The President declared the joint debate closed.

Vote: Item 9.

5. Situation in the former Soviet Union (debate)

The next item was the joint debate on five motions for resolutions (B3-0385, 0396, 0400, 0424 and 0427/93).

In view of the time, the President proposed limiting the speaking time of authors of motions to one minute and authorising no other speakers.

Parliament agreed to this proposal.

The following introduced the motions for resolutions: Mr Bertens, Mr Blot, Mr Newens, Mr Coimbra Martins, Mr Robles Piquer.

The following, spoke: Mr Van den Broek, Member of the Commission, Mrs Cramon Daiber, firstly on the conduct of business and then on the joint motion on the situation in the former Soviet Union, Mr Kostopoulos, who deplored the organisation of the debate, since a number of speakers had not been given the floor.

The President declared the joint debate closed.

Vote: Item 10.

6. Disasters

The next item was the joint debate on two motions for resolutions (B3-0355/93 and 0398/93).

After consulting the political group chairmen, pursuant to Rule 64(6), and securing their agreement, the President decided to put the motions for resolutions on this subject to the vote without debate.

The following expressed agreement with this decision: Mr Raffarin, Mrs Dury and Mr Lataillade, chairman of the Subcommittee on Fisheries.

Vote: Item 11.

VOTING TIME

7. Violation of human rights (vote)

Motions for resolutions B3-0374, 0399, 0412, 0430, 0363, 0376, 0386, 0394, 0411, 0420, 0362, 0367, 0422, 0361, 0426, 0372, 0423, 0378, 0381 and 0405/93

Rape of women in former Yugoslavia

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B3-0374, 0412 and 0430/93:

joint motion for a resolution tabled by:
 Mrs Crawley, Mrs Dury and Mrs Van Hemeldonck,
 on behalf of the SOC Group,
 Mrs Pack, on behalf of the EPP Group,
 Mrs Larive, on behalf of the LDR Group,
 Mrs Cramon Daiber, on behalf of the Green Group,
 Mr Killilea, on behalf of the EDA Group,
 Mrs Bjørnvig and Mr Vandemeulebroucke, on behalf of the RB Group,

Mrs Elmalan and Mr Ribeiro, on behalf of the LU Group,

Mrs Domingo Segarra, Non-attached Member, to replace these motions by a new text:

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (EPP):

Members voting: 205

For: 200 Against: 2 Abstentions: 3

(Part II, Item 1(a))

(Motion for a resolution B3-0399/93 fell)

Rwanda

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B3-0363, 0376, 0386, 0394, 0411 and 0420/93:

joint motion for a resolution tabled by:
 Mrs Dury and Mr Arbeloa Muru, on behalf of the SOC Group,
 Mr Verhagen, on behalf of the EPP Group,
 Mrs André, on behalf of the LDR Group,
 Mrs Ernst de la Graete, on behalf of the Green Group,

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 1(b)).

to replace these motions by a new text:

Cuba

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B3-0362 and 0367/93:

joint motion for a resolution tabled by:
 Mrs Dury and Mr Cabezón Alonso, on behalf of the SOC Group,
 Mr Robles Piquer, on behalf of the EPP Group,
 Mr Bertens, on behalf of the LDR Group,
 to replace these motions by a new text:

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (EPP):

Members voting: 217

For: 192 Against: 15 Abstentions: 10

(Part II, Item 1(c))

(Motion for a resolution B3-0422/93 fell)

Marsh Arabs and Kurds in Iraq

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION B3-0361/93:

(The EPP Group had also signed this motion)

Parliament rejected the motion for a resolution by EV.

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION B3-0426/93:

Amendments adopted: 1 and 2

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 1(d)).

Brazil

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B3-0372 and 0423/93:

— joint motion for a resolution tabled by:

Mr Newens and Mrs Dury, on behalf of the SOC Group,

Mr Verhagen and Mr Robles Piquer, on behalf of the EPP Group,

Mrs Larive and Mr Bertens, on behalf of the LDR Group,

Mr Staes, on behalf of the Green Group,

Mr Vandemeulebroucke, on behalf of the RB Group,

Mr Brito, on behalf of the LU Group,

to replace these motions by a new text:

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 1(e)).

East Timor

The following spoke: Mr Brito, Mrs Belo, on behalf of the SOC Group, to propose putting the three motions on this subject to the vote collectively, since the texts were identical, Mr Miranda da Silva and Mr Telkämper, to state that their groups could support the resolution which was to be adopted.

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B3-0378, 0381 and 0405/93:

The EPP Group had requested separate votes on recital F and para. 6.

Recitals A to E: adopted

Recital F: adopted

Paras 1 to 5: adopted

Para. 6: adopted

Para. 7: adopted

Mrs Oomen-Ruijten pointed out that her group had requested an RCV on the motion for a resolution as a whole.

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (EPP):

Members voting: 224

For: 205 Against: 12 Abstentions: 7

(Part II, Item 1(f))

8. South Africa (vote)

Motions for resolutions B3-0360, 0365, 0375, 0404, 0410 and 0421/93

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B3-0360, 0365, 0375, 0410 and 0421/93:

— joint motion for a resolution tabled by:

Mr Ford, on behalf of the SOC Group,

Mr Robles Piquer and Mr Verhagen, on behalf of the EPP Group,

Mr Bertens, on behalf of the LDR Group,

Mr Telkämper, on behalf of the Green Group,

Mr Vandemeulebroucke, on behalf of the RB Group,

Mr Wurtz, on behalf of the LU Group, to replace these motions by a new text:

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 2).

(Motion for a resolution B3-0404/93 fell)

9. Nuclear tests (vote)

Motions for resolutions B3-0364, 0373, 0379, 0387 and 0390/93

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B3-0364, 0373, 0379, 0387 and 0390/93:

— joint motion for a resolution tabled by:

Mr Crampton, Mr Ford and Mr Sakellariou, on behalf of the SOC Group,

Mr Penders and Mr Pöttering, on behalf of the EPP Group.

Mr Lannoye, on behalf of the Green Group,

Mr Vandemeulebroucke, on behalf of the RB Group,

Mrs Ainardi, on behalf of the LU Group,

to replace these motions by a new text:

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (SOC and Greens):

Members voting: 215

For: 196
Against: 10
Abstentions: 9

(Part II, Item 3)

10. Situation in the former Soviet Union (vote)

Motions for resolutions B3-0385, 0396, 0400, 0424 and 0427/93

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B3-0385, 0396, 0424 and 0427/93:

— joint motion for a resolution tabled by:

Mr Coimbra Martins and Mrs Hoff, on behalf of the SOC Group.

Mr Penders and Mr Robles Piquer, on behalf of the EPP Group,

Mr Bertens, on behalf of the LDR Group,

Mr de la Malène, on behalf of the EDA Group,

Mr Vandemeulebroucke, on behalf of the RB Group, to replace these motions by a new text:

Recitals and paras 1 and 2: adopted

Para. 3: adopted (separate votes requested by the Green Group)

Paras 4 and 5: adopted

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 4).

(Motion for a resolution B3-0400/93 fell)

11. Disasters (vote)

Motions for resolutions B3-0355 and 0398/93

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B3-0355 and 0398/93.

joint motion for a resolution tabled by:
 Mrs Denys and Mr Hervé, on behalf of the SOC Group.

Mr Raffarin, on behalf of the LDR Group, Mr Raffin, on behalf of the Green Group,

Mr Lataillade, on behalf of the EDA Group,

Mr Vandemeulebroucke, on behalf of the RB Group, to replace these motions by a new text:

Amendment adopted: 1

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 5).

END OF TOPICAL AND URGENT DEBATE

(The sitting was suspended at 1 p.m. and resumed at 3 p.m.)

IN THE CHAIR: Mr CRAVINHO

Vice-President

12. EC-NIS trade agreements (debate)

Mr Martin introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on External Economic Relations, on the future agreements between the Community and the New Independent States of the former Soviet Union (A3-0073/93).

The following spoke: Mr Price, on behalf of the EPP Group, Mr Blot, on behalf of the ER Group, Mr Benoit, Mr Zavvos, Mr Stavrou, Mrs Miranda de Lage, on behalf of the SOC Group, Mr Steichen, Member of the Commission.

The President declared the debate closed.

Vote: Minutes of 12.3.1993, Part I, Item 20

13. European Economic Area (debate)

Mr Steichen, Member of the Commission, made a statement on the European Economic Area.

The following spoke: Mrs Jepsen, on behalf of the EPP Group, Mr De Clercq, on behalf of the LDR Group, Mr Lane, on behalf of the EDA Group, Mr Geraghty, Mr Stavrou, Mr Maher, Mr Chanterie and Mr Steichen.

The President declared the debate closed.

14. Parliament's accounts for 1992 (debate)

Mr Tomlinson, after protesting at the absence of Parliament's senior administration and asking the President to instruct the Bureau to make sure such a situation did not recur, introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Budgetary Control, on the closure of Parliament's accounts for the 1992 financial year (administrative expenditure) (A3-0053/93).

The President pointed out that it was just by chance that the report had been called at the same time as a Bureau meeting attended by the officials concerned; he would nevertheless forward these expressions of concern to the Bureau.

The following spoke: Mrs Goedmakers, on behalf of the SOC Group, Mrs Theato, on behalf of the EPP Group.

The President declared the debate closed.

Vote: Minutes of 12.3.1993, Part I, Item 21

15. Interinstitutional agreements (debate)

Mr Roumeliotis introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Institutional Affairs, on the conclusion and adaptation of interinstitutional agreements (A3-0043/93).

The following spoke: Mr Suárez González, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on External Economic Relations, Mr Barón Crespo, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Mr Metten, on behalf of the SOC Group, Mr Herman, on behalf of the EPP Group, Mr Dillen, on behalf of the ER Group, Mr Kostopoulos, Non-attached Member, Mr De Giovanni and Mr Vanni d'Archirafi, Member of the Commission.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr BARZANTI

Vice-President

The President declared the debate closed.

Vote: Minutes of 12.3.1993, Part I, Item 22

16. Maritime transport in the Adriatic and Ionian Seas (debate)

Mr De Piccoli introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Transport and Tourism, on the development of maritime transport and the port system in the Adriatic and Ionian Seas (A3-0067/93).

The following spoke: Mr B. Simpson, on behalf of the SOC Group, Mr Sarlis, on behalf of the EPP Group, Mr Bettini, on behalf of the Green Group, Mr Alavanos, on behalf of the LU Group, Mr Guidolin and Mr Vanni d'Archirafi, Member of the Commission.

The President declared the debate closed.

Vote: Minutes of 12.3.1993, Part I, Item 23

17. Road safety (debate)

Mr Tauran introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Transport and Tourism, on a Community programmme for action on road safety (A3-0014/93).

The following spoke: Mr Schlechter, on behalf of the SOC Group, Mr Cornelissen, on behalf of the EPP Group, Mr Wijsenbeek, on behalf of the LDR Group, Mrs van Dijk, chairman of the Transport Committee and also on behalf of the Green Group, Mr Kostopoulos, Non-attached Member, Mr B. Simpson, Mr Wijsenbeek who put a question to the Commission, Mr van der Waal, Mr Ferri, Mr Sisó Cruellas, Mr Visser, Mr Coimbra Martins, Mr Topmann and Mr Vanni d'Archirafi, Member of the Commission.

The President declared the debate closed.

Vote: Minutes of 12.3.1993, Part I, Item 24

18. System of assistance for ACP banana suppliers (debate) *

Mrs Daly introduced her report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Development and Cooperation, on the proposal from the Commission to the Council for a Regulation establishing a special system of assistance to traditional ACP suppliers of bananas (COM(92)0465 — C3-0020/93) (A3-0049/93).

IN THE CHAIR: Mr ESTGEN

Vice-President

The following spoke: Mrs Van Putten, on behalf of the SOC Group, Mrs Hermans, on behalf of the EPP Group, Mr Mendes Bota, on behalf of the LDR Group, Mr Telkämper, on behalf of the Green Group, Mr Sánchez García, on behalf of the RB Group, Mr Tauran, on behalf of the ER Group, Mrs Grund, Non-attached Member, Mr Colino Salamanca, Mr Suárez González, Mr Méndez de Vigo, Mrs Braun-Moser and Mr Steichen, Member of the Commission.

The President declared the debate closed.

Vote: Minutes of 12.3.1993, Part I, Item 25

19. Gabcikovo dam (debate)

Mr Steichen, Member of the Commission, made a statement on the progress in negotiations between Slovakia and Hungary on the Gabcikovo dam.

* *

The President announced that he had received from the following Members, motions for resolutions with request for an early vote pursuant to Rule 56(3), to wind up the debate on the Commission statement:

- Mrs van Dijk, on behalf of the Green Group, on the construction of the Gabcikovo-Nagymaros power station (B3-0289/93);
- Mr Moretti, on behalf of the RB Group, on the Gabcikovo dam (B3-0350/93);
- Mr Habsburg, Mrs Cassanmagnago Cerretti, Mr Fernández-Albor and Mrs Oomen-Ruijten, on behalf of the EPP Group, on the further course of the negotiations between the Slovak Republic and Hungary on the Gabcikovo project (B3-0352/93);
- Mr Punset i Casals, Mr De Vries, Mr Vohrer and Mr Pimenta, on behalf of the LDR Group, on the Gabcikovo dam (B3-0382/93);
- Mrs van Dijk and Mr Lannoye, on behalf of the Green Group, on the construction of the Gabcikovo-Nagymaros power station (B3-0392/93);
- Mrs Roth-Behrendt, on behalf of the SOC Group, on the Gabcikovo dam (B3-0428/93).

He announced that the decision on the request for an early vote would be taken at the end of the debate.

* *

The following spoke: Mrs van Dijk, to provide information on the motion tabled by the Green Group, Mr Sakellariou, on behalf of the SOC Group, Mr Habsburg, on behalf of the EPP Group, Mr Bertens, on behalf of the LDR Group, and Mrs van Dijk, on behalf of the Green Group.

The following spoke:

- Mrs Read, Quaestor, who announced that a demonstration was taking place just outside the Chamber which had not been authorised by the College of Quaestors and asked whether authorisation had been given by another body (the President replied that as far as he was aware no authorization had been given);
- Mr Cot, chairman of the SOC Group, who regarded this demonstration as an attempt to pressurise Members while they were voting and asked for the hall in front of the Chamber to be cleared (the President replied that he had already given instructions for this to be done);

- Mrs Sandbæk, on the demonstration;
- Mr Tindemans, chairman of the EPP Group, who agreed with Mr Cot and asked for work to be suspended until the demonstrators had been cleared (the President replied that the demonstrators had already left the vicinity of the Chamber);
- Mr Planas Puchades, who also protested at the demonstration and said he had been given a brochure dealing with human rights violations in Spain; he asked for all such attempts to exert pressure to be forbidden (the President told Mr Planas Puchades that order had been restored);
- Mr Robles Piquer, who agreed with Mr Planas Puchades;
- Mr Landa Mendibe, who explained the motives of the families of Basque political prisoners who had taken part in the demonstration (the President cut him off and announced he would not allow a debate to begin on this subject);

Mr Desama spoke in the continuation of the debate.

The President declared the debate closed.

Decision on the request for an early vote:

Parliament agreed to an early vote.

Vote: Minutes of 12.3.1993, Part I, Item 26

VOTING TIME

The following spoke: Mr Gutiérrez Díaz, who asked for the Ortiz Climent report to be put to the vote first, and Mr De Gucht, who opposed this request.

Parliament agreed to the request.

Mrs Magnani Noya asked for her report to be put to the vote the same day as she would not be present the following day.

20. Cohesion financial instrument (vote) *

Ortiz Climent report — A3-0085/93

The following spoke:

- the rapporteur, to draw attention to some linguistic errors: in the text, 'draft Treaty on European Union' should read 'Treaty on European Union'; in the Greek version of am. 5; in am. 7, the word 'temporary' should be replaced by 'transitional';
- Mr Brito, who claimed that, in am. 45, 'annual' should be replaced by 'six-monthly';
- Mr Colom i Naval, to point out that certain amendments in Spanish should have the names of Mr H. Köhler and himself, on behalf of the SOC Group and not that of Mr Collins.

PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(92)0599 — C3-0044/93:

Amendments adopted: 1 to 9 (except 7) collectively, 7, 10 and 11 collectively, 12 by EV, 13, 14, 15, 16, 51, 17 by RCV (SOC), 18 by EV, 63, 19 to 26 (except 24) collectively, 24, 27 to 35 (except 30, 33, 34) collectively, 30, 33, 34 by EV, 36 (1st part) by RCV (EPP), 64, 39 (1st part), 39 (3rd part), 40, 42 (1st, 3rd, 4th, 5th, 6th, 7th and 8th parts in order), 65, 66, 44 (2nd part), 44 (3rd part), 44 (5th part), 45 and 46 to 49 collectively (46 as an addition);

Amendments rejected: 50, 52 by EV, 53 by EV, 58, 36 (2nd part) by RČV (EPP), 37, 38, 39 (2nd part) by EV, 64, 62, 59 (1st part), 59 (2nd part) by EV, 41 by EV, 55 by EV, 42 (2nd part), 43, 44 (1st part), 44 (4th part), 57, 60 and 61:

Amendment cancelled: 67

Amendment fallen: 56

The following spoke:

- Mr Colom i Naval, on the rapporteur's opposition to am. 12, which contradicted the position of the committee responsible, the rapporteur, and Mr Gutiérrez Díaz, chairman of the Regional Policy Committee, on the rapporteur's remarks (the President then held an electronic check);
- Mr Bettini, to ask for separate votes on ams. 24, 30 and 33;
- Mr Pons Grau, to ask the rapporteur to give his position before the vote on each amendment;
- the rapporteur, to ask for a split vote on am. 59;
- Mr Colom i Naval, on the split vote on am. 44;
- the rapporteur, to agree to am. 46 being taken as an addition, as requested by the SOC Group.

Split votes were held on:

Am. 36 (EPP):

1st part: 1st sentence 2nd part: remainder

Am. 39 (SOC):

1st part: reinstating 'the Member States concerned and' from the Commission text

2nd part: 'within the framework of partnership and'

3rd part: remainder

Am. 59 (the rapporteur):

1st part: up to 'Annex I' 2nd part: remainder

Am. 42 (LDR):

1st part: introduction and first indent

2nd part: second indent 3rd part: third indent 4th part: fourth indent 5th part: fifth indent 6th part: sixth indent 7th part: seventh indent 8th part: eighth indent

Am. 44 (SOC):

1st part: up to 'No 4253/88' 2nd part: up to 'assessment' 3rd part: up to end of subpara. 3

4th part: subpara. 4 5th part: remainder

Results of RCVs:

Am. 17:

Members voting: 225

For: 122 Against: 103 Abstentions: 0

Am. 36, 1st part:

Members voting: 239

For: 121 Against: 113 Abstentions: 5

Am. 36, 2nd part:

Members voting: 235

For: 37 Against: 194 Abstentions: 4

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended (Part II, Item 6).

The rapporteur spoke.

DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:

Explanations of vote tabled in writing:

Mr Maher, Mr Apolinário, Mr Alavanos, Mr Killilea, Mr Bettini, Mrs Izquierdo Rojo, Mr Colom i Naval, on behalf of the SOC Group, and Mr Ephremidis, on behalf of the LU Group.

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution by RCV (EPP and SOC):

Members voting: 242

For: 235 Against: 6 Abstentions: 1 (Part II, Item 6)

21. Imports of beef and veal (vote) *

Sonneveld report — A3-0069/93

PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(92)0518 — C3-0033/93

Parliament approved the Commission proposal (Part II, Item 7).

DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:

Explanations of vote:

The following spoke: Mr Lane, Mr Brito and Mr Cushnahan.

Explanations of vote tabled in writing:

Mr Nicholson and Mr McCartin.

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (Part II, Item 7).

22. European Union (vote)

Valverde López (A3-0041/93) and Magnani Noya (A3-0040/93) reports

(a) A3-0041/93:

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Amendments adopted: 1, 2, 4 and 5

Amendment cancelled: 3

The different parts of the text were adopted in order (para. 7(b) by separate vote (RB)).

Explanation of vote:

Mr I. Christensen spoke.

Explanations of vote tabled in writing:

Mr Boissière, Mr Ephremidis, Mrs Rønn and Mr Blak.

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 8 a)).

(b) A3-0040/93:

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Amendments adopted: 3 and 1 by EV

Amendments rejected: 2, 6 and 4

Amendment fallen: 5

The different parts of the text were adopted in order (paras. 5 (RB) and 10 (SOC) by separate votes and para. 19 by split vote (Greens)).

The rapporteur said that am. 5 was a linguistic amendment (the President decided not to put the amendment to the vote).

Split vote on para. 19:

1st part: text without the words 'jointly with America': adopted

2nd part: these words: adopted by EV

Explanations of vote tabled in writing:

Mr Schodruch, Mr Ephremidis and Mr Dillen.

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 8(b)).

* *

Mr Roumeliotis asked for his report (A3-0043/93) to be put to the vote at that stage.

Parliament rejected the request.

23. Human rights in the Community (vote)

De Gucht report — A3-0025/93 and A3-0025/93/ supp.

(The report had been referred back to committee on 8 Feburary 1993 pursuant to Rule 71 (Minutes of that sitting, Part I, Item 12)).

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Amendments adopted: 68, 69, 39 by RCV (SOC), 40, 3, 4, 41, 44, 42, 75 (compromise), 22 to 24 collectively, 5 (only the addition of the words 'of all the'), 45, 46, 76 (compromise), 48 by RCV (SOC), 49 by RCV (SOC), 77 (compromise), 51, 52, 53 by split vote (ER), 25, 36, 55 by EV, 29 (1st part), 29 (3rd part) by EV, 26 by split vote, 58, 59, 78 (compromise), 31, 61, 66, 62, 63, 79 (compromise), 65, 80 (compromise) (by RCV (SOC)), 70, 33 by EV (only up to 'United Kingdom') and 47

Amendments rejected: 35 by RCV (EPP), 29 (2nd part)

Amendment inadmissible: 43

Amendment fallen: 60

The different parts of the text were adopted in order:

— separate votes: recital E, para. 8 by EV, paras 12 and 13 (EPP), paras 28 to 30 (EPP), 44 and 46 (EPP), 51 and 52 (EPP), 53 and 54 (EPP), 60 (SOC and EPP), 67 (EPP), 79 (EPP), 81, 83 and 85 (EPP), 84 by EV (SOC), 88 (EPP), 90 (SOC) (rejected), 94 and 95 (EPP), 97 and 98 (EPP), 100 to 104 and 108 (EPP), 114 to 116 (EPP)

split votes: paras. 3, 15 (EPP), 32 (EPP), 43 (SOC)
 (1st part), 83 (SOC) (1st part), 116 (SOC) (1st part), 117 (EPP),

The following paras feil: 21, 22, 26, 27, 35, 37 and 76.

The following spoke:

— the rapporteur, to propose replacing 'rules' with 'principles' in para. 60; the President established that there was no opposition and agreed to this change;

— Mr Van Outrive and the rapporteur, on the SOC Group's proposal to replace 'Turkish minority' with 'Muslim minority' in para. 96; Parliament agreed to this modification;

— the rapporteur, to point out that the split vote on am. 116 rendered this amendment meaningless; he therefore asked the Members who had requested the split vote to withdraw their request; Mr Van Outrive, who had made the request, refused to withdraw it.

Split votes:

Para. 3 (EPP):

1st part: text without the words '(social, economic

authorities)': adopted

2nd part: these words: adopted

Para, 15

1st part: up to 'with the governments concerned': adopted

2nd part: remainder: adopted

Para. 32:

1st part: text without the words 'which poverty consti-

tutes': adopted

2nd part: these words: adopted

Am. 53:

1st part: up to 'amongst young people'

2nd part: remainder

Para. 43:

1st part: up to 'Community': adopted

2nd part: remainder: rejected by EV

Am. 29 (SOC and EPP):

1st part: up to 'conscientious objectors'

2nd part: 'and dissidents'

3rd part: remainder

Am. 26 (EPP):

1st part: up to 'economic crime'

2nd part: remainder

Para. 83:

1st part: text without footnote: adopted

2nd part: footnote: rejected

Para. 116:

1st part: text without footnote: adopted 2nd part: footnote: rejected by EV

Para. 117:

1st part: text without 'the Executive Committee of

Amnesty International': adopted 2nd part: these words: adopted

Results of RCVs

Am. 39:

Members voting: 196

For: 130 Against: 66 Abstentions: 0

Am. 48:

Members voting: 186

For: 107 Against: 65 Abstentions: 14

Am. 49:

Members voting: 182

For: 104 Against: 76 Abstentions: 2

Am. 35:

Members voting: 196

For: 40 Against: 146 Abstentions: 10

Para. 60:

Members voting: 187

For: 102 Against: 74 Abstentions: 11

compromise am. 80

Members voting: 177

For: 118 Against: 57 Abstentions: 2

Explanations of vote:

The following spoke: Mr Van Outrive, on behalf of the SOC Group, Mr De Gucht, rapporteur, on behalf of the LDR Group, Mr Vandemeulebroucke, on behalf of the RB Group, Mr Landa Mendibe, Mr Dessylas, Mr Arbeloa Muru, Mr Tindemans, on behalf of the EPP Group, Mr Coates and Mr De Gucht, the last two on Mr Tindemans' remarks.

Mr Ephremidis pointed out that he was due to be called to give an explanation of vote but had not been.

Explanations of vote tabled in writing:

Mr Tauran, Mr Piquet, Mr Da Cunha Oliveira, Mr C. Beazley, Mr Lambrias, Mrs Goedmakers, Mr Alavanos, Mr Nicholson, Mr Deprez, Mrs Hermans, Mrs Reding, Mr Papoutsis, Mrs Lenz, Mr Kostopoulos, Mr Nianias, Mrs Rønn, Mr Blak and Mr Ephremidis.

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (EPP and LDR):

Members voting: 171

For: 113 Against: 51 Abstentions: 7 (Part II, Item 9)

END OF VOTING TIME

24. Agenda for next sitting

The President announced the following agenda for the sitting of Friday, 12 March 1993:

9 a.m.:

- procedures without report *
- Desama report without debate on European statistics *
- vote on motions for resolutions on which the debate had closed
- 2nd Mattina report on tomatoes * (1)
- Mendes Bota report on the ACP-EEC Joint Assembly (1)
- motion for a resolution on agricultural foodstuffs (1)
- Da Cunha Oliveira report on fruit and vegetables * (1)
- Maher report on an EEC-Madagascar fisheries protocol * (¹)
- Commission statement on fisheries
- Commission statement on oilseeds
- oral question with debate on protection of animals during transport

(The sitting was closed at 8.35 p.m.)

(1) Texts would be put to the vote at the end of each debate.

Enrico VINCI Secretary-General Egon KLEPSCH President

PART II

Texts adopted by the European Parliament

1. Violation of human rights

(a) RESOLUTION B3-0374, 0412 and 0430/93

Resolution on the rape of women in former Yugoslavia

- having regard to its resolution of 11 February 1993 on the situation in Bosnia-Herzegovina (1) and all its preceding resolutions on the situation in former Yugoslavia, especially the resolution of 17 December 1992 on the rape of women in former Yugoslavia (2),
- having regard to the proceedings of the public hearing organized by the Committee on Women's Rights on the rape of women in former Yugoslavia, held in Brussels on 18 February 1993,
- A. recognizing that the atrocities being perpetrated against women in former Yugoslavia will not be properly resolved until a political solution is found to this conflict, and urging all parties to make every effort to seek a solution to the war,
- B. regretting that the United Nations Military Command did not consider it relevant to send a representative to the hearing organized by the Committee on Women's Rights, and affirming that the remit of the military must include the protection of the dignity of those who find themselves caught up in conflict,
- C. welcoming the work of the Warburton Delegation, but regretting the fact that this European Community delegation sent to investigate the rapes of women in former Yugoslavia was given neither a broad enough remit nor sufficient resources and support to carry out its task effectively,
- D. noting with regret that no women serve on the United Nations Commission on War Crimes,
- Calls for the immediate dismantling of rape camps and the release of women held in them; 1.
- Condemns the detention and rape of women in former Yugoslavia; 2.
- Demands that systematic abuse of women be considered a war crime and a crime against humanity, regardless of whether it is carried out as part of a national or international conflict and whether it involves military personnel or civilians;
- Acknowledges that most of the victims of systematic rape have been Muslim women but deplores such practices, whoever the victims;
- Calls for resources to be made available to enable speedy and thorough investigations to take place and to support existing independent documentation centres or, where these do not exist, to set up such centres to compile evidence to identify the perpetrators;
- Welcomes UN Security Council Resolution 808 on the setting-up of an international tribunal to try cases of serious violations of human rights committed in former Yugoslavia since 1991 and calls on the UN Secretary-General to take the necessary steps to implement this resolution forthwith;

Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 8.

Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 8(c).

- 7. Calls for the rapid establishment of this special tribunal to bring to trial and punish those who have committed or ordered such atrocities, calls for the reversal of the burden of proof in rape cases and compensation for the victims;
- 8. Calls on the Member States to ensure that the UN Commission on War Crimes and the tribunal are partly made up of women;
- 9. Notes the UN Security Council's intention to include rape suffered by women in former Yugoslavia among the crimes to be judged by this tribunal;
- 10. Demands that funding be made available to establish centres specifically geared for women victims and their children, thus enabling them to be removed from existing refugee camps, where that is their choice;
- 11. Calls for transport to be made available to these centres;
- 12. Calls for action to be taken in the interim to ensure an immediate improvement in the physical conditions for abused women in existing refugee camps, including better sanitation, health care, food and counselling support;
- 13. Calls for the provision of appropriate and accessible long-term accommodation for the most traumatized women;
- 14. Calls for the provision of proper medical support for women rape victims including:
- emergency mobile health teams, linked to major hospitals,
- facilities for termination of pregnancy, where that is the woman's wish,
- ante-natal and post-natal support,
- close liaison between gynaecological and psychiatric practitioners and departments;
- 15. Calls for effective counselling support for those who have suffered rape to be integrated into community support systems for war victims, so as to avoid women feeling they are being stigmatized;
- 16. Considers that priority must be given to schemes to enable women to undertake activities that ensure their economic independence;
- 17. Calls for support for women who decide to keep the children resulting from rape so that international adoption can be viewed as a last resort, and emphasizes that the best interests of the child should be paramount at all times;
- 18. Calls for the provision of educational material and information which can then be distributed via refugee centres, hospitals, schools and religious and cultural centres;
- 19. Calls for existing Military Codes of Conduct to be revised, setting out new guidelines on the collection of evidence on the incidence of rape, and challenges the idea that rape is somehow an acceptable part of the spoils of war;
- 20. Calls on the Commission to develop and strengthen its presence in the area with a mandate to:
- coordinate and sustain financially the efforts of governmental, non-governmental and private organizations working on behalf of women on a non-nationalistic basis,
- extend the programme of practical assistance and monitor its implementation,
- share the experience gained in former Yugoslavia so that lessons can be learned which
 enable the international community to respond more effectively to similar circumstances
 elsewhere in the future,
- follow up these recommendations;
- 21. Asks the European Community to send an outreach team of Community workers e.g. social workers and counsellors, including those with experience of dealing with rape, to advise and train workers operating locally and support self-help groups;
- 22. Calls on the EC Monitoring Force to report to the European Parliament at the earliest possible opportunity;

- 23. Urges Member States to offer a haven for women and children fleeing such atrocities where it is impossible for them to remain in their own community and in particular to:
- speed up visa procedures for such refugees,
- grant temporary entry to women needing medical treatment,
- recognize rape as a legitimate reason for asylum,
- accept the responsibilities which flow from decisions to allow the resettlement of rape victims and provide effective long-term support to enable women to recover from their trauma;
- 24. Calls on the United Nations to establish an appropriate Convention to protect women in times of emergency and armed conflict;
- 25. Calls on the parties involved not to accept any peace settlement which does not take account of these points;
- 26. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, the governments of the Member States and the Secretary-General of the United Nations.

(b) RESOLUTION B3-0363, 0376, 0386, 0394, 0411 and 0420/93

Resolution on human rights in Rwanda

- having regard to its previous resolutions on Rwanda,
- A. mindful of the acts of violence which have been increasing since January 1993 in the north of the country and which have been committed by the various parties involved, the RPF (Rwanda Patriotic Front), the regular army and commando groups which are waging a guerrilla war of which the civilian population is victim,
- B. alarmed at the exodus of around one million people fleeing the north of Rwanda and heading towards the capital Kigali,
- C. concerned at the extreme poverty of these people and the rate of malnutrition amongst children which has already reached 30%,
- D. condemning the war crimes, summary executions, rape and looting which, according to the international commission of representatives and experts from human rights organizations, have been carried out by the Rwanda regular army and the Rwanda Patriotic Front,
- E. condemning the destruction of houses and welfare centres and the occupation of hospitals, etc., some of which were set up and funded by European cooperation,
- F. seriously concerned by any breach of the cease-fire agreement of 12 July 1992, and more so by the subsequent resumption of armed conflict,
- G. aware of the efforts already made by the countries of the region as well as by Belgium, France and the United States acting as observers in the negotiations under the aegis of the OAU,
- H. recalling previous appeals made by international organizations, institutions and non-governmental organizations, particularly the ACP-EEC Joint Assembly resolution adopted in Santo Domingo in February 1992,
- I. having regard to the decision taken by the Rwanda Government and the rebels in Dar es Salaam to reconsider the presence of foreign troops,

- 1. Calls on the Rwanda Government and all ruling and opposition parties to resume the stalled Arusha talks and implement the agreements signed;
- 2. Calls on the government of President Habyarimana and the RPF to call a halt to all hostilities and implement a lasting cease-fire;
- 3. Calls on the government to put an end to the persecution of the Tutsi community reported by several commissions of inquiry;
- 4. Calls on the Rwanda Government and the RPF to take immediate action to end the torture and killing of unarmed civilians and take action against those responsible for such crimes;
- 5. Calls for the immediate release of all Rwandese already sentenced or awaiting trial whose only crime was to call for respect for human rights and the establishment of democratic institutions;
- 6. Calls on the international community and, in particular, the European Community to encourage dialogue between the various sections of Rwanda society, which must accept the rules of democracy in order to avoid a crisis which could rapidly plunge Rwanda into a situation which is unfortunately increasingly common in Africa;
- 7. Calls for early elections in the presence of international observers;
- 8. Requests the EC and its Member States to encourage the peaceful efforts that are being deployed by the OAU and the countries of the region and to this end requests the EC to increase its logistical and financial support to the OAU Observer Group so as to enhance its capacity to assume an increased role as an international peacekeeping force;
- 9. Calls on the Community, acting through ECHO and its Member States, to implement rapid effective humanitarian action to cope with the large number of displaced persons, *inter alia* by supporting the activities already undertaken in Rwanda by the WFP and the ICRC;
- 10. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, the Co-Presidents of the ACP-EEC Joint Assembly, the OAU and the Government of Rwanda.

(c) RESOLUTION B3-0362 and 0367/93

Resolution on the human rights situation in Cuba

- having regard to its previous resolutions on human rights abuses in Cuba,
- A. whereas elections were held to the 'Assembly of People's Power' in Cuba on 24 February 1993,
- B. whereas Cubans were only allowed to vote for a single list presented by the Communist Party of Cuba, which has an absolute monopoly of power in the Republic of Cuba,
- C. whereas a large-scale campaign urged the electorate to vote en bloc for this single list,
- D. whereas, according to official results, the single list was elected by 87,3% of those who turned out to vote,
- E. whereas, according to the same official information, despite pressure from the government and the Partido Unico (the single party of Cuba), 15,6% of Cubans decided not to vote or to hand in blank or partially filled-in ballot papers or to cast votes which were subsequently cancelled,

- F. drawing attention to the fact that there has been no other election in Cuba since President Castro came to power in 1959,
- G. gravely disturbed by the number of political prisoners and people detained for their opinions in Cuba,
- H. calling attention to the persecution by physical violence and intimidation as well as by arrest and imprisonment of those who seek to defend human rights,
- I. calling attention in particular to the cases of:
 - José Luiz Pujol Iriza, sentenced to three years' imprisonment in September 1992, apparently for having written a letter critical of President Castro to a Cuban exile,
 - Sebastian Arcos Bergnes, Vice-President of the Comité Cubano Pro Derechos Humanos, sentenced to four years in October 1992 for having sent abroad information on the violation of human rights which the Cuban authorities claim to be false,
 - María Elena Cruz Varela, distinguished poet and defender of human rights who, it is reported, is still being maltreated physically and mentally in prison,
 - Yademiro Restano Diaz and María Elena Aparicio, sentenced to 10 and seven years respectively in May 1992 for belonging to Movimiento de Armonía, which, according to the Cuban authorities, advocates changing the political, economic and social structure,
 - Gustavo Arcos, Rodolfo Gonzalez, Osvaldo Pava, Elizardo Sanchez and Jesus Yanes, who have all been subjected to mob violence or imprisonment or recently had their lives threatened by government officials,
- calling attention to the role of the Brigadas Populares de Respuesta Rapida, who behave like storm troopers in beating up and intimidating dissidents,
- K. drawing attention to the fact that many people trying to escape from Cuba are drowned in the attempt,
- 1. Calls on the Cuban Government to show respect for democracy by allowing the holding of genuine elections in the near future;
- 2. Calls once again on the Cuban authorities to engage in dialogue with the internal and external Cuban opposition to pave the way for democratic, multiparty elections preceded by a free election campaign and monitored by international observers;
- Demands the immediate release of all political prisoners;
- 4. Calls on the Cuban Government to allow international human rights organizations to visit the country and to stop the persecution of Cuban human rights organizations;
- 5. Calls on the Cuban Government to disband the Brigadas Populares de Respuesta Rapida;
- 6. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission, Council and European Political Cooperation and to the Secretary-General of the Organization of American States and the Government of Cuba.

(d) **RESOLUTION B3-0426/93**

Resolution on human rights in Iraq

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the report submitted to the Human Rights Commission in Geneva on 1 March 1993 by the UN special rapporteur on Iraq, Mr Max van der Stoel,
- A. whereas the report alleges that in recent months the Iraqi authorities have executed hundreds of persons from the south of the country in 'death camps',
- B. whereas the report notes that prisoners from the south have been moved to camps in the north,
- C. appalled that Saddam Hussein is seeking the destruction of the Marsh Arabs of Southern Iraq, and shocked by the barbarity of his methods, the systematic poisoning of water, the indiscriminate shelling of civilians and the destruction of the resources and environment of the people by draining the marshes,
- 1. Regards this information as extremely worrying;
- 2. Calls on the international community to exert pressure on the Iraqi authorities to bring an end to the executions and the transfers of prisoners;
- 3. Endorses the demand made by the UN special rapporteur that Baghdad should end the economic blockade on the Kurdish regions in the north of the country and the Shiite regions in the south;
- 4. Calls on the UN Security Council to warn the Iraqi government that unless it stops its attacks on the Marsh Arabs and the drainage operations within a matter of days, actions will be taken to ensure the safety of the Marsh Arabs in accordance with UN Security Council Resolution 688;
- 5. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, the Iraqi Government and the United Nations.

(e) RESOLUTION B3-0372 and 0423/93

Resolution on the escape of the murderers of Chico Mendes in Brazil

- having regard to Article 7 of ILO Convention 95 on debt enslavement,
- having regard to Article 3 of the Framework Agreement for Cooperation between the EEC and the Federative Republic of Brazil,
- A. having regard to the need to respect democratic principles and human rights,
- B. recalling with great respect the work of the trade unionist and grassroots environmentalist, Chico Mendes, who worked with rubber tappers to preserve the Amazon rainforest,
- C. recalling his brutal murder on 22 December 1988 and the quick investigation of this crime, which led to the arrest, conviction and sentence to 19 years' imprisonment of Darci and Darli Alves da Silva,

- D. noting that, according to Amnesty International, this fact marked the first time that a Brazilian court had convicted a landowner for ordering the murder of a rural trade unionist,
- E. deeply concerned by the escape of Darci and Darli Alves da Silva from jail in Rio Branco, State of Acre, a fact that weakens substantially the credibility of the Brazilian justice system,
- F. concerned also that similar cases have occurred where state authorities appear unwilling or unable to prevent jail escapes by people accused of assassinating union leaders and human rights workers in rural areas,
- G. convinced that action to prevent and investigate killings of peasants and rural trade union leaders in the context of land disputes should be taken by the newly installed Brazilian Government, particularly because out of 1 684 such cases between 1964 and 1991, only 25 came to trial and in only 14 cases were people convicted,
- H. whereas the forest lands for which Chico Mendes gave his life, like those of the Yanomami people, have once again been invaded by gold prospectors, Awa forest land continues to be destroyed by illegal settlers, loggers and farmers and there is a serious delay in the implementation of Article 231 of the Brazilian Constitution, which requires all indigenous lands to be demarcated by October 1993,
- I. having regard to numerous reports over the last two years of forced labour and debt bondage of workers in the Amazon region of Brazil as the *modus operandi* of certain branches of economic activity, such as forest clearing, mining or charcoal production, the principal form of subjection being by debt incurred through transport to work sites and in company stores, against which wages are held, as Mr M. Lavenere Machado has recently been able to report to Parliament,
- concerned by reports of multiple torture and killings by hired gunmen of workers trying to flee such conditions,
- 1. Appeals to the Brazilian authorities to investigate the circumstance of the escape of Darci and Darli Alves da Silva, the possible complicity of guards and law enforcement officers and bring to justice those responsible;
- 2. Calls on European Political Cooperation to bring to the attention of the Brazilian Government the importance the European Community attaches to this case;
- 3. Appeals to the Brazilian authorities to ensure that all reported cases of human rights violations in the context of land conflicts are brought to justice, including the instigators;
- 4. Welcomes the Brazilian Government's *Operação Selva Livre* to remove the gold prospectors from Yanomami Reserve to Boa Vista;
- 5. Appeals to the Brazilian Government to provide education and employment for the ex-miners in Boa Vista and also demarcate, protect and ratify Awa Guaja land and other indigenous territories further to Article 231 of the Constitution by October 1993;
- 6. Calls on the Ministry of Labour, newly reconstituted as a separate Ministry in April last year, to strengthen inspectorates and to implement the systematic follow-up of denunciations of illegal coercive labour practices;
- 7. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to EPC, the Council, the Commission and the Government of Brazil.

(f) RESOLUTION B3-0378, 0381 and 0405/93

Resolution on the trial of Xanana Gusmão and human rights in East Timor

- having regard to its resolution of 21 January 1993 on the trial of the former leader of the Timor resistance, Xanana Gusmão (1),
- A. whereas the defence counsel, who was, moreover, unofficially appointed by the Indonesian authorities, has continually argued, albeit without success, that the latter have no legal right to try Xanana Gusmão,
- B. whereas the first stage of the trial has seriously increased the worst fears about the purely arbitrary nature of a trial which lacks the slightest legal basis,
- C. whereas the judgment is expected in the next two or three weeks,
- D. mindful of the most recent report by Amnesty International which showed that the systematic violation of human rights was still Indonesia's real policy in East Timor,
- E. whereas, finally, under Indonesian law, the crimes with which Xanana Gusmão is charged can result in the death penalty,
- 1. Reaffirms its previous positions on East Timor to the effect that the people of that territory have the right to unrestricted self-determination and that consequently all the acts of mass repression which have been violently perpetrated since 1975 by the occupying Indonesian authorities must cease immediately;
- 2. Emphasizes and supports the position of the Council, as recently reaffirmed by the Danish presidency before the UN Commission on Human Rights, as regards both the defence of human rights and the political solution of the problem in line with the relevant UN resolutions and the instructions given to its Secretary-General;
- 3. Reaffirms that the trial of Xanana Gusmão is completely illegal and repeats that it will not accept any conviction resulting from the trial in view of the Indonesian court's complete lack of legitimacy or competence in the matter;
- 4. Instructs its Subcommittee on Human Rights to include East Timor in its work programme as a matter of urgency with a view to carrying out an in-depth analysis and possibly making proposals;
- 5. Reminds its President of the need to ensure that the planned visit of an ad hoc parliamentary delegation to Jakarta and Dili takes place without delay so that it can obtain detailed information on the situation in East Timor;
- 6. Repeats its profound concern at the fact that the situation in East Timor is already seriously affecting not only relations between the EEC and Indonesia but even relations between the EEC and the Asean Group relations whose development is regarded as of major importance by both sides but which, as a general principle, must reflect respect for international law and the observance of human rights;
- 7. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, the governments of the Member States, the UN Secretary-General and the Government of the Republic of Indonesia and the other Asean countries.

⁽¹⁾ Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 5(g).

2. South Africa

RESOLUTION B3-0360, 0365, 0375, 0410 and 0421/93

Resolution on South Africa

- recalling its previous resolutions on South Africa,
- A. having regard to the progress made by South African society towards the establishment of a democratic state,
- B. whereas the holding of general elections conforming to the principle of one-person-one-vote is an indispensable element for the transformation of South Africa into a non-racial democracy which respects human rights,
- C. having regard to the negotiations between the South African Government and the ANC,
- D. having regard to the results of the first international conference of the ANC,
- E. having regard to the all-party agreement to resume negotiations on 5 April 1993,
- F. gravely concerned about the economic situation in South Africa, in particular in the townships where poverty, unemployment, racial inequalities in the distribution of wealth and income and social imbalances are in great measure a consequence of the past system of apartheid,
- 1. Welcomes the prospect within the near future of South Africa's first one-person-one-vote elections to a Constituent Assembly, which will have as its main task the drawing up and adoption of a new democratic constitution for South Africa to create a just and equitable society and which will open the way to the election after five years of a democratic government and parliament;
- 2. Believes it is therefore essential for the electoral process and the elections to the Constituent Assembly to be free and fair and judged to be so by the international community;
- 3. Calls, therefore, on the South African Government and where appropriate on all negotiating parties to ensure:
- (a) the early establishment of the Independent Electoral Commission, in which not only the Government, the ANC and the other political parties should be represented, but also representatives of civil society, such as the Independent Forum for Electoral Education, which is supported by the South African churches and several other non-governmental organizations,
- (b) free and fair access to the mass media by all political parties,
- (c) unimpeded access to and simple formalities for, voter registration,
- (d) equitable financial resources available to all parties,
- (e) the training of neutral monitors;
- 4. Calls on the international community, in particular the UN, the Organization for African Unity and the European Community, to provide international monitoring of the election campaign to ensure fair elections without fraud, intimidation or ballot rigging;
- 5. Calls on the Council and the Commission to make proposals to contribute to a programme of reconstruction to repair the harm done by apartheid and to achieve the vision of a new South Africa;
- 6. Calls therefore on the Council and Commission to seek active ways of contributing to the development of a democratic South Africa through positive measures and to promote investment that will help relieve the terrible unemployment and enable the country to address the numerous and urgent social and economic needs of the people of South Africa;

- 7. Welcomes the ANC statement that, on the announcement of an agreed date for elections, and on the establishment of the Transitional Executive Council, the Independent Electoral and Media Commissions and the Enactment of the Transition to Democracy Act, the remaining non-mandatory sanctions should be lifted;
- 8. Calls on the international community and, in particular, the EC, to ensure strict observance of the arms embargo until a democratic government has been installed;
- 9. Expresses its concern and anxiety at the violence within South Africa which still causes enormous loss of life and suffering and poses a major threat to the democratic process;
- 10. Believes that the democratic transformation now underway in South Africa offers the prospect that all the peoples of southern Africa can live in peace and freedom and jointly engage in the current task of reconstruction and equitable development;
- 11. Welcomes the constructive approach of the ACP-EEC Joint Assembly to the problems faced by the countries of southern Africa and South Africa and hopes that the meeting of the Joint Assembly in Gaborone will provide a sound basis for strengthening the relations between a future democratic South Africa and the member countries of the Lomé Convention, particularly those of the southern African region;
- 12. Welcomes the decision of the Bureau of the ACP-EEC Joint Assembly to invite Mr Nelson Mandela and President F. W. De Klerk to address the meeting in Gaborone, and thus to lend its support to the consolidation of the democratic constitutional reform process in South Africa;
- 13. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission, the Council, EPC, the Secretaries-General of the UN and the OAU, the Government of South Africa, the ANC and other Codesa participants, the South African Council of Churches, and the SACBC.

3. Nuclear tests

RESOLUTION B3-0364, 0373, 0379, 0387 and 0390/93

Resolution on stopping nuclear tests by the nuclear powers

- having regard to the 1963 Treaty Banning Nuclear Weapon Tests in the Atmosphere, in Outer Space and Under Water, the Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons of 1968, the Threshold Test Ban Treaty of 1974 and the Peaceful Nuclear Explosions Treaty of 1976,
- having regard to the on-going Geneva Conference on Disarmament and the Start agreements.
- A. welcoming in this regard the forthcoming meeting between Presidents Clinton and Yeltsin,
- B. whereas the Extension Conference of the Non-Proliferation Treaty (to which all EC Member States are signatories) will open in 1995,
- C. whereas nuclear testing is likely to be one of the central issues of the Extension Conference as a multilateral, comprehensive ban would help protect individual health and the environment, and enhance efforts to halt the proliferation of nuclear weapons,

- D. whereas there exists at the moment a real danger of nuclear proliferation and the emergence of new nuclear-weapon states,
- E. whereas international control on the transfer of nuclear material and knowledge has become more urgent than ever before,
- F. welcoming the French proposal of last November calling on the representatives of the five nuclear powers at the Geneva Disarmament Conference to undertake a joint reflection on the nuclear testing question and aware that the nuclear test ban represents an important step towards extending the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty after 1995;
- 1. Welcomes the moratoria on underground nuclear testing proclaimed by France, Russia and the US until 1 July 1993;
- 2. Calls upon the other nuclear states to join these moratoria and to adopt a common approach to the nuclear test issue;
- 3. Calls upon all states, and in particular on the non-Russian CIS republics to join the NPT without delay;
- 4. Urges the EC Signatories of the NPT to initiate, at the earliest possible date, multilateral negotiations toward a comprehensive nuclear weapons test ban;
- 5. Calls upon the governments of the 12 Member States to take appropriate steps to strengthen the international control of transfer of nuclear material;
- 6. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission and the Governments of France, the United Kingdom, the United States, China, Russia, and the other CIS republics and to the Chairman of the UN Conference on Disarmament currently in session in Geneva.

4. Situation in the former Soviet Union

RESOLUTION B3-0385, 0396, 0424 and 0427/93

Resolution on the situation in the Russian Federation

- having regard to its former resolutions on the situation in the Russian Federation,
- A. deeply concerned by growing tension between the government and parliament of the Russian Federation,
- B. alarmed by recent statements made by high-ranking officers of the armed forces concerning the current political situation,
- C. convinced that the failure of the attempt to establish democracy in Russia would be a disaster,
- D. concerned about growing insecurity in the main centres of population and increasing terrorist activities,
- E. convinced that growing poverty and deteriorating standards of living contribute to political instability,
- F. concerned by the increasing tension between Russia and the Ukraine, notably concerning the problems of security and defence,

- 1. Calls on the Community to pay special attention to the humanitarian needs within its overall aid and cooperation programmes to the Russian Federation;
- 2. Calls on the Government and Parliament of the Russian Federation to reach a stable agreement as soon as possible on a distribution of power which enjoys the support of the people and helps to overcome the problems currently facing the Russian Federation;
- 3. Asks the Twelve to develop a common foreign and security policy towards the Russian Federation;
- 4. Calls on the EC and its Member States to assist in the dismantling of weapons of mass destruction on the territory of the former Soviet Union and in the conversion of armaments factories to civilian use;
- 5. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission and the authorities of the Russian Federation.

5. Disasters

RESOLUTION B3-0355 and 0398/93

Resolution on the oyster-farming crisis in the Marennes-Oléron basin, France

- A. whereas shellfish, and oysters in particular, have been officially declared contaminated by toxins as a result of samples taken by a specialist institute (Ifremer), leading to a ban on sales,
- B. whereas, however, additional research had to be carried out, in the form of more detailed analyses of the actual toxicity of the substances concerned, the final results proving negative,
- C. whereas the losses suffered by shellfish farmers so far total FF 400 million,
- 1. Draws attention to the sense of responsibility shown by oyster farmers faced with a situation whose economic consequences are particularly serious because the end of the oyster season has been ruined;
- 2. Stresses, further, the efforts already made by shellfish farmers to comply with the relevant European health standards;
- 3. Notes with satisfaction the speed with which the local authorities decided to ban sales of oysters, thereby preventing any risk of contamination;
- 4. Urges the Community to take part in the measures which will be taken to promote oyster farming in order to make good the damage suffered by the fish trade in general;
- 5. Calls on the Commission, accordingly, to grant emergency aid to oyster farmers, so that they receive compensation for the losses resulting from the sales ban on and poor sales of oysters;
- 6. Calls for research into the causes of the proliferation of phytoplankton, which led to the contamination of the shellfish, to be stepped up;
- 7. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission and to the local and regional authorities in Poitou-Charentes.

6. Cohesion financial instrument *

PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(92)0599 — C3-0044/93

Proposal for a Council Regulation establishing a cohesion financial instrument

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES (*)

TEXT AMENDED
BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

(Amendment No 1)

First citation a (new)

Having regard to the decisions of the European Councils of Lisbon, 26 and 27 June 1992, and Edinburgh, 11 and 12 December 1992, concerning the establishment of the Cohesion Fund,

(Amendment No 2)

First citation b (new)

Having regard to the European Parliament's resolution of 10 June 1992 on the Commission communication 'From the Single Act to Maastricht and beyond: the means to match our ambitions', (1)

(¹) OJ No C 176, 13.7.1992, p. 74.

(Amendment No 3)

First recital a (new)

Whereas one of the Community's fundamental tasks is to encourage economic and social cohesion and solidarity between the Member States as essential goals so far as its development and success are concerned;

(Amendment No 4)

First recital b (new)

Whereas account must be taken of the major unavoidable development efforts required of certain Member States with a view to the necessary convergence of their respective economies;

(Amendment No 5)

Third recital

Whereas the European Council, at its meeting in Edinburgh on 11 and 12 December 1992, proposed creating an interim financial instrument pending the establishment of *a* Cohesion Fund;

Whereas the European Council, at its meeting in Edinburgh on 11 and 12 December 1992, proposed creating an interim financial instrument pending the establishment of the Cohesion Fund and named the recipient States, the criteria and indicative allocation brackets in such a way as to ensure the immediate provision of financial aid to Ireland, Greece, Portugal and Spain in the areas to be covered by the Fund;

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

TEXT AMENDED BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

(Amendment No 6)

Third recital a (new)

Whereas the purpose of both the financial instrument and the Cohesion Fund is to support the efforts required of the recipient States with a view to convergence;

(Amendment No 7)

Fourth recital

Whereas, given the conclusions of the European Council and given the impossibility of implementing, on the basis of Article 235 of the EEC Treaty, the set of conditions which are linked to Article 104c of the draft Treaty on European Union, the financial instrument should be of a temporary nature; whereas it should be replaced as soon as possible by the Cohesion Fund as envisaged in Article 130d of the draft Treaty and should in any event be reexamined before 31 December 1993 in the light of the process of ratifying the draft Treaty;

Whereas, given the impossibility of implementing, on the basis of Article 235 of the EEC Treaty, all the conditions which are linked to the Cohesion Fund in the Treaty on European Union, the financial instrument should be of a transitional nature; whereas it should be replaced immediately by the Cohesion Fund as envisaged in Article 130d of the Treaty on European Union when the latter enters into force and should in any event be reexamined in the light of the process of ratifying this Treaty;

(Amendment No 8)

Fifth recital

Whereas the financial resources of the financial instrument should be those provided for the Cohesion Fund in the financial perspectives for the general budget of the European Communities for the years for which the financial instrument applies; Whereas, in the absence of an interinstitutional agreement, the institutions should abide by the conclusions of the European Council of 11 and 12 December 1992 as regards the sums earmarked for the Cohesion Fund (and thus for the provisional financial instrument as well), which means that they shall view these sums as spending targets;

(Amendment No 9)

Sixth recital

Whereas the promotion of economic and social cohesion calls for a concentration of the funds available to the cohesion financial instrument on projects concerning the environment and transport infrastructure of common interest in Member States with a per capita GNP of less than 90% of the Community average;

Whereas the promotion of economic and social cohesion calls for a concentration of the funds available to the cohesion financial instrument on projects concerning the environment and transport infrastructure of common interest in the four Member States referred to above with a per capita GNP of less than 90% of the Community average, thereby anticipating as far as possible the provisions of the Treaty on European Union, so as to ensure a smooth transition from this regulation to the future regulation on the Cohesion Fund;

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

TEXT AMENDED BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

(Amendment No 10)

Seventh recital

Whereas the implementation of convergence programmes designed to avoid excessive government deficits is a necessary condition for progress towards economic and monetary union;

Whereas the implementation of convergence programmes designed to avoid excessive government deficits is a necessary condition for progress towards economic and monetary union; whereas the financial instrument should serve, in this context, to facilitate real convergence among the economics of the recipient states and, ultimately, to strengthen economic and social cohesion;

(Amendment No 11)

Eighth recital

Whereas Title IV of Part Two of the Treaty provides that the Council shall lay down any appropriate provisions to implement a common transport policy; whereas the Community should make a contribution, through the cohesion financial instrument, to trans-European networks in the area of transport infrastructure; Whereas it is the Council's task to adopt any appropriate provisions to implement a common transport policy; whereas the Community should make a contribution, through the cohesion financial instrument, to trans-European networks in the area of transport infrastructure;

(Amendment No 12)

Ninth recital

Whereas Article 130r of the Treaty defines the objectives of the Community in the field of the environment; whereas the Community should contribute, through the cohesion financial instrument, to action designed to achieve these objectives in accordance with Article 130a of the Treaty;

Whereas preserving, protecting and improving the quality of the environment, protecting human health, and the prudent and rational utilization of natural resources are fundamental objectives of the Community environmental policy; whereas the Community should contribute, through the cohesion financial instrument, to action designed to achieve these objectives;

(Amendment No 13)

Ninth recital a (new)

Whereas it is necessary to guarantee an appropriate balance between the two sectors to be financed under the financial instrument, in accordance with the priorities laid down by and the specific characteristics of each of the four recipient Member States;

(Amendment No 14)

Ninth recital b (new)

Whereas environmental policy must be given the same priority as infrastructure policy;

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

TEXT AMENDED BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

(Amendment No 15)

10th recital

Whereas, in the light of an undertaking by the Member States concerned not to decrease their investment efforts in the fields of environmental protection and transport infrastructure, additionality in the sense of Article 9 of Council Regulation (EEC) No 4253/88 of 19 December 1988 laying down provisions for implementing Regulation (EEC) No 2052/88 as regards coordination of the activities of the different structural Funds between themselves and with the operations of the European Investment Bank and other existing financial instruments will not apply to the cohesion financial instrument;

Whereas, in the light of an undertaking by the Member States concerned not to decrease their investment efforts in the fields of environmental protection and transport infrastructure and in the light of the budgetary demands which the convergence programmes place on the recipient countries, additionality in the sense of Article 9 of Council Regulation (EEC) No 4253/88 of 19 December 1988 laying down provisions for implementing Regulation (EEC) No 2052/88 as regards coordination of the activities of the different structural Funds between themselves and with the operations of the European Investment Bank and other existing financial instruments will not apply to the cohesion financial instrument;

(Amendment No 16)

10th recital a (new)

Whereas the European Investment Bank (EIB) must also help to finance investment programmes in conjunction with assistance from the Structural Funds and other Community financial instruments;

(Amendment No 51)

10th recital b (new)

Whereas the Commission's Green Paper (COM(92)0046) on the impact of transport on the environment points out the need to develop a transport network which shows greater respect for the environment;

(Amendment No 17)

11th recital a (new)

Whereas such coordination will not be possible without application of the principle of partnership between the Commission, the Member States and regional or local authorities, as defined in Article 4 of Council Regulation (EEC) No 2052/88, which is a key principle in the implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the Community's structural policies;

(Amendments Nos 18 and 63)

11th recital b (new)

Whereas, likewise, such coordination will not be feasible without effective consultation between the Commission and the recipient Member States; whereas it should be consistent with the aims of the Structural Funds;

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

TEXT AMENDED BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

(Amendment No 19)

13th recital

Whereas the operations of the cohesion financial instrument must be consistent with Community policies, inter alia, those regarding environmental protection, transport, competition and the award of public contracts;

Whereas the operations of the cohesion financial instrument must be consistent with the convergence programmes of the Member States concerned leading to the real convergence necessary for the fulfilment of the convergence criteria required for the transition to the third stage of Economic and Monetary Union, and with Community policies, inter alia, those regarding environmental protection, nature conservancy, transport, competition and the award of public contracts; whereas adequate information must be provided to ensure this;

(Amendment No 20)

14th recital

Whereas an indicative allocation of commitment appropriations between the Member States should be provided for in order to facilitate the programming of projects;

Whereas an indicative allocation of commitment appropriations between the Member States should be provided for in order to facilitate the programming of projects, in accordance with objective statistical criteria which are made public;

(Amendment No 21)

14th recital a (new)

Whereas an appropriate balance must be ensured between financing for transport infrastructure projects and for environmental projects;

(Amendment No 22)

14th recital b (new)

Whereas calculations of the overall cost of transport infrastructure projects should include environmental costs but should be presented in a transparent manner;

(Amendment No 23)

15th recital

Whereas it is necessary, given the requirements of economic and social cohesion, to provide a high rate of assistance;

Whereas economic and social cohesion actions together with the objective of controlling public deficits will mean that a high rate of assistance is necessary;

(Amendment No 24)

16th recital

Whereas, in the interests of the proper management of the cohesion financial instrument, the provisions contained in Titles VI and VII of Regulation (EEC) No 4253/88 should be applied where appropriate and by analogy;

Whereas, in the interests of the proper management of the cohesion financial instrument, it is necessary to ensure effective methods of monitoring, assessing and carrying out checks in respect of Community operations;

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

TEXT AMENDED BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

(Amendment No 25)

17th recital

Whereas provision should be made to give adequate publicity to Community assistance provided by the cohesion financial instrument;

Whereas provision should be made to provide freedom of access to information concerning projects to be funded by the financial instrument and to give adequate publicity to Community assistance provided by the cohesion financial instrument;

(Amendment No 26)

Article 1

A cohesion financial instrument (hereinafter referred to as 'the financial instrument') is hereby established, whereby the Community shall provide financial contributions to projects in the fields of the environment and trans-European transport infrastructure networks in Greece, Spain, Ireland and Portugal, each of which shall have a convergence programme examined by the Council, designed to avoid an excessive government deficit.

A cohesion financial instrument (hereinafter referred to as 'the financial instrument') is hereby established, whereby the Community shall provide financial contributions to projects in the fields of the environment and trans-European transport infrastructure networks in Greece, Spain, Ireland and Portugal; to this end each State shall have a convergence programme examined by the Council, designed to create conditions which will enable them to join the Economic and Monetary Union.

(Amendment No 27)

Article 2, second indent

- transport infrastructure projects of common interest financed by Member States which promote the interconnection and interoperability of national networks and access to such networks, taking account in particular of the need to link insular, landlocked or peripheral regions with the central regions of the Community, in particular the projects which are provided for in trans-European network schemes which have been adopted by the Council or proposed by the Commission in accordance with Title IV of Part Two of the Treaty;
- transport infrastructure projects of common interest financed by the public authorities of Member States which promote the interconnection and interoperability of national networks and access to such networks, taking account in particular of the need to link insular, landlocked or peripheral regions with each other and with the central regions of the Community, in particular the projects which are provided for in trans-European network schemes which have been adopted by the Council or proposed by the Commission:

(Amendment No 28)

Article 3

The commitment appropriations for the financial instrument shall be ECU 1 500 million in 1993 and ECU 1 750 million in 1994, expressed in 1992 prices.

- 1. The commitment appropriations considered necessary for the financial instrument shall be ECU 1 500 million in 1993 and ECU 1 750 million in 1994, expressed in 1992 prices.
- 2. The budgetary authority shall decide, as part of the budget procedure, what appropriations are to be made available for each financial year.

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

TEXT AMENDED BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

(Amendment No 29)

Article 4

In order to facilitate the planning of assistance in the Member States concerned the Commission shall on the basis of an indicative allocation of the total resources of the financial instrument, establish the commitment appropriations for each Member State. The indicative allocation shall principally be based on population, GNP per capita and surface area; it shall also take account of other socio-economic factors, such as deficiencies in transport infrastructure.

In order to facilitate the planning of assistance in the Member States concerned the Commission shall on the basis of an indicative allocation of the total resources of the financial instrument, establish the commitment appropriations for each Member State. The indicative allocation shall be based on objective statistical parameters which are to be made public by the Commission, such as population, GNP per capita and surface area.

(Amendment No 30)

Article 5(1)

- 1. The rate of assistance granted by the financial instrument shall be 80% to 85% of public or similar expenditure as defined for the purposes of the Structural Funds.
- 1. The rate of assistance granted by the financial instrument shall be 85% to 90% of public or similar expenditure as defined for the purposes of the Structural Funds.

(Amendment No 31)

Article 5(2)

- 2. Preliminary studies and technical support measures necessary for the implementation of eligible projects *may* be financed at 100%.
- 2. Preliminary studies and technical support measures necessary for the implementation of eligible projects shall be financed at 100% of their total cost.

(Amendment No 32)

Article 5(2a) (new)

2a. The effective rate of assistance shall be established in accordance with the nature of the operations to be undertaken and the budgetary constraints to which the Member State in question is subject.

(Amendment No 33)

Article 5a (new)

Article 5a

The indicative allocation between the eligible Member States shall be made within the following brackets: Spain 52 to 58% of the total, Greece: 16 to 20%, Portugal: 16 to 20%, Ireland: 7 to 10%.

(Amendment No 34)

Article 5b (new)

Article 5b

Community operations under the financial instrument shall be established through close consultation between the Commission and the Member State concerned. Consultation shall cover the preparation, financing, monitoring and evaluation of operations.

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

TEXT AMENDED BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

(Amendment No 35)

Article 6(1)

- 1. Projects financed by the financial instrument shall be in keeping with the provisions of the Treaties, with the instruments adopted pursuant thereto and with Community policies, including those concerning environmental protection, transport, competition and the award of public contracts.
- 1. Projects financed by the financial instrument shall be in keeping with the provisions of the Treaties, with the instruments adopted pursuant thereto and with Community policies, including those concerning environmental protection, nature conservancy, transport, competition and the award of public contracts. The Commission and the Member States shall ensure compatibility.

(Amendments Nos 36 and 64)

Article 6(2)

- 2. The Commission shall ensure coordination and coherence between projects undertaken in pursuance of this Regulation and measures undertaken with contributions from the Community budget, the EIB and the other financial instruments of the Community.
- 2. The Commission shall, within the framework of partnership, ensure coordination and coherence between projects undertaken in pursuance of this Regulation and measures undertaken with contributions from the Community budget, the EIB and the other financial instruments of the Community in coordination with the aims of the Structural Funds.

(Amendment No 39)

Article 8(2)

- 2. The Member States concerned and the Commission shall ensure an appropriate balance between projects in the fields of the environment and transport infrastructure.
- 2. The Member States concerned and the Commission shall, having regard to deficiencies in the fields in question and national priorities, ensure an appropriate balance between projects in the fields of the environment and transport infrastructure.

(Amendment No 40)

Article 8(2a) (new)

2a. The environmental costs of a transport infrastructure project shall be included in the overall cost of the project and may under no circumstances be financed separately from the amount earmarked for the environment.

(Amendments Nos 42 and 65)

Article 8(5)

- 5. The following criteria shall be employed to ensure the quality of the projects:
- their medium-term economic and social benefits, an assessment which shall be commensurate with the resources deployed; this shall be made in the light of an analysis of costs and benefits;
- 5. Some of the following criteria shall be employed to ensure the quality of the projects:
- their medium-term economic and social benefits, an assessment which shall be commensurate with the resources deployed; this shall be made in the light of an analysis of costs and benefits;
- appropriate coordination with the aims of the Structural Funds;

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

- the priorities established by the beneficiary Member States:
- the contribution which projects can make to the implementation of Community policies on the environment and trans-European networks;
- the compatibility of projects with Community policies and their consistency with other Community structural measures.

TEXT AMENDED BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

- the priorities established by the beneficiary Member States:
- the contribution which projects can make to the implementation of Community policies on the environment and trans-European networks;
- the compatibility of projects with Community policies and their consistency with other Community structural measures;
- the consistency of projects with the fundamental goal of sustainable development;
- the ability of projects to stimulate private investment and thereby make a real contribution to the GNP of the countries concerned;
- for transport projects, their compliance with the priority to be given to public transport and to the most environment-friendly modes of transport (rail and inland waterways).

(Amendment No 66)

Article 8(6)

- 6. Subject to the availability of commitment appropriations, the Commission shall decide on assistance from the financial instrument *generally* within three months of receipt of an application. Commission decisions approving projects or groups of related projects shall determine the amount of financial support, a financing plan and all the provisions and conditions necessary for the realization of the projects.
- 6. Subject to the availability of commitment appropriations, the Commission shall decide on assistance from the financial instrument within three months of receipt of an application. Commission decisions approving projects or groups of related projects shall determine the amount of financial support, a financing plan and all the provisions and conditions necessary for the realization of the projects in coordination with the aims of the Structural Funds.

(Amendment No 44)

Article 9

In implementing this Regulation, the Commission shall where appropriate and by analogy apply the relevant provisions of Titles VI and VII of Regulation (EEC) No 4253/88.

In implementing this Regulation, the Commission shall where appropriate and by analogy apply the relevant provisions of Titles VI and VII of Regulation (EEC) No 4253/88 concerning commitments, payments, use of the ecu, financial control, reduction, suspension and cancellation of assistance, monitoring and assessment.

The following special provisions shall apply:

- 1. after commitment of the first instalment, a second instalment may not be committed unless 60% of the first instalment has been implemented;
- 2. after the first advance has been paid, a second advance may not exceed 50% of that part of the committed instalment which is still to be utilized;

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

TEXT AMENDED BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

- 3. requests for payment of the balance shall contain detailed information on the eligibility of the operations, the ultimate beneficiaries and the progress achieved;
- 4. the annual report provided for in Article 16 of Regulation (EEC) No 2052/88 shall set out the results of the assessment of the action of the financial instrument, particularly as regards growth in GNP and structural progress in the transport and environment sectors of the States concerned;
- 5. the implementing Regulation shall make express provision for immediate suspension and recovery of sums lost through irregularity or negligence, in particular if a project proves to be incompatible with Community environmental policy. Unless the Member State and/or the authority responsible for implementation provide proof that the irregularity or negligence is not attributable to them, the Member State shall be ultimately responsible for reimbursement of the sums wrongly paid.

(Amendment No 45)

Article 10(1)

- 1. The Commission shall present an annual report on the activities of the financial instrument to the Council, the European Parliament and the Economic and Social Committee.
- 1. The Commission shall present an annual report on the activities of the financial instrument and on the monitoring and assessment of projects to the Council, the European Parliament, the Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions, as soon as it is established. The report shall set out in an annex the list and content of the projects selected by Member States.

The European Parliament shall deliver an opinion on the report as rapidly as possible. The Commission shall give details in the following annual report of measures taken in response to the comments made in Parliament's opinion.

(Amendment No 46)

Article 10(2)

- 2. Member States shall ensure that adequate publicity is given to the operations of the financial instrument with a view to making the general public aware of the role played by the Community in relation to projects. They shall consult the Commission on, and inform it about, the initiatives taken for this purpose.
- 2. Member States shall ensure that adequate publicity is given to the operations of the financial instrument with a view to making the general public aware of the role played by the Community in relation to projects. They shall consult the Commission on, and inform it about, the initiatives taken for this purpose. In particular, Member States shall ensure the placement of clearly visible signs indicating the percentage of the cost of a particular project being financed by the Cohesion Fund.

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

TEXT AMENDED BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

(Amendment No 47)

Article 10(2a) (new)

2a. The Commission and the Member States shall ensure freedom of access to information on projects to be financed by the financial instrument at all stages of planning, implementation and assessment.

(Amendment No 48)

Article 11

This Regulation shall be reexamined before 31 December 1993.

This Regulation shall be reexamined once the Treaty on European Union has been ratified.

(Amendment No 49)

Article 12, second paragraph

It shall remain in force for two years.

It shall remain in force until the entry into force of the Regulation governing the Cohesion Fund, which shall take over all the outstanding obligations of the financial instrument.

LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION A3-0085/93

Legislative resolution embodying the opinion of the European Parliament on the Commission proposal for a Council Regulation establishing a cohesion financial instrument.

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(92)0599) (1),
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 235 of the EEC Treaty (C3-0044/93),
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Regional Policy, Regional Planning and Relations with Regional and Local Authorities and the opinions of the Committee on Budgets, the Committee on Budgetary Control, the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy, the Committee on Transport and Tourism, the Committee on Energy, Research and Technology, the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection and the Committee on Institutional Affairs (A3-0085/93),
- 1. Approves the Commission proposal subject to Parliament's amendments and in accordance with the vote thereon;
- 2. Asks to be consulted again should the Council intend to make substantial modifications to the Commission proposal;
- 3. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and Commission.

⁽¹) OJ No C 38, 12.2.1993, p. 18.

7. Imports of beef and veal *

PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(92)0518 — C3-0033/93

The proposal was approved.

LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION A3-0069/93

Legislative resolution embodying the opinion of the European Parliament on the Commission proposal for a Council Regulation opening for 1993, as an autonomous measure, a special import tariff quota for high-quality fresh, chilled or frozen beef and veal falling within CN codes 0201 and 0202 and for products falling within CN codes 0206 10 95 and 0206 29 91

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(92)0518),
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 43 of the EEC Treaty (C3-0033/93),
- having regard to the report of the Committee on External Economic Relations and the opinions of the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development and the Committee on Budgets (A3-0069/93),
- 1. Approves the Commission proposal in accordance with the vote thereon;
- 2. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and Commission.

8. European Union

(a) **RESOLUTION A3-0041/93**

Resolution on the European Council report for 1991 on progress towards European Union

- having regard to the European Council report for 1991 on progress towards European Union (C3-0256/92 — SN 1928/1/92),
- having regard to the Treaty on European Union signed in Maastricht,
- having regard to its resolution of 14 October 1992 on the state of European Union and ratification of the Maastricht Treaty (1),
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Institutional Affairs and the opinion of the Committee on Culture, Youth, Education and the Media (A3-0041/93),
- 1. Notes that the Council's report on progress towards European Union merely reviews the year's activities and makes no effort to analyse the delays and shortcomings in the European integration process;

⁽¹) OJ No C 299, 16.11.1992, p. 8.

- 2. Stresses that the Treaty on European Union has given the Community integration process fresh impetus which will enable it to progress towards Union; notes that this impetus stems from the confidence generated by the Single Act, the prospect of a unified internal market in 1993 and the work of the Commission, Parliament and many Member States in the interinstitutional conferences;
- 3. Draws attention, nevertheless, to the significant shortcomings in the Treaty on European Union, whose structure, based on 'pillars', fails to incorporate into the EC Treaty the common foreign and security policy or cooperation in the spheres of justice and internal affairs; calls for the WEU to become part of the Union and for its activities to be subject to stronger parliamentary control:
- 4. Economic and Monetary Union:
- Welcomes the fact that the Treaty provides for the introduction of a single currency by 1999 at the latest and 1997 at the earliest, a step which would entail the conduct of a common monetary policy and the establishment of an independent European system of central banks; recommends the European Council to strengthen democratic control of EMU by greater transparency in decision-making procedures, by increased participation by the European Parliament and by negotiation of the necessary interinstitutional agreements;
- 5. Economic and social cohesion:
- Calls for the Cohesion Fund and for the proposals contained in the Delors II package to be implemented immediately and stresses that the Treaty stipulates that the Member States and the Community must conduct their policies with a view to achieving the objective of economic and social cohesion;
- 6. Ratification and application of the Treaty:
- Stresses once again the need for those Member States which have not yet done so to ratify the Treaty as it stands so that it can enter into force as soon as possible; emphasizes that, although the Maastricht Treaty displays minor internal contradictions, the experience gained with the application of the Single Act shows that everything will depend on the interpretation and, above all, practical day-to-day application of the Treaty;
- 7. Takes the view that substantial improvements can be achieved without amending the text of the Maastricht Treaty:
- (a) subsidiarity

 Notes that subsidiarity is primarily a philosophy which leaves scope for interpretation, but that the application of that philosophy must not lead to a dismantling of the Community acquis; stresses the need for the interinstitutional conference (Commission, Council and Parliament) which has already been called to be given a remit to frame the instruments needed to apply the subsidiarity principle, draw up an interinstitutional agreement on that principle, and lay down a requirement that the Commission should forward to the Council and Parliament a report on its implementation;
- (b) citizenship

 Notes that the granting of specific political rights to the citizens of the Union both inside (right to vote) and outside (diplomatic protection) its frontiers is one of the main achievements of the Maastricht Treaty; calls for the Treaty provisions governing citizens' rights, in particular the right to vote and stand for election, and their full participation in the European integration process to be implemented; takes the view that citizenship also covers the protection of fundamental rights and freedoms;
- (c) transparency and democracy of the Community legislative process Emphasizes that transparency and democracy will be enhanced by an annual legislative programme adopted by the three institutions (Council, Commission, Parliament) and which must be made public, a political undertaking by the Council not to adopt legislative texts previously rejected by Parliament, and the effective and regular consolidation of Community law in order to make it more accessible to Community citizens;

8. Comitology:

 Deplores the fact that the Council, when granting the Commission implementing powers, tends to make use of committees which guarantee it a particularly broad measure of control over the measures proposed by the Commission, and stresses the need for the 'comitology' system to be simplified to ward off the danger of a renationalization of common policies;

9. Classification of Community acts:

— Takes the view that it is absolutely vital to define clearly the nature of Community acts; notes that the current classification gives rise to confusion as to the respective roles of the legislature and executive in the Community; calls for a clear classification of Community acts to be introduced which distinguishes between constitutional acts, budgetary acts, legislative acts and implementing measures;

10. Information policy:

Notes the need for the institutions to revise their information policy and takes the view that certain recently observed public attitudes stem from the lack of information on the benefits deriving from the Community and the Maastricht Treaty; takes the view that the Community and national authorities must share responsibility for information policy;

11. National parliaments:

 Points out once again that the national parliaments play a vital role in the democratization of the Community and stresses their responsibility for monitoring the incorporation of Community law into national law;

12. The Commission:

— Considers that the independence of the Commission is fundamental to its proper functioning;

13. The Council:

- Urges the Council to discuss legislation in public;
- 14. Considers that Council deliberations in public will allow national parliaments and citizens to monitor their government representatives in the Council;
- 15. Urges the members of the Council to display a greater collective responsibility in their public utterances, which would serve to make public opinion in the Member States more favourable to Community policies;

16. European Council:

 Regards it as essential that the European Council should retain and consolidate its role as a provider of stimuli and guidelines;

17. Internal market:

— Notes with concern that certain key proposals for the completion of the internal market were not adopted in time to be incorporated into national law before 31 December 1992 (e.g. proposals relating to the free movement of persons and indirect taxation); deplores the fact that, according to the last Commission report on the implementation of the White Paper on the completion of the internal market, in August 1992, 25% of measures adopted had still to be incorporated into the national law of the Member States;

18. External borders, right of asylum, visas:

Deplores the fact that the Member States have still not reached agreement on the application
of the convention on checks at the Community's external borders; also deplores that there
has been no progress towards the harmonization of policies on immigration and the right of
asylum;

19. Monetary instability:

— Considers that the recent instability in the money markets demonstrates that socio-economic cohesion and coordination of the economic and financial policies of the Member States is needed more than ever before; deplores the inadequate reaction of the Council and the Commission to the crisis; considers that multilateral supervision should be strengthened and more efficient means should be adopted to fight against speculation and its destabilizing effects:

20. External economic relations:

 Points out the need to reach a global, fair, and balanced agreement within GATT in order to strengthen multilateral trading systems and trade patterns; stresses the need for the Uruguay Round to be brought to a speedy conclusion, on condition that all the parties involved make equivalent concessions;

21. European Economic Area:

— Welcomes the forthcoming establishment of the European Economic Area, which will be the world's largest integrated economic market; stresses, however, that the agreement does not go as far as to set up a customs union or a single market covering all the 18 countries involved and does not provide for a common external trade policy;

22. Environment:

 Deprecates the Council's failure to reach a decision on the seat of the European Environment Agency, thus delaying its establishment, and warns that it will oppose implacably any renationalization of environmental and consumer protection policies under the pretext of subsidiarity;

23. Credibility of foreign policy:

 Deplores the fact that the Member States let slip an excellent opportunity to draw up and follow, in the spirit of the Maastricht Treaty, a common policy on the conflict in the former Yugoslavia; notes that this lack of unity has helped to turn public opinion against the Treaty;

24. Regular debates on European Union:

- Stresses the need to consider on a regular basis current problems connected with the establishment of European Union and to deliver an opinion on those problems;
- 25. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission and the governments and parliaments of the Member States.

(b) **RESOLUTION A3-0040/93**

Resolution on the European Council report on progress towards European Union

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the report on progress towards European Union in 1991 activities within the framework of external relations and political cooperation — which the European Council forwarded to Parliament (C3-0256/92 — SN 1928/1/92),
- having regard to the conclusions of the Edinburgh European Council of 11/12 December 1992,
- having regard to its resolution of 18 December 1992 on the establishment of the European Community's common foreign policy (1),
- having regard to the Treaty on European Union,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Foreign Affairs and Security (A3-0040/93),

⁽¹⁾ Minutes of that sitting, Part II, Item 4.

- A. whereas in 1991 Community action in the field of external policy mainly consisted of a series of responses to events occurring on the international scene, rather than an organized approach designed to achieve common objectives,
- B. deploring the inefficiency of Community action with reference to crises in particular geographical areas, especially in former Yugoslavia,
- C. convinced that strengthening of the Community presence in some parts of the world would make an important contribution to international peace and security,
- D. whereas there is a need to make full use of the instruments contained in the Treaty on Union without waiting for it to be ratified,
- E. whereas the objectives of the common foreign and security policy set out in the Maastricht Treaty may form the basis of a policy in line with the interests of the citizens of the Union, if implemented democratically and fully integrated into the Community system,
- 1. Considers that the actions taken in the sphere of external relations and political cooperation in 1991 were not sufficiently effective to contribute to the protection of the Community's interests;
- 2. Notes the progress achieved through the signing of the Treaty on European Union and hopes that the effectiveness of Community foreign policy will be strengthened thereby,
- 3. Confirms the advisability of including foreign and security policy in the Community's terms of reference, making it subject to fully democratic and controllable decision-making procedures;
- 4. Approves the foreign policy declarations adopted at the Edinburgh European Council and hopes that the Community will confirm its solidarity and play a more important part in international relations, especially in the prevention of conflicts;
- 5. Deplores, however, the decisions adopted at Edinburgh in so far as they allow one of the Member States to refrain from participating in actions in the field of security, thus undermining the consistency and cohesion needed in the design and implementation of the common foreign policy;
- 6. Welcomes the reorganization of the Commission to address common foreign and security policy issues and decisions in greater depth;
- 7. Believes that the provisions concerning a common foreign and security policy should under no circumstances call into question the existing mechanisms for dealing with the external aspects of Community policies, which must be implemented normally and in compliance with the prerogatives of the European Parliament;
- 8. Reaffirms that the Community's foreign policy must be designed to promote security and disarmament and to uphold human and minority rights as well as international law and UN resolutions;
- 9. Reaffirms that the common foreign and security policy must be implemented in strict compliance and close coordination with the existing mechanisms for dealing with the external aspects of Community competences (environment policy, ACP/EEC Joint Assembly, agricultural policy, scientific and technological research, economic and social cohesion, etc.);
- 10. Considers that the Member States should encourage the process of reform of the United Nations and its bodies, particularly the Security Council, in order to strengthen the Community's ability to influence the work of the UN;
- 11. Considers that the current international situation demands united participation by the Member States in the CSCE and the UN, and that, where necessary and possible, measures to formulate and implement strategies and action to maintain international peace and security must be taken by the European Community jointly with these organizations;

- 12. Believes that the Community and its Member States should play a more active and constructive role at international level and that political action should be aimed primarily at the prevention of conflict;
- 13. Considers it essential to promote the development of less advanced countries in order to eliminate sources of tension which could jeopardize international peace and security;
- 14. Calls on the Commission and Council to proceed without delay with the initiatives to implement the European Economic Area, which represents one of the pillars of the new European structure and a factor in the prosperity of the peoples of the states concerned;
- 15. Reaffirms that any form of association, partnership or cooperation with third countries must be based on full compliance by the latter with the principles of the CSCE;
- 16. Considers that the time has come to take decisive and vigorous action to put a definitive end to the current conflict in the former Yugoslavia; to this end the embargo must be strengthened by adopting sanctions against countries which do not respect it;
- 17. Asks the Council and Commission to prepare the legal and political framework for relations with the Czech and Slovak Republics as soon as possible, on the understanding that these two new states must be considered on an equal footing as regards the conclusion of association agreements with the Community;
- 18. Is of the opinion that the phase of emergency aid to Russia must now be replaced by structural measures to put an end to the emergency and create the conditions for transition to a market economy, without jeopardizing the democratic change that is under way;
- 19. Is convinced that greater involvement by the Community in the Middle East peace process could favour the interests of all the parties in question and promote European interests throughout the Mediterranean region; in this respect recalls its previous resolutions on the creation of a Conference on Security and Cooperation in the Mediterranean (CSCM);
- 20. Considers it necessary to create the conditions for genuine dialogue with the United States on the basis of equality; is of the opinion that the principal decisions on maintaining international peace and security and on intervention for humanitarian ends must be taken jointly with the United States and in full agreement with the United Nations;
- 21. Calls on the Council and Commission to strengthen the Community presence in the Far East in the light of the strategic and economic importance of the region; considers it advisable to hold talks with the Chinese Government and to bring strong pressure to bear to ensure that the fundamental rights of all Chinese citizens are finally guaranteed; with regard to Tibetan citizens in particular, calls for an end to all forms of repression, the resumption of talks with the Dalai Lama and consideration of some form of self-determination;
- 22. Repeats that the protection of human and minority rights must be an essential condition for any form of cooperation between the Community and non-member countries;
- 23. Supports the initiatives to create a right of humanitarian intervention and considers that the Community must assume a pioneering role in this area;
- 24. Takes the view that the Council's annual report was inadequately planned and drafted in relation to Parliament's expectations and the spirit of the Solemn Declaration of Stuttgart, in so far as it merely repeats the content of the declarations adopted by EPC without providing a general picture of Community activity and does not in any way respond to the positions adopted by Parliament; is convinced, moreover, that the report would be of greater interest if such aspects as geographic and chronological accuracy had been respected;

- 25. Calls on the Council to include the annual report as part of the application of Article J7 of the Treaty on European Union in future; points out that the annual report is the main instrument for providing Parliament with information on foreign policy, to enable the debate specified in the same article to take place;
- 26. Asks to be consulted by the Council with regard to the report on Joint Action and the Development of the Common Foreign and Security Policy in the Field of Security, adopted by the Council on 7 December 1992;
- 27. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, European Political Cooperation and the governments of the Member States.

9. Human rights in the Community

RESOLUTION A3-0025/93 and A3-0025/93/suppl.

Resolution on respect for human rights in the European Community (annual report of the European Parliament)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights,
- having regard to the United Nations Covenants on Civil and Political Rights and on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the protocols thereto,
- having regard to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms and its protocols,
- having regard to its resolution of 12 April 1989 adopting the Declaration of fundamental rights and freedoms (1),
- having regard to the principles deriving from international and European human rights standards,
- having regard to its resolution of 12 March 1992 on the death penalty (2),
- having regard to its resolution of 13 October 1989 on conscientious objection and alternative civilian service (3),
- having regard to the Treaties establishing the European Community,
- having regard to the Treaty on European Union,
- having regard to the general principles of law common to all the Member States,
- having regard to the Joint Declaration of 5 April 1977 by Parliament, the Council and the Commission on fundamental rights,
- having regard to the Joint Declaration of 11 June 1986 by Parliament, the Council, the representatives of the Member States meeting within the Council and the Commission on racism and xenophobia,
- having regard to the European Charter of Fundamental Social Rights,
- having regard to its resolution of 29 October 1982 on the memorandum from the Commission on the accession of the European Communities to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (4),

⁽¹) OJ No C 120, 16.5.1989, p. 51.

⁽²⁾ OJ No C 94, 13.4.1992, p. 277. (3) OJ No C 291, 20.11.1989, p. 122.

⁽⁴⁾ OJ No C 304, 22.11.1982, p. 253.

- having regard to the Commission communication of 19 November 1990 on Community accession to the European Convention on Human Rights,
- having regard to its resolution of 9 July 1991 on human rights (1),
- having regard to the case law of the Court of Justice of the European Communities,
- having regard to Rule 121 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs and the opinion of the Committee on Culture, Youth, Education and the Media (A3-0025/93 and A3-0025/93/suppl.),
- A. whereas respect for human rights is the foundation of democracy and constitutes a basic principle of Community integration,
- B. having regard to Community action to promote human rights in the world,
- having regard to the principle of interference on humanitarian grounds, as recognized by the international community in UN Security Council Resolution No 688,
- D. deeply concerned by the rise in racism and xenophobia and in particular the acts of racist violence committed against foreign communities in a number of Member States,
- E. whereas in certain Member States and in European scientific bodies there is discrimination on grounds of trade union and party membership and whereas the rights of trade union delegates are restricted,
- F. whereas jurisdiction over respect for human rights in the Member States lies with national courts and the relevant organs of the Council of Europe,
- G. whereas up to now, Community law, the common legal principles of the Member States and the rules of international law have provided protection of fundamental rights against the actions of Community institutions and bodies,
- H. whereas, however, there are no specific checks on whether human rights are respected in Community law,
- whereas there is no body of law setting out the fundamental rights of European citizens and guaranteeing protection of those rights within the Community legal order,
- J. whereas certain groups of people, including women, children, the disabled, the elderly, detainees, internees, those placed in institutions, itinerant persons and foreigners, are especially vulnerable and insufficiently well organized to assert their rights and to defend their fundamental freedoms; whereas legal assistance, legal protection and the judicial process and information about them are not sufficiently accessible to such groups, *inter alia* because of the high costs, the complexity and the inappropriateness of the system,

General principles

1. Takes the view that the abolition of internal frontiers under the Single European Act, and the provisions for intergovernmental cooperation in the fields of justice and home affairs in the Treaty on European Union, reinforce the need for clear and readily available judicial processes against breaches of human rights in each Member State, under the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights, in advance of the establishment of a Community system for the protection of human rights;

⁽¹) OJ No C 240, 16.9.1991, p. 45.

- 2. Considers that the extension of the Community's powers and the processes of economic integration and their consequences require on-going parallel checks to be made on the degree of protection for basic human rights, which can be fully ensured only if the Community institutions draw up and implement a real 'action programme on basic human rights' in consultation with the appropriate bodies of the Council of Europe;
- 3. Believes that such an action programme should include a set of legislative, political and monitoring measures relating to the impact of the integration process on human rights (social, economic, environmental and consumer rights, rights *vis-à-vis* the authorities), the questions raised by new technologies (bioethics, freedom of information and the protection of personal data) and areas which call for special measures (children and citizens from outside the Community);
- 4. Recalls the absolute principle of the universality of human rights; considers, nevertheless, that because of their colour, ethnic or national affiliations, sex or sexual preferences, age, physical handicaps, religion, philosophical or moral beliefs, certain individuals may be more likely to suffer a violation of their human rights than others; calls, therefore, for particular attention to be paid to such persons;
- 5. Takes the view that, in particular as a result of the implementation (in the Schengen Accords and through the work of specific intergovernmental groups) of an extensive and complex system of 'compensatory measures' to deal with the abolition of internal frontiers, the establishment of a system for protecting and safeguarding human rights is urgently needed;
- 6. Considers also that, given the increasing complexity of the Community legal order, the adoption of a basic instrument aimed at guaranteeing fundamental rights in areas covered by Community law will ensure greater transparency for European citizens;

A Community system for the protection of human rights

- 7. Calls on the Commission to draw up an action programme for a consistent and coordinated human rights policy and, to this end, to produce a White Paper;
- 8. Calls on the Commission and the Council to issue a Joint Declaration supporting the European Parliament's Declaration of fundamental rights and freedoms, for inclusion on the agenda for future intergovernmental conferences with a view to its incorporation in the Treaties;
- 9. Expresses the wish that the Community will rapidly enter into negotiations with a view to its accession to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms and accordingly calls on the Commission to submit the relevant proposal for a decision to Parliament;
- 10. Calls on the Commission to develop a coherent and coordinated Community human rights policy, by drawing up a White Paper on such a Community policy;
- 11. Stresses that the Community must ensure that human rights are respected in the Member States in order to lend maximum credibility to its commitment to human rights in the rest of the world;
- 12. Calls on the Community and the Member States to create a structure in which attention is paid to the protection and promotion of human rights within the Community and to combating racism and xenophobia, with a view to joint action being taken against the Member States concerned;
- 13. Acknowledges that including references to human rights conventions in cooperation agreements with third countries forms a legal basis for the partner countries to use to encourage the Community to act against violations of human rights on its own territory;

- 14. Proposes, to that end, that a clause be included in the agreements concluded by the Community stipulating that relations between the Community and the country or countries concerned as well as all the provisions of the agreement in question are to be based on respect for the democratic principles and human rights which inspire the domestic and international policies both of the Community and of the country or countries concerned and 'which constitute and essential element of the agreement';
- 15. Proposes further that, in the preamble to the agreement in question a general reference should be made to respect for human rights and democratic values as well as references to the universal and/or regional instruments common to both parties;
- 16. Proposes, finally, that all agreements concluded by the Community should include an express suspensory clause ('Baltic clause') and a general non-implementation clause in the event of serious breaches of human rights;
- 17. Considers that it is the responsibility of the European Parliament to promote fundamental rights and freedoms and to help to improve their protection in respect of citizens of the Union, and all nationals of third countries;
- 18. Decides to include on its agenda for its plenary sessions topical and urgent issues relating to the respect for human rights within the Community, on a par with human rights issues outside the Community;
- 19. Instructs its Committee on the Rules of Procedure to amend the procedure for considering urgent motions for resolutions to bring it into line with its powers with regard to human rights within the EC;
- 20. Undertakes, as a representative body, to speak out on cases of human rights violations within the Community;
- 21. Instructs its appropriate committees to take up important issues related to human rights policy and practice in the Member States with the governments concerned, which may include sending delegations to carry out on-the-spot investigations;
- 22. Recommends that legal entities (associations) should also have the right to bring proceedings before the Court of Human Rights;

Poverty and economic, social and cultural rights

- 23. Deplores the fact that the problem of poverty in Europe is widespread and worsening, and the fact that ever-larger sections of society are falling below the poverty line which is a *de facto* barrier to the enjoyment of fundamental rights; calls on the Commission to study the causes and extent of poverty in the Community and to propose to the European Parliament and the Council measures to improve the situation of those concerned;
- 24. Considers that economic, social and cultural rights recognized at international level as fundamental rights, i.e. the effective enjoyment of those rights must be recognized and guaranteed for each individual, even though they are in many cases only defined as part of a programme, should enjoy the same level of protection as civil and political rights, given the indivisibility and interdependence of all human rights and fundamental freedoms;
- 25. Believes therefore that the Community and the Member States should unreservedly ratify and apply the Council of Europe's social charter, that they should respect the international conventions and recommendations of the ILO, and that the Government of the United Kingdom should without delay sign the agreement on social policy appended to the Maastricht Treaty;

- 26. Recommends that a system be devised which provides minimum guarantees in respect of housing, income, social aid, health care and legal aid essential to leading a life in keeping with human dignity; such a system should be accessible in particular to the disadvantaged sections of the population and to non-EC citizens legally resident on Community territory; considers that emergency medical care and legal aid should also be accessible to non-EC citizens on the territory of the Community;
- 27. Considers that the codification of economic, social and cultural rights is not in itself sufficient and that, as the process of pauperization is structural in nature, it must be coupled with sustained action, readily accessible to the most disadvantaged members of society, to tackle the root of the problem;
- 28. Believes that full participation by disadvantaged persons in the drawing up, monitoring and evaluation of measures in their favour would be an additional guarantee of efficiency and relevance;
- 29. Supports, therefore, measures to promote self-sufficiency activities of the NGOs as part of an integrated policy to combat poverty, involving the Community and the Member States;
- 30. Believes it is essential to inform the people of Europe and especially young people of the nature and extent of poverty, in particular by drawing up educational programmes for schools on human rights;
- 31. Expresses its support for the efforts of all those in the Community and throughout the world who refuse to accept the violation of human rights which poverty constitutes, and calls for the General Assembly of the United Nations to proclaim 17 October as World Day of Opposition to Poverty;

Racism, xenophobia and discrimination

- 32. Expresses its condemnation of the growing intolerance in Europe towards foreigners, non-EC citizens and persons belonging to minority social groups and roundly condemns acts of openly racist and fascist violence perpetrated in the name of this ideology and, in general, any action liable to be a vehicle for such ideology or to encourage racist behaviour, in particular amongst young people; also expresses its solidarity with all victims of racism and xenophobia;
- 33. Also expresses its deep concern at the discrimination against, or marginalization of, persons constituting some other form of 'otherness': the physically or mentally handicapped and people belonging to a (non-) religious, ethnic, linguistic or sexual minority;
- 34. Proposes that a European media campaign be launched by the EC institutions with a view to supporting the struggle against these forms of intolerance and aimed at encouraging initiatives and measures taken at national, regional and local levels;
- 35. Makes an urgent appeal to the governments of the Member States and the Community authorities to guarantee the protection of foreign communities against racist and fascist violence and to work towards improving their living, housing and working conditions;
- 36. Calls on the governments of the Member States and the Community authorities to step up the struggle against racism and xenophobia, in particular by adopting and, where appropriate, strengthening legislation against racism and xenophobia, monitoring the application of such legislation and granting legal entities and associations the right to institute proceedings against acts of a racist nature and to act as civil party in such proceedings;
- 37. Calls on the Council and the Commission to organize forthwith a consistent and integrated campaign against racism and xenophobia as part of the social policy and policy of cooperation in the fields of judicial and home affairs and immigration;
- 38. Stresses the urgent need for such action, which should be accompanied by a European campaign of awareness of the right to be different and respect for fundamental freedoms, to be targeted at young people and adolescents;

39. Instructs its competent committee to draw up new reports on the question of racism and xenophobia, with particular reference to the causes of the revival in right-wing extremism and xenophobia, and to draw up structural proposals aimed at tackling the underlying causes;

Death penalty

- 40. Notes that the death penalty is no longer applied in the Community;
- 41. Reaffirms that the right to life and the right not to be subjected to inhuman or degrading treatment are absolute and inviolable rights, which may not be left to the discretion of states;
- 42. Calls on the Member States in which the death penalty is still in force to abolish it;
- 43. Calls on the Member States which have not yet done so to accede to and/or ratify Protocol 6 to the European Convention on Human Rights and Protocol 2 to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights;
- 44. Welcomes the recent ratification by Luxembourg of Protocol 2 to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, which seeks to abolish the death penalty;
- 45. Calls on the Member States to adopt legally binding measures which prohibit the extradition of any accused person liable to the death sentence in a third country;

Conscientious objection

- 46. Considers that the right of conscientious objection, as recognized by Resolution 89/59 of the UN Commission on Human Rights on conscientious objection against military service, should be incorporated as a fundamental right in the legal systems of the Member States;
- 47. Notes, however, that this right is not included in any international human rights agreement and therefore falls within the sovereign power of each State;
- 48. Calls for common principles to be defined with a view to eliminating discrimination between European citizens with respect to military service;
- 49. Considers that these common principles should include minimum guarantees to ensure that:
- sufficient information is made available on conscientious objector status,
- conscientious objector status can be applied for at any time, including during military service.
- an effective means of appeal is made available should the conscientious objector status be refused;
- 50. Condemns the trials and imprisonment of conscientious objectors in the Member States, many of whom have been regarded as prisoners of conscience by Amnesty International;
- 51. Stresses that an alternative civilian service should be provided for, of the same length as military service, so that it is not seen as a sanction or deterrent;
- 52. Encourages the introduction at Community level of alternatives to military service as part of Third World development aid programmes or assistance cooperation with the countries of Eastern Europe;
- 53. Condemns, in particular, the practice in Greece which treats conscientious objectors as criminals and condemns them to long periods of imprisonment in military prisons;

Threats to the rule of law

- 54. Notes the widespread and serious attacks on the rule of law, democracy and human rights resulting from organized crime and organized financial and economic crime, in particular because of its close links with politics, economics and the civil service, and also because of large-scale tax evasion and avoidance which represent significant losses to ordinary people, notably in social and economic terms;
- 55. Considers that these activities also constitute an obstacle to the enjoyment of the freedom of establishment and freedom to provide services in the Community;
- 56. Points out that, given the international scale of organized crime and organized economic and financial crime, and the opening of borders within the Community, this cooperation must be developed if measures to combat organized crime and organized economic and financial offences are to be effective;
- 57. Regrets that the work carried out at Community level to develop police cooperation (Europol) and take joint measures against organized crime and organized financial and economic crime in general (Trevi III) pays insufficient attention to the principles of democracy and the rule of law, and in particular accountability to Parliament and the courts, and regrets that such work will apparently remain outside the remit of the Community;
- 58. Considers that, together with police cooperation, in order to ensure that measures are effective while preserving the guarantees underlying democratic systems, legal cooperation should be developed and stepped up, starting with certain welcome innovations contained in the Schengen accords (extradition for financial and fiscal fraud and on the basis of the provisions of Title VI of the Treaty of Maastricht);
- 59. Also considers that, in order to deal adequately with the special characteristics of a criminal world which is now organized on an international scale, a common legal area should be established by passing important common standard criminal laws to complement and form part of a legal area based on the principles of cooperation, extradition, the *non bis in idem* principle and the international enforcement of sentences;
- 60. Calls on the Member States to take all the necessary measures in the fight against the Mafia and other forms of organized crime to restore respect for the rule of law within their territories in order to ensure that fundamental rights and freedoms are guaranteed and actually enjoyed;
- 61. Considers that a long-term campaign against crime organized on an international scale, especially organized economic and financial crime, must also include measures to increase awareness of the problem among European citizens and international public opinion;
- 62. Undertakes, in this connection, to denounce unequivocally and wherever necessary any threats to the rule of law;

Double jeopardy

- 63. Believes that the practice adopted by certain Member States of deporting non-Community citizens after they have been convicted and have served a sentence may lead to an individual being punished twice for the same offence;
- 64. Considers that the authority of *res judicata* and the principle of individual freedom, which together form the basis of the *non bis in idem* rule in criminal law, are among the general principles of law;
- 65. Believes that the principle of free movement within the Community should be accompanied by general recognition of the *non bis in idem* rule in order to eliminate the possibility of double jeopardy in the Community;

Right of asylum

66. Regrets the fact that several Member States have begun progressively to reduce legal protection and social security for asylum seekers;

- 67. Regrets the intergovernmental nature of initial measures taken to harmonize the status of nationals of third countries in the Community, adopted under agreements signed between the Member States to deal with the consequences of the abolition of intra-Community frontiers;
- 68. Deplores the fact that these measures contain no guarantees relating to the protection of fundamental rights, in particular with regard to asylum seekers;
- 69. Wishes to draw attention to the danger that Europe may set itself up as a fortress if non-Community nationals are discriminated against in terms of the principles on which the Community order is based;
- 70. Believes that the procedures for examining requests for asylum should initially be harmonized on the basis of fundamental rules of fair and humane treatment, as established by the 1951 Geneva Convention and further elaborated in the Conclusions adopted by the UNHCR Executive Committee and Recommendation R(81)16 of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe;
- 71. Calls on the Member States to ensure strict compliance with these international agreements and, in particular, to put an end to the irregularities, abuse and contravention of the procedures on arrival in the host country, immediately following the first application for asylum; the immediate repatriation of applicants for asylum and the refusal to provide legal assistance when such applicants are first questioned constitute serious violations of human rights as set out in international agreements;
- 72. Calls on the Community and the Member States to adopt an international agreement on minimum standards for fair and satisfactory asylum procedures, which would provide the Member States with a uniform legal basis for the examination of asylum claims, enhance their capacity to achieve effective harmonization of their asylum policies, and set a clear standard against which to measure asylum procedures and practice in host third countries to which asylum-seekers may be sent;
- 73. Calls on the Commission to consider whether a supranational body could be set up to be responsible, at Community level and in cooperation with the UNHCR, for giving its opinion on final decisions to reject asylum applications;
- 74. Urges that Article K9 of the Treaty on European Union be utilized as early and as widely as possible and in any event as envisaged in the Declaration on Asylum attached to the said Treaty;

Emergency criminal laws

- 75. Believes that emergency criminal laws may give rise to cases of abuse and arbitrary interpretations since they imply increasing the police's discretionary powers to the detriment of judicial investigations and procedural guarantees and that as a consequence there should be guarantees to prevent such potential abuse and that provision must be made for judicial and parliamentary reviews;
- 76. Considers in any case that even if conditions indicating an exceptional and serious situation leading to the adoption of special criminal laws have been fulfilled, strict arrangements must be made to ensure that these are temporary;
- 77. Considers, at all events, that a number of guarantees must be provided for the purposes of respecting fundamental rights, in accordance with the principles of democracy and of international law, namely:
- respect for the principle of presumption of innocence,
- respect for the rights of the defence so as to avoid, in particular, the reversal of the burden of proof,
- clarity of law,
- respect for the principle that laws may not be applied retroactively,
- respect for the principle of proportionality,

- respect for the physical and psychological integrity of persons in custody or charged with an offence.
- the need for an official search warrant,
- the protection of personal data;
- 78. Calls on those Member States which have introduced emergency criminal proceedings or which have actually introduced a state of emergency at regional level to abandon such procedures and, in particular, to introduce a ban on solitary confinement;

Conditions of detention

- 79. Considers that it is essential to stress the idea of the reformatory function of the sentence and the aim of reintegrating prisoners as human beings and members of society;
- 80. Reasserts firmly the absolute nature of the ban on inhuman and degrading treatment;
- 81. Utterly condemns the use of torture and inhuman or degrading treatment and expresses its dismay at the fact that such practices are used in Europe during police questioning and in prisons and believes that, where such practices are directed at immigrants, applicants for asylum or persons belonging to minority groups, they may set a dangerous precedent for racial discrimination and xenophobia, since they are applied by representatives of the legal authorities;
- 82. Recalls that, by virtue of the principle of presumption of innocence, any pre-trial detention decision should be based on legitimate and exceptional reasons; accordingly, regards as arbitrary the use of detention on remand as a general rule;
- 83. Questions whether the resources made available to prison administrations are adequate for guaranteeing living conditions in keeping with human dignity, given the overcrowding and lack of hygiene reported in certain detention centres;
- 84. Considers that detainees must enjoy at least the following fundamental rights:
- the right to privacy;
- the right to dignity and to physical and moral inviolability;
- the right to receive visits and mail;
- the right to health and hygienic conditions;
- the right to receive legal and social assistance, with particular reference to reintegration into society;
- 85. Calls for the police code of ethics to be based on respect for human rights;
- 86. Instructs its appropriate committee to draw up a European draft code of conduct for the police based on international criteria such as those set out in the UN Code of Conduct for law enforcement officials;
- 87. Welcomes the fact that an additional protocol on the rights of persons deprived of their liberty is being prepared at the Council of Europe;
- 88. Calls on the Member States which have introduced emergency measures in respect of criminal offences and which actually apply emergency proceedings to specific regions to keep the period of detention without trial to a minimum in accordance with Article 5(3) of the European Convention on Human Rights and court rulings based on that Article;

Length of proceedings

- 89. Is aware of the general lengthiness of judicial proceedings in Europe;
- 90. Believes that, apart from the danger of leading to a denial of justice, excessive delays in the field of justice have unforeseen consequences and undermine the fairness of proceedings;

91. Calls for the concept of a reasonable time limit, as protected by the European Convention on Human Rights, to be introduced into the national legal orders, and calls on the Member States to consider how to cut down procedural delays;

Acquisition and/or retention of nationality

- 92. Expresses its concern with regard to Article 19 of the Greek Nationality Code which, without any legal basis and in defiance of international commitments, is used to deprive members of the Muslim minority of their Greek citizenship if they leave the country with the 'intention' of not returning;
- 93. Considers that freedom of movement and the extension of European citizenship call for the replacement of the principle of 'ius sanguinis' by the principle of 'ius soli' as a basis for citizenship;
- 94. Considers, in general terms, that obstacles to the acquisition of nationality are a source of discrimination which is unjustified in present-day Europe;
- 95. Reaffirms that the exercise of the fundamental right to leave any country and return to one's country may not be penalized by the withdrawal of citizenship rights;

Political and trade union discrimination

- 96. Condemns the excessive number of infringements of trade union rights and the rights of trade union officials in many Member States and certain European scientific bodies and calls for such practices to be terminated through the recognition of trade union freedom as a fundamental right in all Member States and all European scientific bodies;
- 97. Deplores in particular the unilateral denunciation of long-term collective agreements, denial of the right of elected trade union representatives to information about business management, denial of the right of workers to be represented in connection with complaints or disciplinary measures, and failure on the part of employers to consult trade union representatives about questions concerning surplus personnel, health and safety;
- 98. Expresses its concern at the fact that, in one Member State in particular, numerous cases have arisen in which there was a failure to apply the legal principles, applicable in a constitutional State, of the presumption of innocence and of a verdict of not guilty if no clear proof of the accused's guilt is adduced;
- 99. Condemns the unilateral removal of trade union rights from the workers at GCHQ in the United Kingdom;
- 100. Wishes, in general terms, to draw attention to the fact that any administrative sanction must result from an investigation that is sufficiently thorough and demonstrates expertise and compliance with the laws and constitutional principles without regard to individual political positions so as to avoid arbitrary decisions;
- 101. Considers that administrative investigations in the FRG do not adequately meet these conditions because the introduction of the criterion of 'proximity to the state', measured in terms of active involvement in the SED, in mass organizations and substantive or honorary positions in the state, the economy and in society, means that decisions are clearly politically biased;
- 102. Expresses its concern, in this connection, at the dismissal of academics and civil servants in general, and the investigations and accusations against lawyers and solicitors and in political circles in the former GDR, which are being carried out in defiance of the law and without prior examination and are an infringement of the freedom of expression and of opinion (1);

⁽¹) See motion for a resolution by Mr Piquet and others on police searches in PDS offices in the new Länder on 24 February 1992 (B3-0464/92).

- 103. Remains concerned at the dismissal of public service employees, in particular school and university teachers, the unjustified restrictions on access to public service and the refusal to take into account time worked in the public service in assessing a person's working life or calculating pensions;
- 104. Is also concerned at the lack of coherence of administrative penalties and measures adopted by the United Kingdom to abolish subsidies to certain social and cultural associations and groups in Northern Ireland and to slash the budgets for institutions permitting minorities to express their opinions;
- 105. Is concerned at the risk of abuse of power arising wherever an administrative measure aimed at countering or punishing a specific act is applied generally;

European legal assistance

- 106. Reiterates its disapproval of the intergovernmental nature of work in certain areas of common interest (justice, home affairs, immigration policy) following the opening up of frontiers:
- 107. Believes that mechanisms created in this context should be subject to monitoring by courts of law and that access to such monitoring should be guaranteed to those concerned in the form of legal assistance which should be organized at Community level;

Respect for privacy

- 108. Notes that, in view of the completion of the internal market, the need of transborder traffic, including the exchange of personal and other privacy-related data, has increased significantly;
- 109. Points out that the unrestricted exchange of personal and other privacy-related data poses an unprecedented threat to the right to privacy;
- 110. Considers that harmonization of privacy legislation among the Member States is urgently needed;
- 111. Reconfirms the need to adopt a Council Directive with the aim of securing the harmonized adaptation of national legislation;
- 112. Considers that harmonization of legislation should be directed towards acquiring a high level of privacy protection within the Community, without lowering the standards achieved in some Member States;
- 113. Welcomes the proposals of the Commission as submitted to the Council in October 1992;
- 114. Calls upon the Council to review these proposals in due course and to adopt a privacy Directive without delay;

Protection of personal integrity

- 115. Calls on the Member States to amend their legislation with a view to granting greater protection to individuals with particular regard to the trade in human organs, possible abuses of genetic engineering, human exploitation, sexual abuse, forced sterilization and any other form of physical or mental abuse of human beings;
- 116. Expresses its deep concern at the increase in medical tests and controls carried out without any objective justification, and sometimes without the consent of the persons concerned, which are used as a selection criterion for access to employment, private or social insurance and housing etc., and which are a flagrant example of discrimination;

Motions for resolutions incorporated in this annual report

- Believes that the principle of the presumption of innocence and the guarantee of fair procedures are essential preconditions for a fair penal code which respects the principle of non-discrimination before the law (1);
- Reiterates that the freedom of peaceful assembly as set out in Article 11 of the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms protects the right of collective defence of interests organized through trade unions democratically constituted at the place of work (2);
- Believes that the ban on inhuman or degrading treatment is absolute in nature and deplores the situation of certain refugees on Community territory, despite international commitments in this field;
- Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, the governments and parliaments of the Member States and to the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, the Council of Europe's Human Rights Committee, the Executive Committee of Amnesty International and to the governments and parliaments of the states with which the European Community has Association Agreements.

See motion for a resolution by Mr Balfe on behalf of the Socialist Group on the Maguire Case (B3-1653/91).

See motion for a resolution by Mrs Valent on civil rights and trade union recognition (B3-0102/92).

ATTENDANCE REGISTER

11 March 1993

ADAM, ALAVANOS, ALBER, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, AMARAL, AMENDOLA, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDRÉ, ANDREWS, APOLINÁRIO, ARBELOA MURU, ARIAS CAÑETE, AVGERINOS, BALFE, BANDRÉS MOLET, BANOTTI, BARÓN CRESPO, BARRERA I COSTA, BARTON, BARZANTI, BEAZLEY C., BEAZLEY P., BEIRÔCO, BELO, BENOIT, BERTENS, BETHELL, BETTINI, BEUMER, BIRD, BJØRNVIG, BLAK, BLANEY, BLOT, BOCKLET, BÖGE, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOISSIÈRE, BOMBARD, BONDE, BONTEMPI, BORGO, BOURLANGES, BORTEMPI, BORTO, BRILLINGO, de BOWE, BRAUN-MOSER, BREYER, Van den BRINK, BRITO, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CANO PINTO, CAPUCHO, CARNITI, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASINI, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CASTELLINA, CATASTA, CATHERWOOD, CAUDRON, CECI, CHANTERIE, CHEYSSON, CHIABRANDO, CHRISTENSEN I., CINGARI, COATES, COIMBRA MARTINS, COLINO SALAMANCA, COLLINS, COLOM I NAVAL, CONTU, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, COT, COX, CRAMON DAIBER, CRAMPTON, CRAVINHO, CRAWLEY, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, CUSHNAHAN, DALSASS, DALY, DAVID, DEBATISSE, DE CLERCQ, DEFRAIGNE, DE GIOVANNI, DE GUCHT, DELCROIX, DENYS, DE PICCOLI, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESMOND, DESSYLAS, DE VITTO, de VRIES, DIDO', Van DIJK, DILLEN, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, DURY, DUVERGER, ELLES, ELLIOTT, ELMALAN, EPHREMIDIS, ERNST de la GRAETE, ESCUDERO, ESTGEN, EWING, FALQUI, FANTUZZI, FAYOT, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FERRI, FITZGERALD, FITZSIMONS, FLORENZ, FONTAINE, FORD, FORLANI, FORTE, FRIEDRICH, FRIMAT, FUNK, GAIBISSO, GALLE, GARCÍA AMIGO, CARCÍA AMIAS. CERACULTY CUI DONATO. GARCÍA ARIAS, GERAGHTY, GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GRAEFE zu BARINGDORF, GREEN, GRÖNER, GRUND, GUIDOLIN, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, HABSBURG, HADJIGEORGIOU, HÄNSCH, HARRISON, HERMAN, HERVÉ, HINDLEY, HOFF, HOON, HOPPENSTEDT, HOWELL, HUGHES, HUME, IACONO, IMBENI, INGLEWOOD, IZQUIERDO ROJO, JACKSON Ca., JACKSON Ch., JAKOBSEN, JANSSEN van RAAY, JEPSEN, JUNKER, KELLETT-BOWMAN, KEPPELHOFF-WIECHERT, KILLILEA, KLEPSCH, KÖHLER H., KÖHLER K.P., KOFOED, KOSTOPOULOS, KUHN, LAFUENTE LÓPEZ, LAGAKOS, LAGORIO, LALOR, LAMANNA, LAMBRIAS, LANDA MENDIBE, LANE, LANGENHAGEN, LANGER, LANGES, LANNOYE, LARIVE, LARONI, LATAILLADE, LEMMER, LENZ, LINKOHR, LIVANOS, LLORCA VILAPLANA, LO GIUDICE, LOMAS, LUCAS PIRES, LÜTTGE, LULLING, LUSTER, McCARTIN, McCUBBIN, McGOWAN, McINTOSH, McMILLAN-SCOTT, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MAIBAUM, MALANGRÉ, de la MALÈNE, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MARINHO, MARQUES MENDES, MARTIN D., MARTINEZ, MAZZONE, MEDINA ORTEGA, MELIS, MENDES BOTA, MENDEZ DE VIGO, MENRAD, MERZ, METTEN, MIHR, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, MOORHOUSE, MORETTI, MORODO LEONCIO, MORRIS, MOTTOLA, MÜLLER Ge., MÜLLER GÜ., MUNTINGH, MUSCARDINI, NAPOLETANO, NEUBAUER, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NEWTON DUNN, NIANIAS, NICHOLSON, NIELSEN, NORDMANN, ODDY, O'HAGAN, ONESTA, ONUR, OOSTLANDER, ORTIZ CLIMENT, PACK, PAISLEY, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PASTY, PATTERSON, PEIJS, PENDERS, PESMAZOGLOU, PETER, PIECYK, PIERMONT, PIERROS, PIMENTA, PIQUET, PIRKL, PISONI F., PISONI N., PLANAS PUCHADES, PLUMB, POETTERING, POLLACK, POMPIDOU, PONS GRAU, PORRAZZINI, PRAG, PRICE, PRONK, PROUT, PUCCI, PUERTA, van PUTTEN, QUISTHOUDT-ROWOHL, QUISTORP, RAFFARIN, RAFFIN, RAGGIO, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, RANDZIO-PLATH, RAUTI, RAWLINGS, READ, REDING, REYMANN, RIBEIRO, RINSCHE, ROBLES PIQUER, ROGALLA, ROMEOS, ROMERA I ALCÀZAR, ROSMINI, ROSSETTI, ROTH, ROTH-BEHRENDT, ROTHE, ROUMELIOTIS, ROVSING, RUBERT DE VENTÓS, SABY, SÄLZER, SAKELLARIOU, SAMLAND, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, SANDBÆK, SANTOS, de los SANTOS LÓPEZ, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHINZEL, SCHLECHTER, SCHLEE, SCHLEICHER, SCHMIDBAUER, SCHODRUCH, SCHÖNHUBER, SCHWARTZENBERG, SCOTT-HOPKINS, SEAL, SELIGMAN, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMMONDS, SIMPSON A., SIMPSON B., SISÓ CRUELLAS, SMITH A., SMITH L., SONNEVELD, STEVENS ON STEWART SLÍÁDEZ SPECIALE, SPENCER, STAES, STAVROU, STEVENS, STEVENSON, STEWART, SUÁREZ GONZÁLEZ, TAURAN, TAZDAÏT, TELKÄMPER, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TITLEY, GONZALEZ, TAUKAN, TAZDATI, TELKAMPEK, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TITLET, TOMLINSON, TONGUE, TOPMANN, TORRES COUTO, TRAUTMANN, TRIVELLI, TSIMAS, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VECCHI, VEIL, van VELZEN, VERBEEK, VERDE I ALDEA, VERHAGEN, VERWAERDE, VISSER, VITTINGHOFF, VOHRER, von der VRING, van der WAAL, von WECHMAR, WELSH, WEST, WETTIG, WHITE, WIJSENBEEK, WILSON, von WOGAU, WOLTJER, WIJSENBEEK, WILSON, von WOGAU, WOLTJER, WURTH-POLFER, WURTZ, WYNN, ZAVVOS.

Observers from the former GDR

BEREND, BOTZ, GLASE, KAUFMANN, KERTSCHER, KLEIN, KOCH, KOSLER, MEISEL, RICHTER, ROMBERG, STOCKMANN, THIETZ, TILLICH.

ANNEXE

Result of roll-call votes

(+) = For

(-) = Against

(O) = Abstention

Topical and urgent debate.

Joint resolution on rape of women in former Yugoslavia

Whole

(+)

ADAM, ALBER, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDRÉ, APOLINÁRIO, ARBELOA MURU, ARIAS CAÑETE, AVGERINOS, BALFE, BANOTTI, BEAZLEY C., BEAZLEY P., BEIRÔCO, BELO, BERTENS, BETHELL, BETTINI, BEUMER, BIRD, BÖGE, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOMBARD, BRITO, BROK, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CANO PINTO, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CATASTA, CAUDRON, CHANTERIE, COATES, COIMBRA MARTINS, COLOM I NAVAL, CONTU, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, COT, CRAMPTON, CRAVINHO, CRAWLEY, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, CUSHNAHAN, DALSASS, DALY, DE CLERCQ, DENYS, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESMOND, DESSYLAS, Van DIJK, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, DURY, ELLES, ELLIOTT, ERNST de la GRAETE, ESCUDERO, ESTGEN, EWING, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FONTAINE, FORLANI, FORTE, FRIEDRICH, FRIMAT, FUNK, GARCÍA ARIAS, GERAGHTY, GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GREEN, GRÓNER, GUIDOLIN, HABSBURG, HADJIGEORGIOU, HARRISON, HERMAN, HERMANS, HERVÉ, HINDLEY, HUGHES, KELLETT-BOWMAN, KOFOED, LAGAKOS, LALOR, LAMANNA, LANE, LANGEN, LANGER, LANNOYE, LARIVE, LATAILLADE, LENZ, LOMAS, LUCAS PIRES, LÜTTGE, LULLING, McGOWAN, McINTOSH, McMILLAN-SCOTT, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MAIBAUM, MARCK, MEGAHY, MELIS, MENRAD, MERZ, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, MOORHOUSE, MORRIS, MOTTOLA, MÜLLER GE., MÜLLER GÜ., MUNTINGH, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NEWTON DUNN, NORDMANN, ODDY, ONUR, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, PACK, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PISONI F., PLANAS PUCHADES, POLLACK, PONS GRAU, PRAG, PUERTA, RAFFARIN, RAFFIN, RAGGIO, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, RAWLINGS, READ, REDING, RIBEIRO, ROBLES PIQUER, ROMEOS, ROMERA I ALCAZAR, ROSMINI, ROTH, RUBERT DE VENTÓS, SAKELLARIOU, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLECHTER, SCHLIEICHER, SCHMIDBAUER, SCHÖNHUBER, SCOTT-HOPKINS, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMPSON A., SIMPSON B., SMITH A., SONNEVELD, SPENCER, STAES, STEVENS, STEWART, TAZDAÏT, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TITLEY, TOMLINSON, TONGUE, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VECCHI, VERBEEK, VERHAGEN, VISSER, VITTINGHOFF, von der VRING

(-)

BLOT, JANSSEN van RAAY.

(O)

CATHERWOOD, DILLEN, SCHODRUCH.

Joint resolution on Cuba

Whole

(+)

ADAM, ALBER, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDRÉ, APOLINÁRIO, ARBELOA MURU, ARIAS CAÑETE, BALFE, BANOTTI, BEAZLEY C., BEAZLEY P., BEIRÔCO, BELO, BERTENS, BETHELL, BEUMER, BIRD, BLOT, BÖGE, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOMBARD, Van den BRINK, BROK, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANO PINTO, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CATASTA, CATHERWOOD, CAUDRON, CHANTERIE, COATES, COIMBRA MARTINS, COLOM I NAVAL, CONTU, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, COT, CRAMPTON, CRAVINHO, CRAWLEY, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, CUSHNAHAN, DALSASS, DALY, DE CLERCQ, DENYS, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESMOND, Van DIJK, DILLEN, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, DURY, ELLES, ELLIOTT, ERNST de la GRAETE, ESCUDERO, ESTGEN, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FONTAINE, FORD, FORLANI, FORTE, FRIEDRICH, FRIMAT, FUNK, GALLE, GARCÍA ARIAS, GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GREEN, GRÖNER, GRUND, GUIDOLIN, HABSBURG, HADJIGEORGIOU, HARRISON, HERMAN, HERMANS, HERVÉ, HOWELL, HUGHES, INGLEWOOD, JANSSEN VAN RAAY, KELLETT-BOWMAN, KOFOED, LAGAKOS, LALOR, LAMANNA, LANE, LANGENHAGEN, LANGER, LARIVE, LATAILLADE, LENZ, LUCAS PIRES, LÜTTGE, LULLING, McCARTIN, McCUBBIN, McGOWAN, McINTOSH, McMILLAN-SCOTT,

MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MAIBAUM, MARCK, MARQUES MENDES, MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MENDEZ DE VIGO, MENRAD, MERZ, MIRANDA DE LAGE, MOORHOUSE, MOTTOLA, MÜLLER GE., MÜLLER GE., MUNTINGH, NEWTON DUNN, NORDMANN, ODDY, ONUR, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, PARTSCH, PATTERSON, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PISONI F., PLANAS PUCHADES, POLLACK, PONS GRAU, PRICE, PRONK, RAFFARIN, RAGGIO, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, RAWLINGS, READ, REDING, ROBLES PIQUER, ROMERA I ALCÀZAR, ROSMINI, RUBERT DE VENTÓS, SAKELLARIOU, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLECHTER, SCHLEICHER, SCHMIDBAUER, SCHODRUCH, SCHÖNHUBER, SCOTT-HOPKINS, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMMONDS, SIMPSON A., SIMPSON B., SONNEVELD, SPENCER, STAES, STEVENS, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TITLEY, TOMLINSON, TONGUE, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VECCHI, VEIL, VERHAGEN, VISSER, VITTINGHOFF, VON dER VRING, van dER WAAL, WELSH, WEST, WHITE, WIJSENBEEK, VON WOGAU, WOLTJER, WYNN.

(-)

BRITO, DESSYLAS, GERAGHTY, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, HINDLEY, LOMAS, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MORRIS, PUERTA, RIBEIRO, ROTH, SMITH A., STEWART, TELKÄMPER, TSIMAS.

(O)

BETTINI, CANAVARRO, EWING, LANNOYE, MELIS, NEWMAN, RAFFIN, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VERBEEK.

East Timor (B3-0378/93)

Whole

(+)

ALBER, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDRÉ, APOLINÁRIO, ARBELOA MURU, ARIAS CAÑETE, AVGERINOS, BALFE, BANOTTI, BEAZLEY C., BEAZLEY P., BEIRÔCO, BELO, BERTENS, BETHELL, BETTINI, BEUMER, BIRD, BÖGE, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOMBARD, BRITO, BROK, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CANO PINTO, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CATHERWOOD, CAUDRON, CHANTERIE, COATES, COIMBRA MARTÍNS, COLOM I NAVAL, CONTU, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, COT, CRAMON DAIBER, CRAMPTON, CRAVINHO, CRAWLEY, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, CUSHNAHAN, DALSASS, DALY, DAVID, DE CLERCQ, DENYS, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESMOND, DESSYLAS, Van DIJK, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, DURY, ELLES, ELLIOTT, ERNST de la GRAETE, ESCUDERO, EWING, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FONTAINE, FORD, FORLANI, FORTE, FRIEDRICH, FRIMAT, FUNK, GALLE, GARCÍA ARIAS, GERAGHTY, GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GREEN, GRÖNER, GUIDOLIN, HABSBURG, HADJIGEORGIOU, HARRISON, HERMAN, HERMANS, HERVÉ, HINDLEY, HOWELL, HUGHES, INGLEWOOD, JACKSON Ch., KELLETT-BOWMAN, LAGAKOS, LALOR, LAMANNA, LANE, LANGENHAGEN, LANGER, LARIVE, LATAILLADE, LOMAS, LUCAS PIRES, LÜTTGE, LULLING, McCUBBIN, McGOWAN, McMILLAN-SCOTT, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MARCK, MARQUES MENDES, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MELIS, MENDEZ DE VIGO, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, MORRIS, MOTTOLA, MUNTINGH, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NEWTON DUNN, NORDMANN, ODDY, ONESTA, ONUR, OOSTLANDER, PACK, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PATTERSON, PENDERS, PESMAZOGLOU, PIECYK, PIERROS, PIRKL, PISONI F., PLANAS PICHADES, POLLACK, PONS GRAU, PRAG, PRICE, PROUT, PUERTA, QUISTORP, RAFFARIN, RAFFIN, RAGGIO, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, RAWLINGS, READ, REDING, RIBEIRO, ROBLES PIQUER, ROMEOS, ROMERA I ALCÀZAR, ROSMINI, ROTH, SAKELLARIOU, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLECHTER, SCHLEICHER, SCHLIEICHER, SCHLIEICHER, SCHLEICHER, SCHLEICHER, SCHLEICHER, SCHLEICHER, SCHLEICHER, SCHLEICHER, SCHLEICHER, SCHSON, TONGUE, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VECCHI, VEIL, VERBEEK, von der VRING, WEST,

(-)

JANSSEN van RAAY, LENZ, McINTOSH, MENRAD, MERZ, MOORHOUSE, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, PRONK, SONNEVELD, STEVENS, VERHAGEN, van der WAAL.

(O)

DILLEN, GRUND, MÜLLER Ge., MÜLLER Gü., SCHÖDRUCH, SCHÖNHUBER, WELSH.

Joint resolution on nuclear tests

Whole

(+)

ALBER, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDRÉ, APOLINÁRIO, ARBELOA MURU, ARIAS CAÑETE, AVGERINOS, BALFE, BANOTTI, BEAZLEY C., BEIRÔCO, BELO, BERTENS, BETTINI, BEUMER, BIRD, BÖGE, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOMBARD, Van den BRINK, BRITO, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CANO PINTO, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CAUDRON, CHANTERIE, COATES, COIMBRA MARTINS, COLOM I NAVAL, CONTU, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, COT, CRAMON DAIBER, CRAMPTON, CRAVINHO, CUSHNAHAN, DALSASS, DAVID, DE CLERCO, DENYS, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESMOND, DESSYLAS, Van DIJK, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, DURY, ELLES, ELLIOTT, ERNST de la GRAETE, ESCUDERO, EWING, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FONTAINE, FORD, FORLANI, FORTE, FRIEDRICH, FRIMAT, FUNK, GALLE, GARCÍA ARIAS, GERAGHTY, GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GREEN, GRÖNER, GRUND, GUIDOLIN, HADJIGEORGIOU, HARRISON, HERMAN, HERVÉ, HINDLEY, HUGHES, KOFOED, LAGAKOS, LALOR, LAMANNA, LANGENHAGEN, LANNOYE, LARIVE, LENZ, LOMAS, LUCAS PIRES, LÜTTGE, LULLING, McCUBBIN, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, LENZ, LOMAS, LUCAS PIRES, LÜTTGE, LULLING, McCUBBIN, MCGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, LENZ, LOMAS, LUCAS PIRES, LÜTTGE, LULLING, McCUBBIN, MCGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, LENZ, LOMAS, LUCAS PIRES, LÜTTGE, LULLING, McCUBBIN, MCGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, LARIVE, MCCANNI MCGANINA MCCANNI MCCANN MAHER, MARCK, MARQUES MENDES, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MELIS, MENDEZ DE VIGO, MENRAD, MERZ, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, MORRIS, MOTTOLA, MÜLLER Ge., MUNTINGH, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NEWTON DUNN, NICHOLSON, NORDMANN, ODDY, ONESTA, ONUR, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, PACK, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PATTERSON, PENDERS, PESMAZOGLOU, PIECYK, PIERROS, PIRKL, PISONI F., PLANAS PUCHADES, POLLACK, PONS GRAU, PRICE, PRONK, PROUT, RAFFIN, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, READ, REDING, RIBEIRO, ROBLES PIQUER, ROMEOS, ROMERA I ALCAZAR, ROSMINI, ROTH, SAKELLARIOU, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SARIDAKIS, KOSMINI, ROTH, SAKELLARIOU, SANZ FERNANDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SARIDARIS, SARLIS, SCHLECHTER, SCHLEICHER, SCHMIDBAUER, SCOTT-HOPKINS, SEAL, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMMONDS, SONNEVELD, SPECIALE, STAES, STEVENS, STEWART, TAZDAÏT, TELKÄMPER, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TITLEY, TOMLINSON, TONGUE, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VECCHI, VERBEEK, VERHAGEN, VISSER, VITTINGHOFF, von der VRING, van der WAAL, WEST, WHITE, WILSENDEEK, WILSON, von WOCALL WOLTER WYNN ZAVVOS WIJSENBEEK, WILSON, von WOGAU, WOLTJER, WYNN, ZAVVOS.

(-)

BEAZLEY P., BETHELL, DALY, DILLEN, KELLETT-BOWMAN, McINTOSH, RAWLINGS, SCHODRUCH, SIMPSON A., SPENCER.

(O)

HABSBURG, HOWELL, INGLEWOOD, JACKSON Ch., LANE, McMILLAN-SCOTT, MOORHOUSE, MÜLLER Gü., WELSH.

Ortiz Climent report (A3-0085/93)

Amendment No 17

(+)

ALAVANOS, ALBER, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDREWS, APOLINÁRIO, BANOTTI, BEAZLEY C., BEAZLEY P., BERTENS, BETTINI, BEUMER, BLANEY, BOISSIÈRE, BRAUN-MOSER, BRITO, BROK, CANAVARRO, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASINI, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CASTELLINA, CHANTERIE, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, CRAMON DAIBER, CUSHNAHAN, DALSASS, DALY, DEPREZ, DESSYLAS, Van DIJK, ELLES, EPHREMIDIS, ERNST de la GRAETE, ESCUDERO, ESTGEN, FALQUI, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FITZGERALD, FITZSIMONS, FONTAINE, FORTE, FUNK, GAIBISSO, GARCÍA AMIGO, GERAGHTY, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GUIDOLIN, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, HERMAN, HERMANS, INGLEWOOD, JEPSEN, KELLETT-BOWMAN, KEPPELHOFF-WIECHERT, KILLILEA, KLEPSCH, LAGAKOS, LALOR, LAMBRIAS, LANE, LANGER, LANNOYE, LATAILLADE, LEMMER, LUCAS PIRES, LULLING, McCARTIN, MAHER, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MELIS, MENDEZ DE VIGO, MENRAD, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MOTTOLA, MÜLLER GÜ., MUNTINGH, NEWTON DUNN, NIANIAS, NIELSEN, ONESTA, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, ORTIZ CLIMENT, PARTSCH, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PIQUET, PISONIF., PLUMB, PRAG, PUERTA, RAFFIN, REYMANN, RIBEIRO, RINSCHE, ROBLES PIQUER, ROTH, SÄLZER, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLEICHER, SELIGMAN, SIMMONDS, SONNEVELD, STAES, STAVROU, STEVENS, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VERBEEK, VON WECHMAR, VON WOGAU, WURTH-POLFER, ZAVVOS.

(-)

ADAM, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ARBELOA MURU, AVGERINOS, BARÓN CRESPO, BARTON, BENOIT, BIRD, BLAK, BOFILL ABEILHE, Van den BRINK, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANO PINTO, CECI, CHEYSSON, CINGARI, COATES, COLLINS, COLOM I NAVAL, COT, CRAMPTON, CRAVINHO, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, DAVID, DE GIOVANNI, DELCROIX, DESAMA, DESMOND, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP, ELLIOTT, FORD, FRIMAT, GARCÍA ARIAS, GOEDMAKERS, GREEN, GRUND, HÄNSCH,

HARRISON, HINDLEY, HOFF, HUGHES, HUME, IZQUIERDO ROJO, JUNKER, KÖHLER K.P., LIVANOS, LÜTTGE, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MARQUES MENDES, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MENDES BOTA, METTEN, MIRANDA DE LAGE, NEWENS, NEWMAN, ONUR, PAPOUTSIS, PIECYK, PLANAS PUCHADES, POLLACK, PONS GRAU, van PUTTEN, RAGGIO, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, READ, RØNN, ROMEOS, ROTHE, ROUMELIOTIS, SABY, SAKELLARIOU, SAMLAND, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SCHLECHTER, SCHMIDBAUER, SCHODRUCH, SCHÖNHUBER, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMPSON B., SPECIALE, STEWART, TITLEY, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VECCHI, van VELZEN, VERDE I ALDEA, VISSER, von der VRING, WEST, WHITE, WIJSENBEEK, WILSON, WOLTJER, WYNN.

Amendment No 36 (1st part)

(+)

ALAVANOS, ALBER, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDREWS, APOLINÁRIO, ARIAS CAÑETE, BANOTTI, BEAZLEY C., BEAZLEY P., BETTINI, BEUMER, BLANEY, BOISSIÈRE, BRITO, BROK, CANAVARRO, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASINI, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CASTELLINA, CHANTERIE, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, CRAMON DAIBER, CUSHNAHAN, DALSASS, DALY, DEPREZ, DESSYLAS, Van DIJK, ELLES, EPHREMIDIS, ERNST de la GRAETE, ESCUDERO, ESTGEN, FALQUI, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FITZGERALD, FITZSIMONS, FONTAINE, FORTE, FUNK, GAIBISSO, GARCÍA AMIGO, GERAGHTY, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GUIDOLIN, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, HABSBURG, HERMAN, HERMANS, INGLEWOOD, KELLETT-BOWMAN, KEPPELHOFF-WIECHERT, KLEPSCH, LAGAKOS, LALOR, LAMBRIAS, LANE, LANGENHAGEN, LANGER, LANNOYE, LATAILLADE, LEMMER, LENZ, LUCAS PIRES, LULLING, McCARTIN, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MELIS, MENDEZ DE VIGO, MENRAD, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MOTTOLA, MÜLLER Gü., MUNTINGH, NEWTON DUNN, NIANIAS, ONESTA, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, ORTIZ CLIMENT, PAPOUTSIS, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PIQUET, PISONI F., PLUMB, PRAG, PROUT, PUERTA, RAFFIN, REDING, REYMANN, RIBEIRO, RINSCHE, ROBLES PIQUER, ROTH, SÄLZER, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLEICHER, SELIGMAN, SIMMONDS, SISÓ CRUELLAS, SONNEVELD, STAES, STAVROU, SUÁREZ GONZÁLEZ, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VERBEEK, VON WOGAU, ZAVVOS.

(-)

ADAM, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ARBELOA MURU, AVGERINOS, BARÓN CRESPO, BARTON, BENOIT, BERTENS, BOFILL ABEILHE, Van den BRINK, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANO PINTO, CECI, CHEYSSON, CINGARI, COATES, COLINO SALAMANCA, COLLINS, COLOM I NAVAL, COT, CRAMPTON, CRAVINHO, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, DE GIOVANNI, DE GUCHT, DESAMA, DESMOND, de VRIES, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, ELLIOTT, FORD, FRIMAT, GARCÍA ARIAS, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GREEN, HÄNSCH, HARRISON, HINDLEY, HOFF, HUGHES, HUME, IZQUIERDO ROJO, JUNKER, KOSTOPOULOS, LARIVE, LINKOHR, LIVANOS, LÜTTGE, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MARQUES MENDES, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MENDES BOTA, METTEN, MIRANDA DE LAGE, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NIELSEN, ONUR, PARTSCH, PIECYK, PLANAS PUCHADES, POLLACK, PONS GRAU, PORRAZZINI, van PUTTEN, RAGGIO, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, READ, RØNN, ROMEOS, ROTHE, ROUMELIOTIS, SABY, SAKELLARIOU, SAMLAND, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SCHLECHTER, SCHMIDBAUER, SCHÖNHUBER, SEAL, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMPSON B., SPECIALE, STEWART, TITLEY, TOMLINSON, TOPMANN, TORRES COUTO, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VECCHI, van VELZEN, VERDE I ALDEA, VISSER, von der VRING, von WECHMAR, WEST, WHITE, WIJSENBEEK, WOLTJER, WURTH-POLFER.

(O)

DAVID, DILLEN, GRUND, KÖHLER K.P., SCHODRUCH.

Amendment No 36 (rmainder)

(+)

ALAVANOS, ANDREWS, APOLINÁRIO, BETTINI, BLANEY, BRITO, CANAVARRO, CRAMON DAIBER, DESSYLAS, Van DIJK, EPHREMIDIS, ERNST de la GRAETE, FALQUI, FITZGERALD, FITZSIMONS, GERAGHTY, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, LALOR, LANE, LANGER, LANNOYE, LATAILLADE, MELIS, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MUNTINGH, NIANIAS, PIQUET, PUERTA, RAFFIN, REDING, RIBEIRO, ROTH, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, STAES, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VERBEEK.

(-)

ADAM, ALBER, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ARBELOA MURU, ARIAS CAÑETE, AVGERINOS, BANOTTI, BARÓN CRESPO, BARTON, BEAZLEY C., BEAZLEY P., BENOIT, BERTENS, BEUMER, BIRD, BOFILL ABEILHE, BRAUN-MOSER, Van den BRINK, BROK, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANO PINTO, CARVALHO

CARDOSO, CASINI, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CECI, CHANTERIE, CHEYSSON, CINGARI, COATES, COLINO SALAMANCA, COLLINS, COLOM I NAVAL, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, COT, CRAMPTON, CRAVINHO, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, CUSHNAHAN, DALSASS, DALY, DAVID, DE GIOVANNI, DE GUCHT, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESMOND, de VRIES, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, ELLES, ELLIOTT, ESCUDERO, ESTGEN, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FONTAINE, FORD, FORTE, FRIMAT, FUNK, GAIBISSO, GARCÍA AMIGO, GARCÍA ARIAS, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GREEN, GRUND, GUIDOLIN, HABSBURG, HÄNSCH, HARRISON, HERMAN, HERMANS, HINDLEY, HOFF, HUGHES, HUME, INGLEWOOD, IZQUIERDO ROJO, JEPSEN, JUNKER, KELLETT-BOWMAN, KEPPELHOFF-WIECHERT, KLEPSCH, KOSTOPOULOS, LAGAKOS, LAMBRIAS, LANGENHAGEN, LARIVE, LEMMER, LENZ, LINKOHR, LIVANOS, LUCAS PIRES, LÜTTGE, LULLING, McCARTIN, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MARQUES MENDES, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MENDES BOTA, MENDEZ DE VIGO, MENRAD, METTEN, MIRANDA DE LAGE, MÜLLER Gü., NEWENS, NEWMAN, NEWTON DUNN, NIELSEN, ONUR, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, ORTIZ CLIMENT, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PESMAZOGLOU, PIECYK, PIERROS, PISONI F., PLANAS PUCHADES, PLUMB, POLLACK, PONS GRAU, PORRAZZINI, PRAG, van PUTTEN, RAGGIO, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, READ, REYMANN, RINSCHE, ROBLES PIQUER, RØNN, ROMEOS, ROTHE, ROUMELIOTIS, SABY, SÄLZER, SAKELLARIOU, SAMLAND, SAPENA GRANELL, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLECHTER, SCHLEICHER, SCHMIDBAUER, SEAL, SELIGMAN, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMMONDS, SIMPSON B., SISÓ CRUELLAS, SONNEVELD, SPECIALE, STAVROU, STEWART, SUÁREZ GONZÁLEZ, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TITLEY, TOPMANN, TORRES COUTO, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VECCHI, van VELZEN, VERDE I ALDEA, VISSER, von der VRING, van der WAAL, von WECHMAR, WEST, WHITE, WILSON, von WOGAU, WOLTJER, ZAVVOS.

(O)

DILLEN, KÖHLER K.P., SCHODRUCH, SCHÖNHUBER.

Resolution

(+)

ADAM, ALAVANOS, ALBER, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDREWS, APOLINÁRIO, ARBELOA MURU, ARIAS CAÑETE, AVGERINOS, BANOTTI, BARÓN CRESPO, BARTON, BEAZLEY C., BENOIT, BERTENS, BETTINI, BEUMER, BIRD, BLAK, BOCKLET, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOISSIÈRE, BOWE, BRAUN-MOSER, Van den BRINK, BRITO, BROK, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CANO PINTO, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASINI, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CASTELLINA, CECI, CHANTERIE, CHEYSSON, CINGARI, COATES, COLINO SALAMANCA, COLLINS, COLOM I NAVAL, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, COT, CRAMPTON, CRAVINHO, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, CUSHNAHAN, DALSASS, DALY, DAVID, DE GIOVANNI, DE GUCHT, DENYS, DE PICCOLI, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESMOND, DESSYLAS, Van DIJK, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, ELLES, ELLIOTT, EPHREMIDIS, ERNST de la GRAETE, ESCUDERO, ESTGEN, FALQUI, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FITZGERALD, FITZSIMONS, FONTAINE, FORD, FORTE, FRIMAT, FUNK, GAIBISSO, GARCÍA AMIGO, GARCÍA ARIAS, GERAGHTY, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GREEN, GUIDOLIN, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, HABSBURG, HÄNSCH, HARRISON, HERMAN, HERMANS, HINDLEY, HOFF, HUGHES, HUME, INGLEWOOD, IZQUIERDO ROJO, JEPSEN, JUNKER, KELLETT-BOWMAN, KEPPELHOFF-WIECHERT, KLEPSCH, KOSTOPOULOS, LAGAKOS, LALOR, LAMBRIAS, LANE, LANGENHAGEN, LANGER, LANNOYE, LARIVE, LATAILLADE, LEMMER, LENZ, LINKOHR, LIVANOS, LUCAS PIRES, LÜTTGE, McCARTIN, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MARINHO, MARQUES MENDES, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MENDES BOTA, MENDEZ DE VIGO, MENRAD, MERZ, METTEN, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, MOTTOLA, MÜLLER Gü., NEWENS, NEWMAN, NEWTON DUNN, NIANIAS, NIELSEN, NORDMANN, ONESTA, ONUR, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PESMAZOGLOU, PIECYK, PIERROS, PIQUET, PISONI F., PLANAS PUCHADES, PLUMB, POLLACK, PONS GRAU, PORRAZZINI, PRAG, PROUT, PUERTA, van PUTTEN, RAFFIN, RAGGIO, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, READ, REDING, RIBEIRO, ROBLES PIQUER, RØNN, ROMEOS, ROTH, ROTHE, ROUMELIOTIS, SABY, SAKELLARIOU, SAMLAND, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLECHTER, SCHLEICHER, SCHMIDBAUER, SEAL, SELIGMAN, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMMONDS, SIMPSON B., SISÓ CRUELLAS, SONNEVELD, SPECIALE, STAVENOU, STEWART, SUÁREZ GONZÁLEZ, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TITLEY, TOMLINSON, TOPMANN, TORRES COUTO, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VECCHI, van VELZEN, VERBEEK, VERDE I ALDEA, VISSER, von der VRING, van der WAAL, von WECHMAR, WEST, WHITE, WIJSENBEEK, WILSON, WOLTJER, WURTH-POLFER, WYNNIN ZAVVOS WYNN, ZAVVOS.

(-)

CHRISTENSEN I., DILLEN, GRUND, KÖHLER K.P., SCHODRUCH, SCHÖNHUBER.

(O)

NICHOLSON.

De Gucht report (A3-0025/93)

Amendment No 39

(+)

ALAVANOS, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDREWS, ARBELOA MURU, AVGERINOS, BARTON, BERTENS, BETTINI, BIRD, BJØRNVIG, BLAK, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOISSIÈRE, BOWE, Van den BRINK, BRITO, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CANO PINTO, CECI, CHEYSSON, CINGARI, COATES, COLOM I NAVAL, COT, CRAMON DAIBER, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, CUSHNAHAN, DAVID, DE GUCHT, DESAMA, DESSYLAS, de VRIES, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, ELLIOTT, EPHREMIDIS, ERNST de la GRAETE, EWING, FALQUI, FITZGERALD, FITZSIMONS, FORD, FRIMAT, GARCÍA ARIAS, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GREEN, HÄNSCH, HARRISON, HINDLEY, HOFF, HUGHES, HUME, JUNKER, KOSTOPOULOS, LALOR, LANDA MENDIBE, LANE, LANGER, LANNOYE, LARIVE, LINKOHR, LIVANOS, LÜTTGE, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MARQUES MENDES, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MENDES BOTA, METTEN, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NIANIAS, NIELSEN, ONESTA, ONUR, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PIQUET, PLANAS PUCHADES, van PUTTEN, QUISTORP, RAFFIN, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, READ, RIBEIRO, RØNN, ROMEOS, ROTH, ROTHE, ROUMELIOTIS, SAKELLARIOU, SAMLAND, SAPENA GRANELL, SCHLECHTER, SCHMIDBAUER, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMPSON B., STAES, STEWART, TITLEY, TOMLINSON, TOPMANN, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VECCHI, van VELZEN, VERBEEK, VERDE I ALDEA, VISSER, von der VRING, von WECHMAR, WHITE, WIJSENBEEK, von WOGAU, WOLTJER.

(-)

ALBER, ARIAS CAÑETE, BANOTTI, BEAZLEY C., BEUMER, BOCKLET, BRAUN-MOSER, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASINI, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, DALY, DEPREZ, DILLEN, ELLES, ESCUDERO, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FONTAINE, FORTE, FUNK, GARCÍA AMIGO, GRUND, GUIDOLIN, HERMAN, HERMANS, INGLEWOOD, KELLETT-BOWMAN, LAGAKOS, LAMBRIAS, LANGENHAGEN, LATAILLADE, LEMMER, LENZ, LULLING, McCARTIN, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MENDEZ DE VIGO, MENRAD, MÜLLER Gü., NICHOLSON, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PISONI F., PROUT, REDING, ROBLES PIQUER, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLEICHER, SCHODRUCH, SELIGMAN, SIMMONDS, SISÓ CRUELLAS, STAVROU, TAURAN, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, ZAVVOS.

Amendment No 48

(+)

von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANDRÉWS, ARBELOA MURU, AVGERINOS, BARTON, BENOIT, BERTENS, BIRD, BLAK, BLANEY, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOWE, Van den BRINK, BRITO, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CANO PINTO, CECI, CHEYSSON, COATES, COT, CRAMPTON, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, CUSHNAHAN, DAVID, DE GUCHT, DESAMA, DESSYLAS, de VRIES, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, ELLIOTT, EPHREMIDIS, EWING, FITZSIMONS, FORD, FRIMAT, GARCÍA ARIAS, GERAGHTY, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GREEN, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, HÄNSCH, HARRISON, HERMANS, HINDLEY, HOFF, HUGHES, JUNKER, KOSTOPOULOS, LALOR, LANDA MENDIBE, LANE, LARIVE, LINKOHR, LIVANOS, LÜTTGE, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MARQUES MENDES, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MENDES BOTA, METTEN, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NIANIAS, NIELSEN, ONUR, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PIQUET, PLANAS PUCHADES, POLLACK, van PUTTEN, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, RIBEIRO, RØNN, ROMEOS, ROTHE, SAKELLARIOU, SAMLAND, SAPENA GRANELL, SCHLECHTER, SCHMIDBAUER, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMPSON B., STEWART, TITLEY, TOPMANN, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VERDE I ALDEA, von der VRING, WHITE, WIJSENBEEK.

(-)

ALBER, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ARIAS CAÑETE, BEAZLEY C., BEUMER, BOCKLET, BROK, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASINI, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, DALY, DILLEN, ELLES, ESCUDERO, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FONTAINE, FORTE, GARCÍA AMIGO, GRUND, GUIDOLIN, HERMAN, INGLEWOOD, JEPSEN, KELLETT-BOWMAN, LAGAKOS, LAMBRIAS, LANGENHAGEN, LATAILLADE, LEMMER, LENZ, LULLING, McCARTIN, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MENRAD, MÜLLER GÜ., OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PISONI F., PLUMB, PRAG, PROUT, REDING, ROBLES PIQUER, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SELIGMAN, SIMMONDS, SISÓ CRUELLAS, STAVROU, TAURAN, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, van VELZEN, van der WAAL, von WOGAU, ZAVVOS.

(O)

BETTINI, BOISSIÈRE, CHANTERIE, CRAMON DAIBER, ERNST de la GRAETE, FALQUI, LANGER, LANNOYE, ONESTA, QUISTORP, RAFFIN, ROTH, STAES, VERBEEK.

Amendment No 49

(+)

ALAVANOS, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANDREWS, ARBELOA MURU, AVGERINOS, BARTON, BENOIT, BJØRNVIG, BLAK, BLANEY, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOWE, Van den BRINK, BRITO, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CANO PINTO, CECI, CHEYSSON, COATES, COT, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, CUSHNAHAN, DAVID, DE GUCHT, DE PICCOLI, DESSYLAS, de VRIES, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, ELLIOTT, EPHREMIDIS, FITZSIMONS, FORD, FRIMAT, GARCÍA ARIAS, GERAGHTY, GOEDMAKERS, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GREEN, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, HÄNSCH, HARRISON, HERMANS, HINDLEY, HUGHES, HUME, KOSTOPOULOS, LANDA MENDIBE, LANE, LINKOHR, LIVANOS, LÜTTGE, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MARQUES MENDES, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MENDES BOTA, METTEN, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NIANIAS, NIELSEN, ONUR, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PIQUET, PLANAS PUCHADES, Van PUTTEN, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, READ, RIBEIRO, ROMEOS, SAKELLARIOU, SAMLAND, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, SAPENA GRANELL, SCHLECHTER, SCHMIDBAUER, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMPSON B., STEWART, TITLEY, TOMLINSON, TOPMANN, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, Van VELZEN, VERDE I ALDEA, VISSER, von der VRING, WIJSENBEEK, WOLTJER.

(-)

ALBER, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ARIAS CAÑETE, BEAZLEY C., BETTINI, BEUMER, BOCKLET, BOISSIÈRE, BROK, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASINI, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CORNELISSEN, CRAMON DAIBER, DALY, DILLEN, ELLES, ERNST de la GRAETE, ESCUDERO, FALQUI, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FONTAINE, FORTE, FUNK, GARCÍA AMIGO, GRUND, GUIDOLIN, INGLEWOOD, JEPSEN, KELLETT-BOWMAN, LAGAKOS, LAMBRIAS, LANGENHAGEN, LANGER, LANNOYE, LATAILLADE, LEMMER, LENZ, LULLING, McCARTIN, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MENRAD, MÜLLER Gü., ONESTA, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PISONI F., PLUMB, PRAG, PROUT, QUISTORP, RAFFIN, REDING, ROBLES PIQUER, ROTH, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLEICHER, SELIGMAN, SIMMONDS, SISÓ CRUELLAS, STAES, STAVROU, TAURAN, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, van der WAAL, von WOGAU, ZAVVOS.

(O)

CHANTERIE, LALOR.

Amendment No 35

(+)

ALAVANOS, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, BETTINI, BJØRNVIG, BLANEY, BOISSIÈRE, BRITO, CANAVARRO, CHEYSSON, CRAMON DAIBER, DESSYLAS, EPHREMIDIS, ERNST de la GRAETE, EWING, FALQUI, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, HARRISON, HINDLEY, KELLETT-BOWMAN, LANDA MENDIBE, LANGER, LANNOYE, MENDES BOTA, MIRANDA DA SILVA, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NIANIAS, ONESTA, PIQUET, POLLACK, QUISTORP, RAFFIN, RIBEIRO, ROTH, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, STAES, TELKÄMPER, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VERBEEK.

(-)

ALBER, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDREWS, ARBELOA MURU, ARIAS CAÑETE, AVGERINOS, BARTON, BEAZLEY C., BENOIT, BEUMER, BLAK, BOCKLET, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOWE, Van den BRINK, BROK, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANO PINTO,

CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASINI, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CHANTERIE, COATES, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, COT, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, CUSHNAHAN, DAVID, DE GUCHT, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESMOND, DILLEN, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, ELLES, ELLIOTT, ESCUDERO, ESTGEN, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FITZGERALD, FITZSIMONS, FONTAINE, FORD, FORTE, FRIMAT, FUNK, GARCÍA AMIGO, GARCÍA ARIAS, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GREEN, GRUND, GUIDOLIN, HÄNSCH, HERMAN, HOFF, HUGHES, HUME, INGLEWOOD, JEPSEN, JUNKER, KOSTOPOULOS, LAGAKOS, LALOR, LAMBRIAS, LANE, LANGENHAGEN, LATAILLADE, LEMMER, LENZ, LINKOHR, LIVANOS, LÜTTGE, LULLING, McCARTIN, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MENRAD, METTEN, MIRANDA DE LAGE, MÜLLER Gü., NEWTON DUNN, ONUR, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, PAPOUTSIS, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PISONI F., PLANAS PUCHADES, PLUMB, PRAG, PROUT, van PUTTEN, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, READ, REDING, ROBLES PIQUER, RØNN, SAKELLARIOU, SAMLAND, SAPENA GRANELL, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLECHTER, SCHLEICHER, SCHMIDBAUER, SELIGMAN, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMMONDS, SIMPSON B., SISÓ CRUELLAS, SPECIALE, STAVROU, STEWART, SUÁREZ GONZÁLEZ, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TITLEY, TOMLINSON, TOPMANN, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VERDE I ALDEA, VISSER, von der VRING, van der WAAL, WIJSENBEEK, von WOGAU, WOLTJER, ZAVVOS.

(O)

von ALEMANN, BERTENS, DALY, de VRIES, HERMANS, LARIVE, MAHER, MARQUES MENDES, NIELSEN, PARTSCH.

Paragraph 60

(+)

ALAVANOS, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANDREWS, ARBELOA MURU, AVGERINOS, BERTENS, BETTINI, BLANEY, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOISSIÈRE, BOWE, BRITO, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CECI, COATES, COT, CRAMON DAIBER, CUSHNAHAN, DAVID, DE GUCHT, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESSYLAS, de VRIES, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, ELLIOTT, EPHREMIDIS, ERNST de la GRAETE, ESTGEN, EWING, FITZSIMONS, FORD, FRIMAT, GARCÍA ARIAS, GERAGHTY, GÖRLACH, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, HÄNSCH, HARRISON, HERMANS, HINDLEY, HOFF, HUGHES, HUME, KOSTOPOULOS, LALOR, LANE, LANGER, LANNOYE, LARIVE, LÜTTGE, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MEDINA ORTEGA, MENDES BOTA, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NIELSEN, ONESTA, ONUR, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PIQUET, PLANAS PUCHADES, PONS GRAU, QUISTORP, RAFFIN, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, READ, RIBEIRO, ROTH, ROTHE, SAKELLARIOU, SAMLAND, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, STAES, STEWART, TELKÄMPER, TOMLINSON, TOPMANN, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VERBEEK, VERDE I ALDEA, VISSER, von der VRING, WIJSENBEEK.

(-)

ALBER, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ARIAS CAÑETE, BEAZLEY C., BEUMER, BOCKLET, BRAUN-MOSER, Van den BRINK, BROK, CARVALHO CARDOSO, CASSANMAGNAGO CERRETTI, CHANTERIE, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, DALY, DESMOND, DILLEN, ELLES, ESCUDERO, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FONTAINE, FORTE, FUNK, GARCÍA AMIGO, GOEDMAKERS, GUIDOLIN, HERMAN, INGLEWOOD, KELLETT-BOWMAN, KEPPELHOFF-WIECHERT, LAGAKOS, LAMBRIAS, LANGENHAGEN, LATAILLADE, LEMMER, LENZ, LINKOHR, LULLING, McCARTIN, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MENRAD, METTEN, MÜLLER Gü., NEWTON DUNN, NIANIAS, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PISONI F., PLUMB, POLLACK, PRAG, PROUT, van PUTTEN, REDING, ROBLES PIQUER, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLEICHER, SELIGMAN, SIMMONDS, SISÓ CRUELLAS, STAVROU, SUÁREZ GONZÁLEZ, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, van der WAAL, von WOGAU, ZAVVOS.

(O)

BLAK, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, GRUND, JUNKER, LIVANOS, MARTIN D., MEGAHY, RØNN, SCHLECHTER, SCHMIDBAUER, TITLEY.

Amendment No 80

(+)

ALAVANOS, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ARBELOA MURU, AVGERINOS, BARTON, BERTENS, BETTINI, BJØRNVIG, BLAK, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOISSIÈRE, BOWE, Van den BRINK, BRITO, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CANO PINTO, CECI, CHANTERIE, COATES, COLOM I NAVAL, COT, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, DAVID, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESMOND, DESSYLAS, de VRIES, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, ELLIOTT, EPHREMIDIS, ERNST de la GRAETE, EWING, FALQUI, FITZSIMONS, FORD, FRIMAT, GARCÍA ARIAS, GERAGHTY, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GONZALEZ ALVAREZ, GREEN, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, HÄNSCH, HARRISON, HERMANS, HINDLEY, HOFF, HUME, JUNKER, KOSTOPOULOS, LALOR, LANE, LANGER, LANNOYE, LARIVE, LINKOHR, LIVANOS, LÜTTGE, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MELIS, MENDES BOTA, METTEN, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NIANIAS, NIELSEN, ONESTA, ONUR, PAPOUTSIS, PARTSCH, PIQUET, PLANAS PUCHADES, POLLACK, PONS GRAU, van PUTTEN, QUISTORP, RAFFIN, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, READ, RIBEIRO, RØNN, ROMEOS, ROTH, ROTHE, SAKELLARIOU, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SCHLECHTER, SCHMIDBAUER, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMPSON B., STAES, STEWART, TITLEY, TOPMANN, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VERDE I ALDEA, VISSER, von der VRING.

(-

ALBER, ANASTASSOPOULOS, BEAZLEY C., BEUMER, BRAUN-MOSER, BROK, CARVALHO CARDOSO, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, ELLES, ESCUDERO, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FONTAINE, FORTE, FUNK, GARCÍA AMIGO, GUIDOLIN, HERMAN, INGLEWOOD, KELLETT-BOWMAN, KEPPELHOFF-WIECHERT, LAGAKOS, LAMBRIAS, LANGENHAGEN, LATAILLADE, LENZ, LULLING, McCARTIN, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MENRAD, MÜLLER GÜ., NEWTON DUNN, NICHOLSON, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, OOSTLANDER, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PISONI F., PLUMB, PRAG, PROUT, REDING, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLEICHER, SIMMONDS, SISÓ CRUELLAS, STAVROU, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, van der WAAL, ZAVVOS.

(O)

GRUND, LANDA MENDIBE.

Resolution

(+)

ALAVANOS, von ALEMANN, ÁLVAREZ DE PAZ, ANASTASSOPOULOS, ANDREWS, APOLINÁRIO, ARBELOA MURU, AVGERINOS, BARTON, BERTENS, BETTINI, BLAK, BOFILL ABEILHE, BOISSIÈRE, Van den BRINK, BRITO, BRU PURÓN, CABEZÓN ALONSO, de la CÁMARA MARTÍNEZ, CANAVARRO, CANO PINTO, CASTELLINA, COATES, COLOM I NAVAL, COT, da CUNHA OLIVEIRA, DAVID, DE GUCHT, DEPREZ, DESAMA, DESMOND, DESSYLAS, de VRIES, DUARTE CENDÁN, DÜHRKOP DÜHRKOP, ELLIOTT, EPHREMIDIS, FALQUI, FITZSIMONS, FORD, FRIMAT, GARCÍA ARIAS, GERAGHTY, GOEDMAKERS, GÖRLACH, GREEN, GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ, HARRISON, HERMANS, HINDLEY, HOFF, HUGHES, HUME, JUNKER, KOSTOPOULOS, LALOR, LANE, LANGER, LANNOYE, LARIVE, LIVANOS, LÜTTGE, McGOWAN, MAGNANI NOYA, MAHER, MARTIN D., MEDINA ORTEGA, MEGAHY, MELIS, MENDES BOTA, METTEN, MIRANDA DA SILVA, MIRANDA DE LAGE, NEWENS, NEWMAN, NIELSEN, ONESTA, ONUR, PAPOUTSIS, PIQUET, POLLACK, PONS GRAU, van PUTTEN, QUISTORP, RAFFIN, RAMÍREZ HEREDIA, RIBEIRO, RØNN, ROMEOS, ROTH, ROTHE, SAKELLARIOU, SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA, SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, SAPENA GRANELL, SCHLECHTER, SCHMIDBAUER, SIERRA BARDAJÍ, SIMPSON B., STAES, STEWART, TITLEY, TOMLINSON, TOPMANN, VANDEMEULEBROUCKE, VAN HEMELDONCK, VAN OUTRIVE, VAYSSADE, VÁZQUEZ FOUZ, VERBEEK, VISSER, von der VRING, WIJSENBEEK.

(-)

ALBER, BEAZLEY C., BRAUN-MOSER, BROK, COONEY, CORNELISSEN, ELLES, ESCUDERO, FERNÁNDEZ-ALBOR, FERRER, FORTE, FUNK, GUIDOLIN, HERMAN, INGLEWOOD, KELLETT-BOWMAN, LAGAKOS, LAMBRIAS, LENZ, LUCAS PIRES, LULLING, MANTOVANI, MARCK, MÜLLER Gü., NEWTON DUNN, NIANIAS, NICHOLSON, OOMEN-RUIJTEN, PESMAZOGLOU, PIERROS, PISONI F., PLUMB, PRAG, PROUT, REDING, ROBLES PIQUER, SARIDAKIS, SARLIS, SCHLEICHER, SELIGMAN, SIMMONDS, SISÓ CRUELLAS, STAVROU, TAURAN, THEATO, THYSSEN, TINDEMANS, TURNER, VALVERDE LÓPEZ, van der WAAL, ZAVVOS.

(O)

BEUMER, BJØRNVIG, CHANTERIE, ESTGEN, LANGENHAGEN, OOSTLANDER, PIERMONT.