Official Journal

C 177

Volume 42 22 June 1999

of the European Communities

English edition

Information and Notices

Notice No	Contents	Page
	I Information	
	European Parliament	
	1999/2000 session	
(1999/C 177/01)	Minutes of the sitting of Monday 22 March 1999	
	1. Resumption of session	1
	2. Approval of Minutes of previous sitting	1
	3. Documents received	1
	4. Texts of agreements forwarded by the Council	3
	5. Order of business	3
	6. Commission statement (without debate)	4
	7. Resignation of the Commission (statement with debate)	4
	8. EAEC accession to KEDO — Relations with Democratic People's Republic of Korea (debate)	5
	9. Emigration from Iraq and neighbouring region (debate)	5
	10. Application of Community law (debate)	5
	11. Common system of value added tax * (debate)	6
	12. Agenda for next sitting	6
(1999/C 177/02)	Minutes of the sitting of Tuesday 23 March 1999	
	Part I: Proceedings of the sitting	
	1. Approval of Minutes of previous sitting	8
	2. Referral with power of decision to committees (Rule 52)	8
EN	3. Liability for defective products ***II (debate)	8
	4. Global governance and UN reform (debate)	8

Price: EUR 24,50 (Continued overleaf)

Contents (con	ntinued) F	Pag
Guideline	s for the draft general budget for 2000 (debate)	1
6. Police coo	operation * (debate)	
	o da Vinci' programme **II (debate)	
8. Official w	velcome	
VOTING TIM	E	
9. Financial	Regulation (Rule 52)	9
10. Resignation	on of the Commission (vote)	
11. Civil avia		10
	el documents * (procedure without debate) (vote)	10
13. European	Student Card (procedure without debate) (vote)	1
Van ta gumb	ola yand	
Key to symbo	Consultation procedure	
**I	Cooperation procedure: first reading	
**II	Cooperation procedure: second reading	
***	Assent procedure	
***]	Codecision procedure: first reading	
***II	Codecision procedure: second reading	
***III	Codecision procedure: third reading	
(The type of	procedure is determined by the legal basis proposed by the Commission.)	
"	relating to voting time	
on the amend	I otherwise, the rapporteurs informed the Chair in writing, before the vote, of their position dments.	n
Abbreviation	s used for Parliamentary Committees	
FASE	Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy	
AGRI	Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development	
BUDG	Committee on Budgets	
ECON	Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy	
RTDE	Committee on Research, Technological Development and Energy	
RELA	Committee on External Economic Relations	
LEGA	Committee on Legal Affairs and Citizens' Rights	
SOCI	Committee on Social Affairs and Employment	
REGI	Committee on Regional Policy	
TRAN	Committee on Transport and Tourism	
ENVI	Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection	
CULT	Committee on Culture, Youth, Education and the Media	
DEVE	Committee on Development and Cooperation	
CIVI	Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs	
INST	Committee on Institutional Affairs	
CONT	Committee on Budgetary Control	
FISH	Committee on Fisheries	
RULE	Committee on the Rules of Procedure, the Verification of Credentials and Immunities	
WOME	Committee on Women's Rights	
PETI	Committee on Petitions	
Abbreviation	s used for political groups	
PSE	Group of the Party of the European Socialists	
PPE	Group of the European People's Party (Christian-Democratic Group)	
ELDR	Group of the European Liberal Democrat and Reform Party	
UPE	Union for Europe Group	
GUE / NGL	Confederal Group of the European United Left / Nordic Green Left	
V	Green Group in the European Parliament	
ARE	Group of the European Radical Alliance	
I-EDN	Group of Independents for a Europe of Nations	
NI	Non-attached Members	
1		



Cor	ntents (continued)	Page
14.	Liability for defective products ***II (vote)	11
15.	'Leonardo da Vinci' programme **II (vote)	11
16.	Common system of value added tax * (vote)	11
17.	Police cooperation * (vote)	11
18.	Guidelines for the draft general budget for 2000 (vote)	12
19.	EAEC accession to KEDO — Relations with the Democratic People's Republic of Korea (vote)	12
20.	Emigration from Iraq and neighbouring region (vote)	13
21.	Application of Community law (vote)	13
22.	Global governance and UN reform (vote)	13
ENI	D OF THE VOTING TIME	
23.	Forwarding of texts adopted during the sitting	14
	Dates for next sittings	14
	Adjournment of session	14
-2.		
Par	t II: Texts adopted by Parliament	
1.	Financial Regulation (Rule 52)	
	A4-0140/99	
	Resolution on the Commission working document on the recasting of the Financial Regulation (SEC(98)1228 — C4-0689/98)	15
2.	Resignation of the Commission	
	B4-0327, 0328, 0329, 0330, 0331, 0332 and 0333/99	
	Resolution on the resignation of the Commission and the appointment of a new Commission	19
3.	Civil aviation **I (procedure without report)	
	Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Regulation (EEC) 3922/91 on the harmonisation of technical requirements and administrative procedures in civil aviation (COM(98)0759 — C4-0136/99 — 98/0349(SYN))	20
4.	False travel documents *	
	A4-0112/99	
	I. Draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union on the improved exchange of information to combat counterfeit travel documents (5003/99 - C4-0057/99 - 99/0904(CNS))	21
	Legislative resolution	23
	II. Draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union concerning the provision of equipment for the detection of false or falsified documents in the visa departments of diplomatic representations abroad and in the offices of domestic authorities dealing with the issue or extension of visas (5271/99 — C4-0056/99 — 99/0903(CNS))	23
	Legislative resolution	25
5.	European Student Card	
	A4-0122/99	
	Resolution on a European Student Card	26
6.	Liability for defective products ***II	
	A4-0068/99	
	Decision on common position (EC) No 3/1999 adopted by the Council with a view to adopting a European Parliament and Council Directive amending Council Directive 85/374/EEC on the approximation of the laws, regulations and administrative provisions of the Member States concerning liability for defective products (12872/1/98 — C4-0016/99 — 97/0244(COD))	28



Coı	nteni	ts (continued)	Page
7.	Leo	nardo da Vinci **Ⅱ	
		0108/99	
	Cou	cision on common position (EC) No 7/1999 adopted by the Council with a view to adopting a uncil Decision establishing the second phase of the Community vocational training action gramme 'Leonardo da Vinci' (C4-0001/99 – 98/0196(SYN))	29
8.	Cor	nmon system of value added tax *	
	A4-	0129/99	
	Dir	posal for a Council Directive amending, with regard to the level of the standard rate, ective 77/388/EEC on the common system of value added tax (COM(98)0693 — C4-0711/98 18/0331(CNS))	35
	Leg	islative resolution	36
9.	Poli	ice cooperation *	
	A4-	0110/99	
	I.	Draft action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K. 3 of the Treaty on European Union on police cooperation on the verge of the adoption of standards for joint operations (14061/98 — C4-0047/99 — 99/0908(CNS))	36
		Legislative resolution	38
	II.	Draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union with regard to combating international crime with fuller cover of the routes used (14060/98 – C4-0048/99 – 99/0907(CNS))	39
		Legislative resolution	40
10.	Gui	delines for the draft general budget for 2000	
	(a)	A4-0109/99	
		Resolution on the guidelines for the 2000 budget procedure — Section III — Commission	40
	(b)	A4-0120/99	
		Resolution on the guidelines for the 2000 budget procedure: Section I — European Parliament, Annex: Ombudsman; Section II — Council; Section IV — Court of Justice; Section V — Court of Auditors; Section V — Economic and Social Committee and Committee of the Regions and Joint Organisational Structure	44
11.	EA	EC accession to KEDO — EU-DPRK relations	
	(a)	A4-0104/99	
		Resolution on the Agreement on terms and conditions of the Accession of the European Atomic Energy Community to the Korean Peninsula Energy Development Organisation (KEDO) (C4-0483/97)	47
	(b)	B4-0326/99	
		Resolution on relations between the European Union and the Democratic People's Republic of Korea	51
12.	Em	igration from Iraq and neighbouring region	
	A4-	0079/99	
		olution on the influx of migrants from Iraq and the neighbouring region: EU action plan pted by the Council on 26 January 1998 (5573/98 — C4-0124/98)	53
13.	App	plication of Community law	
	A4-	0092/99	

Resolution on the 15th Annual Report from the Commission to the European Parliament on monitoring the application of Community law (1997) — (COM(98)0317 — C4-0377/98)

Resolution on the challenges of global governance and the reform of the United Nations $\,\ldots\,$

14. UN reform: public affairs at world level

A4-0077/99

56



I

(Information)

EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

1999/2000 SESSION

Sittings of 22 and 23 March 1999 ESPACE LEOPOLD — BRUSSELS

MINUTES OF THE SITTING OF MONDAY 22 MARCH 1999

(1999/C 177/01)

IN THE CHAIR: Mr GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO President

(The sitting opened at 17.05)

1. Resumption of session

The session, adjourned on 12 March 1999, was resumed.

2. Approval of Minutes of previous sitting

The following spoke:

- Mr Barón Crespo, who paid tribute to the memory of Yehudi Menuhin who had died on 12 March in Berlin;
- Mr Rübig, who referred to a crime which had been committed very close to Parliament and called for a police station to be opened in rue Wiertz (the President replied that he had already sent letters to the Belgian authorities on this problem and that he would make further representations);
- Mr Falconer, who with particular regard to remarks he had made during the sitting of 11 March (Part I, Item 5 of the Minutes of that day) referred again to the Commission's failure to pay the salaries of freelance interpreters and asked for an assurance that the explanatory note promised by Mrs Fontaine,

who had been in the Chair when he spoke, would be distributed (the President replied that the Bureau had decided to look into the matter and that a note would be distributed to Members; he added that all possible pressure would be brought to bear in the search for a solution to the problem).

The minutes of the previous sitting were approved.

3. Documents received

The President had received the following texts:

- (a) from the Council:
- (aa) requests for opinions on:
- Proposal for a Council Decision establishing a Community action programme to promote the integration of refugees (COM(98)0731 - C4-0049/99 - 98/0356(CNS))

referred to responsible: CIVI

opinion: FASE, BUDG, ESOC

legal basis: Art. 235 EC

- Proposal for a Council Regulation on the common organisation of the markets in the sugar sector (codified version) (COM(98)0794 - C4-0147/99 - 98/0370(CNS))

referred to responsible: LEGA opinion: AGRI

legal basis: Art. 42, 43 EC

(ab) opinions on proposals for transfers of appropriations:

 Opinion of the Council on transfer of appropriations No 01/99 between Chapters in Section III — Commission — Part A — of the General Budget for the European Union for the financial year 1999 (C4-0126/99)

referred to

responsible: BUDG

(ac) the following texts:

— Council Recommendation on the discharge to be given to the Management Board of the European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training in respect of the implementation of the statement of revenue and expenditure of the European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training for the financial year 1997 (5912/99 — C4-0148/99)

referred to

responsible: CONT opinion: ESOC

 Council Recommendation on the discharge to be given to the Administrative Board of the European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions in respect of the implementation of the statement of revenue and expenditure of the Foundation for the financial year 1997 (5913/99 – C4-0149/99)

referred to

responsible: CONT opinion: ESOC

(b) from the Commission:

(ba) proposals:

 Amended proposal for a European Parliament and Council Directive relating to motor vehicles and their trailers transporting certain animals and amending Directive 70/156/EEC in respect of the type-approval of motor vehicles and their trailers (COM(99)0053 — C4-0146/99 — 97/0190(COD))

referred to

responsible: ECON opinion: AGRI, TRAN

legal basis: Art. 100a EC

Amended proposal for a European Parliament and Council Directive on the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to the measures to be taken against the emission of gaseous and particulate pollutants from diesel engines for use in vehicles (COM(99)0089 - C4-0150/99 - 97/0350(COD))

referred to

responsible: ENVI opinion: ECON

legal basis: Art. 100a EC

(bb) the following texts:

— Opinion of the Commission on the European Parliament's amendments to the Council's common position regarding the proposal for proposal for a European Parliament and Council Directive concerning the approximation of the laws, regulations and administrative provisions of the Member States relating to the classification, packaging and labelling of dangerous preparations (COM(99)0115 — C4-0151/99 — 96/0200(COD))

referred to

responsible: ENVI opinion: BUDG

legal basis: Art. 100a EC

- (c) from the European Ombudsman:
- Annual Report 1998 (C4-0138/99)

referred to responsible: PETI

(d) from committees:

(da) reports:

 Report on the challenges of global governance and the reform of the United Nations — Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy

Rapporteur: Mr De Melo (A4-0077/99)

 Report on criminal procedures in the European Union (Corpus Juris) – Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs

Rapporteur: Mr Wiebenga (A4-0091/99)

 Report on the Agreement on terms and conditions of the Accession of the European Atomic Energy Community to the Korean Peninsula Energy Development Organisation (KEDO) (C4-0483/97) — Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy (Hughes procedure)

Rapporteur: Mr Tindemans (A4-0104/99)

Report on the guidelines for the 2000 budget procedure –
 Section III – Commission – Committee on Budgets

Rapporteur: Mr Bourlanges (A4-0109/99)

* Report

 I. on the draft joint action on police cooperation in the EU on the verge of the adoption of standards for joint operations (14061/98 — C4-0047/99 — 99/0908(CNS));

II. on the draft joint action with regard to combating international crime with fuller cover of the routes used (14060/98 – C4-0048/99 – 99/0907(CNS)) – Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs

Rapporteur: Sir Jack Stewart-Clark (A4-0110/99)

- * Report
- on the draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union on the improved exchange of information to combat counterfeit travel documents (5003/99 — C4-0057/99 — 99/ 0904(CNS));
- II. on the draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union concerning the provision of equipment for the detection of false or falsified documents in the visa departments of diplomatic representations abroad and in the offices of domestic authorities dealing with the issue or extension of visas (5271/98 C4-0056/99 99/0903(CNS)) Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs

Rapporteur: Mr Lehne (A4-0112/99)

Report on the guidelines for the 2000 budget procedure:
 Section I — European Parliament — Annex: Ombudsman;
 Section II — Council; Section IV — Court of Justice; Section V
 Court of Auditors; Section VI — Economic and Social
 Committee, Committee of the Regions and Joint Organisational
 Structure — Committee on Budgets

Rapporteur: Mrs Müller (A4-0120/99)

 Report on a European Student Card — Committee on Culture, Youth, Education and the Media

Rapporteur: Mr Evans (A4-0122/99)

* Report on the proposal for a Council Directive amending, with regard to the level of the standard rate, Directive 77/388/EEC on the common system of value added tax (COM(98)0693 – C4-0711/98 – 98/0331(CNS)) – Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy

Rapporteur: Mr Secchi (A4-0129/99)

- Report on the Commission working document on the recasting of the Financial Regulation (SEC(98)1228 - C4-0689/98) - Committee on Budgets

Rapporteur: Mr Dell'Alba (A4-0140/99)

(db) recommendations for second reading:

 **II Recommendation for second reading on common position (EC) No 7/1999 established by the Council with a view to adopting a Council Decision on the second phase of the Community vocational training action programme 'Leonardo da Vinci' (13380/2/98 — C4-0001/99 — 98/0196(SYN)) — Committee on Employment and Social Affairs

Rapporteur: Mrs Waddington (A4-0108/99)

- (e) from Members:
- (ea) oral questions (Rule 40):
- Spencer, on behalf of the Committee on Foreign Affairs,
 Security and Defence Policy, to the Council, on the European
 Union's relations with the Democratic People's Republic of
 Korea (North Korea) (B4-0147/99);
- Spencer, on behalf of the Committee on Foreign Affairs,
 Security and Defence Policy, to the Commission, on the
 European Union's relations with the Democratic People's
 Republic of Korea (North Korea) (B4-0148/99);
- Colino Salamance and Garot, on behalf of the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development, to the Commission, on vegetable protein supplies and the situation of starch manufacture (B4-0155/99);
- Estevan Bolea, Malerba, Ligabue, Danesin and Castagnetti, on behalf of the PPE Group, to the Commission, on the crisis in Venice (B4-0156/99);

4. Texts of agreements forwarded by the Council

The President had received from the Council certified true copies of the the following documents:

- Protocol establishing the fishing opportunities and the financial contribution provided for in the agreement between the European Economic Community and the Government of the Democratic Republic of São Tomé e Principe on fishing off the coast of São Tomé e Principe for the period 1 June 1996 to 31 May 1999;
- Agreement in the form of an exchange of letters concerning the provisional application of the protocol establishing the fishing opportunities and the financial contribution provided for in the agreement between the European Economic Community and the Government of the Democratic Republic of São Tomé e Principe on fishing off the coast of São Tomé e Principe for the period 1 June 1996 to 31 May 1999.

5. Order of business

The President reminded the House that the order of business for the sittings of 22 and 23 March 1999 had been established (Minutes of 8.3.1999, Item 10).

He proposed, however, in view of the events of the previous week, to amend the agenda for those sittings, pursuant to Rule 97, as follows (see PE 276.810/OJ/COR):

Monday 22 March, 17.00 to 21.00:

- statement by President of Commission (without debate)
- statement by Council following the resignation of the Commission (with debate)

The House was reminded that the deadline for tabling amendments and joint motions for resolutions was 22.00 that evening.

21.00 to 24.00:

- the joint debate on two reports by the Budgets Committee (Bourlanges — A4-0109/99 and Müller — A4-0120/99) on the agenda of 22 March (Items 99 and 101) would exchange places with the joint debate on the agenda of 23 March (Items 104 and 114) on a report and oral questions by the Foreign Affairs Committee (Tindemans report — A4-0104/99 and oral questions by Mr Spencer — B4-0147 and 0148/99)
- remainder of agenda unchanged

Tuesday 23 March:

apart from the abovementioned modification, the agenda was unchanged

* *

The following spoke:

- Mr Fabre-Aubrespy, who considered that the wording used in Item 158 of that day's agenda 'resignation of the Commission' did not accord with the reality as the Commission had not resigned *en masse* but each of its Members had resigned individually (the President agreed to the words: 'resignation of all the Members of the Commission' being used);
- Mrs Theato, chairman of the Committee on Budgetary Control, who called for the De Giovanni report (A4-0107/99 Item 150) to be referred back to committee pursuant to Rule 129(1);

The following spoke: Mrs Müller, who backed this request on behalf of the V Group, and Mr De Giovanni, rapporteur, and chairman of the Committee on Institutional Affairs, who also spoke on behalf of the PSE Group.

Parliament approved the request for referral back to committee.

— Mr Robles Piquer, who referred to the Commission's resignation and to the fact that the Commission was merely performing current business, and asked whether the debate on Agenda 2000 on the agenda of the Berlin Council fell within the definition of 'current business' (the President suggested the Council answer this question in the statement it would be making at the start of the agenda and added that a legal report concerning this matter was available to Members);

— Mr Ephremidis, who noted the possibility of imminent military action by NATO in Kosovo and called for the Council and Commission to keep Members abreast of the European Union's position on this matter (the President reminded the speaker that Kosovo was not on the agenda).

* *

The order of business was thus established.

6. Commission statement (without debate)

Mr Santer, President of the Commission, made a statement.

7. Resignation of the Commission (statement with debate)

Mr Fischer, President-in-Office of the Council, made a statement following the resignation of all the members of the Commission.

The following spoke: Mrs Green, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Martens, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Cox, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Pasty, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Puerta, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, Mrs Aelvoet, on behalf of the V Group, Mrs Lalumière, on behalf of the ARE Group and Mr Bonde, on behalf of the I-EDN Group.

IN THE CHAIR: Mrs FONTAINE

Vice-President

The following spoke: Mrs Muscardini, Non-attached Member, Mr Verheugen, President-in-Office of the Council, Mr Görlach, Mrs Theato, Mr Brinkhorst, Mr Rosado Fernandes, Mrs Moreau, Mrs Müller, Mrs Maes, Mr Fabre-Aubrespy, Mr Le Pen, Mr Medina Ortega, Mr Galeote Quecedo, Mrs Van Bladel, Mr Miranda, Mr Holm, Mr Hudghton, Mr Blokland, Mr Le Gallou, Mr Colajanni, Mr Elles, Mr Escolá Hernando, Mr Formentini, Mr Duhamel, Mr Brok and Mrs Raschhofer.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr GUTIÈRREZ DÌAZ

Vice-President

The following spoke: Mr Alan J. Donnelly, Mr Tillich, Mr Vanhecke, Mr Roubatis, Mr Castagnetti, Mr Marinho, Mrs Maij-Weggen, Mrs d'Ancona, Mr Christodoulou, Mrs Lööw, Mr Bourlanges, Mr Swoboda, Mr McCartin, Mr Desama, Mr McMillan-Scott, Mr Blak, Mrs Stenzel, Mrs Myller, Mrs Reding, Mrs Malone, Mr Cunha, Mr Fayot, Mr Burenstam Linder and Mrs Matikainen-Kallström.

The President had received motions for resolutions pursuant to Rule 37(2) from the following Members:

 Blokland, Bonde, Fabre-Aubrespy and Nicholson, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, on action to be taken in response to the report by the Committee of Independent Experts (B4-0325/99);

- Cox, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on the resignation of the Commission (B4-0327/99);
- Puerta, Moreau, Miranda, Vinci, Eriksson, Manisco and Alavanos, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, on the appointment of a new Commission (B4-0328/99);
- Aelvoet, on behalf of the V Group, on the resignation of the President of the Commission and the Commissioners (B4-0329/99);
- Lalumière, on behalf of the ARE Group, on the resignation of the Commission and the appointment of a new Commission (B4-0330/99);
- Green, on behalf of the PSE Group, on the resignation of the Commission and the appointment of a new Commission (B4-0331/99);
- Pasty, Gerard Collins, Rosado Fernandes, Caccavale, Kaklamanis, Van Bladel and Giansily, on behalf of the UPE Group, on the resignation of the European Commission (B4-0332/99);
- Martens, Oomen-Ruijten, Mendez de Vigo, Böge, Brok, Bourlanges, Herman and Elles, on behalf of the PPE Group, on the resignation of the Commission (B4-0333/99).

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 23.3.1999, Part I, Item 10.

(The sitting was suspended at 20.35 and resumed at 21.00)

IN THE CHAIR: Mr PODESTÀ

Vice-President

The President announced that the Council would not be present that evening due to prior engagements.

8. EAEC accession to KEDO — Relations with Democratic People's Republic of Korea (debate)

The next item was the joint debate on a report and two oral questions by the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy.

Mr Tindemans introduced his report on the agreement on terms and conditions of the accession of the European Atomic Energy Community to the Korean Peninsula Energy Development Organisation (KEDO) (C4-0483/97) (A4-0104/99).

Draftsmen of opinions (Hughes procedure): Mr Brinkhorst (BUDG) and Mr Ford (RTDE)

He also moved the oral questions which Mr Spencer had put to the Council and the Commission on the European Union's relations with the Democratic People's Republic of Korea (North Korea) (B4-0147 and 0148/99). The following spoke: Mr Brinkhorst, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Budgets, and on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Ford, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Research, Technological Development and Energy, and on behalf of the PSE Group, Sir Leon Brittan, Vice-President of the Commission, Mr Jarzembowski, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Kreissl-Dörfler, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Dupuis, on behalf of the ARE Group, who also expressed regret at the absence of the Council, Mr Brinkhorst who, in view of this absence, referred to Rule 40(4) and requested that the debate be suspended and resumed the following day (the President informed him that no more speakers were entered on the list) and who asked, before the vote the following day, for a written answer from the Council to the question put to it, and Sir Leon Brittan.

The President had received the following motion for a resolution pursuant to Rule 40(5):

 by Mr Tindemans, on behalf of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy, on relations between the European Union and the Democratic People's Republic of Korea (B4-0326/99).

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 23.3.1999, Part I, Item 19.

9. Emigration from Iraq and neighbouring region (debate)

Mrs Terrón i Cusí introduced her report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs, on the influx of migrants from Iraq and the neighbouring region: EU Action Plan adopted by the Council on 26 January 1998 (5573/98 — C4-0124/98) (A4-0079/99).

Draftsman of opinion (Hughes procedure): Mr Sakellariou (FASE)

The following spoke: Mr Lambrias, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Wiebenga, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Ceyhun, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Bertens and Mrs Gradin, Member of the Commission.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 23.3.1999, Part I, Item 20.

* *

Mrs Terrón i Cusí regretted that the Council had not answered the question put to it in the previous debate (the President replied that, pursuant to Rule 40, the Council was required to answer this question).

10. Application of Community law (debate)

Mrs Sierra González introduced her report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Citizens' Rights, on the fifteenth annual report on monitoring the application of Community law (1997) (COM(98)0317 — C4-0377/98) (A4-0092/99).

The following spoke: Mr Anastassopoulos, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mrs Thors, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mrs Palacio Vallelersundi and Sir Leon Brittan, Vice-President of the Commission.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 23.3.1999, Part I, Item 21.

11. Common system of value added tax * (debate)

Mr Secchi introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy, on the proposal for a Council Directive amending, with regard to the level of the standard rate, Directive 77/388/EEC on the common system of value added tax (COM(98)0693 — C4-0711/98 — 98/0331(CNS) (A4-0129/99).

The following spoke: Mr Paasilinna, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Mendes Bota, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Wolf, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Blot, Non-attached Member, and Sir Leon Brittan, Vice-President of the Commission.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 23.3.1999, Part I, Item 16.

12. Agenda for next sitting

The President announced the following agenda for the sitting of Tuesday 23 March 1999:

09.00 - 13.00:

- Roth-Behrendt recommendation for 2nd reading on liability for defective products ***II
- De Melo report on global governance and UN reform
- joint debate on the Bourlanges and Müller reports on guidelines for the draft general budget for 2000
- Stewart-Clark report on police cooperation *
- Waddington recommendation for 2nd reading on Leonardo da Vinci **II

15.00:

- voting time

(The sitting closed at 22.55)

Julian PRIESTLEY
Secretary-General

Magdalene HOFF Vice-President

ATTENDANCE REGISTER 22 March 1999

The following signed:

d'Aboville, Adam, Aelvoet, Ahern, Ainardi, Alavanos, Amadeo, Anastassopoulos, d'Ancona, Andersson, André-Léonard, Angelilli, Antony, Anttila, Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldarelli, Baldi, Balfe, Banotti, Bardong, Barón Crespo, Barthet-Mayer, Barton, Bazin, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Berger, Bernardini, Bertens, Bertinotti, Bianco, van Bladel, Blak, Blokland, Blot, Bösch, Bonde, Bontempi, Boogerd-Quaak, Bowe, Breyer, Brinkhorst, Bru Purón, Burenstam Linder, Burtone, Cabezón Alonso, Caligaris, Camisón Asensio, Campos, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Carnero González, Carniti, Carrère d'Encausse, Carrozzo, Cars, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnède, Castagnetti, Castricum, Caudron, Cederschiöld, Cellai, Ceyhun, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coates, Coelho, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colombo Svevo, Colom i Naval, Corbett, Cornelissen, Correia, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cot, Cottigny, Cox, Crampton, Crawley, Crowley, Cunha, Cushnahan, van Dam, Damião, Danesin, Dankert, Darras, Dary, Daskalaki, De Clercq, De Coene, De Esteban Martin, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Dell'Alba, De Luca, De Melo, Denys, Deprez, Desama, Dillen, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnay, Donnelly Alan John, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Dupuis, Dybkjær, Eisma, Elchlepp, Elles, Elliott, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Eriksson, Escolá Hernando, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Evans, Ewing, Fabra Vallés, Fabre-Aubrespy, Falconer, Fassa, Fayot, Ferber, Féret, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Fitzsimons, Flemming, Florio, Fontaine, Ford, Formentini, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Frischenschlager, Frutos Gama, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Gallagher, García Arias, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garot, Garriga Polledo, Gasòliba i Böhm, de Gaulle, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Giansily, Gillis, Gil-Robles Gil-Delgado, Girão Pereira, Glante, Glase, Goedbloed, Goepel, Goerens, Görlach, Gollnisch, Gomolka, González Álvarez, González Triviño, Graenitz, Graziani, Green, Gröner, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, Guinebertière, Gutiérrez Díaz, Haarder, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hänsch, Hager, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hatzidakis, Haug, Hautala, Hawlicek, Heinisch, Hendrick, Herman, Hermange, Hernandez Mollar, Herzog, Hoff, Holm, Howitt, Hudghton, Hughes, Hyland, Ilaskivi, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Rojo, Jarzembowski, Jensen Kirsten M., Jensen Lis, Jöns, Jové Peres, Junker, Kaklamanis, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kellett-Bowman, Kerr, Kestelijn-Sierens, Killilea, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kjer Hansen, Klaß, Klironomos, Kofoed, Kokkola, Krehl, Kreissl-Dörfler, Kristoffersen, Kronberger, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Lagendijk, Laignel, Lalumière, Lambraki, Lambrias, Lang, Langen, Langenhagen, Lannoye, Larive, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Lataillade, Le Gallou, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Leopardi, Le Pen, Leperre-Verrier, Le Rachinel, Ligabue, Lindeperg, Lindholm, Lindqvist, Linkohr, Lööw, Lómas, Lukas, Lulling, McAvan, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Maes, Maij-Weggen, Malerba, Malone, Manisco, Mann Erika, Mann Thomas, Manzella, Marin, Marinho, Martens, Martin David W., Martin Philippe-Armand, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mégret, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendiluce Pereiro, Mendonça, Menrad, Metten, Mezzaroma, Miller, Miranda, Miranda de Lage, Mohamed Ali, Mombaur, Monfils, Moorhouse, Morán López, Moreau, Moretti, Morgan, Morris, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Müller, Mulder, Muscardini, Musumeci, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Nassauer, Needle, Newman, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nicholson, Nordmann, Novo, Oddy, Ojala, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Paasilinna, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Palm, Papakyriazis, Papayannakis, Parigi, Pasty, Pérez Royo, Perry, Peter, Pettinari, Pex, Pimenta, Pinel, Pirker, Plooij-van Gorsel, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poisson, Pollack, Pomés Ruiz, Pompidou, Pradier, Pronk, Provan, Puerta, van Putten, Querbes, Rack, Rapkay, Raschhofer, Rauti, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rehder, Ribeiro, Riis-Jørgensen, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rosado Fernandes, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Rovsing, Rübig, Ryynänen, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre, Sakellariou, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sandbæk, Santini, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Scapagnini, Scarbonchi, Schäfer, Schaffner, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schifone, Schlechter, Schlüter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schnellhardt, Schörling, Schröder, Schroedter, Seal, Secchi, Seppänen, Sierra González, Simpson, Sindal, Sisó Cruellas, Skinner, Smith, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Sonneveld, Souchet, Spaak, Spencer, Spiers, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Stockmann, Striby, Sturdy, Svensson, Swoboda, Tajani, Tannert, Tappin, Tatarella, Taubira-Delannon, Telkämper, Terrón i Cusí, Teverson, Theato, Theonas, Theorin, Thomas, Thors, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Titley, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Trakatellis, Truscott, Tsatsos, Ullmann, Väyrynen, Valdivielso de Cué, Vallvé, Valverde López, Vanhecke, Van Lancker, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Verwaerde, Viceconte, Vinci, Viola, Virgin, Virrankoski, Waddington, Walter, Watson, Watts, Weber, Wemheuer, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiebenga, Wieland, Wiersma, Wijsenbeek, Willockx, Wilson, Wolf, Wurtz, Wynn

MINUTES OF THE SITTING OF TUESDAY 23 MARCH 1999

(1999/C 177/02)

PART I

Proceedings of the sitting

IN THE CHAIR: Mr GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO

President

(The sitting opened at 09.00)

1. Approval of Minutes of previous sitting

Mr Bourlanges had informed the Chair that he had been present the previous day but that he had forgotten to sign the attendance register.

The minutes of the previous sitting were approved.

2. Referral with power of decision to committees (Rule 52)

The Bureau had, on 10 March 1999, pursuant to Rule 52(1), referred with power of decision to the Committee on External Economic Relations the own-initiative report on multilateral commercial relations: the European Union and the developing partner countries of the EU (former title: on world trade and regional blocs) (INI0940) (for authorisation to draw up the report see Minutes of 19.12.97, Part I, Item 4).

3. Liability for defective products ***II (debate)

Mrs Roth-Behrendt introduced the recommendation for second reading, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection, on common position (EC) No 3/1999 adopted by the Council with a view to adopting a European Parliament and Council Directive amending Council Directive 85/374/EEC on the approximation of the laws, regulations and administrative provisions of the Member States concerning liability for defective products (12872/1/98 — C4-0016/99 — 97/0244(COD))(A4-0068/99).

The following spoke: Mrs Grossetête, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Eisma, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Blokland, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, Mrs Raschhofer, Non-attached Member, Mr Graenitz, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Whitehead, Mr Bru Purón, Mrs Flemming, Mrs Roth-Behrendt, rapporteur, and Mr Monti, Member of the Commission.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Item 14.

4. Global governance and UN reform (debate)

Mr De Melo introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy, on the challenge of global governance and the reform of the United Nations (A4-0077/99).

The following spoke: Mr Vecchi, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Development and Cooperation, Mr Barón Crespo, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Spencer, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Bertens, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Alavanos, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, Mrs Hautala, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Dupuis, on behalf of the ARE Group, and Mr Imbeni.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr AVGERINOS

Vice-President

The following spoke: Mr Carnero González, Mrs Schörling, Mr Howitt, Mr Ephremidis, Mr Amadeo and Mr Van den Broek, Member of the Commission.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Item 22.

5. Guidelines for the draft general budget for 2000 (debate)

The next item was the joint debate on two reports drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Budgets.

Mr Bourlanges introduced his report on guidelines for the 2000 budget procedure — Section III — Commission (A4-0109/99).

Mrs Müller introduced her report on guidelines concerning the 2000 budgetary procedure: Section I — European Parliament — Ombudsman annex; Section II — Council; Section IV — Court of Justice; Section V — Court of Auditors; Section VI — Economic and Social Committee and Committee of the Regions and Joint Organisational Structure (A4-0120/99).

The following spoke: Mr Ferber, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Research, Technological Development and Energy, Mrs Carlotti, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Development and Cooperation, Mr Wynn, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mrs Müller, rapporteur, on the previous speaker's remarks, Mr Elles, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Brinkhorst, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Giansily, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mrs Müller, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Dell'Alba, on behalf of the ARE Group, Mr Van Dam, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, Mr Samland, chairman of the Committee on Budgets, and Mr Hatzidakis.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr MARINHO

Vice-President

The following spoke: Mr Virrankoski, Mrs Dührkop Dührkop, Mr Bourlanges, rapporteur, Mr Liikanen, Member of the Commission, and Mr Bourlanges.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Item 18.

6. Police cooperation * (debate)

Sir Jack Stewart-Clark introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs, on

- I. police cooperation on the verge of the adoption of standards for joint operations (14061/98 — C4-0047/99 — 99/0908(CNS)) and
- II. with regard to combating international crime with fuller cover of the routes used (14060/98 — C4-0048/99 — 99/0907(CNS)) (A4-0110/99).

The following spoke: Mr Schmid, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Mendes Bota, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Rosado Fernandes, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Sjöstedt, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, Mr Blot, Non-attached Member, Mrs Matikainen-Kallström and Mrs Gradin, Member of the Commission.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Item 17.

7. 'Leonardo da Vinci' programme **II (debate)

Mrs Waddington introduced the recommendation for second reading, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs, on common position (EC) No 7/1999 adopted by the Council with a view to adopting a Council Decision establishing the second phase of the Community vocational training action programme 'Leonardo da Vinci' (13380/2/98 — C4-0001/99 — 98/0196(SYN)) (A4-0108/99).

The following spoke: Mr Wim van Velzen, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Mann, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mrs Boogerd-Quaak, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mrs Guinebertière, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Wolf, on behalf of the V Group, Mrs Maes, on behalf of the ARE Group, Mr Papakyriazis and Mr Pronk.

IN THE CHAIR: Mrs SCHLEICHER

Vice-President

The following spoke: Mr Lindqvist and Mr Liikanen, Member of the Commission.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Item 15.

(The sitting was suspended at 12.10 and resumed at 15.05.)

IN THE CHAIR: Mr GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO President

8. Official welcome

On behalf of Parliament, the President welcomed Mr José Saramago, the most recent recipient of the Nobel Prize for literature, who was in the official gallery.

* *

The following spoke:

- Mr Ford who said that the previous evening at approximately 21.00 a member of the Japanese Delegation to Parliament had been prevented from attending the debate on EAEC accession to KEDO by the security service who had said that the sitting was closed when in fact there was a night sitting; he asked that this service be made aware of Parliament's agenda (the President said that the matter would be looked into and steps taken to avoid such a situation happening again);
- Mr Duhamel who said that, according to Reuters, weapons had been seized from Mr Le Pen's car;
- Mr Martinez, following these remarks, who explained what weapons had been seized (the President said that Members wishing to have more details could ask him for a copy of the letter sent to him by Mr Martinez);
- Mrs Matikainen-Kallström who asked for measures to be taken to ensure that smokers observe the no-smoking areas in Parliament's premises (the President replied that provisions existed already but that reminders would be issued if necessary).

VOTING TIME

FOR RESULTS OF ROLL-CALL VOTES, SEE ANNEX TO THE MINUTES

9. Financial Regulation (Rule 52)

The President announced that, in the absence of written opposition by a tenth of Parliament's component Members belonging to at least three political groups, the resolution contained in the report by Mr Dell'Alba, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Budgets, on the Commission Working Document on the recasting of the Financial Regulation (SEC(98)1228 — C4-0689/98) (A4-0140/99) was deemed adopted, pursuant to Rule 52(5) (*Part II, Item 1*).

10. Resignation of the Commission (vote)

Motions for resolutions B4-0325, 0327, 0328, 0329, 0330, 0331, 0332 and 0333/99 (Simple majority)

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION B4-0325/99:

Parliament rejected the motion for a resolution.

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B4-0327, 0328, 0329, 0330, 0331, 0332 and 0333/99:

joint motion for a resolution tabled by the following Members:
 Green, on behalf of the PSE Group Martens, Oomen-Ruijten and Tillich, on behalf of the PPE Group Pasty, on behalf of the UPE Group Cox, on behalf of the ELDR Group

Puerta, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group Aelvoet, on behalf of the V Group Lalumière, on behalf of the ARE Group

to replace these motions with a new text:

Mrs Müller drew attention to a correction to be made to the German version of am. 10 to the joint motion for a resolution.

Amendments adopted: 15 by RCV (I-EDN), 16 by EV (303 for, 200 against, 9 abstentions); 17 by EV (302 for, 205 against, 9 abstentions); 14 by RCV (V); 13 by EV (296 for, 200 against, 31 abstentions); 12 (para. 5b) by RCV (PPE); 2 by EV (289 for, 218 against, 13 abstentions); 6 by RCV (V); 11 by RCV (V)

Amendments rejected: 3 by RCV (I-EDN); 4 by RCV (PPE); 18 by RCV (I-EDN); 19 by RCV (I-EDN); 20 by RCV (I-EDN); 21 by RCV (I-EDN); 1; 5 by RCV (PPE); 9 by RCV (V); 10 by RCV (V)

Amendments withdrawn: 12 (para. 5a); 7; 8

The different parts of the text were adopted in order, both parts of para. 2 (PPE), para. 4 (V, PPE), 5 (PPE), 7 (V, PPE), 8 (PPE), 9 (PPE) by RCV.

The following spoke during the vote:

— Mr Fabre-Aubrespy, first on am. 16 by his group, next to point out that am. 3 which departed further from the text than am. 14 should be put to the vote first (Mr Elles supported this proposal and the President agreed to it), next on am. 19 and finally to take over the 1st part of am. 12 (para. 5a) which had been withdrawn by Mrs Stenzel, co-author of this amendment, to which he nevertheless proposed an oral amendment seeking to have it read: 'insists that Members of the Commission who have resigned under no circumstances be allowed to be Members of the new Commission'.

The President established that more than 12 Members opposed this oral amendment which was therefore not taken into account.

— Mrs Green, on behalf of the PSE Group, proposed an oral amendment to am. 1 seeking to add after 5 May 1999 the words 'or at the latest by the end of the life of this Parliament'; Mr Cox, signatory of am. 1 on behalf of the ELDR Group, then agreed to this proposal but the President established that more than 12 Members opposed this oral amendment which was therefore not taken into account.

Split votes:

para. 2 (PSE)

1st part: the words 'the Members of'

2nd part: remainder of text

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (V) (Part II, Item 2).

IN THE CHAIR: Mr COT

Vice-President

The President announced that the consolidated text of the resolution would be available that afternoon in all the official languages.

11. Civil aviation ****I** (procedure without report) (vote)

Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Regulation (EEC) 3922/91 on the harmonisation of technical requirements and administrative procedures in civil aviation (COM(98)0759 — C4-0136/99 — 98/0349(SYN)) (Simple majority)

referred to

responsible: TRAN opinions: ECON, LEGA

PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(98)0759 — C4-0136/99 — 98/0349(SYN):

Parliament approved the Commission proposal (Part II, Item 3).

12. False travel documents * (procedure without debate) (vote)

Report by the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs on draft joint actions adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union on:

- I. the provision of equipment for the detection of false or falsified documents in the visa departments of diplomatic representations abroad and in the offices of domestic authorities dealing with the issue or extension of visas (5003/99 – C4-0057/99 – 99/0904(CNS) and
- II. the improved exchange of information to combat counterfeit travel documents (5271/99 – C4-0056/99 – 99/0903/CNS)) (A4-0112/99)

(rapporteur: Mr Lehne). (Simple majority)

 DRAFT JOINT ACTION 5003/99 — C4-0057/99 — 99/ 0904(CNS):

Amendments adopted: 1; 15; 2 and 4 collectively; 16 by EV (248 for, 173 against, 11 abstentions); 5 and 6 collectively; 17; 18

Amendment not put to the vote (Rule 125(1)(e)): 3

Parliament approved the Council draft as amended (Part II, Item 4).

DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (Part II, Item 4).

II. DRAFT JOINT ACTION 5271/99 — C4-0056/99 — 99/ 0903(CNS):

Amendments adopted: 19; 7; 8 to 14 collectively

Parliament approved the Council draft as amended (Part II, Item 4).

DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (Part II, Item 4).

13. European Student Card (procedure without debate) (vote)

Report by the Committee on Culture, Youth, Education and the Media on the European Student Card (A4-0122/99) (rapporteur: Mr Evans). (Simple majority)

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (PSE) (Part II, Item 5).

14. Liability for defective products ***II (vote)

Roth-Behrendt recommendation for 2nd reading — A4-0068/99

(Qualified majority)

COMMON POSITION OF THE COUNCIL 12872/1/98 — C4-0016/99 — 97/0244(COD):

Amendments rejected: 1 by RCV (V); 2 to 5 collectively; 6 by RCV (V); 7 and 8 collectively

The President declared the common position approved (Part II, Item 6).

15. 'Leonardo da Vinci' programme **II

(vote)

Waddington recommendation for 2nd reading — A4-0108/99

(Qualified majority)

Mrs Boogerd-Quaak, on behalf of the ELDR Group, asked that, in view of the fact that the report of the Committee of Experts had raised concerns in connection with the 'Leonardo' programme, consideration of this recommendation for 2nd reading be postponed to the next part-session pursuant to Rule 131.

Mrs Waddington, rapporteur, and Mr Wolf, on behalf of the V Group, spoke on this request.

Parliament rejected the request.

Mr Ford reminded the House that the use of mobile phones was banned in the Chamber.

COMMON POSITION OF THE COUNCIL 13380/2/98 – C4-0001/99 – 98/0196(SYN):

Amendments adopted: 1; 2; 3 to 6 collectively; 9; 11; 13; 36; 14 to 20 collectively; 22 to 25 collectively; 34; 35 by EV (380 for, 81 against, 3 abstentions); 27 to 29 and 31 to 33 collectively

Amendments rejected: 8 by EV (290 for, 173 against, 11 abstentions); 10; 12; 21

Amendments fallen: 37; 38; 26

Amendments not put to the vote (Rule 125(1)(e)): 7 and 30

Separate votes: am. 2 (ELDR); 8, 10, 12, 21 (PPE)

The common position was thus amended (Part II, Item 7).

16. Common system of value added tax * (vote)

Secchi report — A4-0129/99 (Simple majority)

PROPOSAL FOR A DIRECTIVE COM(98)0693 — C4-0711/98 — 98/0331(CNS):

Amendments rejected: 2 by EV (213 for, 228 against, 17 abstentions); 1 by EV (213 for, 232 against, 20 abstentions)

Parliament approved the Commission proposal (Part II, Item 8).

DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (Part II, Item 8).

17. Police cooperation * (vote)

Stewart-Clark report — A4-0110/99 (Simple majority)

I. DRAFT JOINT ACTION 14060/98 — C4-0048/99 — 99/0907(CNS):

Amendments adopted: 1; 12; 3 to 6 collectively

Amendment fallen: 2

Parliament approved the Council draft as amended (Part II, Item 9).

DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (Part II, Item 9).

II. DRAFT JOINT ACTION 14061/98 — C4-0047/99 — 99/0908(CNS):

Amendments adopted: 7 and 9 collectively; 13; 10 and 11 collectively

Amendment cancelled: 8

Parliament approved the Council draft as amended (Part II, Item 9).

DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (Part II, Item 9).

18. Guidelines for the draft general budget for 2000 (vote)

Bourlanges A4-0109/99 and Müller A4-0120/99 reports (Simple majority)

(a) A4-0109/99

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 10(a)).

(b) A4-0120/99

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Amendments adopted: 1 by EV (238 for, 193 against, 15 abstentions); 2 by EV (224 for, 199 against, 12 abstentions)

Amendments rejected: 3; 4; 6 by RCV (V); 9; 7 and 8

Amendment withdrawn: 5

The different parts of the text were adopted in order, para. 13 by RCV (V), paras 14 to 16 collectively by EV (263 for, 170 against, 3 abstentions), para. 19 by EV (270 for, 172 against, 2 abstentions).

The 2nd part of para. 18 was rejected by EV (205 for, 240 against, 9 abstentions).

Separate votes: para. 19 (Mr Wynn, on behalf of the PSE Group)

Split votes:

para. 18 (PSE)

1st part: up to 'submitted' 2nd part: remainder

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 10(b)).

19. EAEC accession to KEDO — Relations with the Democratic People's Republic of Korea

(vote

Tindemans report — A4-0104/99 and motion for a resolution B4-0326/99 (Simple majority)

(a) A4-0104/99

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Mr Tindemans, rapporteur, spoke on the three amendments tabled by the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy and paras 4 and 5 of the motion for a resolution.

Amendments adopted: 1; 2; 3

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

The following parts were rejected: para. 4, the 1st part of para. 5 (the 2nd part thus fell)

Separate votes: para. 4 (FASE); 10; 14; 24 and 25 (V)

Split votes:

para. 5 (V)

1st part: up to 'in reserve' 2nd part: remainder

para. 9 (V):

1st part: up to 'internationally'

2nd part: remainder

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 11(a)).

(b) B4-0326/99

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION:

The following spoke: Mr Brinkhorst who first said that the Council had been absent during the debate the previous evening and that he had asked for a written answer to the oral question, and then asked if the Council had indeed sent an answer (the President said it had and that it would be distributed to Members), Mr Tindemans on the amendments tabled by the ARE Group and Mr Dupuis, signatory of these amendements, on the previous speaker's remarks.

Amendments rejected: 1; 4; 5; 2; 3; 6; 7; 8; 9; 10; 11

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

Separate votes: para. 9 (V)

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 11(b)).

20. Emigration from Iraq and neighbouring region (vote)

Terrón i Cusí report — A4-0079/99 (Simple majority)

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Mrs Terrón i Cusí, rapporteur, withdrew the end of ams 1 and 4 which she had tabled on behalf of the PSE Group, and which should as a result read respectively as follows: 'draws attention to Turkish incursions into the area' (am. 1) and 'calls on the Member States ... repression of the Kurdish people' (am. 4). After having also regretted the absence of the Council during yesterday's debate, she asked if the protest she had made had been forwarded to the Council and what its reaction had been (the President established that there was no opposition to the two oral amendments proposed by the rapporteur being taking into consideration).

Amendments adopted: 1 amended orally; 2; 3; 4 amended orally

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

Split votes:

para. 19 (UPE)

1st part: up to 'immigration'

2nd part: remainder

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 12).

21. Application of Community law (vote)

Sierra González report — A4-0092/99 (Simple majority)

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 13).

22. Global governance and UN reform (vote)

De Melo report — A4-0077/99 (Simple majority)

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Amendments adopted: 1; 2; 3; 4; 9 by EV (187 for, 142 against, 7 abstentions); 5; 6; 7; 10; 8

Amendment rejected: 11

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 14).

* *

Explanations of vote were made by the following Members:

Resignation of the Commission

orally: Ephremidis, von Habsburg, Lulling, Breyer, Fabre-Aubrespy, Habsburg-Lothringen, Palm

— *in writing:* Hautala, on behalf of the V Group; Van Dam and Blokland, on behalf of the I-EDN Group; Berthu; Ferrer; Filippi; Martinez; Banotti; Schörling, Holm, Lindholm

Lehne report — A4-0112/99

- in writing: Sjöstedt, Eriksson, Svensson; Hager

Evans report — A4-0122/99

 in writing: Eriksson, Sjöstedt, Svensson; Palm, Wibe, Theorin; Titley

Roth-Behrendt recommendation for 2nd reading — A4-0068/

- in writing: Sandbæk, on behalf of the I-EDN Group

Waddington recommendation for 2nd reading — A4-0108/99

- orally: Raschhofer

- in writing: Seillier, on behalf of the I-EDN Group; Lindqvist

Stewart-Clark report - A4-0110/99

in writing: Buffetaut; Palm, Wibe, Theorin; Lindqvist;
 Deprez

Bourlanges report — A4-0109/99

- orally: Fabre-Aubrespy, on behalf of the I-EDN Group

- in writing: Palm, Wibe, Theorin

Tindemans report — A4-0104/99

- orally: von Habsburg, Iversen

in writing: Lindqvist, Holm, Schörling, Lindholm

Terrón i Cusí report – A4-0079/99

— *in writing:* Palm, Theorin, Lööw, Sandberg-Fries, Andersson; Lindqvist

De Melo report — A4-0077/99

in writing: Theorin, Palm, Wibe; Deprez

* *

Corrections to votes — Members present but not voting

Resignation of the Commission

am. 15
 Intended to vote for: Lulling

para. 2, 1st part
 Intended to vote for: Ferrer, Kirsten M. Jensen, Blak,
 Iversen, Sindal

para. 2, 2nd part
 Intended to vote for: Ferrer, Kirsten M. Jensen, Blak,
 Iversen, Sindal
 Intended to vote against: Sonneveld

- am. 3
 Intended to vote for: Chichester, McMillan-Scott
- am. 19
 Intended to vote for: Raschhofer, Iversen, Sindal Intended to abstain: Cederschiöld
- para. 4
 Intended to vote for: Cederschiöld, Metten
 Intended to vote against: Fabre-Aubespy, Novo
 Intended to abstain: McKenna
- para. 5
 Intended to vote for: Cederschiöld
 Intended to abstain: Lindeperg
- am. 20
 Intended to vote for: Nicholson
 Intended to vote against: Poisson
- para. 7
 Intended to vote for: Riis-Jørgensen, Soulier, Decourrière
 Intended to vote against: Lis Jensen
- am. 6
 Intended to vote for: De Clercq, Lis Jensen
 Intended to vote against: Carlsson
- am. 5
 Intended to vote for: Cederschiöld
- am. 9
 Intended to vote for: Lis Jensen
- para. 8
 Intended to vote for: Sindal, Cederschiöld
- para. 9
 Intended to vote for: Metten
- am. 10
 Intended to vote against: Carlsson
- am. 11
 Intended to vote for: Bennasar Tous, Stenzel, Haarder Intended to vote against: Sandbæk, Kirsten M. Jensen, Blak, Iversen, Sindal, Lindqvist, Lis Jensen Intended to abstain: Hermange, Poisson

 joint motion for a resolution as a whole Intended to vote for: Poisson, Stenzel Intended to vote against: Lis Jensen

Evans report — A4-0122/99

motion for a resolution
 Intended to vote for: Pompidou

Roth-Behrendt recommendation for 2nd reading — A4-0068/

am. 1
 Intended to vote for: Keppelhoff-Wiechert and Klaß

END OF VOTING TIME

23. Forwarding of texts adopted during the sitting

The President informed Parliament, pursuant to Rule 133(2), that the Minutes of that day's sitting would be submitted to Parliament for its approval at the beginning of its next sitting.

With Parliament's agreement, he stated that he would forward the texts that had just been adopted forthwith to the bodies named therein.

24. Dates for next sittings

The President announced that the next sittings would be held from 12 to 16 April 1999.

25. Adjournment of session

The session was adjourned.

(The sitting closed at 16.40)

Julian PRIESTLEY
Secretary-General

José María GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO President

PART II

Texts adopted by the European Parliament

1. Financial Regulation (Rule 52)

A4-0140/99

Resolution on the Commission working document on the recasting of the Financial Regulation (SEC(98)1228-C4-0689/98)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Commission working document, SEC(98)1228 C4-0689/98,
- having regard to the Financial Regulation of 21 December 1977 applicable to the general budget of the European Communities (¹),
- having delegated the power of decision, pursuant to Rule 52 of its Rules of Procedure, to the Committee on Budgets,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgets and the opinion of the Committee on Budgetary Control (A4-0140/99),
- A. having regard to its resolutions in 1995, 1996, 1997 and 1998 on the Commission's annual legislative programme and its unceasing call for the Commission to submit a proposal to recast the Financial Regulation,
- B. having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control on giving discharge to the Commission in respect of the implementation of the general budget of the European Communities for the 1996 financial year (A4-0502/98) and the resolution of 14 January 1999 (²) concerning the same subject and recommending that the Commission submit a proposal to recast the Financial Regulation,
- C. having regard to the debate on the Commission's reactions to Parliament's vote of 17 December 1998 concerning the discharge procedure for 1996 and to the Commission President's proposals in that debate on the recasting of the Financial Regulation (3),
- 1. Gives the Commission the following guidelines for the recasting of the Financial Regulation and calls on it to take account of them with a view to the legislative proposal to be submitted by it before 30 June 1999;

Quality of drafting

- 2. Accepts the Commission's suggestion to reorganise the present Regulation into two parts (general provisions and special provisions relating to specific sectors); reserves the right to consider, on a case-by-case basis, the Commission's proposed wording intended to simplify the text, given that a measure of detail might continue to be necessary;
- 3. Suggests that a schedule of all the sectoral financial provisions subordinate to the general principles laid down by the Financial Regulation be drawn up in the legislative text; calls on the Commission to provide a register of all the statements relating to the Regulation which have been entered in the minutes of the Council or of conciliation meetings, during the successive processes of amending it, with a view to their possible incorporation into the legislative text;
- 4. Proposes that there should be consideration of the scope for taking account, within the purview of the Regulation, of certain elements of 'soft law' constituted by the interinstitutional agreements, and in particular the content of Article 17 of the 1993 IIA, which presumes agreement on the MRI if the financial perspective ceilings are complied with;

OJ L 356, 31.12.1977, p. 1, as last amended by Council Regulation (EC, ECSC, Euratom) No 2779/98 of 17 December 1998 ('eighth series' of amendments), OJ L 347, 23.12.1998, p. 3.

⁽²⁾ Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 1.

⁽³⁾ Verbatim report of 11 January 1999.

- 5. Recalls that the transparency and completeness of the budget structure, as provided for by the Financial Regulation, are a *sine qua non* for correct implementation and calls for the prohibition of the use of any administrative procedure which is external to the budget as a basis for implementation;
- 6. Agrees that it is necessary to transfer certain provisions from the Financial Regulation to the implementing rules and vice versa;

Provision of information to the European Parliament

- 7. Affirms its intention of stating in more detail the Commission's obligations, laid down in Article 89 of the current Regulation, to provide the budgetary authority with information, given the serious shortcomings which emerged in the discharge procedure for 1996 and in the light of the powers available to the Court of Auditors with regard to access to documents; takes the view that an interinstitutional agreement on the application of Article 206(2) of the Treaty (future Article 276) should establish a procedure of the kind that governs Parliament's right of inquiry, so as to ensure the confidentiality of any information that is forwarded, appearances by officials or other agents who have been summoned, etc. and thus create a climate of trust between the discharge authority and the authority being inspected;
- 8. Recalls its attachment to the principles which guarantee the protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms, and its concern not to interfere in *sub judice* proceedings; stresses that its own procedures have hitherto enabled it to ensure that these principles are complied with, particularly in the context of discharge, but considers that these provisions should be codified and adapted;

Prevention and punishment of financial irregularities

- 9. Calls for the Financial Regulation to enshrine as soon as possible the recommendations which the high-level group proposed by the Presidency-in-Office of the Council, comprising the representatives of the three institutions, may be led to make with a view to creating a new anti-fraud agency independent of the Commission;
- 10. Proposes that, pending ratification of the Convention of 26 July 1995 on the protection of the European Communities' financial interests and of the protocols thereto (¹), the possibility of incorporating those international instruments into the Financial Regulation ought to be studied;
- 11. Notes the uncertainties in the concept of 'tasks involving the European public service', which ought to be spelled out in order better to demarcate delegations of power by the Commission to third parties; considers that provision ought to be made for harsher penalties in the event that an outside person to which a Community activity has been subcontracted acts without having been delegated or authorised to do so;
- 12. Cautions against any temptation to classify tasks which fall within the remit of the European public service, such as in connection with proposals for submissions in the context of invitations to tender, as auxiliary activities;

Bolstering the principle of budget unity

- 13. Supports the Commission's position in favour of applying the Financial Regulation and Article 205 of the Treaty (future Article 274) to expenditure relating to the activities coming under the second and third pillars (CFSP and JHA) where they are borne by the Community budget; also restates its call for activities such as the Schengen Information System (SIS), the Eurodac system and Europol itself to be included in the budget;
- 14. Insists on budgetisation of the activities currently financed outside the budget, such as the various European funds (in particular the Guarantee Fund for External Actions), borrowing and lending operations, the decentralised agencies and the European Development Fund; expects specific proposals from the Commission in this connection;
- 15. Proposes, if certain activities cannot yet be fully budgetised, that a series of principles be specified, such as Parliament's involvement in the Commission's annual forecasting exercise, inclusion of the operations in the regular budget implementation reports pursuant to Article 34 of the Financial Regulation, the applicability of the Financial Regulation to the activities concerned and the power of the Commission and the Court of Auditors to carry out the necessary checks;

- 16. Stresses the importance it attaches to inclusion of the activities of the decentralised agencies in the budget, and proposes that the code of conduct (accepted by all the agencies in the 1999 budget) should at least be incorporated into the purview of the Financial Regulation, in particular as regards informing the budgetary authority in advance about changes in their internal budget procedures;
- 17. Opposes the Commission's suggestion to treat negative expenditure in the agricultural sector as re-use of appropriations or as earmarked revenue, and advocates that such amounts should, rather, be regarded as revenue to be added as such to the budget;
- 18. Reaffirms its rejection of the negative-revenue practice involving administrative costs assumed to have been incurred by the Member States in collecting own resources, and kept by them, which is therefore tantamount to a deduction from the revenue belonging to the Community budget;
- 19. Recalls its resolution of 15 July 1998 on the interest earned on funds from the Community budget (¹), and agrees with the Court of Auditors that interest constitutes revenue to be paid over to the Community budget;
- 20. Recalls the undertaking given by the Commission, in the context of conciliation on the seventh series of amendments, to draw up provisions governing, in a manner which is coherent and consistent with the objectives of sound financial management, treatment of the interest yielded by Community budget appropriations;

Flexibility in the budget

- 21. Considers it desirable, while recalling its resolution of 2 April 1998 on the guidelines for the 1999 budget procedure Section III Commission (²), to lay down provisions permitting the Commission to submit a request for transfer, where this is requested by either arm of the budgetary authority, to transfer appropriations from an operating budget item to the reserve in the light of conditions for implementation;
- 22. States its willingness to consider the Commission's proposals to provide a framework for making use of the reserve instrument if the principle set out in paragraph 21 is accepted;
- 23. Proposes that there should be consideration of the scope for creating earmarked reserves, where a transfer would not take place until payments had become necessary (3);
- 24. Backs the Commission with regard to maintaining the current practice regarding carry-over of appropriations;
- 25. Takes the view that the omnibus transfer procedures can be reviewed in order to arrive at a common procedure for examination by the two arms of the budgetary authority which would be both more transparent and more effective;
- 26. Takes the view that the provisions of Article 15(5) of the Financial Regulation, which allow only the Council not to adopt a draft supplementary and amending budget without Parliament's agreement, should be reconsidered, so as to take account of the obligation, deriving from the Treaty, to cooperate in good faith;

The structure of the budget and the definition and nature of appropriations

27. Recalls paragraph 25 of its resolution of 17 December 1998 on the draft general budget of the European Union for the financial year 1999 as modified by the Council (all sections) and on Letter of Amendment No 1/99 to the preliminary draft budget for 1999 — Section III — Commission (4), which established the principle that appropriations in Part B cannot be used for administrative expenditure unless this has been duly authorised by the budgetary authority in its remarks; confirms its position that the use of amounts over and above the ceiling laid down by the budgetary authority shall be deemed to constitute a failing punishable by disciplinary action, and reiterates its call to the Commission to include these principles in the revision of the Financial Regulation;

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 292, 21.9.1998, p. 61.

⁽²) OJ C 138, 4.5.1998, p. 149.

⁽³⁾ See paragraph 3 of resolution of 2.4.1998 referred to above.

⁽⁴⁾ Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 1.

- 28. Is nonetheless open to the notion of moving to a different presentation of the allocation of financial and administrative resources ('activity-based budgeting'), provided that transparency can be ensured and the budgetary authority's decision-taking capacity is not diminished;
- 29. Also states its willingness to consider the appropriateness of making more general use of differentiated appropriations (commitment appropriations and payment appropriations) in other parts of the budget;

Financial management

- 30. Presses for a number of clarifications concerning the new system of *ex post* or spot-check financial control introduced by the seventh series of amendments, under which the Financial Controller no longer necessarily gives prior approval to commitments; calls in this connection for the *ex post* establishment of irregularities to have serious consequences (recovery of expenditure, disciplinary procedure);
- 31. Insists that, even within a highly computerised financial management system, the Court of Auditors should retain access to original supporting documents and retain the possibility of checking original documents on the spot;
- 32. Takes the view that it is appropriate to continue with the current system for the awarding of grants by the Commission as far as those provided for in Part A of Section III of the budget are concerned;
- 33. Welcomes also the rules which the Commission is planning to apply in the case of grants in order to ensure their transparency, in accordance with the undertakings it has given during the debate on the discharge for the 1996;
- 34. Accepts the remarks by the Commission concerning the need for better reporting on budget implementation and its remarks concerning accounting, and can subscribe to the objective of bringing the contract award provisions of the Financial Regulation into line with the provisions contained in the public contracts Directives and in the Agreement on Government Procurement (AGP) concluded within the WTO, and in particular notes with satisfaction the Commission's desire, with regard to external aid, to improve the clarity of the rules which apply to the applicant countries;
- 35. Supports, subject to the specific rules, the initiative which the Commission has taken at the instigation of the Court of Auditors to improve the definition and Regulation of the concepts of 'advances' and 'payments on account' and the system for the treatment of interest which such funds yield;
- 36. Notes with satisfaction the amendments proposed by the Commission with regard to the ACPC, in particular the reference in the Financial Regulation to the setting of the threshold and the abolition of the ACPC-JRC;
- 37. Calls on the Commission to propose provisions which:
- endow the rules governing commitments with the regulatory clarity required by the Court of Auditors;
- establish a coherent system defining the powers of those involved in budget transactions, recalling, in
 this connection, the Court of Auditors' proposals for authorising officers to be made responsible for
 the proper functioning of such a system;
- increase the dependence of future decisions on the outcome of evaluations;
- incorporate into the Financial Regulation the provisions which will govern causes, cases and consequences of conflicts of interest, pursuant to Article 22; calls for those provisions to be such as to relate not only to players in the budgetary procedure but also to administrative staff, be they employed on a statutory or any other basis, and to any persons who may exert influence on the budgetary and administrative procedures, including Members of the Commission in the appropriate legal context;

Final remarks

38. Underscores its willingness to reach agreement on recasting as quickly as possible;

* *

39. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission and the Council.

2. Resignation of the Commission

B4-0327, 0328, 0329, 0330, 0331, 0332 and 0333/99

Resolution on the resignation of the Commission and the appointment of a new Commission

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the first Report by the Committee of Independent Experts on the allegations of fraud, mismanagement and nepotism in the Commission,
- having regard to the decision of the President and the Members of the Commission to resign from office,
- A. whereas the European Parliament has consistently stressed, including in its resolution of 14 January 1999 on improving the financial management of the Commission (¹), the need to combat fraud and ensure better and more responsible administration of the EU budget; recalling the findings of the Court of Auditors and the Committee of Budgetary Control,
- B. whereas the Commission has withheld important documents from Parliament (Article 206 (future Article 276) of the EC Treaty,
- whereas following publication of the Report, which indicated a generalised lack of accountability, the Commission resigned in accordance with President Santer's earlier commitment,
- D. convinced that a strong European Union inevitably requires a strong Commission which is capable of acting in an efficient and transparent manner,
- 1. Acknowledges the first report by the Committee of Independent Experts and expresses its appreciation of the report and its substantial content and reasoning; notes its conclusions and takes note of the criticism of the lack of sense of responsibility and the loss of administrative and management control demonstrated by Commissioners individually and by the Commission as a body; takes note that the committee did not encounter cases where a Commissioner was directly and personally involved in fraudulent activities:
- 2. Respects the decision by the Members of the Commission to resign as both necessary and proportionate to the nature and scale of the criticism contained in the conclusions of the Committee of Independent Experts' report and as an act which recognises the need for political responsibility and democratic accountability;
- 3. Following the report and its conclusions, calls on the Commission to re-examine the case of Paul Van Buitenen;
- 4. Looks forward to the second report by the Committee of Independent Experts containing a more wide-ranging review of the Commission's culture, practices and procedures and in particular its concrete recommendations for strengthening these procedures and any other appropriate reforms to be considered by Commission and Parliament; this report should deal amongst other issues with procedures in existence for the awarding of financial contracts and of contracts for interim or temporary staff to implement programmes, with procedures for following up allegations of fraud, mismanagement and nepotism (detection and treatment), and with the treatment by the Commission of cases of fraud, mismanagement and nepotism, involving staff; this report must be finished by the beginning of September 1999;
- 5. Considers that the institutional crisis represents an opportunity to reinforce the political and democratic dimension of the EU, by strengthening the accountability of the Commission to Parliament and by offering the chance to build a new, strong, politically responsible and efficient Commission;

⁽¹⁾ Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 1.

- 6. Notes that the principle of collegiality remains important but believes that it should not exempt individual Commissioners from the consequences, not only of any personal wrongdoing, but also of any incompetent or negligent management of their own areas of responsibility; further believes that the report of the Committee of Independent Experts strongly establishes the case for individual executive responsibility as the basis for a stronger, independent and political Commission founded on the principle of democratic accountability;
- 7. Demands of the Council that a procedure be laid down as soon as possible which enables individual Commissioners to be called to account;
- 8. Notes that in recommending budget discharge for 1996 the Council failed to assume its responsibilities as one of the two arms of the budget authority;
- 9. Regrets that on the very day of publication of the Committee of Independent Experts' report and conclusions the Council should recommend budget discharge for 1997 again without assuming its political responsibilities;
- 10. Calls on the European Council at its extraordinary meeting in Berlin to put forward, in collaboration with Parliament, a precise and reasonable calendar for dealing with the appointment of the new Commission and asks the governments of the Member States as a matter of urgency to put forward their candidate for the post of President of the Commission and subsequently for those of Commissioners; recalls that this Commission, in accordance with the Treaty, is appointed for the remaining period of the Commission's mandate, i.e. until the end of this year, and insists that the procedures laid down by the Amsterdam Treaty shall apply both to the approval of this Commission and to the Commission which will take office as from 1 January 2000;
- 11. Insists that the number of new women Commissioners increase substantially in the new College of Commissioners:
- 12. Insists that the Commission initiate an ambitious and thoroughgoing programme of radical reform of its financial management and financial control procedures and of its entire management culture with a view to establishing appropriate and better standards for the conduct of European affairs based on the principle of transparency;
- 13. Insists that the resignation of the Commission must not be used by the European Council as an excuse or reason for postponing a final and comprehensive decision regarding the Agenda 2000 package at its extraordinary meeting in Berlin;
- 14. Calls on the Member States to deposit their instruments of ratification relating to the Treaty of Amsterdam as soon as possible;
- 15. Calls on Member State governments to take decisive action in order to ensure that Parliament too is given the instruments to improve its credibility and accountability *vis-à-vis* public opinion, by finding an agreement on Parliament's proposal regarding a statute for its Members before the next European elections:
- 16. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the European Council, the governments of the Member States and the national parliaments.

3. Civil aviation **I (procedure without report)

Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Regulation (EEC) 3922/91 on the harmonisation of technical requirements and administrative procedures in civil aviation (COM(98)0759 - C4-0136/99 - 98/0349(SYN))

(Cooperation procedure: first reading)	
The proposal was approved.	

4. False travel documents *

A4-0112/99

I.

Draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union on the improved exchange of information to combat counterfeit travel documents (5003/99 - C4-0057/99 - 99/0904(CNS))

The draft was approved with the following amendments:

COUNCIL DRAFT AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 1)

Citation 2a (new)

Having regard to the opinion of the European Parliament,

(Amendment 15)

Recital -1 (new)

Whereas Article K.1 stipulates that without prejudice to the powers of the European Community, Member States shall regard the following areas as matters of common interest:

- rules governing the crossing by persons of the external borders of the Member States and the exercise of controls thereon;
- immigration policy and policy regarding nationals of third countries:
 - (a) conditions of entry and movement by nationals of third countries on the territory of Member States;
 - (b) conditions of residence by nationals of third countries on the territory of Member States, including family reunion and access to employment;
 - (c) combating unauthorised immigration, residence and work by nationals of third countries on the territory of Member States;

(Amendment 2)

Recital 4

with the intention of making possible or speeding up the conduct of criminal proceedings by means of standardised information collection,

with the intention furthermore of improving the potential for using such information in the speedier conduct of criminal proceedings,

(Amendment 4)

Article 2

- 1. A standard form, the content of which shall be determined by the *False Documents Working Party*, shall be used to transmit information in accordance with Article 1.
- 1. A standard form, the content of which shall be determined by the **Council**, shall be used to transmit information in accordance with Article 1.

COUNCIL DRAFT

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

- 2. The exchange of information shall take place directly and without delay between the central units of the Member States, with the General Secretariat of the Council being notified thereof.
- 2. The exchange of information shall take place directly and without delay between the central units of the Member States, with the General Secretariats of **the Commission and** the Council being notified thereof.

(Amendment 16)

Article 3(1)

- 1. For the purposes of uniformly collecting information which may *presumably* be *required* for subsequent criminal proceedings for falsifying travel documents, Member States shall use a questionnaire *drawn up by the False Documents Working Party*.
- 1. For the purposes of uniformly collecting information which may be **of use** for subsequent criminal proceedings for falsifying travel documents, Member States shall use a **model** questionnaire, **the content of which shall be established by the Council**.

(Amendment 5)

Article 3(2)

- 2. Personal data shall be communicated to other Member States *in accordance with* national law and international conventions.
- 2. Personal data shall be communicated to other Member States, in compliance with European Parliament and Council Directive 96/9/EC (¹) and maintaining the greatest possible legal protection, on the basis of European Union legislation, national law and international conventions.
- (1) OJ L 77, 27.3.1996, p. 20.

(Amendment 6)

Article 3a (new)

Article 3a

The Council shall adopt the implementing measures referred to in Article 2(1) and Article 3(1) by a qualified majority as laid down in Article 148 of the EC Treaty.

(Amendment 17)

Article 4

This Joint Action shall be published in the Official Journal. It shall enter into force three months after its publication.

This Joint Action shall be published in the Official Journal. It shall enter into force three months after its publication. It shall remain applicable for 12 months.

(Amendment 18)

Article 4a (new)

Article 4a

- 1. The Commission shall first of all submit to the Council and the European Parliament its report on the future compilation, transfer and processing of data covered by Title IIIa of the Treaty of Amsterdam and, three months after the entry into force of that Treaty, shall draw up a proposal for a regulation on a measure which shall replace this Joint Action.
- 2. A proposal for a measure which shall replace this Joint Action shall be submitted at the latest six months before the expiry of the validity of this Joint Action.

Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union on the improved exchange of information to combat counterfeit travel documents (5003/99 — C4-0057/99 — 99/0904(CNS))

(Consultation procedure)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Council draft, 5003/99 99/0904(CNS),
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article K.6(2) of the Treaty on European Union (C4-0057/99),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs (A4-0112/99),
- 1. Approves the Council draft, subject to Parliament's amendments;
- 2. Calls on the Council to alter its draft accordingly;
- 3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament and consult it again should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
- 4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and Commission.

II.

Draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union concerning the provision of equipment for the detection of false or falsified documents in the visa departments of diplomatic representations abroad and in the offices of domestic authorities dealing with the issue or extension of visas (5271/99 — C4-0056/99 — 99/0903(CNS))

The draft was approved with the following amendments:

COUNCIL DRAFT AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 19)

Citation 1a (new)

Having regard to the initiative of Germany,

(Amendment 7)

Citation 1b (new)

Having regard to the opinion of the European Parliament,

(Amendment 8)

Recital -1 (new)

Whereas Article K.1 stipulates that without prejudice to the powers of the European Community, Member States shall regard the following areas as matters of common interest:

 rules governing the crossing by persons of the external borders of the Member States and the exercise of controls thereon;

COUNCIL DRAFT

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

- immigration policy and policy regarding nationals of third countries:
 - (a) conditions of entry and movement by nationals of third countries on the territory of Member States;
 - (b) conditions of residence by nationals of third countries on the territory of Member States, including family reunion and access to employment;
 - (c) combating unauthorised immigration, residence and work by nationals of third countries on the territory of Member States;

(Amendment 9)

Article 3a (new)

Article 3a

To ensure uniform levels of expertise and state of the art equipment for detecting forged documents in the visa-issuing authorities, the Member States of the European Union shall ensure that staff are given the requisite training at regular intervals and that the equipment meets the requirements of Article 3.

(Amendment 10)

Article 3b (new)

Article 3b

The Member States of the European Union shall undertake to make an inventory of their visa-issuing authorities to gain an overview of the potential risk of false and falsified visas in the relevant visa departments.

(Amendment 11)

Article 3c (new)

Article 3c

Criminal proceedings shall be envisaged for any person involved in the falsification and/or counterfeiting of passports to which visas are to be affixed.

(Amendment 12)

Article 3d (new)

Article 3d

- 1. The Council may decide to amend this joint action unanimously.
- 2. The Council may adopt the necessary implementing measures by a qualified majority as laid down in Article 148 of the EC Treaty.

COUNCIL DRAFT AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 13)

Article 4

This Joint Action shall be published in the Official Journal and shall enter into force on the day following its publication.

This Joint Action shall be published in the Official Journal. It shall enter into force three months after its publication. It shall remain in force for a period of 12 months.

(Amendment 14)

Article 4a (new)

Article 4a

- 1. The Commission shall forward its report on the future of the collection, transfer and processing of data within the framework of Title IIIa of the Treaty of Amsterdam to the Council and the European Parliament.
- 2. Three months at the latest after the entry into force of the Treaty of Amsterdam or at least six months before the joint action expires, whichever shall be the earlier, the Commission shall submit a proposal for an action to replace this joint action.

Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union concerning the provision of equipment for the detection of false or falsified documents in the visa departments of diplomatic representations abroad and in the offices of domestic authorities dealing with the issue or extension of visas (5271/99 - C4-0056/99 - 99/0903(CNS))

(Consultation procedure)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Council draft, 5271/99 99/0903(CNS),
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article K.6 of the Treaty on European Union (C4-0056/99),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs (A4-0112/99),
- 1. Approves the Council draft, subject to Parliament's amendments;
- 2. Calls on the Council to alter its draft accordingly;
- 3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament and consult it again should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
- 4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and Commission.

5. European Student Card

A4-0122/99

Resolution on a European Student Card

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Treaty on European Union, in particular Articles 126 and 127 (future Articles 149 and 150) thereof.
- having regard to the agreement concluded in Lisbon on 1 June 1987 between the organisations managing young people's passes in Scotland, Spain, Portugal, the Netherlands, Belgium, France, Greece and Luxembourg, and the ensuing EURO<26 youth card,
- having regard to its resolution of 17 February 1989 on the need for a European young people's pass (1),
- having regard to its resolution of 16 February 1990 on Community education and training programmes (2),
- having regard to its resolution of 25 January 1991 on the European dimension at university level, with particular reference to student and teacher mobility (3),
- having regard to its resolution of 14 June 1991 on Community policies and their impact on youth (4),
- having regard to its resolution of 15 July 1993 on the Commission memorandum on higher education in the European Community (5),
- having regard to Directive 93/96/EEC on the right of residence for students (6),
- having regard to the judgement of the European Court of Justice of 15 March 1994 in Case C-45/93 on discrimination against foreign tourists (7),
- having regard to the Council Resolution of 31 March 1995 on cooperation in the field of youth information and studies concerning youth (8),
- having regard to its resolution of 12 March 1997 on the Commission White Paper on Education and Training, 'Teaching and Learning: Towards the Learning Society' (COM(95)0590 – C4-0597/95) (9),
- having regard to its resolution of 14 May 1997 on the Commission Green Paper on 'Education, Training, Research: The Obstacles to Transnational Mobility' (COM(96)0462 - C4-0580/96) (10),
- having regard to its resolution of 26 June 1997 on the Commission Communication to the Council, the European Parliament, the Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions, 'Learning in the Information Society — action plan for a European education initiative (1996-1998)' (COM(96)0471 - C4-0528/96) (11),
- having regard to the conclusions of the EU Youth Ministers, meeting within the Council, of 28 October 1997,
- having regard to European Parliament and Council Decision 1686/98/EC of 20 July 1998 establishing the Community action programme 'European Voluntary Service for Young People' (12),
- having regard to European Parliament and Council Decision 51/99/EC of 21 December 1998 on the promotion of European pathways for work-linked training including apprenticeship (13),

OJ C 69, 20.3.1989, p. 213.

OJ C 68, 19.3.1990, p. 175.

OJ C 48, 25.2.1991, p. 216.

OJ C 183, 15.7.1991, p. 469

OJ C 255, 20.9.1993, p. 161

OJ L 317, 18.12.1993, p. 59. European Court Reports 1994, p. I-0911. OJ C 207, 12.8.1995, p. 5. OJ C 115, 14.4.1997, p. 85.

OJ C 167, 2.6.1997, p. 94. OJ C 222, 21.7.1997, p. 48.

OJ L 214, 31.7.1998, p. 1.

⁽¹³⁾ OJ L 17, 22.1.1999, p. 45.

- having regard to its resolution of 13 May 1998 on the Commission Communication to the Council, the European Parliament, the Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions, 'Towards a Europe of Knowledge' (COM(97)0563 — C4-0649/97) (¹),
- having regard to the conclusions of the Cardiff European Council of 15 and 16 June 1998,
- having regard to the proposal for a European Parliament and Council Decision establishing the Community action programme for youth (2),
- having regard to the proposal for a European Parliament and Council Decision establishing the second phase of the Community action programme in the field of education (Socrates) (3),
- having regard to the proposal for a Council Decision establishing the second phase of the Community vocational training action programme 'Leonardo da Vinci' (4),
- having regard to the forthcoming Commission proposal for a statute for mobility of students in the European Community,
- having regard to Rule 148 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Culture, Youth, Education and the Media, (A4-0122/99),
- A. whereas we are in the process of building a Europe for the people, a process in which young people are more enthusiastic than other age groups,
- B. whereas the Community has as one of its main aims an ever closer union among the peoples of Europe, and as a result should encourage greater mutual contacts and understanding between the citizens of the different Member States whilst also increasing individual awareness of the Community dimension.
- C. whereas individual mobility is a vital element of the European Community's investment in human resources.
- D. whereas increased student mobility is essential in order to provide better qualified people who have experience of studying, living and working in other Member States,
- E. whereas the time spent studying is as much a life experience as it is an academic one, when people are generally more open to new experiences and ideas, a time that helps shape individuals,
- F. whereas past, current and future EU programmes for education, youth and training have actively sought to encourage mobility of young people and students, notably Erasmus, European Voluntary Service, Leonardo da Vinci and Youth for Europe,
- G. whereas previous Parliament resolutions have called for the introduction of a 'young people's pass' entitling young people to concessions which give them easier access to cultural facilities and promote their mobility throughout the Community,
- H. whereas equality should be an integral part of education, and whereas more general and more equal access to cultural goods are important dimensions of equality of opportunity among citizens,
- I. whereas a variety of cards or passes already exist for either students and/or young people throughout the European Community which give a variety of concessions, but there is no official European Union 'student card',
- J. whereas the principle of mutual recognition of national or regional cards or passes which identify the holder as a 'student' is still not always respected for the purposes of concessions for physical mobility or cultural access,

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 167, 1.6.1998, p.136.

⁽²) OJ C 311, 10.10.1998, p. 6

⁽³⁾ OJ C 314, 13.10.1998, p. 5.

⁽⁴⁾ OJ C 309, 9.10.1998, p. 9.

- 1. Calls on the European Commission to conduct a feasibility study into the possibility of introducing a European Union student card and other options such as the use of an official European Union logo on nationally issued student cards to enhance mutual recognition of these;
- 2. Calls on the Member States and the Commission to continue to take appropriate measures to ensure that barriers to mobility for all students are removed;
- 3. Calls on the Commission to examine how particular use may be made of a European Union student card by reductions, where applicable, to encourage greater participation in cultural activities, or greater access to facilities, which receive European Union funding;
- 4. Recommends that information campaigns should be conducted through the media and Internet, particularly with the establishment of a web site, on how the card can be obtained and where reductions are available in each of the Member States, such campaigns also to include information on exchange programmes and citizens' rights and to be carried out in close cooperation with the national, regional and local authorities responsible for issuing existing cards;
- 5. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission, the Council and the governments of the Member States.

6. Liability for defective products ***II

A4-0068/99

Decision on common position (EC) No 3/1999 adopted by the Council with a view to adopting a European Parliament and Council Directive amending Council Directive 85/374/EEC on the approximation of the laws, regulations and administrative provisions of the Member States concerning liability for defective products (12872/1/98 — C4-0016/99 — 97/0244(COD))

(Codecision procedure: second reading)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the common position of the Council, 12872/1/98 C4-0016/99 97/0244(COD) (¹),
- having regard to its opinion at first reading (2) on the Commission proposal to Parliament and the Council (COM(97)0478) (3),
- having regard to Article 189b(2) of the EC Treaty,
- having regard to Rule 72 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the recommendation for second reading of the Committee on the Environment,
 Public Health and Consumer Protection (A4-0068/99),
- Approves the common position;
- 2. Calls on the Council to adopt the act definitively, and as soon as possible, in accordance with the common position;

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 49, 22.2.1999, p. 1.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 359, 23.11.1998, p. 25.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 337, 7.11.1997, p. 54.

- 3. Instructs its President to sign the act with the President of the Council pursuant to Article 191(1) of the EC Treaty;
- 4. Instructs its Secretary-General duly to sign the act and, in agreement with the Secretary-General of the Council, to have it published in the Official Journal;
- 5. Instructs its President to forward this decision to the Council and the Commission.

7. Leonardo da Vinci **II

A4-0108/99

Decision on common position (EC) No 7/1999 adopted by the Council with a view to adopting a Council Decision establishing the second phase of the Community vocational training action programme 'Leonardo da Vinci' (13380/2/98 — C4-0001/99 — 98/0196(SYN))

(Cooperation procedure: second reading)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the common position of the Council, 13380/2/98 C4-0001/99 98/0196(SYN) (¹),
- having regard to its opinion at first reading (²) on the Commission proposal to the Council COM(98)0330 (³),
- having regard to the amended Commission proposal (COM(98)0697) (4),
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 189c of the EC Treaty,
- having regard to Rule 67 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the recommendation for second reading of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs (A4-0108/99),
- 1. Amends the common position as follows;
- 2. Instructs its President to forward this decision to the Council and Commission.

(4) OJ C 14, 19.1.1999, p. 9.

COMMON POSITION OF THE COUNCIL

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 1)

Recital 9a (new)

(9a) Whereas the Commission, in conjunction with the Member States, is seeking to secure consistency and complementarity between the actions under this programme and Community action of a structural nature, particularly by facilitating the transfer and dissemination on a wider scale, through the European Social Fund, of innovatory approaches and methods developed under this programme; whereas the Commission, in partnership with both sides of industry, is endeavouring to develop cooperation between this programme and the activities of the Community social dialogue;

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 49, 22.2.1999, p. 65.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 359, 23.11.1998, p. 44.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 309, 9.10.1998, p. 9

COMMON POSITION OF THE COUNCIL

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 2)

Recital 15a (new)

(15a) Whereas the extension in the duration of the programme and the political priority given to vocational training require a substantial increase in the resources allocated to this programme;

(Amendment 3)

Article 2(1)(a)

- (a) improve the skills and competences of people, especially young people, in initial vocational training at all levels; this may be achieved inter alia through work-linked vocational training and apprenticeship with a view to promoting employability and facilitating vocational integration and reintegration;
- (a) improve the skills and competences of people, including young people, in initial vocational training and retraining at all levels and all stages of working life; this may be achieved inter alia through work-linked vocational training and apprenticeship with a view to promoting employability and facilitating vocational integration and reintegration:

(Amendment 4)

Article 2(1)(c)

- (c) promote and reinforce the contribution of vocational training to the process of innovation, with a view to improving competitiveness and entrepreneurship; special attention shall be paid in this respect to fostering cooperation between vocational training institutions, including universities, and undertakings, particularly SMEs.
- (c) promote and reinforce the contribution of vocational training to the process of innovation, with a view to improving competitiveness and entrepreneurship, particularly in relation to new sources of employment; special attention shall be paid in this respect to fostering cooperation between vocational training institutions, including universities, and undertakings, particularly SMEs.

(Amendment 5)

Article 2(2)

- 2. In implementing the objectives set out in paragraph 1, particular attention shall be paid to people at a disadvantage in the labour market, to the promotion of equality and to equal opportunities for women and men.
- 2. In implementing the objectives set out in paragraph 1, particular attention shall be paid to **systems and practices facilitating access to training for** people at a disadvantage in the labour market, **to the removal of all forms of discrimination**, to the promotion of equality and to equal opportunities for women and men **and to the vocational and social integration of disabled people**.

(Amendment 6)

Article 3(1)(a)

- (a) support for the transnational mobility of people undergoing vocational training, *especially* young people, and for those responsible for training ('Mobility');
- (a) support for the transnational mobility of people undergoing vocational training, including young people, and for those responsible for training ('Mobility');

COMMON POSITION OF THE COUNCIL

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 9)

Article 5(2), first indent

- take the necessary steps to secure, by means of appropriate structures, the coordination, an integrated management and the follow-up for the attainment of the objectives of this programme, involving all the parties concerned by vocational training, in accordance with national practice;
- take the necessary steps to secure, by means of appropriate structures, the coordination, an integrated management and the follow-up in terms of monitoring and evaluation for the attainment of the objectives of this programme, involving all the parties concerned by vocational training, in accordance with national practice;

(Amendment 11)

Article 9(2a) (new)

2a. The Commission and the Member States shall furthermore ensure consistency and complementarity between action taken under this programme and Community action under the European Social Fund. They shall in particular facilitate the transfer and dissemination on a wider scale, through the European Social Fund, of innovatory approaches and methods developed under this programme.

(Amendment 13)

Article 13(4)

- 4. Member States shall submit to the Commission by 31 December 2003 and 30 June 2007 respectively reports on the implementation and effectiveness of this programme and its impact on the vocational training systems and arrangements which exist in the Member States.
- 4. Member States shall submit to the Commission by 31 December 2003 and 30 June 2007 respectively reports on the implementation and effectiveness of this programme and its impact on the vocational training systems and arrangements which exist in the Member States. Specific mention shall be made of the measures taken to combat all forms of discrimination and to promote equality of opportunity between men and women and the impact of these measures in terms of participation in the programme.

(Amendment 36)

Article 13(5)

- 5. The Commission shall submit to the European Parliament, the Council and the Economic and Social Committee:
- an interim report on the implementation of this programme

by 30 June 2004;

- a communication on the continuation of this programme by 31 December 2004; where appropriate, that communication shall contain a suitable proposal;
- a final report on the implementation of this programme by 31 December 2007.

- 5. The Commission shall submit to the European Parliament, the Council and the Economic and Social Committee:
- a first interim report on the implementation of this programme by 30 June 2002;
- a second interim report on the implementation of this programme by 30 June 2004;
- a communication on the continuation of this programme by 31 December 2005; where appropriate, that communication shall contain a suitable proposal;
- a final report on the implementation of this programme by 31 December 2007.

COMMON POSITION OF THE COUNCIL

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 14)

Annex I, Section I(2)

- 2. Each proposal submitted by a transnational partnership will pursue one *or more* of the objectives of the programme, and will indicate the measure(s) it intends to implement in order to achieve its aims. Proposals can be submitted for activities integrating various measures according to Article 3(1) and in a manner to be determined by the Committee referred to in Article 7 of the Decision. With the exception of measures 1 (Mobility) and 3 (Language Competences) as described in Section II, each proposal must involve partners from at least three participating countries, of which at least *one* must be a Member State of the European Union. In the case of project proposals under Measures 1 and 3, each proposal must involve partners from at least two participating countries, of which at least one must be a Member State of the European Union.
- 2. Each proposal submitted by a transnational partnership will pursue one of the objectives of the programme, and will indicate the measure(s) it intends to implement in order to achieve its aims. Proposals can be submitted for activities integrating **over the years** various measures according to Article 3(1) and in a manner to be determined by the Committee referred to in Article 7 of the Decision. With the exception of measures 1 (Mobility) and 3 (Language Competences) as described in Section II, each proposal must involve partners from at least three participating countries, of which at least **two** must be a Member State of the European Union. In the case of project proposals under Measures 1 and 3, each proposal must involve partners from at least two participating countries, of which at least one must be a Member State of the European Union.

(Amendment 15)

Annex I, Section I(5)

- 5. Proposal selections will take place at least once yearly in accordance with the procedures defined in Section III.
- 5. The proposals can be sent in at any time during the period of validity of the call for proposals. Proposal selections will take place at least once yearly in accordance with the procedures defined in Section III.

(Amendment 16)

Annex I, Section I(7a)(new)

7a. Article 2(2) provides that the selected projects must respect the principle of equality of opportunity and pay particular attention to people at a disadvantage in the labour market. The special needs of the disabled shall also be taken into account in setting the level of subsidies.

(Amendment 17)

Annex I, Section II(1), subtitle

Support for transnational mobility projects for people undergoing vocational training, *especially* young people, and for trainers

Support for transnational mobility projects for people undergoing vocational training, **including** young people, and for trainers.

(Amendment 18)

Annex I, Section II(1)(a), third indent a (new)

 any persons undergoing vocational training who are not covered by the above categories and who are participating in a programme of liefelong learning, career redirection or reintegration;

COMMON POSITION OF THE COUNCIL

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 19)

Annex I, Section II(1)(a), second paragraph

Whenever possible, these placements *should* involve the validation of skills and competences acquired during the placement, according to the practices of the country of origin.

Whenever **the duration of the placement makes it** possible, these placements **shall** involve the validation of skills and competences acquired during the placement, according to the practices of the country of origin.

(Amendment 20)

Annex I, Section II(1), last paragraph

The transnational placement and exchange projects may last up to two years.

The transnational placement and exchange projects may last up to two years. They will include provisions ensuring full access for any disabled participants taking into account the additional costs of participation.

(Amendment 22)

Annex I, Section II(1), Funding, last paragraph

Any unused part of this allocation *may be redeployed by the management structure* elsewhere within this measure.

The management structure may, in agreement with the Commission, redeploy any unused part of this allocation elsewhere within this measure.

(Amendment 23)

Annex I, Section II(2), Thematic Actions, second indent

- actions in support of Member States' policies and initiatives to equip with appropriate skills those at a disadvantage in the labour market, particularly those *young* people who have no qualifications;
- actions in support of Member States' policies and initiatives to equip with appropriate skills those at a disadvantage in the labour market, particularly those people who have no qualifications or whose qualifications need updating;

(Amendment 24)

Annex I, Section II(3), first paragraph

Community support is available for transnational pilot projects to develop language competences *linked to the promotion of the social and occupational integration of people, especially young people, and a higher level of employability and adaptability of workers.* Special attention will be paid to projects on less widely used and taught languages.

Community support is available for transnational pilot projects to develop language competences **in a vocational training context**. Special attention will be paid to projects on less widely used and taught languages.

(Amendment 25)

Annex I, Section II(5), second indent a (new)

introducing arrangements to observe innovatory practices in lifelong training, particularly with regard to access to continuing training, in close conjunction with the social partners at the various levels.

COMMON POSITION OF THE COUNCIL

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 34)

Annex I, Section II (7)(3)

- 3. In carrying out the programme, the Commission can have recourse to technical assistance organisations the financing of which shall be provided for within the overall envelope for the programme. It can, under the same conditions, have recourse to experts. Furthermore, the Commission will be able to organise seminars, colloquia or other meetings of experts, likely to facilitate the implementation of the programme and take forward information, publication and dissemination actions.
- 3. The Commission shall recruit the staff necessary to carrying out the programme from its own ranks. Furthermore, the Commission will be able to organise seminars, colloquia or other meetings of experts, likely to facilitate the implementation of the programme and take forward information, publication and dissemination actions.

(Amendment 35)

Annex I, Section II (7)(4)

- 4. The respective roles and tasks of *the technical assistance organisation(s) and* the national management structures should be defined.
- 4. The respective roles and tasks of the national management structures for programme implementation pursuant to Article 5 should be precisely defined.

(Amendment 27)

Annex I, Section III, introduction, second and third indents

- Procedure B applicable to:
 - pilot projects (measure 2) except for thematic actions,
 - language competences (measure 3),
 - transnational networks (measure 4);
- Procedure C applicable to:
 - reference material (measure 5),
 - thematic actions (within measure 2),
 - joint actions (measure 6),
 - projects of European organisations (under all measures).

- Procedure B applicable to:
 - pilot projects (measure 2) except for thematic actions,
 - language competences (measure 3),
- Procedure C applicable to:
 - reference material (measure 5),
 - thematic actions (within measure 2),
 - joint actions (measure 6),
 - projects of European organisations (under all measures),
 - transnational networks (measure 4).

(Amendment 28)

Annex I, Section III(1)(v)

- (v) The Member States will submit to the Commission an annual report on the results of the mobility programmes.
- (v) The Member States will submit to the Commission an annual report on the results of the mobility programmes. The report shall indicate clearly for each programme and by group of beneficiaries:
 - the target publics of the programme;
 - the contents and objectives in terms of skills and/or qualifications;
 - the duration of training and/or work learning experience in a training establishment and/or company;

COMMON POSITION OF THE COUNCIL

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

- the partners associated in the other Member State or States;
- the arrangements for validating or recognising skills and/or qualifications acquired in the training system of the Member State in which the beneficiaries began their training.

(Amendment 29)

Annex I, Section III(2)(i)

- (i) Under the rules defined in the call for proposals, preproposals are to be submitted by the promoters to the management structure designated by the Member State.
- (i) Under the rules defined in the call for proposals, preproposals are to be submitted by the promoters to the management structure designated by the Member State. The promoters will also send a copy of their preproposal to the Commission.

(Amendment 31)

Annex I, Section III(2)(viii)

- (viii) The process on stages (iii) to (vi) *should* not take more than five months.
- (viii) The period between the Community call for proposals and the communication of the outcome of the selection of pre-proposals shall not exceed three months; the process on stages (iii) to (vi) shall not take more than five months.

(Amendment 32)

Annex I, Section III(3)(viii)

- (viii) The process on stages (iii) to (vi) *should* not take more than five months.
- (viii) The period between the Community call for proposals and the communication of the outcome of the selection of pre-proposals shall not exceed three months; the process on stages (iii) to (vi) shall not take more than five months.

(Amendment 33)

Annex II, Section II(2), third indent

- appropriate measures to be taken in the interests of sound preparation, organisation and follow-up of placements and exchanges.
- appropriate measures to be taken in the interests of sound preparation, organisation and follow-up of placements and exchanges, including accessibility measures to ensure equal opportunities and address potential discrimination.

8. Common system of value added tax *

A4-0129/99

Proposal for a Council Directive amending, with regard to the level of the standard rate, Directive 77/388/EEC on the common system of value added tax (COM(98)0693 - C4-0711/98 - 98/0331(CNS))

The proposal was approved.

Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a Council Directive amending, with regard to the level of the standard rate, Directive 77/388/EEC on the common system of value added tax (COM(98)0693 — C4-0711/98 — 98/0331(CNS))

(Consultation procedure)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council, COM(98)0693 98/0331(CNS) (¹),
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 99 of the EC Treaty (C4-0711/98),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy (A4-0129/99),
- 1. Approves the Commission proposal;
- 2. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
- 3. Calls for the conciliation procedure to be opened should the Council intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
- 4. Asks to be consulted again should the Council intend to make substantial modifications to the Commission proposal;
- 5. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and Commission.

(1)	OJ C 409, 30.12.1998, p. 13.	

9. Police cooperation *

A4-0110/99

I.

Draft action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K. 3 of the Treaty on European Union on police cooperation on the verge of the adoption of standards for joint operations (14061/98 - C4-0047/99 - 99/0908(CNS))

The draft was approved with the following amendments:

COUNCIL AMENDMENTS
DRAFT BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 1)

Citation 1

Having regard to the Treaty on European Union, and in particular Article K.3 (2)(b) thereof,

Having regard to the Treaty on European Union, in particular Article K.3 (2)(b) thereof, the Treaty of Amsterdam and the Europol Convention,

COUNCIL DRAFT

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 12)

Recital 1

Convinced that, in order to guarantee an area of freedom, security and justice, further improvement in cooperation between the police *forces* of the Member States is necessary,

Convinced that, in order to guarantee an area of freedom, security and justice, further improvement in cooperation is necessary between the police, customs and other competent law enforcement bodies of the Member States, whether direct or through Europol,

(Throughout the rest of the text the word 'police' to be similarly expanded.)

(Amendment 3)

Article 1

In order further to intensify cooperation between the police forces of the Member States, the relevant Council Working Party comprising senior police officers of the Member States shall meet as required.

In order further to intensify cooperation between the police, customs and other competent law enforcement bodies of the Member States, a Multidisciplinary Group comprising Heads of such bodies and Heads of competent Ministries of the Member States shall meet as required.

(Amendment 4)

Article 2

Without prejudice to the authority of Europol, and in accordance with the national laws of the Member States, the relevant *Council Working Party* composed as described in Article 1 shall *address in particular the following subjects*:

- (a) continual exchange of information on the priorities of the campaign to fight crime and major police projects which would have repercussions on the security concerns of the other Member States.
- (b) *initiation* of measures to combat international crime *that* provide fuller cover of the routes used,
- (c) mixed inspection and search groups and patrols, with seconded officers having the status of liaison officials with no executive powers,
- (d) exchanges of police officers from all countries for extended periods,

Without prejudice to the authority of Europol, and in accordance with the national laws of the Member States, the relevant **Multidisciplinary Group** composed as described in Article 1 shall **define**, **discuss and agree upon:**

- (a) the priorities of the campaign to fight crime and major police projects which are likely to have repercussions on the security concerns of the Member States,
- (b) **the institution of** measures to combat international crime **including the following:**
 - establishing an effective information exchange and setting up an Early Warning System of criminal activities;
 - (ii) conducting investigations of routes used for illegal activities and the transport of illegal goods,
- (c) the establishment of mixed inspection operations at the external borders including harbours and airports, with seconded officers having the status of liaison officials with no executive powers,
- (d) exchanges of police, customs and other competent law enforcement teams for joint investigations against criminal organisations active in several or all Member States.

COUNCIL DRAFT

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

- (e) joint training events and practical exercises,
- (f) harmonisation of technical communications systems between Member States' police forces.
- (e) joint training events and practical exercises,
- (f) harmonisation of technical communications systems between Member States' police, customs and other competent law enforcement authorities.

(Amendment 5)

Article 3(1)

- 1. One representative of Europol shall be invited to meetings and *shall have the right to speak*.
- 1. One representative of Europol shall be invited to and involved in meetings and, where appropriate, in discussions, planning and implementation of the measures referred to in Article 2.

(Amendment 6)

Article 3(2)

2. Senior police officers of *those* States negotiating to accede to the European Union may be invited. Such invitations may be confined to individual agenda items.

2. Senior police, customs and other competent law enforcement officers of States either negotiating to accede to the European Union or having relations with Europol pursuant to Article 42(2) of the Europol Convention may be invited. Such invitations may be confined to individual agenda items.

Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union on police cooperation on the verge of the adoption of standards for joint operations (14061/98 - C4-0047/99 - 99/0908(CNS))

(Consultation procedure)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the draft joint action 14061/98 99/0908(CNS),
- having regard to Article K.3(2)(b) of the Treaty on European Union,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to the second paragraph of Article K.6 of the Treaty on European Union (C4-0047/99),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs (A4-0110/99),
- 1. Approves the Council's draft, subject to Parliament's amendments;
- 2. Calls on the Council to alter its draft accordingly;
- 3. Asks to be consulted again should the Council intend to make substantial modifications to the text approved by Parliament;
- 4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and Commission.

II.

Draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union with regard to combating international crime with fuller cover of the routes used (14060/98 - C4-0048/99 - 99/0907(CNS))

The draft was approved with the following amendments:

COUNCIL DRAFT AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 7)

Recital 1

[No English version contained in the original Council text 14060/98]

Concerned by international crime, and in particular international criminal organisations,

(Amendment 9)

Article 1

Member States shall, with the participation of Europol, carry out simultaneous operations *involving* the deployment of large numbers of police on recognised routes in order to combat crime occurring along them, in line with national legal provisions and jurisdiction and with due respect for national sovereign rights.

Member States shall, with the participation of Europol, carry out simultaneous operations utilising the best and most sophisticated intelligence and if necessary the deployment of large numbers of police on recognised routes in order to combat crime occurring along them, in line with national legal provisions and jurisdiction and with due respect for national sovereign rights.

(Amendment 13)

Article 2

The purpose of such deployment on specific routes shall be to ensure maximum *possible police success*, *especially* in the form of *arrests*, to coordinate joint *police* action and smooth communication and to obtain additional intelligence on criminal behaviour and methods of committing crime.

The purpose of such deployment on specific routes shall be to ensure maximum **effective results** in the form of **tracking down criminals and their organisations, and the subsequent bringing of them to justice**, to coordinate joint **law enforcement** action and smooth communication and to obtain additional intelligence on criminal behaviour and methods of committing crime.

(Amendment 10)

Article 3(1)

- 1. Member States shall, with the participation of Europol, undertake a joint evaluation and shall in the process be guided by efforts to develop measures designed further to improve route strategies. In particular, they shall examine the conclusions to be drawn from the fact that, with the abolition of checks at most internal borders of the Community, *police* authorities are no longer able to make use of one of the important lines of defence for combating cross-border crime in the same way as in the past.
- 1. Member States shall, with the participation of Europol, undertake a joint evaluation and shall in the process be guided by efforts to develop measures designed further to improve route strategies. In particular, they shall examine the conclusions to be drawn from the fact that, with the abolition of checks at most internal borders of the Community, law enforcement authorities are no longer able to make use of one of the important lines of defence for combating cross-border crime in the same way as in the past.

COUNCIL DRAFT

AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 11)

Article 3(2)

2. The provision of personal data shall be governed by national law and by international conventions.

2. The provision of personal data shall be governed by national law, by the 1981 Council of Europe Convention on the protection of data and by international conventions.

Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the draft joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union with regard to police cooperation: combating international crime with fuller cover of the routes used (14060/98 - C4-0048/99 - 99/0907(CNS))

(Consultation procedure)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to draft joint action 14060/98 99/0907(CNS),
- having regard to Article K.3(2)(b) of the Treaty on European Union,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to the second paragraph of Article K.6 of the Treaty on European Union (C4-0048/99),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs (A4-0110/99),
- 1. Approves the Council's draft, subject to Parliament's amendments;
- 2. Calls on the Council to alter its draft accordingly;
- 3. Asks to be consulted again should the Council intend to make substantial modifications to the text approved by Parliament;
- 4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and Commission.

10. Guidelines for the draft general budget for 2000

(a) A4-0109/99

Resolution on the guidelines for the 2000 budget procedure - Section III - Commission

The European Parliament,

The context: uncertainty

- having regard to Article 203 (future Article 272) of the EC Treaty,
- having regard to the Joint Declaration by the European Parliament, the Council and the Commission of 6 March 1995 concerning the incorporation of financial provisions in legislative acts (¹),

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 102, 4.4.1996, p. 4.

- having regard to the Interinstitutional Agreement of 29 October 1993 on budgetary discipline and improvement of the budgetary procedure (1),
- having regard to the Interinstitutional Agreement on provisions regarding financing of the CFSP (2),
- having regard to the Interinstitutional Agreement of 13 October 1998 on legal bases (3),
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgets and the opinions of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy, the Committee on Research, Technological Development and Energy, the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs, the Committee on Regional Policy, the Committee on Transport and Tourism, the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection and the Committee on Development and Cooperation (A4-0109/99),
- A. whereas the Institutions have laid down a timetable which should shortly culminate in the conclusion of a new interinstitutional agreement and a new financial perspective which will enable the Commission to submit the 2000 preliminary draft budget (PDB) on the basis of new ceilings and new headings in the financial perspective,
- B. whereas the conclusions of the Vienna European Council of 12 and 13 December 1998, the informal Berlin European Council to be held on 24 and 25 March 1999 and the proceedings of the various Ecofin and General Affairs Councils over the last few months suggest that an interinstitutional agreement might be concluded in the context of the overall agreement on the financial package for Agenda 2000,
- C. whereas, in the absence of such an agreement laying down a new financial perspective, the financial framework for the 2000 budget will be constituted by the adjusted ceilings for the headings, pursuant to Article 25 of the Interinstitutional Agreement of 29 October 1993,
- D. whereas all the other interinstitutional agreements governing the budget procedure remain in force, so that the budgetary authority in particular must comply with the amounts laid down for the pilot schemes and preparatory actions,
- E. whereas the 2000 budget must continue the approach employed in connection with the austerity budgets, combining efforts to achieve the objective of budgetary discipline and guarantees that means will be available for the Union's policies, as stipulated by Article F(3) (future Article 6(4)) of the EU Treaty,
- F. whereas the 2000 budget procedure will have to take account of the timetable imposed by the June 1999 European elections,
- 1. Notes the fact that the Council has not denounced the 1993 interinstitutional agreement and that, in the absence of a new financial perspective, the 2000 budget will be capped at the 1999 financial perspective, adjusted pursuant to Article 25 of the agreement, unless the denunciation of the agreement by the Council were to entail the use of Article 203 (future Article 272) of the EC Treaty;
- 2. States its determination to adopt a budget for the year 2000 which safeguards its prerogatives and takes account, regardless of the financial framework laid down, of its political priorities, in particular:
- the need, in keeping with Parliament's consistent priorities, to support job-creation by means of
 continuing measures to assist SMUs, measures adopted to assist education and continuing training
 and targeted assistance for research and development and, above all, by means of increased Union
 financial involvement in the development of transport networks;
- the financing of regional development with the objective of development with cohesion between the various regions of the Union;
- the strengthening of the European Union in the world through effective external measures and a solidarity-based and coherent development policy capable of realising objectives at international level;
- the gradual dismantling of Technical Assistance Offices carrying out duties which the Commission administration should discharge itself;

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 331, 7.12.1993, p. 1.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 286, 22.9.1997, p. 80.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 344, 12.11.1998, p. 1.

The principle: basing expenditure on the quality of implementation

- 3. Points out that the budgetary discipline it has observed has enabled it to adopt, in the last three financial years, budgets whose volume remained below the level of the PDB, an illustration of the joint recognition by the two arms of the budgetary authority of the need for rigour;
- 4. Reasserts, in connection with the 2000 budget, the principles underlying that achievement, in particular:
- the budgetary rigour applied to all headings in order to guarantee margins for manoeuvre, provided that the implementation mechanisms allow this;
- the use of quantitative and qualitative outturn statistics as a criterion for assessing whether or not expenditure is justified;
- the concentration of appropriations with a view to releasing fresh resources in the service of clear priorities;
- 5. Emphasises the need for the Commission and Council to take account of the objectives set out in Parliament's budget guidelines in a spirit of constructive cooperation with a view to the drafting of the PDB and DB;
- 6. Points out that the Union budget, whilst not subject to the same convergence rules and the same changing requirements as national budgets, must nevertheless take account of trends in those budgets; calls on the next Parliament to contemplate forms of coordination with the specialist bodies of the national parliaments;
- 7. Emphasises the need, in connection with the 2000 budget, to revamp Parliament's decision-making arrangements with a view to increasing the attention which parliamentary committees pay to the qualitative aspects of the implementation of expenditure; calls on the next Parliament to take organisational measures designed to ensure closer cooperation between its budgetary and its specialist committees:
- 8. Draws attention, therefore, to the need to strengthen the arrangements for monitoring and scrutinising the implementation of expenditure by means of closer cooperation, not only internally between the specialist committees and the Committee on Budgets, but also externally, between Parliament's bodies and the Commission's services and between the two arms of the budgetary authority;
- 9. Reiterates its determination, irrespective of whether an interinstitutional agreement has been concluded, to continue with the Tillich-Mulder procedure which authorises the Commission to submit at a late stage a letter of amendment in order to adjust agricultural spending on the basis of the most recent forecasts, and likewise to continue to apply the ad hoc procedure to fisheries agreements and the CFSP;
- 10. Voices its concern at trends concerning outstanding commitments under headings 4, 3 and 2, which, at the end of 1998, represented 243%, 142% and 110% respectively of commitments, and calls for the appropriate measures to be taken to incorporate at least 50% of outstanding commitments into the 2000 budget in order to eliminate the burden of the past; emphasises that, because of the excessively restrictive policy in recent financial years, requirements in terms of payment appropriations within heading 2 will be greater than might be indicated by the commitment appropriations for the year; insists that the Commission and the Council approve the appropriations needed to be able to meet commitments entered into;

Priorities: the need for concentration

Heading 1

11. Confirms its intention of reconciling the principles of rigour and adequate funding, thereby clearing the way for the satisfactory implementation of agricultural expenditure on the basis of the corresponding legislative acts;

Heading 2

12. Emphasises the need for a clear distinction to be drawn between appropriations from the new financial planning period (2000-2006) and those from the previous planning period (1993-1999) in the presentation of Subsection B2 of the budget; draws attention to the principles laid down by Parliament with a view to ensuring that the distribution within the budget of expenditure on the Structural Funds reflects the provisions of the legal frameworks governing them;

13. Calls on the Commission, therefore, in the preliminary draft budget for the year 2000, to enter the appropriations relating to the Community support frameworks, the Community initiative programmes and innovative measures in different titles of Subsection B2 and to divide up expenditure on the Community support frameworks by objective (chapter) and Fund (article); takes the view that such a presentation will help to strike the balance required between the transparency of the financial provisions in respect of structural policy and the constraints linked to its administrative management;

Heading 3

- 14. Proposes, having regard to the concern regarding the perceived distance between the EU and its citizens, that the Commission submit, before 15 September, a plan of the measures to enhance the prioritised and decentralised nature of information and communication measures;
- 15. Points out that it is important to take account of the transfer of asylum and immigration policy to the Community arena, which involves, in particular, augmenting the resources intended for burden-sharing in connection with the reception of refugees from seriously destabilised countries and earmarking the appropriations needed for implementing the Eurodac system;
- 16. Is of the opinion that the process of 'greening' the Community budget has to be developed further and expanded to other areas such as external and development policies, transport policy and also to the administration of the European Institutions, and takes the view that funding for the PHARE and TACIS programmes must serve to a greater extent to solve environmental problems, a principle which is already accepted in the ALA and MEDA programmes;
- 17. Calls on the Commission to start the groundwork needed with regard to public health and consumer protection, areas which will be expanded considerably after the entry into force of the Treaty of Amsterdam, and calls on the Commission to present as soon as possible proposals for those areas of environment policy, consumer protection and public health where inexistent or insufficient legal bases for Community expenditure could threaten the continuation of existing actions or projects;
- 18. Reiterates its declaration annexed to its decision of 15 December 1998 on the joint text approved by the Conciliation Committee concerning the fifth framework programme for research (¹), notes, in the context of establishing the 2000 budget in the area of internal policies, the outcome of that conciliation process for the costing of research spending for 2000, and points out that this legislative decision remains an appropriate legal basis for the implementation of the programme by the Commission in the year 2000 and beyond, even if no agreement is reached on a new financial perspective for the same period;

Heading 4

- 19. Calls on the Commission to specify the appropriations allocated to the three sets of measures intended to finance the pre-accession strategy (PHARE, ISPA and agricultural instrument) in a single title in Subsection B7;
- 20. Wishes to explore with the Commission and Council, following evaluation of the effectiveness of the measures carried out, the scope for concentrating Community aid to the developing countries on the poorest countries, and for possibly increasing it, given the difficulties the budgetary authority faces in implementing such a policy until such time as the European Development Fund has been incorporated into the budget;

Heading 5

- 21. Regards it as essential to make the budget estimate in respect of the staff resources of the Community administration part of a multiannual assessment of requirements which takes into account:
- the review of the Staff Regulations for EU officials;
- the need to ensure that tasks intrinsic to a public authority are carried out by personnel covered by the Staff Regulations;
- the full and optimum use of the human resources allocated by the budgetary authority and the requirements linked to the new priorities;
- the redeployment of staff, in terms of both duties and places of work, with a view to decentralising the management of Community appropriations as far as possible;
- the necessary appropriations to be allocated for combating fraud;

⁽¹⁾ Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 5.

- 22. Asks the Board of Governors of the European Schools to inform the budgetary authority well in advance of all plans to open new European Schools; will not accept any 'fait accompli', given that any new school will have a severe budgetary impact;
- 23. Calls on the Commission to carry out a thoroughgoing revision of its management methods and to put forward practical proposals to highlight the proportion of public spending on funded measures accounted for by administrative costs, introducing in particular administrative management based on the cost of the activities (activity-based budgeting); takes the view that the experience gained in connection with the management of Subsection B6 could usefully be extended, whilst taking steps to ensure that the distinction drawn between administrative appropriations and operating appropriations safeguards transparency and the power of the budgetary authority;
- 24. In the context of the 2000 budget procedure, calls for rigorous checks to be carried out on the allocation of the human and financial resources made available to the programmes, in the light of the Union's political priorities, with a view to launching a general political debate into the resources earmarked for the implementation of the measures; requests the Commission, in its ongoing work programme of reform, to produce a report by 30 June 1999 which sets out its staffing priorities and real staffing requirements, both in terms of numbers as well as nature of duties, to ensure the effective operation of EU policies in the 21st century;

* *

25. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission and the Union's satellite agencies.

(b) A4-0120/99

Resolution on the guidelines for the 2000 budget procedure: Section I — European Parliament, Annex: Ombudsman; Section II — Council; Section IV — Court of Justice; Section V — Court of Auditors; Section V — Economic and Social Committee and Committee of the Regions and Joint Organisational Structure

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the general budget of the European Union for the financial year 1999 (1),
- having regard to the Court of Auditors' Annual Report concerning the financial year 1997, together with the institutions' replies (²),
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgets (A4-0120/99),
- A. whereas a sum of EUR 4 502.3 million has been entered in the 1999 budget under heading 5, Administrative expenditure,
- B. whereas, if the 1993 interinstitutional agreement is not denounced and in the absence of a new financial perspective, the financial framework for the 2000 budget will be constituted by the 1999 financial perspective adjusted pursuant to Article 25 of the agreement, unless the denunciation of the agreement by the Council were to entail the use of Article 203 (future Article 272) of the EC Treaty; whereas, at all events, the margin for increases will be extremely limited, and whereas essential staffing increases in individual institutions or committees will have to be offset as far as possible by equivalent savings in other areas,
- C. having regard to its resolution of 17 December 1998 on the draft general budget of the European Union for the financial year 1999 as modified by the Council (all sections) and on Letter of Amendment No 1/99 to the preliminary draft budget for 1999 Section III Commission (³), in which it called for reports on the financing conditions governing certain activities in the sphere of administrative expenditure and laid down the deadlines for the submission of those reports,

¹⁾ OJ L 39, 12.2.1999.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 349, 17.11.1998.

⁽³⁾ Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 1.

- D. convinced that a uniform presentation of administrative expenditure, as was the case in the 1999 budget procedure, will lead to a single reading of the draft budget,
- E. in an effort to improve the performance of the institutions and the two committees by implementing a competence-oriented staff policy which is capable of motivating its staff,

All institutions and the two committees

- 1. Calls on the administrations of the institutions and the two committees, when presenting their budgets, to be guided by realisation of the Union's medium-term objectives, including enlargement; urges them to employ a strategy geared to enhancing efficiency by improving transparency, motivation, mobility and further training;
- 2. Calls, therefore, for due account to be taken of the requirements of detailed accounting based on cost centres ('activity-based budgeting') and, experimentally, for them to be submitted in annexes in the preliminary draft budgets for the next financial year;
- 3. Takes the view that appropriate staff mobility is required within and among the institutions and committees and that further professional training, including the use of state-of-the-art technologies, should be encouraged;
- 4. Calls on the institutions and the two committees to seek fresh opportunities for interinstitutional cooperation, since experience has shown that savings can be generated in this way; in that connection, thinks in particular of the testing of the synergies which can be achieved by means of cooperation among the Parliament departments in Brussels and those of the two committees, which are geographically adjacent, in a number of technical areas, such as libraries, the Medical Service, the Security Service, the sports centre, etc.;
- 5. Draws attention to its abovementioned resolution of 17 December 1998 and to its resolution of 16 December 1998 on the Commission's work programme for the year 1999 (¹) in which Parliament calls on the institutions and committees, in the context of interinstitutional cooperation and under the leadership of the Commission, to adopt, *mutatis mutandis*, the Commission Action Plan on Sustainable Administrative Management;
- 6. Emphasises that measures are needed to make provision for officials' pensions; assumes that such a reform must
- (a) be sustainable,
- (b) take the fullest possible account of the contributions made, and
- (c) lead to the allocation of costs to the institutions in a manner which reflects periods of service as far as possible; calls on the Council to give its views on this matter at the first reading of the 2000 budget;
- 7. Reiterates its view that the volume of the institutions' budgets does not represent a spending target, but rather an absolute ceiling which must not be exceeded;
- 8. Calls for an interinstitutional approach to the negotiations with the Luxembourg authorities or alternative contractual partners so that a coherent buildings policy can be pursued and the most advantageous terms possible secured; calls for a speedy continuation of the policy of purchasing buildings; expects, prior to the purchase of buildings, detailed comparative cost schedules to be submitted to the budgetary authority; draws attention, further, to the need to prepare in good time the smooth handover to subsequent tenants of any buildings to be vacated and thereby avoid any situation in which buildings stand empty;
- 9. Calls on the institutions to submit to it, along with the budget estimates, relevant information concerning the permanent and temporary posts which will fall vacant as a result of natural wastage during the 1999 financial year, broken down by category, grade, activity and administrative unit plus a list of successful competition candidates, at the respective institutions, who are suitable to fill vacant posts;

European Parliament

10. Notes the proposals put forward by the Secretary-General in the 'Second Note on the Consequences of the Amsterdam Treaty' of 25 November 1998 and calls for consideration to be given to the possibility of further rationalising human resources by merging committee secretariats in the Directorate-General for Committees and Delegations;

⁽¹⁾ Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 12.

- 11. Asks the Council to approve the proposal for a Statute for Members of the European Parliament and the proposal for a Statute for Members' assistants, as put forward by Parliament (¹), as soon as possible and calls on Parliament's Secretary-General to take account of this objective in the estimates for the year 2000:
- 12. Notes that the mopping-up of outstanding appropriations in the 1998 budget (volume: almost EUR 62 million) has led to a reduction in the financial cost of Parliament's buildings in 1999 of EUR 8,5 million, and urges Parliament's Administration to continue this practice;
- 13. Is of the opinion that facilities within EP buildings which are not needed in connection with the Institution's activities must be economically self-supporting and may not be financed with subsidies from Parliament's budget; any exceptions for imputed costs must be shown separately;

Ombudsman

- 14. Advocates a continuation of the agreement with the Ombudsman;
- 15. Takes the view that the Ombudsman's budget should be a separate section of the general budget and, should the Council opt not to draw up a new section, intends to implement this in line with the Financial Regulation to be revised;
- 16. Invites the Council to adopt, as soon as possible, the eighth series of amendments, part B, revising the Financial Regulation, called for by Parliament and the Commission;

Court of Justice

- 17. Expresses its understanding for the Court's problems with regard to the translation service; asks the Council, therefore, as the institution responsible, quickly to comply with the wishes of the Court of Justice for appropriate changes to its Rules of Procedure, to be submitted by it, with a view to limiting the increase in the workload and keeping to a minimum the allocation of new posts which would otherwise be required;
- 18. Looks to the Court to submit an interim staffing plan with the aim of bringing about structural changes, a plan which outlines a transitional solution covering the period until it has become clearer what the impact of the structural changes to the profile of tasks will be; states that no new posts will be authorised unless such an interim plan is submitted;

Court of Auditors

19. Calls on the Council, in connection with the appointment of eight new Members of the Court in the year 2000, to avoid duplication of staff and other costs over certain one-month periods and proposes, therefore, 29 February 2000 as the date on which outgoing Members should leave their posts and 1 March 2000 as that on which new Members should take up their duties;

The two committees

- 20. Calls on the two committees to submit a plan for the division of their Joint Organisational Structure as soon as possible and an action plan concerning their establishment plans in good time prior to the Council's first reading; the plan should have legal certainty as its aim, so that the two committees can carry out their work efficiently and on a long-term basis; emphasises that this action plan should take account of the tasks entrusted to the committees by the Amsterdam Treaty and the modernisation and dynamisation of the administrations referred to above;
- 21. Takes the view that the allocation of the posts from the Joint Organisational Structure to the two committees should take account of the workload of the committees and should guarantee equal treatment for officials of the two committees as regards career development;

Economic and Social Committee

22. Expects that, through cuts in the membership of the study groups and a reduction in the number of meetings required to deal with requests for opinions, significant savings will be achieved against budget Item S6-A250 (Meetings in general);

⁽¹⁾ Minutes of Sitting of 3.12.1998, Part II, Item 1, and Minutes of Sitting of 11.3.1999, Part II, Item 4.

Committee of the Regions

23. Welcomes the fact that the Committee of the Regions is introducing new rules for its plenary sessions structure with a view to reducing costs and points out that the system of substitutes must not lead to additional costs;

European Central Bank

24. Looks to the ECB to forward its budget at the same time as the other institutions and committees;

*

25. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to all the institutions and to all the advisory bodies concerned and the European Central Bank.

11. EAEC accession to KEDO - EU-DPRK relations

(a) A4-0104/99

Resolution on the Agreement on terms and conditions of the Accession of the European Atomic Energy Community to the Korean Peninsula Energy Development Organisation (KEDO) (C4-0483/97)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Agreement on terms and conditions of the Accession of the European Atomic Energy Community to the Korean Peninsula Energy Development Organisation (C4-0483/97),
- having regard to the Euratom Treaty, in particular Article 101 thereof,
- having regard to its resolution of 14 May 1998 on improvements in the functioning of the Institutions without modification of the Treaties making EU policies more open and democratic (¹),
- having regard to its resolution of 28 May 1998 on the role of the Union in the world (2),
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy and the opinions of the Committee on Budgets and the Committee on Research, Technological Development and Energy (A4-0104/99),
- A. whereas the decision for the European Union to join KEDO is an important issue of foreign policy, which also has budgetary and energy implications,
- B. whereas the Commission and Council agreed that it was appropriate for Euratom to be the Community which acceded to KEDO, despite its CFSP aspects,
- Whereas the Accession Agreement is based on Article 101 of the Euratom Treaty, which does not
 provide for consultation of the European Parliament,
- D. whereas the Commission and Council refused to consult Parliament on the Agreement on a voluntary basis.
- E. whereas the Agreement was concluded by the Commission with the approval of the Council on 19 September 1997, without the European Parliament having delivered an opinion thereon,

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 167, l.6.1998, p. 211.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 195, 22.6.1998, p. 35.

- F. whereas Parliament's repeated calls for the Euratom Treaty to be revised to provide for parliamentary consultation have been ignored, as have been its requests to be consulted on all international agreements and other general acts based on the Euratom Treaty even in the absence of a formal obligation to do so,
- G. whereas the Agreement provides for a financial contribution to KEDO from the European Union amounting to EUR 15 million per annum for five years, a contribution which ensures Euratom a seat on the KEDO Executive Board during this period,
- H. whereas the budgetary appropriations for such activities are non-compulsory expenditure,
- I. whereas the first two instalments of the EU contribution were in fact paid for 1996 and 1997,
- J. whereas Parliament placed the EUR 15 million under line B7-6600 in the 1998 Budget in the reserve,
- K. whereas these funds were unblocked after an exchange of letters with the Commission agreeing that Parliament would in future be given the opportunity to express its opinion on all significant international agreements based on the Euratom Treaty,
- L. whereas, by virtue of this exchange of letters, the Commission specifically agreed (¹) to keep the appropriate parliamentary committee informed of proceedings during the negotiation of such agreements and to give the European Parliament an opportunity to make its views known well in advance of a decision on the conclusion of any such agreement,
- M. whereas the Commission, on 15 December 1998, concluded an Agreement between the European Atomic Energy Community (Euratom) and Canada for cooperation in the area of nuclear research (²),
- N. whereas the Commission did not inform Parliament about this agreement during negotiations nor give Parliament an opportunity to make its views on it known before conclusion,
- O. whereas part of the funds destined for KEDO in the 1999 budget have been placed in the reserve,
- 1. Deplores the Commission's failure to respect the agreement in the abovementioned exchange of letters providing for Parliament to express its opinion on all significant international agreements based on the Euratom Treaty before their conclusion specifically insofar as the Euratom-Canada-Agreement for cooperation in the area of nuclear research is concerned;
- 2. Maintains its criticism of the Commission and Council for not having consulted Parliament before the Euratom-KEDO Accession Agreement was concluded;
- 3. Welcomes the belated steps taken by the Commission to establish procedures to ensure that its commitments in the abovementioned exchange of letters are respected (3); notes that these steps will ensure that the Commission provides Parliament, at the beginning of each year, with a list of Euratom agreements under the second paragraph of Article 101 which are under negotiation or for which negotiations are to be launched in the coming year, with regular updates and with briefings upon request, as well as subsequently with the texts at the same time as they are forwarded to the Council, enabling Parliament to express its views on them before conclusion;
- 4. Notes that the Council has realised that KEDO membership may well involve matters outside the energy field, with its common position of 24 July 1997 (4) providing that for matters falling outside EAEC competencies, the position in the KEDO Executive Board shall be determined by the Council and expressed by the Presidency, and calls for regular reports to be made to Parliament on these, pursuant to Article J.7 of the TEU;

⁽¹) Letters of 9 July 1998 (from Mr José Maria Gil-Robles to Mr Jacques Santer), 16 July 1998 (Santer to Gil-Robles), 22 July 1998 (Gil-Robles to Santer) and 27 July 1998 (Santer to Gil-Robles); see Notice to Members PE 228.014.

⁽²⁾ OJ L 346, 22.12.1998, p. 65.

⁽³⁾ As in the annexed letter from Vice-President Brittan to President Gil-Robles establishing the arrangements for the involvement of the European Parliament in international agreements concluded under the second paragraph of Article 101 of the Euratom Treaty.

⁽⁴⁾ OJ No L 213, 5.8.1997, p. 1.

- 5. Considers that the previous conduct of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea and in particular its threat to denounce the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty and escape International Atomic Energy Authority inspections and safeguards, together with its missile development programme, posed a serious danger to the security of the whole region;
- 6. Welcomes the fact that the Agreed Framework, negotiated between the United States and the DPRK, and KEDO, the organisation established to implement its main aspects, did provide a mechanism to significantly reduce the proliferation and other threats, including those of nuclear accidents, whilst regretting that the DPRK's energy and other needs were not satisfied by some means other than agreeing to provide two nuclear Light-Water Reactors;
- 7. Reiterates its commitment and that of the European Union as a whole to closer relations with Asia, welcomes the Commission's desire, expressed in its communication on European Union policy towards the Republic of Korea (COM(98)0714), to promote North Korean engagement internationally, and considers that EU membership of KEDO does contribute to this through showing solidarity with the Republic of Korea and with Japan (which has after all contributed very significant sums to supplement EU and US efforts in Bosnia) and helps in a practical way to increase security in East Asia;
- 8. Appreciates that the involvement of the DPRK with KEDO has enabled certain links between that country and the United States (and to some extent also with the ROK and with Japan) to be established for the first time and expresses the hope that these and other connections may be developed to draw the DPRK into the international community;
- 9. Notes that the cost-sharing arrangement of November 1998 still leaves a financing gap of at least US\$ 350 million out of a total estimated cost of US\$ 4,6 billion for constructing the LWRs;
- 10. Notes that the initial completion date for the KEDO project of 2003 has already been delayed until 2005 and that a further delay appears inevitable;
- 11. Notes that the Light-Water Reactors to be built by KEDO depend on the provision by the DPRK of two stable off-site sources of power and the construction of a suitable electricity grid, which would cost some US\$ 300 million;
- 12. Draws attention to the fact that, being in the grip of a severe economic crisis with serious food shortages, the DPRK is unlikely to be able without help to provide these and calls on Euratom to raise this issue urgently on the KEDO Executive Board, make proposals to resolve the problem and report on them to the European Parliament;
- 13. Draws attention to the fact that the DPRK, with significant coal reserves but minimal coal production owing in part to the lack of electricity to power mining equipment, is being supplied, under the US-DPRK Agreed Framework and the KEDO Agreement, with interim supplies of energy in the form of heavy fuel oil;
- 14. Notes that the erratic pattern of heavy fuel oil supplies has caused additional difficulties for the DPRK and given rise there to the feeling that the US and other KEDO partners are unwilling to keep their side of the bargain;
- 15. Is aware of the lack of political will amongst some sections of the US political establishment which has created difficulties for the United States in meeting the costs of these supplies, which is currently its only direct financial input into KEDO;
- 16. Points out that if the DPRK is to be expected to scrupulously abide by the provisions of the Agreed Framework, it is vital that the United States do so as well;
- 17. Stresses the vital need to maintain energy supplies at the level agreed with the DPRK, and calls on Euratom to ensure that urgent consideration is given to the possibility of supplementing the heavy oil supplies with supplies of coal, which the DPRK's largely coal-fired power stations could burn more efficiently, and also to providing direct aid to the DPRK, possibly outside the KEDO framework, to enable it better to exploit its own coal resources;

- 18. Is deeply concerned by the allegations that the DPRK is pursuing its nuclear weapons programme at an underground facility at Kumchangri and regards it as imperative that doubts relating to underground installations there be removed, possibly through an inspection by a neutral third party, such as the IAEA or the UN;
- 19. Recognises that the DPRK's development of rocket technology does not in any way infringe the Agreed Framework, but its sales of missiles to third countries and its recent launch, without warning, of a rocket which traversed Japan have contributed to insecurity in the region; believes that another launch in similar circumstances would worsen the situation;
- 20. In the light of lingering doubts about the behaviour and intentions of the DPRK regarding missile development and a return to the production of weapons of mass destruction, including ultimately the separation of plutonium from the new LWRs, wishes to the greatest extent possible to be able to keep under review the role of the EU in KEDO as well as the Agreed Framework and changes thereto, and intends, for this purpose, to place the funds for KEDO in 2000 into the reserve, and to do so with any future funding, on an annual basis;
- 21. Considers that, while the KEDO project promises to help alleviate the DPRK's energy shortage in the medium to long term, the EU cannot avoid the necessity of assisting with increased humanitarian aid as well as technical assistance in the non-nuclear energy and agricultural sectors;
- 22. Appreciates the Commission's aim of opening up opportunities for EU industry to contribute to the KEDO project through the EU's obtaining a seat on KEDO's Executive Board, and calls for that Board Member to ensure that tendering procedures for contracts other than those related to the nuclear reactors themselves (which are to be provided by the Korean Electric Power Company, KEPCO) are established in such a way as to give EU companies a fair chance to be awarded contracts;
- 23. Considers that the European Union should play a role in reducing the risk of nuclear weapons proliferation, in increasing nuclear safety and in encouraging development of better relations between the DPRK and its neighbours, and that membership of KEDO will enable it better to play that role;
- 24. Approves, in light of the above remarks, the Euratom-KEDO Accession Agreement;
- 25. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, the governments of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, the United States, the Republic of Korea and Japan and the KEDO Executive Board.

ANNEX

Involvement of the European Parliament in international agreements concluded under the second paragraph of Article 101 of the Euratom Treaty: letter from Vice-President Brittan to President Gil-Robles dated 18 March 1999 establishing the arrangements

Following extensive discussion between myself and various Members of the European Parliament, I am writing to you to confirm the practical arrangements which will now be followed by the Commission to ensure that the understanding reached in July last year in the exchange of letters between yourself and President Santer (related to the conclusion of agreements of significant importance based on the second paragraph of Article 101 of the Euratom Treaty) is now fully implemented.

First, at the beginning of each year the Commission will provide a list of all the relevant Euratom agreements under the second paragraph of Article 101 which are under negotiation or for which negotiations are to be launched in the coming year. This list will be regularly updated and forwarded to the Parliament, under the necessary conditions of confidentiality.

Second, the Commission will provide oral information on request to the relevant EP Committee on the conduct of the negotiations, under the necessary conditions of confidentiality.

Third, the Commission will forward the proposals for conclusion of the relevant Euratom agreements to the Parliament at the same time at which they are forwarded to the Council for approval. This is a significant procedural innovation since it provides a guarantee to the Parliament that it will be informed before the Council has taken a position on the conclusion of those agreements.

Thus, the Parliament will have the opportunity to make its views known before a decision is made to conclude the agreement, in line with the commitments made in our exchange of letters. I should add that the time it takes for the Council to reach a decision on conclusion is generally fairly lengthy and thus leaves ample time for the Parliament to express its view if it so wishes. In those cases where the Council may wish to take a particularly rapid decision, the Commission will duly inform the Parliament of this possibility.

Fourth, by way of this letter, I wish to provide you with information on the relevant agreements under the second paragraph of Article 101 Euratom which are currently either under negotiation or for which a decision of conclusion has not yet been taken, according to the information presently available to the Commission services. Please note that the agreements referred to represent all agreements covered by the second paragraph of Article 101 Euratom which are under negotiation or for which negotiations are to be launched in the coming year:

- Euratom Agreement with Ukraine (nuclear fusion and nuclear security): the draft agreement was
 established on 16 October 1998. The relevant documents are now being prepared to be officially
 forwarded to the Council and the Parliament within a matter of weeks.
- Euratom Agreement with Kazakhstan nuclear fusion (separate adoption of nuclear security agreement already in preparation): draft agreement should be ready within a matter of weeks (the last substantive talks were held in January 1999) following which the relevant documents will be forwarded officially to the Council and the Parliament.
- Euratom Agreement with Russia (nuclear fusion and nuclear security). Negotiations are still underway.
- Euratom Agreement with Japan. Negotiations are due to start in the coming weeks.

It has been brought to my attention that there have been some teething problems in applying the understanding we reached last year to those agreements for which negotiations were concluded after the date of our exchange of letters. In order to ensure there is no further misunderstanding between the Commission and the Parliament, I have instructed my services to convey separately to your services all relevant texts of agreements which should have been covered by our understanding during the latter half of last year and the beginning of this year.

Finally, it would provide significant procedural clarity to the above arrangements if you could inform me which Parliamentary Committee is the lead Committee in these matters so that the information can be properly communicated via the right channels.

On this basis, I trust that we can now fully implement the understanding reached last year to the mutual satisfaction of the European Parliament and of the Commission.

I am copying this letter to H.E. Dietrich von Kyaw, President of the Permanent Representatives Committee.

(b) B4-0326/99

Resolution on relations between the European Union and the Democratic People's Republic of Korea

The European Parliament,

- having regard to its resolutions of 15 May 1997 (¹), 23 October 1997 (²) and 12 March 1998 (³) on the food shortage in North Korea,
- having regard to the report of its ad hoc delegation which visited the Democratic People's Republic of Korea (DPRK) in December 1998 (4),

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 167, 2.6.1997, p. 157.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 339, 10.11.1997, p. 153.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 104, 6.4.1998, p. 236.

⁽⁴⁾ PE 229.331.

- having regard to the Commission communication on European Union policy towards the Republic of Korea (COM(98)0714),
- having regard to its resolution of 23 March 1999 on the Agreement on terms and conditions of the Accession of the European Atomic Energy Community to the Korean Peninsula Energy Development Organisation (KEDO) (¹),
- A. whereas the continuing food crisis in the DPRK is accompanied by a severe general economic crisis,
- B. whereas the European Union has been a major contributor of humanitarian aid to the DPRK,
- C. whereas the European Union opened an informal political dialogue with the DPRK in December 1998,
- 1. Considers that the time has come to intensify the EU's involvement in issues concerning the Korean Peninsula:
- 2. Considers that this implies building up relations with the Republic of Korea (ROK) and establishing and developing relations with the DPRK in a process of engagement, a process already started with the Troika-DPRK political dialogue and the Commission Communication on European Union policy towards the Republic of Korea, which welcomes President Kim Dae-jung's 'Sunshine policy' and calls for EU support for efforts to promote North Korean engagement with the international community;
- 3. Believes that such a process would contribute to détente and greater openness, and complement US efforts in this respect, and that therefore such a catalytic role for the EU should be welcomed by all sides;
- 4. Expresses, as a further parliamentary contribution to this process of engagement, its willingness to receive a delegation from the Supreme People's Assembly of the DPRK, which could meet with representatives of the relevant parliamentary committees;
- 5. Calls on the Council and Commission, as a part of the process of engagement, to consider the establishment of a DPRK-EU liaison office in Brussels, which has been already requested by the DPRK, in return for an agreement in principle on the establishment of a similar office for the EU in Pyongyang;
- 6. Believes that it would be in the EU's interest for diplomatic links with the DPRK to be strengthened, the current Commission presence there suffering from a lack of diplomatic status and the Member States' representation being limited to a Swedish Embassy with a German interests section;
- 7. Calls therefore on the 10 Member States which do not currently recognise the DPRK to give careful consideration to establishing diplomatic links; asks the Council to examine the idea of setting up a joint embassy, which would be an expression of the development of the CFSP as well as an efficient use of resources; and asks the Commission to look into the possibility of upgrading its group of technical assistants based in Pyongyang to an office or a delegation;
- 8. Stresses that the EU should continue to provide humanitarian aid, and also help to improve productivity in the agricultural sector and assist in the energy sector outside KEDO; calls on the DPRK Government, in this regard, to improve the Commission's access for monitoring and contact with technical ministries, as well as provision of information and documentation concerning all assistance;
- 9. Confirms the importance of KEDO as a vehicle not only in the DPRK's energy development but also in opening up the regime to outside contacts and stresses the importance of KEDO's commitments (to provide interim energy supplies and to build Light-Water Reactors) being scrupulously respected;

⁽¹⁾ Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 11(a).

- 10. Underlines that observance of the non-proliferation regime and the IAEA safeguards are essential components of the confidence-building process needed to give credibility to the DPRK as a member of the international community;
- 11. Considers it vital to ensure that the underground facility at Kumchangri has no nuclear aspects and calls for increased transparency regarding the DPRK's development of rockets;
- 12. Believes that human rights is an essential element in any dialogue between the EU and the DPRK;
- 13. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, the governments of the DPRK, the United States, the ROK and Japan and the KEDO Executive Board.

12. Emigration from Iraq and neighbouring region

A4-0079/99

Resolution on the influx of migrants from Iraq and the neighbouring region: EU action plan adopted by the Council on 26 January 1998 (5573/98 — C4-0124/98)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to Rule 51 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to Article K.6 of the EU Treaty,
- having regard to the letter of 25 February 1998 from the Council forwarding the European Union's action plan on the influx of migrants from Iraq and the neighbouring region,
- having regard to its resolution of 15 January 1998 on Kurdish refugees and on the position of the European Union (¹),
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs and the opinion of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy (A4-0079/99),
- A. whereas the contents of the action plan have more to do with the Union's policy on cooperation in the fields of justice and home affairs than with the common foreign and security policy, since it focuses on the prevention of illegal immigration,
- B. whereas Article K.6 of the EU Treaty provides that 'the Presidency shall consult the European Parliament on the principal aspects of activities in the areas referred to ... and shall ensure that the views of the European Parliament are duly taken into consideration',
- C. whereas the wording of Article J.7 of the EU Treaty concerning foreign and security policy is almost identical,
- D. whereas the European Parliament was not consulted before the Council took its decision,
- E. whereas the action plan was not therefore established lawfully,
- F. whereas the following subjects are covered by the action plan: improved analysis of the causes and origins of the influx, development of contacts with the government of Turkey and with the UNHCR, ensuring that humanitarian aid makes an effective contribution, effective application of asylum procedures, preventing abuse of asylum procedures, tackling the involvement of organised crime, combating illegal immigration and ensuring coherent and coordinated implementation, monitoring and review,

- G. whereas all these aspects require attention,
- H. whereas some asylum-seekers whose applications are rejected cannot be sent back because they would be in danger in the country to which they would be required to return,
- whereas according to the most recent report by the UN special rapporteur on Iraq (November 1998) the Iraqi Government has deported more than 15 000 people of Kurdish origin — most of them women and children — in an attempt to change the ethnic composition of this oil-rich region,
- J. whereas the possibility of abusing the asylum procedures is mainly due to the fact that the Member States take far too long over their decisions and have failed to reach satisfactory agreements in the past with a view to preventing asylum-seekers from submitting applications in one Member State after another,
- K. whereas the Member States do not in many cases have satisfactory agreements relating to the return of asylum-seekers whose applications are rejected to the countries from which they came, in which they were (initially) received or which can be held responsible for their entry into the European Union,
- L. whereas a proper balance must be maintained between combating illegal immigration, particularly the traffickers, and humanitarian responsibilities towards genuine asylum-seekers; whereas stigmatising asylum-seekers must be avoided at all costs and whereas it is essential to find solutions to this major problem,

Establishment, implementation, monitoring and review

- 1. Demands that the Commission submit within three months a new proposal on which Parliament is consulted before the Council takes its decision, since the present action plan was not established lawfully;
- 2. Agrees that studies should continue to be carried out on the basis of the action plan, but believes that, as the action plan was not established lawfully, the Member States may not base any legislative action on it and that there may be no financing of measures emanating from it without the European Parliament's explicit consent;
- 3. Acknowledges the complexity of the problems but stresses that it would be preferable to concentrate on specific points rather than a detailed list with frequently overlapping 'future' initiatives which defer effective action;
- 4. Demands access to all documentation on the implementation and monitoring of the action plan, including all documents discussed at the level of the K4 Committee;

Analysis of the causes and origins of the influx

- 5. Believes that the conditions in the region are such that human rights are violated with comparative frequency, war, or civil war situations regularly arise and the repression, political or otherwise, of minorities is common practice;
- 6. Draws attention to Turkish incursions into the area;
- 7. Notes that there has not been a sudden influx of large numbers of refugees but a steady stream of people wanting to leave the region for various reasons;
- 8. Notes the impression arising in this context that much of the influx is organised by people who stimulate it on a large scale for profit-seeking and/or criminal motives;
- 9. Notes that this does not alter the fact that a distinction must be made between people fleeing their region because they are in danger and people doing so because of the wretched conditions in which they find themselves;
- 10. Calls on the Commission to carry out a study into the motives and causes of the influx, in collaboration with the UNHCR and Amnesty International, and to present the findings of this study within three months;
- 11. Expresses its disapproval of the fact that the action plan refers to migrants from Iraq and the neighbouring region and creates the impression that Iraqi and Kurdish refugees are primarily concerned, whereas the relevant documentation (including the note to the K4 Committee of 28 April 1998) largely concerns people from Bangladesh, Pakistan, Sri Lanka and Egypt;

12. Considers that the European Union must guarantee maximum aid to regions having to deal with a mass influx of immigrants from regions in conflict to enable them to cope with the humanitarian situations arising from the conflicts in those regions and neighbouring areas;

Development of contacts with the government of Turkey and with the UNHCR; possible financing

- 13. Refers to its earlier resolutions on Turkey and emphasises that a solution to the problem of human rights violations and respect for minorities in Turkey must first be sought before the possibility of the Turkish Government acting as an agent, or even adviser, for the European Union can be considered;
- 14. Calls on the Turkish authorities to capitalise on the existing situation in order to find a political solution to the Kurdish issue;
- 15. Calls on the Member States, the Council and the Commission to renew their efforts to formulate a common foreign policy, in view of the challenge posed by the repression of the Kurdish people;
- 16. Recognises nonetheless that, given its situation, Turkey must play a part in initial reception and points out that this reception should be dignified, with all provisions concerning human rights respected;
- 17. Believes that the UNHCR must be made primarily responsible for the organisation and implementation of initial reception in Turkey;
- 18. Believes that none of the Union's financial resources should be spent on the institutions in Turkey where illegal immigrants are held unless it is established from the outset that the people whose freedom is being restricted are rightly deemed to be illegal immigrants and provision is made for independent monitoring to ensure respect for human rights, and points out that, if these conditions are fulfilled, only resources set aside in the budget specifically for this purpose must be used, not MEDA programme resources;

Effective application of asylum procedures

- 19. Believes that alternative refuge in the home country and reception in the region should be considered first and would prefer to see refugees looked after in a culturally similar country as far as possible;
- 20. Believes, therefore, that contact should be made not only with Turkey but also with other countries in the region that should play a part in the granting of asylum;

Preventing abuse of asylum procedures and combating illegal immigration

- 21. Requests that, as soon as the Treaty of Amsterdam enters into force, the Commission submit a proposal for a Directive on the acceleration of the asylum procedure and a proposal for an arrangement which ensures the return of asylum-seekers whose requests have been rejected, while fully upholding the application of the Geneva Convention and the generally applied humanitarian considerations that stand in the way of the return of such asylum-seekers;
- 22. Believes that tough action must be taken to combat illegal immigration, but that people entering the European Union without papers cannot be automatically expelled from the territory of the Union's Member States as illegal immigrants;
- 23. Urges the Member States and the Union to ensure that an effective instrument (multilateral or bilateral) is created to ensure that the smuggling of human beings is combated in the countries of origin, transit countries and countries of destination and, where possible, prevented through the threat of sanctions and active police investigation, followed by prosecution and effective penalties and through clear information for potential victims;

Tackling the involvement of organised crime

24. Expects more practical and effective measures to be taken and wishes to be consulted on them;

*

25. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council and Commission and to the governments and parliaments of the Member States.

13. Application of Community law

A4-0092/99

Resolution on the 15th Annual Report from the Commission to the European Parliament on monitoring the application of Community law (1997) – (COM(98)0317 – C4-0377/98)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the 15th Annual Report from the Commission (COM(98)0317 C4-0377/98) (1),
- having regard to the Commission's 1997 Annual Management Report (SEC(98)0961),
- having regard to Declaration 19 on the implementation of Community law which is annexed to the Final Act of the Treaty on European Union,
- having regard to the Council resolution of 7 December 1992 on making the Single Market work (2),
- having regard to the Council Resolution of 8 June 1993 on the quality of the drafting of Community legislation (3), and its own resolution of 18 December 1998 on the draft interinstitutional agreement on common guidelines for the quality of drafting of Community legislation (4), approving the draft agreement.
- having regard to the Commission communication of 16 February 1994 to the Council and the European Parliament on the development of administrative cooperation in the implementation and enforcement of Community legislation in the Internal Market (COM(94)0029),
- having regard to the Council Resolution of 20 June 1994 on the electronic dissemination of Community law and national implementing laws and on improved access conditions (5),
- having regard to the Interinstitutional Agreement of 20 December 1994 on an accelerated working method to simplify the arrangements for decision-making as regards official codification (6),
- having regard to certain proposals contained in the report by the Molitor Group on legislative and administrative simplification (COM(95)0288), which was submitted at the Cannes European Council in June 1995,
- having regard to the communication from the Commission to the Council and the European Parliament on the role of penalties in implementing Community internal market legislation (COM(95)0162),
- having regard to its resolution of 9 February 1983 on the responsibility of the Member States for the application of and compliance with Community law (7),
- having regard to its resolution of 14 May 1997 on the Commission's communication on the implementation of Community environmental law (8) and the principles contained therein for improving application of this legislation, which are still valid and topical,
- having regard to the case law of the Court of Justice concerning the liability of a Member State for damage caused to individuals by violations of Community law (9),
- having regard to its resolutions of 16 July 1998 on the Ombudsman's annual report for 1997 (10) and on the special report by the European Ombudsman to the European Parliament following his own-initiative inquiry into public access to documents (11),
- having regard to the Commission Communication of 15 October 1998 on improving the Commission's working methods relating to infringement procedures (SEC(98)1733),

OJ C 250, 10.8.1998, p. 1.

OJ C 334, 18.12.1992, p. 1.

OJ C 166, 17.6.1993, p. 1.

See Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 3(a).

OJ C 179, 1.7.1994, p. 3.

OJ C 293, 8.11.1995, p. 2. OJ C 68, 14.3.1983, p. 32. OJ C 167, 2.6.1997, p. 92.

ECJ judgment of 19.11.1991, cases C-6/90 and C-9/90, Francovich and Bonifaci, ECR I-5357. ECJ judgment of 5.3.1996, cases C-46/93 and C-48/93, Brasserie du pêcheur and Factortame, ECR I-1029.

OJ C 292, 21.9.1998, p. 168.

⁽¹¹⁾ OJ C 292, 21.9.1998, p. 170.

- having regard to the conclusions of the Vienna European Council of 11 and 12 December 1998, with particular reference to the simplification and implementation of Community legislation,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Citizens' Rights and the opinions of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection and the Committee on Petitions (A4-0092/99),
- A. whereas the European Community is a Community ruled by law in which neither the Member States nor the institutions are exempt from monitoring intended to ensure that their acts are in accordance with the Treaty,
- B. whereas the complexity of Community law is doubtless the reflection of the new challenges facing contemporary society (social, political and economic issues relating to globalisation and new technologies) but is also the result of cumbersome legislative procedures which are still to a large extent based on intergovernmental cooperation,
- C. whereas, to facilitate the involvement of the general public in the process of European integration, it is essential that Community law should be drafted in such a way as to be comprehensible to those to whom it applies,
- D. whereas legislative simplification is a major political requirement and whereas the Member States (and in particular their parliaments) must use every available means to ensure that this task is performed properly, especially when Community Directives are incorporated into national law,
- E. whereas the institutions must endeavour to improve the quality of Community legislative texts and to implement, strictly and with a minimum of delay, the guidelines laid down in the interinstitutional agreement on the quality of the drafting of Community legislation,
- F. whereas greater efforts could be made as regards the transparency of the decision-making process and the codification of Community law,
- G. whereas the annual Commission reports on monitoring the application of Community law have two main functions: to monitor the transposition of Directives by the Member States and to provide an account of the use made by the Commission of its discretionary power to initiate procedures for non-compliance,
- H. whereas the Commission's annual reports on the monitoring of the application of Community law also enable the European Parliament to reflect on the nature and the future development of Community law and the way in which the latter has been applied by the members of the various legal professions, by the public authorities and, in particular, by national judges, who are at the same time Community judges of common law,
- I. whereas the rates at which transposition measures are notified vary according to the area of legislation concerned and from one Member State to another,
- J. having regard to the need for a permanent dialogue to be established at various levels between the EU authorities and those of the individual Member States, with a view to establishing a genuine Community ruled by law,
- K. whereas it is important for the effectiveness of Community law that those working in the legal professions should be aware of the current situation,
- L. whereas vigilance exercised by individuals with a view to safeguarding their rights is essential to the correct application of Community law by the Member States, since this would result in more effective monitoring than that carried out by the Commission under Article 169 of the EC Treaty (future Article 226),
- M. whereas the Community should give greater priority to facilitating access by the general public to Community law and to the rapid dissemination thereof by all means possible in order to make it more accessible to the general public and whereas, for this reason, the Institutions should not refuse public access to documents relating to the Community legislative process, except if such access could be prejudicial to the public interest or the privacy of individuals,
- N. having regard to the important role played in the application of Community law by members of the general public who are aware of their rights, when they assert their right to receive compensation from a Member State which fails to meet the obligations imposed on it under Community law, and whereas this right of compensation mainly has to do with national law as regards conditions of substance and form,

O. whereas European citizens, in an increasing number of petitions and complaints, are denouncing to the European Parliament the infringement or incorrect application of secondary Community law; emphasising therefore the contribution that the institution of the petition and of the European Ombudsman make to monitoring the application of that law,

Simplification of Community law

- 1. Stresses that the lack of clarity in Community law is not only a problem stemming from the complexity and the increasingly technical nature of the EU's legislative process but is primarily a political problem since it affects everyday people who simply do not understand Community legislative texts and this leads to an even more serious consequence, namely a questioning of the Union's legitimacy and that of its representative bodies; whereas the European Parliament should under these circumstances assume its political responsibility to legislate in order to serve the people, this being the basis and foundation of democracy;
- 2. Considers in this connection that existing law needs to be simplified as a matter of urgency, in particular through the official qualification thereof, and that clear rules should be followed as regards the quality of the drafting of Community legislation when future legislative proposals are drawn up;
- 3. Undertakes to implement (once it is signed) the interinstitutional agreement on the quality of the drafting of legislative texts and reiterates its basic view that Community acts should be comprehensible in themselves and that the Council and the Member States should once and for all abandon the practice of adopting interpretative statements;
- 4. Considers moreover that the transparency of the decision-making process is an integral part of the democratic character of the European Union and that this essential if there is to be public confidence;

Transposition of Community law

- 5. Fully agrees with the conclusions of the Vienna European Council to the effect that, despite the considerable amount of progress made, there are still gaps in the transposition of Community rules by the Member States;
- 6. In this connection, acknowledges the efforts which the Commission made in 1997 and 1998 by means of a stricter policy of monitoring the transposition of Directives relating to the internal market (involving the periodic drawing up of 'scoreboards') and also by means of a more ambitious information policy and better application of the procedure laid down in Article 169 (future Article 226) of the EC Treaty;
- 7. Considers that cooperation and the exchange of information between the Commission and the authorities of the individual Member States make it easier for Community law to be correctly applied; for this reason, more extensive links should be established and the Commission should encourage the bodies responsible within the Member States for incorporating Community law into national law to request its technical assistance (if necessary) in order to ensure that legislation is correctly transposed; takes the view that such technical assistance must also be made available to the applicant countries with whom formal negotiations have already begun and whose national laws are now being brought into line with the *acquis communautaire*;
- 8. Recalls that, following on from the EP and Council resolutions of May and June 1998 on the drafting, implementation and enforcement of Community environmental law, the Commission undertook to establish minimum criteria for inspection tasks, with a view to promoting effective and even enforcement within the Community; urges the Commission to fulfil this commitment in consultation with the EP and the Council within the lifetime of the present Parliament;

Implementation of the procedure laid down in Article 169 (future Article 226) of the EC Treaty

- 9. Calls on the Commission to indicate the average amount of time that passes between the sending of a letter of formal notice and the delivery of a reasoned opinion, and between the latter and the point at which a case of infringement lapses or is brought before the Court of Justice;
- 10. Notes that the Commission intends to improve its working methods relating to infringement procedures with a particular view to speeding up the processing of cases and calls also on the Commission to propose mandatory time limits, even in more complex cases, so that decisions on the referral of matters to the Court of Justice pursuant to Article 169 are taken within twelve months of the deadline laid down by the Commission in its reasoned opinion; the Commission must give the Member State concerned the opportunity to submit its observations no later than six months after the complaint is registered;

- 11. Considers that, in order to ensure the credibility of infringement procedures in the eyes of the public, the Commission must ensure strict compliance with the two-month deadline by which Member States are to reply to a letter of formal notice; calls on the Commission, therefore, to systematically deliver a reasoned opinion or refer the matter to the Court of Justice in cases where Member States have not complied with the deadlines set;
- 12. Calls on the Commission to indicate how many and which of the complaints and cases it has investigated were originally petitions;
- 13. Calls on the Commission to discuss cases of infringement at least once every three months instead of once every six months;
- 14. Calls on the Commission to inform the plaintiff of all the legal arguments in his case and to give him the opportunity to contest its position before it takes a final decision on whether his complaint gives grounds for an appeal before the Court of Justice;
- 15. Calls on the Commission to establish, as part of the general register of the documents it has received, a register of all complaints received;

The role of the general public and access to Community law

- 16. Considers training of members of the legal professions in Community law to be necessary so that their work can be made more effective, in order to render the information and advice requested from them by members of the general public more accurate; calls once again, therefore, on Member States and universities to make the teaching of Community law compulsory in universities;
- 17. Calls, in this connection, for improved funding of the programmes set up for this purpose, such as Grotius and Schuman and for the continuation of the Euro-jus initiative, which deserves solid support, given that it has such an important role in providing information and imparting knowledge to the public in relation to all aspects of Community law;
- 18. Calls on the Commission to consider, as soon as possible, the idea of regularly placing on the Internet the information contained in the annual report on monitoring the application of Community law, so as to increase the transparency of the implementation of the procedure referred to in Article 169 and to allow greater awareness amongst the public in general and legal professionals in particular;

Substance of the annual report

- 19. Notes that, as regards all the Directives applicable as at 31 December 1997, the average rate for the notification of transposition measures by all the Member States is 94%;
- 20. Regrets, however, the fact that the individual performances of the Member States are extremely varied, as, for example, in the telecommunications and transport sector;
- 21. Welcomes the fact that, in 1997, the Commission for the first time used the right conferred on it under the second subparagraph of Article 171(2) of the EC Treaty (future Article 228) by proposing to the Court of Justice that the Member States concerned should be required to pay a penalty for having failed to implement an initial judgment by the Court of Justice; encourages the Commission to make further use of this procedure which has proved particularly useful for improving the monitoring of the application of Community law (of the eight referrals to the Court, four were rapidly settled), and, in specific cases, to provide more detailed justification with regard to the size of the penalty payment it proposes to the Court of Justice:
- 22. Regrets that no account has been taken of the recommendations made in its resolution of 29 January 1998 (¹) on the previous annual report as regards the addition of new sections to the Commission's annual report, notably:
- a paragraph or section analysing the application of international agreements to which the Community is a party, legislation based on such agreements and external commitments stemming therefrom,
- a special section providing an overview of the Member States' and the Commission's activities in relation to Article 100a(4) et seq (future Article 95) and the action taken in this respect by the Commission,

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 56, 23.2.1998, p. 39.

- a section on the petitions forwarded by Parliament's Committee on Petitions, indicating those cases where petitions have also been dealt with as complaints;
- a section on cases where Member States have transposed social policy directives by means of collective agreements, so that the extent of this method of transposition may be studied;
- Welcomes the positive impact of the procedural reform adopted by the Commission in July 1996, as a result of which, in order to improve compliance with the one-year time limit set by the Commission for the taking of a decision, the total number of formal notices increased by 23% (1 460 in 1997, compared with 1 168 in 1996), and the number of cases terminated also rose by nearly as much (22%);
- Calls on the Commission to include in the next reports a more detailed account of the decisions of national courts concerning the responsibility of Member States with regard to infringements of Community law;

Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission, the Council, the Court of Justice and the governments and parliaments of the Member States.

14. UN reform: public affairs at world level

A4-0077/99

Resolution on the challenges of global governance and the reform of the United Nations

The European Parliament,

- having regard to its resolution of 8 February 1994 on the role of the Union within the UN and the problems of reforming the UN (1),
- having regard to its resolution of 12 October 1995 on the financial crisis at the UN (2),
- having regard to its resolution of 16 November 1995 on the UN Declaration on the rights of indigenous peoples (3),
- having regard to its resolution of 18 June 1998 on the International Criminal Court (4),
- having regard to its resolution of 18 June 1998 on the Second Ministerial Conference of the World Trade Organisation (WTO) (5),
- having regard to its resolution of 28 January 1999 on the environment, security and foreign policy (6),
- having regard to the report of the UN Secretary-General of 14 July 1997 Renewing the United Nations: A Programme for Reform (Doc. A/51/950), together with subsequent documents adding to and clarifying that report,
- having regard to the resolutions adopted in Geneva by the 53rd and 54th sessions of the UN Commission on Human Rights on the question of the death penalty,
- having regard to the report of the Council of Europe of 1 April 1998 on Reform of the United Nations (Doc. 8052/1998),
- having regard to the Memorandum submitted by the European Union to the last UN General Assembly,

OJ C 61, 28.2.1994, p. 43. OJ C 287, 30.10.1995, p. 203.

OJ C 323, 4.12.1995, p. 117.

OJ C 210, 6.7.1998, p. 213.

OJ C 210, 6.7.1998. p. 222.

Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 8.

- having regard to Rule 148 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy and the opinion of the Committee on Development and Cooperation (A4-0077/99),
- A. whereas the profound changes that have occurred in the second half of this century must be reflected in a change in the aims and structures of the United Nations Organisation, so as to give the UN adequate instruments and effective powers,
- B. concerned at the growing complexity of the crises affecting world security at a time when the decision-making mechanisms regulating the right and duty to intervene still await clarification in terms of the UN Charter.
- C. aware that the nature of armed conflict today has made national legal systems incapable of bringing to justice those guilty of war crimes, crimes against humanity and genocide; emphasising the capital importance of establishing the International Criminal Court and appointing an independent prosecutor,
- D. concerned at the dangers of a resumption of the nuclear arms race which challenges the robustness and effectiveness of the existing non-proliferation arrangements,
- E. concerned at the persistence of human rights violations throughout the world and at the impoverishment and deplorable social conditions that prevail for a growing section of the world population,
- F. concerned at the continuing use of capital punishment in many countries,
- G. having regard to the growing interdependence of our societies and mindful of the impact of globalisation on economic, social and environmental policy,
- H. mindful of the growing interaction of certain policies at international level such as foreign affairs, security, trade, environment and development,
- mindful of the growing complexity of the tasks required of the public authorities, i.e. the need to
 create conditions for sustainable development encompassing not only peace, but also freedom,
 economic efficiency, monetary stability, social justice, protection of the environment and respect for
 cultural diversity,
- J. whereas this complex mission calls for a coherent and evolving global institutional framework capable of taking the decisions needed to ensure progress towards these objectives,
- K. concerned at the fact that, at the present time, the phenomenon of globalisation is not balanced by a global institutional structure capable of regulating its effects by means of a global governance role,
- L. whereas the existing organisations with a universal vocation were almost all created in the 1940s or 1950s and are therefore inappropriate either because of their terms of reference or their mode of operation and now require fundamental reform,
- M. whereas many of these institutions are based on limited representativeness and suffer from a lack of transparency and a clear public and democratic mandate,
- N. regretting the lack of interaction, harmonised policies and joint decision-making between those institutions.
- O. recognising the opportunity presented by the convening of a 'Millennium Assembly' at the 55th Session of the General Assembly in September 2000 to focus public attention on the challenges of global governance that will confront the UN in the 21st century, and the part reform will play in meeting these challenges,
- P. taking the view, in the context of the reform process, that increased efficiency does not mean less UN expenditure, but rather better, more effective and, where appropriate, more expenditure, particularly in the context of fostering sustainable development in the G-77 countries,
- Q. underlining the importance of the policy and the activities of the United Nations Drug Control Programme (UNDCP), which has produced significant preliminary results, and reaffirming that it is important that all its initiatives take place in the framework of respect for human rights,

- R. being of the opinion that economic, social and cultural rights are not as well codified as civil and political rights and therefore deserve more attention; stressing at the same time the particular and fundamental importance carried by civil and political rights in the struggle to make human rights universally respected,
- S. regretting in particular the persistent absence of environmental considerations in multilateral trade agreements,
- T. criticising the process of economic globalisation for the de facto transfer of the powers of legitimate governments towards transnational economic power which, in the pursuit of competitiveness, is beyond all democratic scrutiny and often manages to circumvent the obligations to which national economic operators are subject with resulting erosion of the social fabric in the countries where that power is established,
- U. acknowledging, therefore, the urgent need to create a more consistent institutional structure at world level that is capable of coping with the problems of globalisation,
- V. desirous in this connection that the European Union, as an advanced model of regional association, should be able to fulfil a representative and coordinating function by assuming a role and a political authority commensurate with its demographic and economic weight, so as to arrive at a proper common foreign and security policy that will enable it to speak with a single voice,
- 1. Acknowledges that there can be no effective reform of the management of political affairs at world level without a corresponding change in the philosophy and logic of international relations accepting in particular that collective responsibilities are now global;
- 2. Is convinced that the UN, as long as it undergoes appropriate reform, remains the leading intergovernmental policy forum for discussion of, and establishing global consensus on, issues of international and common importance, including many aspects of globalisation;
- 3. Regrets, for this reason, the delay by some member countries, and in particular the United States, in paying their annual quota, which is impairing the proper functioning of its bodies;
- 4. Welcomes the Secretary-General's regrouping of the 30 or so main UN bodies into four thematic areas, notably: peace and security; economic and social affairs; development operations and finally humanitarian affairs; endorses this reform as a first step towards a more rational decision-making structure within the UN system;
- 5. Believes, in the long term, that many of these bodies could be merged into coherent single entities within this four-theme structure;

Peace and Security

- 6. Points out that the main duty of the UN Security Council remains the maintenance of peace and international security but notes that the means of action at its disposal no longer match the requirements generated by the impact of globalisation; underlines, therefore, the need for its reform;
- 7. Is of the opinion that the composition of the Security Council should be based on the democratic principles of fair and transparent geographical representation, while reflecting new world realities, including the EU, which is increasingly playing an important role on the international scene; suggests that a reform of the voting system might follow the existing rules of the OSCE which are based on the principle of unanimity minus one vote;
- 8. Believes it is essential that the UN should have effective instruments for diplomatic intervention and the ability to call upon appropriate rapid reaction forces in order to prevent the escalation of conflicts and for the purposes of peace-keeping; welcomes the Secretary-General's announcement of the establishment of a Strategic Planning Unit to enable the UN to conduct analysis, contingency planning, forward strategy, emergency planning and early warning conflict alert as a means of bolstering the UN's ability to conduct preventive diplomacy;

Economic, social, development and humanitarian operations

9. Is convinced that a mechanism for coordinating their policies should be established between the existing organisations with a universal vocation, while the activities of those institutions should be made more transparent and more democratically legitimate;

- 10. Therefore proposes the introduction of a parliamentary dimension into the system of the UN organisations by creating parliamentary bodies composed of the chairmen of parliamentary committees of national and regional parliaments, starting e.g. with Environment and Foreign Affairs, thus strengthening the existing cooperation between the United Nations and the International Interparliamentary Union;
- 11. Hopes that by creating such parliamentary accountability at world level the UN could become more relevant in the parliaments of the world;
- 12. Supports the proposal to set up a permanent forum of the associations of civil society to convene before the sessions of the General Assembly of the United Nations;
- 13. Stresses the importance of revitalising the global agenda for environmental protection and sustainable development;
- 14. Considers that, in the absence of rules capable of its governance, financial globalisation is creating an urgent need to reform the Bretton Woods design, and this must be carried out in a coordinated approach covering all the institutions in the system (the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank, the International Labour Organisation and the World Trade Organisation); after launching of the euro, the EU must form one of the pillars of the new system;
- 15. Maintains that the structural adjustment conditions imposed by the Bretton Woods institutions on the poorest countries, in which heavy social spending cuts can undermine both the living conditions of large sections of the population and the conditions required for sustainable development, should be reviewed; considers combating poverty and fostering sustainable growth to be priorities which should be included among the missions of the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund;
- 16. Considers that the globalisation of democracy and the universal acceptance of human rights as fundamental values raise an urgent need to provide a universal juridical and judicial system that will be able to protect them and punish their infringement; this is another reason for convening a summit on globalisation at the United Nations;
- 17. Supports the recent proposals to create within the UN an economic Security Council to produce a synthesis of economic development, trade, social justice and environmental protection issues, provided such a body does not duplicate the work of the General Assembly;
- 18. Reiterates its support for the creation of a 'World Environment Agency' to balance the power of the WTO by possibly drawing together existing UN bodies responsible for environmental matters, and further calls for the implementation of the recommendation of the UN Task Force on Environment and Human Settlement;
- 19. Believes that the UN should work with national governments to help them take advantage of the benefits of globalisation, while managing the social and environmental implications;
- 20. Asks the European Union and its Member States to review their development cooperation policies in the light of the conditions created by globalisation by refocusing existing programmes on the mutual recognition of cultures and on human and social development itself based on structural and democratic reforms in the developing countries;
- 21. Emphasises that, as well as working within the framework of the UN's traditional purposes of peacekeeping and development promotion, the EU should be taking action on the major basic problems such as democratisation, respect for human rights, the economic and social imbalances between North and South, major migrational trends etc. and on the new sources of world instability such as environmental destruction, arms and drugs trafficking, terrorism and organised crime etc.; it should also be entering into global politics in support of the sense of community, solidarity and social rights for workers;
- 22. Emphasises that development aid is of fundamental importance to the advancement of the common interests of the entire international community and that the United Nations system should increasingly take on a central role in the coordination and organisation of initiatives taken by international donors and those involved in implementing cooperation projects;

- 23. Draws attention to the important role which the EU traditionally plays at summits held on topics of worldwide interest and asks the Commission to consider ways of establishing networks of relations with the main components of civil society with a view to ensuring the follow-up to the decisions taken at these summits:
- 24. Is of the opinion that the notion of human rights needs to be brought up to date again by being looked at in close relation with civil, political, social, economic and cultural rights; believes, moreover, that the phenomenon of globalisation requires that the notion of universal responsibility also becomes an inseparable component thereof;
- 25. Welcomes the initiative of the UN High Commissioner in reaffirming the universality of human rights by providing the Universal Declaration of Human Rights with a commentary for representatives of cultures other than that of the West and thus bringing it closer to the communities belonging to those cultures:
- 26. Welcomes the efforts made at the UN to introduce the human rights dimension into all policies of that organisation; decides, moreover, to redouble its own efforts to the same end as far as EU policies are concerned; calls on the 1999 session of the United Nations General Assembly to establish a universal moratorium on executions, with a view to the complete abolition of the death penalty;
- 27. Considers that regional organisations for economic integration have become an indispensable factor in international security; accordingly requests the EU to continue to revitalise the dialogue with them:
- 28. Welcomes the past initiatives by its committee responsible for foreign affairs in continuing a political dialogue with similar bodies in the parliaments of crisis-stricken countries;
- 29. Believes that such parliamentary diplomacy is an excellent means of making the management of international affairs more consistent and that it should be further developed;
- 30. Calls on the EU to expand its political authority to match its economic development involvement in regions posing particular risks by becoming the catalyst for the dialogue on security; suggests, moreover, that this dialogue could result in regional agreements on the non-proliferation of nuclear weapons, provided they do not undermine the Non-Proliferation Treaty;
- 31. Calls on the Commission and the Council to reflect on the consistency needed at world level in the relationship between the requirements of foreign policy and those of human rights, particularly in peace-keeping operations;
- 32. Calls on the Council and the institutions of the WEU to examine, in the light of the current challenges of world security and within the limits of Article J.7(2) of the Treaty on European Union, the possibility of redefining in terms of the UN Charter the right and duty of intervention in order to recognise the right of humanitarian intervention as universally valid and the way in which the architecture of global security could be erected around forces drawn from the UN and regional military organisations; this would mean extending the criterion of threatening international peace to include the criterion of protecting people from violation of their safety and fundamental rights;
- 33. Welcomes the establishment of the International Criminal Court (ICC) as a major breakthrough in international law which introduces the international criminal liability of the individual; calls for the EU and its Member States to play an active part in the campaign that will be needed for ratification of the Treaty, particularly in relation to the United States, and to provide the resources necessary for the operation of the ICC;
- 34. Wishes to thank the 71 States that have already signed the Treaty establishing the ICC and invites them to ratify it as soon as possible and asks the Member States to work to ensure that recalcitrant countries also recognise its jurisdiction on their territory, in order that the ICC can start working effectively without delay;

Financial reform

35. Recognises the dire financial situation confronting the UN and reiterates its call in its resolution of 8 October 1998 (1) to all UN Member States to pay their dues in full on time;

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 328, 26.10.1998, p. 197.

Interinstitutional provisions

- 36. Calls on the Council to transmit its Memorandum which it submitted to the last UN General Assembly to the European Parliament pursuant to future Article 21 of the Treaty on European Union with a view to it being adopted as a 'common strategy' within the meaning of future Article 13(2) of the Treaty;
- 37. Calls on the Presidency of the Council and the Commission, pursuant to Article J.7 of the Treaty on European Union, to report to it as soon as possible on the Union's position concerning the specific points contained in this resolution within the context of forthcoming meetings of the United Nations, its agencies and bodies, and all other relevant international fora;

* *

38. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, the Member States, the Secretary-General of the United Nations, the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights and the Secretary-General of the WTO.

ATTENDANCE REGISTER 23 March 1999

The following signed:

d'Aboville, Adam, Aelvoet, Ahern, Ainardi, Alavanos, Aldo, Amadeo, Anastassopoulos, d'Ancona, Andersson, André-Léonard, Angelilli, Antony, Anttila, Aparicio Sánchez, Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Augias, Avgerinos, Azzolini, Baldarelli, Baldi, Balfe, Banotti, Bardong, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barthet-Mayer, Barton, Bazin, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Berès, Berger, Bernardini, Bertens, Berthu, Bertinotti, Billingham, van Bladel, Blak, Blokland, Blot, Böge, Bösch, Bonde, Bontempi, Boogerd-Quaak, Bourlanges, Bowe, Breyer, Brinkhorst, Brok, Bru Purón, Buffetaut, Burenstam Linder, Burtone, Cabezón Alonso, Caccavale, Caligaris, Camisón Asensio, Campos, Campoy Zueco, Carlotti, Carlsson, Carnero González, Carniti, Carrère d'Encausse, Carrozzo, Cars, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnède, Castagnetti, Castricum, Caudron, Cederschiöld, Cellai, Ceyhun, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coates, Coelho, Cohn-Bendit, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Gerard, Collins Kenneth D., Colombo Svevo, Colom i Naval, Corbett, Cornelissen, Correia, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cot, Cottigny, Cox, Crampton, Crawley, Crowley, Cunha, Cunningham, Cushnahan, van Dam, Damião, Dankert, Darras, Daskalaki, De Clercq, De Coene, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Dell'Alba, De Luca, De Melo, Denys, Deprez, Desama, Dillen, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnay, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Donner, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dupuis, Dybkjær, Ebner, Eisma, Elchlepp, Elles, Elliott, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Eriksson, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Ettl, Evans, Ewing, Fabra Vallés, Fabre-Aubrespy, Falconer, Fassa, Fayot, Ferber, Féret, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Fitzsimons, Flemming, Florenz, Florio, Fontaine, Ford, Formentini, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Frischenschlager, Frutos Gama, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Gallagher, García Arias, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garot, Garriga Polledo, Gasòliba i Böhm, de Gaulle. Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Giansily, Gillis, Gil-Robles Gil-Delgado, Girão Pereira, Glante, Glase, Goedbloed, Goepel, Goerens, Görlach, Gollnisch, Gomolka, González Álvarez, González Triviño, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Graenitz, Graziani, Green, Gröner, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, Guinebertière, Gutiérrez Díaz, Haarder, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hänsch, Hager, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hatzidakis, Haug, Hautala, Hawlicek, Heinisch, Hendrick, Herman, Hermange, Hernandez Mollar, Herzog, Hindley, Hoff, Holm, Hoppenstedt, Howitt, Hudghton, Hughes, Hyland, Ilaskivi, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Jensen Kirsten M., Jensen Lis, Jöns, Jové Peres, Junker, Kaklamanis, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kerr, Kestelijn-Sierens, Killilea, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kittelmann, Kjer Hansen, Klaß, Klironomos, Kofoed, Kokkola, Konrad, Krarup, Krehl, Kreissl-Dörfler, Kristoffersen, Kronberger, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lalumière, Lambraki, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lannoye, Larive, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Lataillade, Le Gallou, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Leopardi, Le Rachinel, Lienemann, Liese, Ligabue, Lindeperg, Lindholm, Lindqvist, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, Lulling, McAvan, McCarthy, McCartin, McGowan, McIntosh, McKenna, McMahon, McMillan-Scott, McNally, Maes, Malangré, Malerba, Malone, Manisco, Mann Erika, Mann Thomas, Manzella, Marin, Marinho, Marinucci, Marset Campos, Martens, Martin David W., Martin Philippe-Armand, Martinez, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendiluce Pereiro, Mendonça, Menrad, Metten, Mezzaroma, Miller, Miranda, Miranda de Lage, Mohamed Ali, Mombaur, Monfils, Moorhouse, Morán López, Moreau, Moretti, Morgan, Morris, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Müller, Mulder, Murphy, Muscardini, Musumeci, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Nassauer, Needle, Newens, Newman, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nicholson, Nordmann, Novo, Oddy, Ojala, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Orlando, Otila, Paasilinna, Paasio, Pack, Pailler, Palacio Vallelersundi, Palm, Papakyriazis, Papayannakis, Parigi, Pasty, Peijs, Pérez Royo, Perry, Peter, Pettinari, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, des Places, Plooij-van Gorsel, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poisson, Pollack, Pomés Ruiz, Pompidou, Pons Grau, Porto, Posada González, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Puerta, van Putten, Querbes, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Raschhofer, Rauti, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rehder, Ribeiro, Riis-Jørgensen, Rinsche, Ripa di Meana, Robles Piquer, Rocard, Rosado Fernandes, de Rose, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Rovsing, Rübig, Ryynänen, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre, Sakellariou, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sandbæk, Santini, Sanz Fernández, Sarlis, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schaffner, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schifone, Schlechter, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schnellhardt, Schörling, Schröder, Schroedter, Schulz, Schwaiger, Seal, Secchi, Seillier, Seppänen, Sierra González, Simpson, Sindal, Sisó Cruellas, Sjöstedt, Skinner, Smith, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Sonneveld, Sornosa Martínez, Soulier, Spaak, Speciale, Spencer, Spiers, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Stirbois, Stockmann, Striby, Sturdy, Svensson, Swoboda, Tajani, Tannert, Tappin, Tatarella, Taubira-Delannon, Telkämper, Terrón i Cusí, Teverson, Theato, Theonas, Theorin, Thomas, Thors, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Titley, Todini, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Trakatellis, Truscott, Tsatsos, Ullmann, Väyrynen, Valdivielso de Cué, Vallvé, Valverde López, Vanhecke, Van Lancker, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, Vecchi, van Velzen W.G., van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Verwaerde, Viceconte, Vinci, Viola, Virgin, Virrankoski, Waddington, Walter, Watson, Watts, Weber, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiebenga, Wieland, Wiersma, Wijsenbeek, Willockx, Wilson, von Wogau, Wolf, Wurtz, Wynn, Zimmermann

ANNEX

Result of roll-call votes

(+) = For

(-) = Against

(O) = Abstention

1. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 15

292 (+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Gutiérrez Díaz, Ojala, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Antony, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Lukas, Martinez, Moretti, Pinel, Raschhofer, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PPE: Bébéar, Bourlanges, Chanterie, Decourrière, Deprez, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Fourçans, Grosch, Grossetête, Lehideux, Mann Thomas, Mather, de Rose, Stewart-Clark, Verwaerde

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Marques, Truscott, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

V: Ahern, Holm, Lagendijk

193 (-)

ARE: Weber

ELDR: Boogerd-Quaak, Goerens

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Coates, Ephremidis, González Álvarez, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Sierra González, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

NI: Angelilli, Cellai, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Schifone, Tatarella

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Ferrer, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schleiter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, van Velzen W. G., Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Corbett, Schlechter

V: Aelvoet, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Müller, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

12 (O)

ARE: Dell'Alba

ELDR: Kjer Hansen, Spaak

GUE/NGL: Carnero González

NI: Amadeo

PPE: Argyros, Mombaur

PSE: Aparicio Sánchez, Barros Moura, Roth-Behrendt

V: Lindholm, McKenna

2. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Paragraph 2 (first part)

352 (+)

ARE: Dell'Alba, Ewing, Hudghton Ian, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Coates, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Lukas, Martinez, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Raschhofer, Schifone, Stirbois, Tatarella, Vanhecke

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Baldarelli, Billingham, Cabezón Alonso, Correia, Delcroix, Denys, Elliott, Falconer, Görlach, Hindley, Izquierdo Collado, Jöns, Kindermann, Kuhne, McNally, Manzella, Marinho, Mendiluce Pereiro, Morán López, Mutin, Napoletano, Oddy, Papakyriazis, Sakellariou, Sandberg-Fries, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schmid, Sindal, Stockmann, Tannert, van Velzen Wim, Wibe

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

159 (-)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, González Triviño, Lalumière, Posada González, Weber

ELDR: De Luca

GUE/NGL: Carnero González

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Desama, Donner, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Ettl, Evans, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Karamanou, Katiforis, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, Malone, Mann Erika, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Myller, Needle, Newens, Newman, Paasilinna, Paasio, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Roubatis, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Van Lancker, Vecchi, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

6 (O)

GUE/NGL: Sornosa Martínez

PPE: Argyros, De Melo

PSE: Dührkop Dührkop, Palm, Rothley

3. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Paragraph 2 (second part)

349

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Coates, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Lukas, Martinez, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Raschhofer, Schifone, Stirbois, Tatarella, Vanhecke

PPE: Carlsson, Chanterie, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Grosch, Kittelmann, Konrad, Lenz, Liese, Mather, Reding, Sonneveld, Thyssen, Tindemans

PSE: Andersson, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Truscott, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

161

ARE: Dell'Alba

ELDR: Spaak, Wijsenbeek

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Klaß, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux,

Lehne, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Malangré, Malerba, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Aparicio Sánchez, Campos, Dührkop Dührkop, Megahy, Pérez Royo, Schlechter, Torres Marques

6 (O)

ELDR: De Luca

PPE: Argyros, De Melo, Maij-Weggen

PSE: Adam, Palm

4. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 3

158 (+)

ARE: Escolá Hernando, Ewing, Hudghton Ian, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes

ELDR: Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Dybkjær, Eisma, Goedbloed, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Mulder, Plooij-van Gorsel, Ryynänen, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Coates, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Raschhofer, Schifone, Stirbois, Tatarella, Vanhecke

PPE: Arroni, Cassidy, Chanterie, Christodoulou, Corrie, Cushnahan, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Elles, Ferri, Grosch, Jackson, Konrad, Liese, McIntosh, Maij-Weggen, Mann Thomas, Mather, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Plumb, Posselt, Pronk, Sonneveld, Spencer, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, van Velzen W. G.

PSE: De Coene, Falconer, Lomas, Megahy, Metten, Morán López, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Sakellariou, Smith, Spiers, Stockmann, Tannert, Theorin, Van Lancker, Weiler, Wemheuer, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Zimmermann

UPE: Donnay, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Martin Philippe-Armand

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

341 (-)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, González Triviño, Lalumière, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goerens, Moorhouse, Nordmann, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Virrankoski, Watson

GUE/NGL: Carnero González, Sornosa Martínez, Wurtz

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Azzolini, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Costa Neves, Cunha, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Ebner, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Filippi, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk,

Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Lulling, McCartin, McMillan-Scott, Malangré, Malerba, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Pimenta, Pirker, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Provan, Rack, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Soulier, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Tajani, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Darras, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Mendiluce Pereiro, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Swoboda, Tappin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Vecchi, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, White, Whitehead, Wilson, Wynn

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Killilea, Lataillade, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

18 (O)

ARE: Castagnède

ELDR: Haarder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Riis-Jørgensen, Spaak, Vallvé

GUE/NGL: Gutiérrez Díaz

PPE: Argyros, Baldi, De Melo, Ferber, Mombaur, Reding

PSE: Dankert, Palm, Terrón i Cusí, van Velzen Wim

UPE: Daskalaki

5. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 14

451 (+)

ARE: Escolá Hernando, Ewing, Hudghton Ian, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Sainjon

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, De Clercq, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Teverson, Väyrynen, Watson, Wiebenga

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Coates, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Lukas, Martinez, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Raschhofer, Schifone, Stirbois, Tatarella, Vanhecke

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: d'Ancona, Andersson, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barros Moura, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Collins Kenneth D., Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Donner, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Megahy, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Truscott, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn

UPE: Daskalaki, Donnay, Kaklamanis, Martin Philippe-Armand

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

40 (-)

ARE: Dupuis, Weber

ELDR: De Luca, Virrankoski, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Carnero González

PPE: Berend

PSE: Adam, Aparicio Sánchez, Barón Crespo, Cabezón Alonso, Colino Salamanca, Colom i Naval, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Marinho, Medina Ortega, Mendiluce Pereiro, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Killilea, Lataillade, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

22 (O)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dell'Alba, González Triviño, Lalumière, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: Goerens, Riis-Jørgensen, Spaak, Thors, Vallvé

PPE: Argyros, Colombo Svevo, De Melo, Konrad, Reding

PSE: Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Garot, Palm, Roth-Behrendt, Schlechter

6. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 4

216

(+)

ARE: Escolá Hernando, Weber

ELDR: Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, De Luca, Eisma, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Monfils, Mulder, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Thors, Wiebenga

I-EDN: Berthu, Bonde, Buffetaut, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Lukas, Martinez, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Raschhofer, Schifone, Stirbois, Tatarella, Vanhecke

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

UPE: Martin Philippe-Armand

V: Breyer, Müller

301 (-)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: André-Léonard, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Lindqvist, Moorhouse, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Spaak, Teverson, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Coates, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Blokland, van Dam

PPE: Azzolini, Baldi, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Castagnetti, Estevan Bolea, Galeote Quecedo, Garosci, Graziani, Hernandez Mollar, McMillan-Scott, Malerba, Perry, Podestà, Tajani, Todini, Vaz da Silva

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião,

Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

V: Aelvoet, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

9 (O)

ELDR: Dybkjær

GUE/NGL: Ribeiro

PPE: Argyros, Arroni, De Melo, Rübig

PSE: Palm, Roth-Behrendt

V: Orlando

7. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 18

196 (+)

ARE: Weber

ELDR: Anttila, Bertens, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, De Luca, Eisma, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Mulder, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Thors, Wiebenga

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Lukas, Martinez, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Raschhofer, Schifone, Stirbois, Tatarella, Vanhecke

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Cassidy, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Christodoulou, Coelho, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio

Vallelersundi, Peijs, Pex, Plumb, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, de Rose, Rovsing, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

UPE: Daskalaki, Donnay

V: Müller

315 (-)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: André-Léonard, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Kestelijn-Sierens, Moorhouse, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Coates, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

PPE: Areitio Toledo, Azzolini, Baldi, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Castagnetti, Chichester, Colombo Svevo, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Galeote Quecedo, Gomolka, Graziani, Herman, Malerba, Perry, Pimenta, Pirker, Podestà, Rack, Robles Piquer, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Secchi, Stenmarck, Tajani, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, Viola

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

13 (O)

GUE/NGL: Manisco

PPE: Argyros, Garosci, Goepel, Konrad, Rübig, Schierhuber, Todini

PSE: Palm, Roth-Behrendt, Schlechter

UPE: Martin Philippe-Armand

V: Orlando

8. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 19

83

ARE: Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Maes, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Riis-Jørgensen, Teverson, Watson, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Manisco, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Svensson

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Antony, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Moretti, Musumeci, Pinel, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PPE: Bourlanges, Cassidy, Chichester, Corrie, Deprez, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Elles, Grosch, Grossetête, Jackson, Konrad, Langenhagen, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Mather, Perry, Sisó Cruellas, Sturdy, von Wogau

PSE: Blak, Cottigny, Jensen Kirsten M., Theorin, Wibe

UPE: Donnay

V: Holm, Lindholm, McKenna, Schörling

385 (-

ARE: Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Mulder, Plooij-van Gorsel, Virrankoski, Wiebenga

GUE/NGL: Carnero González, Coates, Ephremidis, Gutiérrez Díaz, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Muscardini, Parigi, Raschhofer

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campov Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Ilaskivi, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Lulling, McCartin, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Tajani, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Inbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz

Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hyland, Killilea, Lataillade, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Müller, Orlando, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann

46 (O)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer

ELDR: Cars, Cox, De Clercq, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Ryynänen, Spaak, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, González Álvarez, Herzog, Jové Peres, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Sierra González, Vinci, Wurtz

PPE: Argyros, Bébéar, Fourçans, de Rose

PSE: Andersson, Happart, Myller, Palm, Schlechter

UPE: Kaklamanis, Martin Philippe-Armand

V: Wolf

9. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Paragraph 4

455 (+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Saint-Pierre, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Carnero González, Coates, Gutiérrez Díaz, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Mohamed Ali, Novo, Ojala, Puerta, Ripa di Meana, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Blokland, Bonde, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Blot, Cellai, Hager, Kronberger, Lukas, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Schifone, Tatarella

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur,

Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Wibe, Wiersma, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: Caccavale, Daskalaki, Kaklamanis

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Hautala, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

31 (-)

ELDR: Lindqvist

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Ephremidis, Eriksson, Miranda, Moreau, Pailler, Querbes, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Svensson, Theonas

I-EDN: Jensen Lis, Krarup, Sandbæk, Striby

NI: Antony, Dillen, Féret, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Moretti, Pinel, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PSE: Marinho, Metten, Whitehead

32 (O)

GUE/NGL: Herzog

I-EDN: Berthu, Buffetaut, des Places

PPE: Argyros, De Melo

PSE: Palm

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Killilea, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

V: Holm, Lindholm, Schörling

10. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Paragraph 5

(+)

443

ARE: Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Maes, Posada González

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Carnero González, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Novo, Ojala, Puerta, Sornosa Martínez, Vinci

I-EDN: Blokland, van Dam, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Schifone, Stirbois, Tatarella, Vanhecke

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Carlotti, Carnotti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: Caccavale, Daskalaki, Kaklamanis

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

16 (-)

ELDR: Lindqvist

GUE/NGL: Coates, Eriksson, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Svensson

NI: Hager, Kronberger, Raschhofer

PSE: Aparicio Sánchez, Barón Crespo, Denys, Pérez Royo, Wibe

UPE: Gallagher

57 (O)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Saint-Pierre, Weber

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Ephremidis, Herzog, Moreau, Pailler, Querbes, Ripa di Meana, Sierra González, Theonas, Wurtz

I-EDN: Berthu, Bonde, Buffetaut, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier

PPE: Argyros, De Melo

PSE: Darras, Garot, Laignel, Mutin, Palm, Rocard

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Carrère d'Encausse, Crowley, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Killilea, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

11. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 12 (second part)

282 (+

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Coates, González Álvarez, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Novo, Puerta, Ribeiro, Sierra González, Vinci

I-EDN: Blokland, van Dam

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Raschhofer, Schifone, Stirbois, Tatarella, Vanhecke

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré,

Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Botz, Falconer, Kuckelkorn, Megahy, Randzio-Plath, Roth-Behrendt, Sandberg-Fries, Schlechter, Schmid, Spiers, Wibe

UPE: Andrews, Carrère d'Encausse, Daskalaki, Donnay, Kaklamanis, Poisson, Rosado Fernandes

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

209

ARE: Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: Goerens, Spaak

GUE/NGL: Carnero González, Eriksson, Gutiérrez Díaz, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Wurtz

I-EDN: Berthu, Bonde, Buffetaut, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

PPE: Bourlanges, Decourrière, Mather, Valverde López

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Graenitz, Green, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hendrick, Hindley, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Smith, Speciale, Stockmann, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, White, Whitehead, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: Bazin, van Bladel, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Killilea, Lataillade, Pasty, Pompidou, Schaffner

30 (O

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Moreau, Ojala, Pailler, Querbes, Theonas

I-EDN: Nicholson

PPE: Argyros, De Melo, Galeote Quecedo, Reding, Schiedermeier

PSE: Andersson, Barros Moura, Carniti, Carrozzo, Donner, Görlach, Hawlicek, Hoff, Iversen, Manzella, Palm, Swoboda, Van Lancker, Wemheuer, Wiersma

UPE: d'Aboville, Caccavale, Martin Philippe-Armand

12. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 20

60 (+)

ARE: Hudghton Ian, Maes ELDR: De Luca, Spaak

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Manisco, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Svensson

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Antony, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Moretti, Raschhofer, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PPE: Berend, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Konrad, Mann Thomas, Mather

PSE: Berger, Blak, Bösch, Botz, Iversen, Jensen Kirsten M., Pettinari, Randzio-Plath, Schlechter, Sindal, Wibe

UPE: Donnay, Poisson

V: Breyer, Holm, Lagendijk, Lindholm, McKenna, Ullmann

454 (-)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, Dybkjær, Eisma, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Haarder, Larive, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Coates, Ephremidis, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Schifone, Tatarella

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Bernardini, Billingham, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl,

Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Pasty, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Wolf

13 (O)

ELDR: Frischenschlager, Goerens, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Lindqvist, Monfils

PPE: Argyros, Lulling

PSE: Palm, Roth-Behrendt

UPE: Martin Philippe-Armand

V: Müller, Orlando

13. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 21

21 (+)

GUE/NGL: Manisco

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Hager, Kronberger, Moretti, Raschhofer

PPE: Pomés Ruiz

PSE: Skinner **V:** Lindholm

477 (-)

ARE: Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Coates, Ephremidis, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Schifone, Tatarella

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson. Sindal, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Killilea, Lataillade, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

22 (O)

ELDR: Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Ojala, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Svensson

NI: Antony, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Le Pen, Martinez, Pinel, Vanhecke

PPE: Argyros, Konrad

PSE: Palm, Wibe

UPE: Donnay, Kaklamanis, Martin Philippe-Armand

14. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Paragraph 7

467 (+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Wiebenga

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Bonde, van Dam, Jensen Lis, Sandbæk

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Schifone

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Corbett, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

45 (-)

ELDR: De Luca

GUE/NGL: Coates, Eriksson, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Svensson, Theonas

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Buffetaut, Fabre-Aubrespy, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Striby

NI: Antony, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Pinel, Raschhofer, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PPE: Baldi, Brok, Decourrière, von Habsburg, Redondo Jiménez, Soulier

PSE: Aparicio Sánchez, Botz, Colom i Naval, Tsatsos, Wibe

UPE: Andrews, Donnay, Martin Philippe-Armand, Rosado Fernandes

17 (O)

ELDR: Kjer Hansen, Riis-Jørgensen, Väyrynen, Watson, Wijsenbeek

I-EDN: Seillier

PPE: Argyros, De Melo, Garosci, Mombaur, Podestà

PSE: Correia, Damião, Lage, Marinho, Palm, Pérez Royo

15. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 6

427

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, Maes, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Haarder, Larive, Lindqvist, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Plooij-van Gorsel, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Virrankoski, Watson

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Coates, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Buffetaut, Sandbæk, Seillier

NI: Hager, Kronberger, Moretti, Raschhofer

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher,

Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Spencer, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Viola, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: d'Ancona, Andersson, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Álonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Favot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Ĝarot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Ĝlante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: Daskalaki, Rosado Fernandes

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

28 (-)

ARE: Weber

ELDR: De Clercq, De Luca, Goerens, Wijsenbeek

I-EDN: Blokland, van Dam, Krarup

NI: Antony, Féret, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Stirbois

PPE: Bébéar, Fourçans, Grossetête, Lehideux, Malerba, Provan, de Rose, Soulier, Stenmarck, Verwaerde

PSE: Samland

UPE: Carrère d'Encausse, Hermange

61 (O)

ARE: Dell'Alba, Dupuis

ELDR: Cox, Goedbloed, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Nordmann, Riis-Jørgensen, Vallvé, Wiebenga

I-EDN: Berthu, Fabre-Aubrespy, Nicholson, des Places, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Dillen, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Schifone, Vanhecke

PPE: Argyros, Cederschiöld, De Melo, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ferber, Günther, Liese, Mather, Mombaur

PSE: Aparicio Sánchez, Colom i Naval, Palm

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

16. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 5

233 (+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, Hudghton Ian, Maes, Posada González, Weber

ELDR: Goerens, Larive, Mulder, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Ojala, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Svensson

I-EDN: Buffetaut, Fabre-Aubrespy, Nicholson, des Places, Seillier, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Schifone

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mather, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland

PSE: Schlechter

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

V: Aelvoet, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Lindholm, Müller

250 (—)

ARE: González Triviño, de Lassus Saint Geniès

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Moorhouse, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Coates, Ephremidis, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Blokland, Bonde, van Dam

NI: Hager, Kronberger, Lukas, Raschhofer

PPE: Christodoulou, Pimenta

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

V: Cohn-Bendit, Lagendijk

(O)

ARE: Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Lalumière, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: Dybkjær, Lindqvist, Spaak

I-EDN: Berthu, Krarup

NI: Antony, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Pinel, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PPE: Argyros, De Melo

PSE: Palm

UPE: Donnay

V: Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Holm, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

17. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 9

132 (+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dupuis, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Coates, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Svensson, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Bonde, van Dam, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Sandbæk

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Lukas, Martinez, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Raschhofer, Schifone, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PPE: Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ferri, Jackson, Konrad, Lenz, Mather

PSE: McGowan, Sakellariou, Wibe

UPE: Caccavale

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

368 (-)

ARE: Weber

ELDR: De Luca, Goerens

GUE/NGL: Carnero González, Sornosa Martínez

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Buffetaut, Fabre-Aubrespy, Nicholson, des Places, Seillier, Striby

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijfen, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: Daskalaki, Donnay, Killilea

28 (O)

ARE: Dell'Alba
ELDR: Nordmann
GUE/NGL: Theonas
PPE: Argyros, Chanterie

PSE: Palm, Van Lancker

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Lataillade, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

18. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Paragraph 8

(+)

510

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Coates, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Lukas, Martinez, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Raschhofer, Schifone, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Malerba, Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel. Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W.,

Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

9 (–)

ARE: Weber

ELDR: Kestelijn-Sierens **PPE:** Camisón Asensio

PSE: Falconer, Metten, Roubatis, Sindal, Stockmann, Zimmermann

(O)

ARE: Posada González

GUE/NGL: Ephremidis, Theonas **PPE:** Argyros, De Melo, de Rose

PSE: Palm, Schlechter

19. Joint resolution - Resignation of the Commission

Paragraph 9

476 (+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Coates, Eriksson, Gutiérrez Díaz, Jové Peres, Manisco, Mohamed Ali, Ojala, Puerta, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Blokland, Bonde, van Dam, Jensen Lis, Sandbæk

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Cellai, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Schifone

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch,

Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Martens, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Lataillade, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

28 (-)

GUE/NGL: Ephremidis, Herzog, Miranda, Moreau, Novo, Pailler, Querbes, Ribeiro

I-EDN: Berthu, Buffetaut, Fabre-Aubrespy, Nicholson, des Places, Seillier, Striby

NI: Blot, Dillen, Féret, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Pinel, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PPE: Malerba, Mann Thomas

PSE: Schlechter

14 (0)

ELDR: Riis-Jørgensen

GUE/NGL: González Álvarez, Marset Campos

I-EDN: Krarup

NI: Hager, Kronberger, Raschhofer

PPE: Argyros, De Melo

PSE: Colom i Naval, Palm, Wibe **UPE:** Martin Philippe-Armand

V: Lindholm

20. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 10

92 (+)

ARE: Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Maes, Posada González

ELDR: Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Goedbloed, Kestelijn-Sierens, Larive, Lindqvist, Moorhouse, Teverson, Thors, Wiebenga

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Ojala, Sjöstedt, Svensson

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Antony, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Lukas, Martinez, Moretti, Pinel, Raschhofer, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PPE: Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Grosch, Konrad, Mather, Thyssen

PSE: Andersson, Berger, De Coene, Falconer, Lööw, Randzio-Plath, Sandberg-Fries, Theorin, Van Lancker, Wibe, Zimmermann

UPE: Kaklamanis

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

(-)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goerens, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Coates, Ephremidis, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Schifone

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lehne, Lenz, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott,

Ettl, Evans, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Hyland, Killilea, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

15 (O)

ELDR: Dybkjær, Haarder, Kjer Hansen, Monfils, Mulder

GUE/NGL: Manisco

PPE: Argyros, Arroni, Chanterie, Corrie, Liese, McMillan-Scott, Perry, Spencer

PSE: Palm

21. Joint resolution - Resignation of the Commission

Amendment 11

405 (+)

ARE: Castagnède, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Riis-Jørgensen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Wiebenga

GUE/NGL: Carnero González, Gutiérrez Díaz, Ojala, Svensson

I-EDN: Blokland, van Dam

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Hager, Lukas, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Schifone

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Lehideux, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose,

Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Perez Royo, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: Caccavale, Kaklamanis, Rosado Fernandes

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schroedter, Ullmann, Wolf

55 (-

ARE: Lalumière, Sainjon

ELDR: Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Plooij-van Gorsel, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Coates, Ephremidis, González Álvarez, Herzog, Jové Peres, Marset Campos, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Berthu, Fabre-Aubrespy, Nicholson, des Places, Seillier, Striby

PPE: Bennasar Tous, Günther, Stenzel

PSE: Carniti, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Peter, Roth-Behrendt, Simpson, Thomas, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma

UPE: d'Aboville, Donnay, Giansily, Hermange, Killilea, Martin Philippe-Armand, Poisson

V: Holm, Lindholm

39 (O)

ARE: Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: Nordmann

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Manisco, Seppänen, Sjöstedt

I-EDN: Buffetaut

NI: Antony, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Pinel, Stirbois, Vanhecke

PPE: Argyros, De Melo

PSE: Palm

UPE: Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Crowley, Daskalaki, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hyland, Lataillade, Pasty, Pompidou, Schaffner

22. Joint resolution — Resignation of the Commission

Resolution

(+)

442

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Maes, Posada González, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Carnero González, Coates, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Jové Peres, Mohamed Ali, Ojala, Puerta, Ripa di Meana, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Vinci

I-EDN: Blokland, van Dam

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Hager, Kronberger, Lukas, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Schifone, Tatarella

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Collins Kenneth D., Corbett, Correia, Cot, Cottigny, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Duhamel, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Metten, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Palm, Papakyriazis, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: Caccavale, Collins Gerard, Daskalaki, Donnay, Guinebertière, Kaklamanis, Rosado Fernandes

V: Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Cohn-Bendit, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

(-)

ARE: Dupuis

GUE/NGL: Ephremidis, Eriksson, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Svensson, Theonas

I-EDN: Berthu, Bonde, Buffetaut, Fabre-Aubrespy, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Seillier, Striby

NI: Antony, Blot, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Pinel, Stirbois

PSE: Aparicio Sánchez, Barón Crespo, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Colino Salamanca, Colom i Naval, Miranda de Lage, Pérez Royo, Verde i Aldea

53 (O)

ARE: Dell'Alba, Sainjon, Saint-Pierre

ELDR: Goerens

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Herzog, Manisco, Marset Campos, Miranda, Moreau, Novo, Pailler, Querbes, Ribeiro, Wurtz

I-EDN: Jensen Lis, Sandbæk NI: Dillen, Féret, Vanhecke

PPE: Argyros, De Melo, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Lehne, Lenz, Lulling, Reding

PSE: Izquierdo Collado, Mendiluce Pereiro, Pons Grau, Roth-Behrendt, Schlechter

UPE: d'Aboville, Andrews, Bazin, van Bladel, Carrère d'Encausse, Crowley, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hermange, Hyland, Killilea, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

23. Evans report — A4-0122/99

Resolution

453 (+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Posada González, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas, Vinci

I-EDN: Blokland, van Dam

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Féret, Hager, Lukas, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Schifone, Tatarella

PPE: Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Liese, Lulling,

McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Blak, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cottigny, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Dührkop Dührkop, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Palm, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: d'Aboville, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Daskalaki, Donnay, Giansily, Guinebertière, Hermange, Kaklamanis, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Schaffner

V: Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

12 (-)

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Seppänen, Sjöstedt, Svensson, Wurtz

I-EDN: Berthu, Bonde, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, des Places, Sandbæk

13 (O)

I-EDN: Nicholson, Striby

NI: Antony, Blot, Dillen, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Pinel, Stirbois

PPE: Kristoffersen

PSE: Wibe

 $24.\ Roth-Behrendt\ recommendation-A4-0068/99$

Amendment 1

303 (+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Posada González, Weber

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Jensen Lis, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Antony, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Lukas, Martinez, Moretti, Pinel, Raschhofer, Stirbois

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Argyros, Böge, Brok, Christodoulou, Flemming, Florenz, Gillis, Graziani, Grosch, Hatzidakis, Lambrias, Liese, Maij-Weggen, Matikainen-Kallström, Mouskouri, Otila, Peijs, Pimenta, Rübig, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Stenmarck, Trakatellis, van Velzen W. G.

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cottigny, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Giovanni, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Dührkop Dührkop, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Glante, Graenitz, Green, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: Kaklamanis

V: Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

168

ELDR: De Clercq, Nordmann

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Musumeci, Parigi, Schifone, Tatarella

PPE: Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bourlanges, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Langen, Langenhagen, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Pack, Perry, Pex, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Todini, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, Verwaerde, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Bernardini, Ghilardotti, Gröner, Manzella, Marinucci, Morán López, Napoletano, Theorin

UPE: d'Aboville, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Daskalaki, Donnay, Giansily, Guinebertière, Hermange, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

4 (O)

GUE/NGL: Wurtz

PSE: Bontempi, Kinnock, Sandberg-Fries

25. Roth-Behrendt recommendation — A4-0068/99

Amendment 6

258 (+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Escolá Hernando, Ewing, González Triviño, Hudghton Ian, Lalumière, de Lassus Saint Geniès, Posada González, Weber

ELDR: Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Ainardi, Carnero González, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Querbes, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci, Wurtz

I-EDN: Blokland, Bonde, Sandbæk

NI: Moretti

PPE: Böge, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Ferri, Maij-Weggen, Pimenta

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cottigny, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Delcroix, Denys, Donner, Dührkop, Dührkop, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Gebhardt, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Lambraki, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Myller, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Palm, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Roubatis, Sakellariou, Samland, Sandberg-Fries, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: Collins Gerard, Kaklamanis

V: Ahern, Breyer, Ceyhun, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

213 (-)

ELDR: André-Léonard, De Clercq, Gasòliba i Böhm, Nordmann

I-EDN: Berthu, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Nicholson, des Places, Seillier, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Lang, Le Pen, Le Rachinel, Martinez, Musumeci, Parigi, Pinel, Raschhofer, Schifone, Stirbois, Tatarella

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Azzolini, Baldi, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Ilaskivi, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lenz, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonça, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pirker, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, van Velzen W. G., Verwaerde, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Bernardini, Darras, Desama, Garot, Ghilardotti, Lindeperg, Manzella, Marinucci, Mutin, Napoletano

UPE: d'Aboville, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Daskalaki, Donnay, Giansily, Guinebertière, Hermange, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Schaffner

12 (O)

ELDR: Lindqvist

I-EDN: Jensen Lis, Krarup

PPE: Banotti, Garosci, Liese, Schnellhardt, Todini

PSE: Bontempi, De Giovanni, Wibe

V: Lindholm

26. Müller report — A4-0120/99

Amendment 6

83 (+)

ELDR: Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Gutiérrez Díaz, Manisco, Ojala, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Svensson

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Cellai, Moretti, Schifone

PSE: Andersson, Baldarelli, De Coene, Marinho, Randzio-Plath, Theorin, Van Lancker, Wibe, Willockx

V: Aelvoet, Breyer, Ceyhun, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

340 (-)

GUE/NGL: Carnero González

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester,

Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Jackson, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Mayer, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonca, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schleider, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, Verwaerde, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cottigny, Crampton, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop Dührkop, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Paasio, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, van Putten, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Daskalaki, Donnay, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Kaklamanis, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

34 (O)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Ewing, González Triviño, Lalumière, Maes, Saint-Pierre, Weber

GUE/NGL: González Álvarez, Herzog, Jové Peres, Marset Campos, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Querbes, Ripa di Meana, Seppänen, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas, Vinci

NI: Angelilli, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Pinel, Stirbois

PPE: Ilaskivi

PSE: Happart, Paasilinna, Palm

27. Müller report — A4-0120/99

Paragraph 13 (+)

450

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Ewing, González Triviño, Lalumière, Saint-Pierre, Weber

ELDR: Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cox, De Clercq, De Luca, Dybkjær, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goedbloed, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kjer Hansen, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moorhouse, Mulder, Nordmann, Plooij-van Gorsel, Riis-Jørgensen, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Carnero González, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Marset Campos, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Querbes, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson, Theonas, Vinci

I-EDN: Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Fabre-Aubrespy, Krarup, Nicholson, des Places, Sandbæk, Striby

NI: Amadeo, Angelilli, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Lang, Le Pen, Moretti, Pinel, Raschhofer, Stirbois, Tatarella

PPE: Anastassopoulos, Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Campoy Zueco, Carlsson, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coelho, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Garosci, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Jackson, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Klaß, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehideux, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Mann Thomas, Matikainen-Kallström, Mendes Bota, Méndez de Vigo, Mendonca, Menrad, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mottola, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Perry, Pex, Pimenta, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, de Rose, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Santini, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Tajani, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Todini, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, Verwaerde, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson, Aparicio Sánchez, Augias, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barton, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Blak, Bösch, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bru Purón, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Carrozzo, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Cottigny, Crampton, Cunningham, Damião, Dankert, Darras, De Coene, Delcroix, Denys, Desama, Donner, Dührkop, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kokkola, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Lambraki, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, Lomas, McAvan, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Paasilinna, Paasio, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pettinari, Pollack, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rocard, Rothe, Rothley, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Speciale, Spiers, Stockmann, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tongue, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Collins Gerard, Daskalaki, Donnay, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Guinebertière, Hermange, Kaklamanis, Lataillade, Martin Philippe-Armand, Pasty, Poisson, Pompidou, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

V: Aelvoet, Breyer, Ceyhun, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lagendijk, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Schörling, Schroedter, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Ullmann, Wolf

ARE: Maes
GUE/NGL: Ripa di Meana, Seppänen
PPE: García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Hernandez Mollar, Kittelmann, McCartin, Mouskouri
PSE: Tsatsos, Willockx

PPE: Mayer
PSE: Palm

11