

Official Journal

of the European Communities

ISSN 0378-6986

C 55

Volume 40

24 February 1997

English edition

Information and Notices

<u>Notice No</u>	Contents	Page
	I Information	
	European Parliament	
	1996/97 session	
(97/C 55/01)	Minutes of the sitting of Wednesday, 29 January 1997	
	<i>Proceedings of the sitting</i>	
	1. Resumption of session	1
	2. Approval of Minutes	1
	3. Documents received	2
	4. Texts of agreements forwarded by the Council	4
	5. Decisions on petitions	4
	6. Membership of committees and delegations	6
	7. Order of business	6
	8. Decision on urgent procedure	6
	9. Urgent political matters (statement followed by questions)	7
	10. Racism and xenophobia (annual debate)	7
	11. Combating terrorism (debate)	7
	12. Progress by European Union in 1995 (debate)	7
	13. Cultural aspects in European Community action (debate)	8
	14. Pricing and transport costs (debate)	8
	15. Research and sustainable development and innovation (debate)	8
	16. Statistics on research, development and innovation (debate)	8
	17. Thirteenth annual report on monitoring the application of Community law (debate)	8
	18. Agenda for next sitting	9



Minutes of the sitting of Thursday, 30 January 1997

Part I: Proceedings of the sitting

1. Approval of Minutes	11
2. Documents received	11
3. Application of Article K.9 TEU (debate)	11
4. Communication of a common position of the Council	12
VOTING TIME	
5. Racism and xenophobia (vote)	12
6. Forestry strategy (vote)	12
7. Fisheries Council of 19-20 December 1996 (vote)	13

Key to symbols used

*	Consultation procedure
**I	Cooperation procedure: first reading
**II	Cooperation procedure: second reading
***	Assent procedure
***I	Codecision procedure: first reading
***II	Codecision procedure: second reading
***III	Codecision procedure: third reading

(The type of procedure is determined by the legal basis proposed by the Commission.)

Information relating to voting time

- unless stated otherwise, the rapporteurs informed the Chair in writing, before the vote, of their position on the amendments;
- results of roll-call votes are appended to each day's Minutes.

Abbreviations used for Parliamentary Committees

FASE	Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy
AGRI	Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development
BUDG	Committee on Budgets
ECON	Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy
RTDE	Committee on Research, Technological Development and Energy
RELA	Committee on External Economic Relations
LEGA	Committee on Legal Affairs and Citizens' Rights
SOCI	Committee on Social Affairs and Employment
REGI	Committee on Regional Policy
TRAN	Committee on Transport and Tourism
ENVI	Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection
CULT	Committee on Culture, Youth, Education and the Media
DEVE	Committee on Development and Cooperation
CIVI	Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs
CONT	Committee on Budgetary Control
INST	Committee on Institutional Affairs
FISH	Committee on Fisheries
RULE	Committee on the Rules of Procedure, the Verification of Credentials and Immunities
WOME	Committee on Women's Rights
PETI	Committee on Petitions

Abbreviations used for political groups

PSE	Group of the Party of the European Socialists
PPE	Group of the European People's Party (Christian-Democratic Group)
UPE	Union for Europe Group
ELDR	Group of the European Liberal Democrat and Reform Party
GUE / NGL	Confederal Group of the European United Left / Nordic Green Left
V	Green Group in the European Parliament
ARE	Group of the European Radical Alliance
I-EDN	Group of Independents for a Europe of Nations
NI	Non-attached Members

Contents (<i>continued</i>)	Page
8. Combating terrorism (vote)	13
9. Progress by European Union in 1995 (vote)	14
10. Cultural aspects in European Community action (vote)	14
11. Pricing and transport costs (vote)	14
12. Statistics on research, development and innovation (vote)	15
13. Thirteenth annual report on monitoring the application of Community law (vote)	15
14. Application of Article K.9 TEU (vote)	15
END OF VOTING TIME	
15. Membership of political groups	15
16. Forwarding of resolutions adopted during the sitting	16
17. Dates for next sittings	16
18. Adjournment of session	16
 <i>Part II: Texts adopted by Parliament</i>	
1. Racism and xenophobia B4-0045/97 Resolution on racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism and the European Year against Racism (1997)	17
2. Forestry strategy A4-0414/96 Resolution on the European Union's forestry strategy	22
3. Fisheries Council of 19-20 December 1996 B4-0029, 0030, 0031, 0032, 0042, 0043 and 0044/97 Resolution on the Commission statement on the outcome of the meeting of the Council of Ministers for Fisheries of 19-20 December 1996	25
4. Combating terrorism A4-0368/96 Resolution on combating terrorism in the European Union	27
5. Progress by European Union in 1995 A4-0396/96 Resolution on the report of the European Council to the European Parliament on the progress achieved by the European Union in 1995 (pursuant to Article D of the Treaty on European Union) (C4-0409/96)	33
6. Cultural aspects in European Community action A4-0410/96 Resolution on the first report of the Commission on the consideration of cultural aspects in European Community action (COM(96)0160 — C4-0249/96)	37
7. Pricing and transport costs A4-0012/97 Resolution on the Commission Green Paper 'Towards fair and efficient pricing in transport — policy options for internalizing the external costs of transport in the European Union' (COM(95)0691 — C4-0610/95)	41
8. Statistics on research, development and innovation A4-0383/96 Resolution on an interim Commission report according to Article 8 of Council Decision 94/78/EC, Euratom establishing a multiannual programme for the development of Community statistics on research, development and innovation (COM(96)0042 — C4-0247/96)	44
9. Thirteenth annual report on monitoring the application of Community law A4-0001/97 Resolution on the Commission's 13th Annual Report to Parliament on monitoring the application of Community law — 1995 (COM(96)0600 — C4-0363/96)	47

(Continued overleaf)

10. Application of Article K.9 TEU A4-0349/96 Resolution on the Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council on the possible application of Article K.9 of the Treaty on European Union (COM(95)0566 – C4-0560/95)	52
--	----

Wednesday, 29 January 1997

I

(Information)

EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

1996/97 SESSION

Sittings of 29 and 30 January 1997
 ESPACE LEOPOLD – BRUSSELS

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS OF THE SITTING OF WEDNESDAY, 29 JANUARY 1997

(97/C 55/01)

Proceedings of the sitting

IN THE CHAIR: Mr GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO

*President**(The sitting opened at 3 p.m.)***1. Resumption of session**

The session, adjourned on 17 January, was resumed.

2. Approval of Minutes

Mrs Guigou had informed the Chair that she had intended to vote for the resolution on the revision of the Treaties (B4-0040/97) (Minutes of 16.1.1997, Part I, Item 7(b)).

The following spoke:

— Mrs Oomen-Ruijten, who protested, as Mr Corrie had done on 27 November 1996 (see Minutes of that sitting, Item 2) against the fact that lifts were often blocked before the opening of the sitting by groups of visitors, which meant that Members reached the Chamber late; she asked the President to take measures to rectify the problem;

— Mrs Crawley, who announced that Mr Goldsmith had distributed propaganda in the United Kingdom saying that

Brussels issued 100 regulations every week; she asked the Bureau to examine the accuracy of this information (the President replied that common sense would enable people to understand that such propaganda should not be allowed to succeed);

— Mr Balfe, Quaestor, who noted with regard to Mrs Oomen-Ruijten's remarks that the College of Quastors had already adopted a decision forbidding access to the lifts to visitors during plenary sittings; he asked the President to ensure this decision was implemented;

— Mr Provan, who agreed with Mrs Crawley and added that the media did not always report the Community institutions' work accurately and asked the Bureau to consider ways of remedying this problem;

— Mr Kenneth D. Collins, on Mrs Crawley's remarks;

— Mr Berthu who, with regard to the remarks concerning his group's chairman, pointed out that the word used in the propaganda should not be understood literally but rather as meaning 'acts' (the President said the Bureau would take action to ensure that the truth was known about Parliament's position, and expressed the hope that Mr Oreja, Commissioner responsible, would do the same regarding the Commission).

The Minutes of the previous sitting were approved.

Wednesday, 29 January 1997

3. Documents received

The President announced that he had received the following texts:

(a) *Council, requests for opinions on:*

— Proposal for a Council Directive on the charging of heavy goods vehicles for the use of certain infrastructures (COM(96)0331 — C4-0027/97 — 96/0182(SYN))

referred to
responsible: TRAN
opinion: ECON, ENVI

legal basis: Art. 075(1) EC

— Proposal for a Council Regulation concerning the granting of Community financial assistance for actions to promote combined goods transport (COM(96)0335 — C4-0028/97 — 96/0207(SYN))

referred to
responsible: TRAN
opinion: BUDG

legal basis: Art. 075(1) EC

— Proposal for a Council Directive on the registration of persons sailing on board passenger ships (COM(96)0574 — C4-0029/97 — 96/0281(SYN))

referred to
responsible: TRAN
opinion: BUDG

legal basis: Art. 084(2) EC

— Proposal for a Council Decision adopting a multiannual Community programme to stimulate the establishment of the Information Society in Europe (Information Society) (COM(96)0592 — C4-0030/97 — 96/0283(CNS))

referred to
responsible: ECON

legal basis: Art. 235 EC

— Proposal for a Council Regulation laying down general rules for the application of measures to improve the production and marketing of honey (COM(96)0596 — C4-0031/97 — 96/0282(CNS))

referred to
responsible: AGRI
opinion: BUDG

legal basis: Art. 042 EC, Art. 043 EC

— Proposal for a Council Decision on the conclusion of an Agreement in the form of an exchange of letters concerning the Interim Extension of the Protocol to the Agreement between the European Community and the Government of the Republic of Senegal on fishing off the coast of Senegal for the period from 2 October 1996 to 1 November 1996 (COM(96)0611 — C4-0032/97 — 96/0287(CNS))

referred to
responsible: FISH

legal basis: Art. 043 EC, Art. 228(2) and (3), first subparagraph EC

— Proposal for a Council Directive on the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to collective redundancies (codified version) (COM(96)0620 — C4-0033/97 — 96/0290(CNS))

referred to
responsible: LEGA
opinion: ESOC

legal basis: Art. 100 EC

— Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Regulation (EEC) No 189/92 adopting provisions for the application of certain control measures adopted by the Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Organisation (COM(96)0684 — C4-0034/97 — 96/0309(CNS))

referred to
responsible: FISH

legal basis: Art. 043 EC

— Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Regulation (EC) No 3069/95 establishing a European Community Observer Scheme applicable to Community fishing vessels operating in the Regulatory Area of the Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Organisation (NAFO) (COM(96)0685 — C4-0035/97 — 96/0310(CNS))

referred to
responsible: FISH

legal basis: Art. 043 EC

— Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Regulation (EEC) No 2328/91 on improving the efficiency of agricultural structures (COM(96)0614 — C4-0036/97 — 96/0288(CNS))

referred to
responsible: AGRI

legal basis: Art. 043 EC

— Proposal for a Council Decision on a specific measure to encourage Italian fishermen to diversify out of certain fishing activities (COM(96)0682 — C4-0037/97 — 96/0308(CNS))

referred to
responsible: FISH

legal basis: Art. 043 EC

(b) *Commission:*

(ba) *proposals and/or communications:*

— Amended proposal concerning a European Parliament and Council Directive on injunctions for the protection of consumers' interests (COM(96)0725 — C4-0021/97 — 96/0025(COD))

referred to
responsible: LEGA
opinion: ENVI

legal basis: Art. 100a EC

Wednesday, 29 January 1997

— Amended proposal concerning a European Parliament and Council Directive relating to the maximum design speed of wheeled agricultural or forestry tractors (COM(97)0005 — C4-0024/97 — 96/0129(COD))

referred to
responsible: ECON
opinion: AGRI, TRAN, ENVI

legal basis: Art. 100a EC

(bb) other texts:

— 'The Contribution of the European Union to intensifying the fight against the sexual abuse and exploitation of children' (C4-0556/96)

referred to
responsible: CIVI
opinion: LEGA, CULT

— Report on Pepper II: promotion of participation by employed persons in profits and enterprise results (including equity participation) in Member States — 1996 (COM(96)0697 — C4-0019/97)

referred to
responsible: ESOC
opinion: ECON

— Seventh Annual Report on the Structural Funds 1995 — ERDF, ESF, EAGGF, FFIG (COM(96)0502 — C4-0020/97)

referred to
responsible: REGI
opinions: ESOC, AGRI, BUDG, CONT

— Planning documents concerning areas of the UK under Objective 2 for the period 1994-1996 (34132/95 — C4-0022/97)

referred to
responsible: REGI
opinion: AGRI, ESOC

language available: FR

— Planning documents concerning areas of France under Objective 2 for the period 1994-1996 (34026/95 — C4-0023/97)

referred to
responsible: REGI

language available: FR

— Commission Staff Working Paper on the competitiveness of European Industry (SEC(96)2121 — C4-0025/97)

referred to
responsible: ECON

languages available: FR, EN

— Report from the Commission to the Council and the European Parliament on the agri-monetary system for the Single Market — 1 July 1995 to 30 June 1996 (COM(96)0636 — C4-0026/97)

referred to
responsible: AGRI
opinions: BUDG, CONT

(c) committees:

(ca) reports:

— Report on development problems and structural assistance in Germany in the period 1994-1999 (94D0628 — C4-0047/96)
— Committee on Regional Policy

Rapporteur: Mr Botz
(A4-0002/97)

— Report on the situation of assisting spouses of the self-employed — the Committee on Women's Rights

Rapporteur: Mrs Lulling
(A4-0005/97)

— Report on the Commission Report concerning the operation of Directive 87/102/EEC for the approximation of the laws, Regulations and administrative provisions of the Member States concerning consumer credit (COM(95)0117 — C4-0185/95) — Committee on Legal Affairs and Citizens' Rights

Rapporteur: Mr Caccavale
(A4-0010/97)

— Report on the Commission Green Paper entitled 'Towards Fair and Efficient pricing in Transport: policy options for internalising the external cost of transport in the European Union' (COM(95)0691 — C4-0610/95) — Committee on Transport and Tourism

Rapporteur: Mrs Schmidbauer
(A4-0012/97)

— * Report on the proposal for a Council Regulation on the conclusion of the Protocol defining, for the period from 3 May 1996 to 2 May 1999, the fishing opportunities and the financial contribution provided for by the Agreement between the European Community and the Republic of Angola on fishing off the coast of Angola (COM(96)0323 — C4-0475/96 — 96/0176(CNS)) — Committee on Fisheries

Rapporteur: Mr Cunha
(A4-0013/97)

— Report on the functioning and future of Schengen — Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs

Rapporteur: Mrs Van Lancker
(A4-0014/97)

— Report on the Communication from the Commission — The Future of Social Protection: A Framework for a European Debate (COM(95)0466 — C4-0524/95) and the report from the Commission on social protection in Europe (1995) (COM(95)0457 — C4-0518/95) (COM(95)0457 — C4-0518/95) — Committee on Employment and Social Affairs

Rapporteur: Mrs Weiler
(A4-0016/97)

— Report on the Commission Report on the development, validation and legal acceptance of alternative methods to animal experiments in the field of cosmetic products — 1995

Wednesday, 29 January 1997

(COM(96)0365 – C4-0662/96) – Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection

Rapporteur: Mrs Roth-Behrendt
(A4-0017/97)

– * Report on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending, for the benefit of unemployed persons, Regulation (EEC) No 1408/71 on the application of social security schemes to employed persons, to self-employed persons and to the members of their families moving within the Community and Regulation (EEC) No 574/72 laying down the procedure for implementing Regulation (EEC) No 1408/71 (COM(95)0734 – C4-0116/96 – 96/0004(CNS)) – Committee on Employment and Social Affairs

Rapporteur: Mrs Oomen-Ruijten
(A4-0018/97)

(cb) *recommendations for second reading:*

– **II Recommendation for second reading on the common position established by the Council with a view to the adoption of a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EEC) 1107/70 on the granting of aids for transport by rail, road and inland waterway (C4-0584/96 – 95/0204(SYN)) – Committee on Transport and Tourism

Rapporteur: Mr Tamino
(A4-0011/97)

– ***II Recommendation for second reading on the common position established by the Council with a view to the adoption of a European Parliament and Council Directive on consumer protection in the indication of the prices of products offered to consumers (COM(95)0276 – C4-0530/96 – 95/0148(COD)) – Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection

Rapporteur: Mrs Oomen-Ruijten
(A4-0015/97)

(d) *Members:*

(da) *oral questions (Rule 40):*

– Ford and Oostlander, on behalf of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs, to the Council: Annual debate on racism (B4-1229/96);

– Ford and Oostlander, on behalf of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs, to the Commission: Annual debate on racism (B4-1230/96).

(db) *a motion for a resolution (Rule 45):*

– Aelvoet, Andrews, Azzolini, Baldarelli, Barton, Bernard-Reymond, Bontempi, Bremond d'Ars, Caccavale, Cars, C. Casini, Caudron, Desama, Dupuis, Ferri, Fitzsimons, Gahrton, Garosci, Happart, Hory, Lindeperg, McCartin, Moreau, Moretti, Newens, Van Lancker, Vandemeulebroucke, Vecchi, Willockx on the revision of the Treaties and communication between citizens of the Union (B4-0046/97)

referred to
responsible: INST

4. Texts of agreements forwarded by the Council

The President announced that he had received from the Council certified true copies of the following documents:

– agreement between the European Community, of the one part, and the Government of Denmark and the home government of the Faroe Islands, of the other part;

– agreement between the European Community and New Zealand on sanitary measures applicable to trade in live animals and animal products;

– agreement, in the form of an exchange of letters, concerning the provisional application of the agreement between the European Community and New Zealand on sanitary measures applicable to trade in live animals and animal products;

– agreement on scientific and technological cooperation between the European Community and the Republic of South Africa, and the final act thereto;

– agreement in the form of an exchange of letters between the European Community and the State of Israel on the adjustment of the regime for imports into the Community of oranges originating in Israel;

– protocol, drawn up on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union, on the interpretation, by way of preliminary rulings, by the Court of Justice of the European Communities of the Convention on the use of information technology for customs purposes;

– declaration concerning the simultaneous adoption of the Convention on the use of information technology for customs purposes and the Protocol on the interpretation by way of preliminary rulings, by the Court of Justice of the European Communities, of that Convention;

– protocol of correction to the additional protocol to the Europe Agreement establishing an association between the European Communities and their Member States of the one part, and the Republic of Poland, of the other part;

– agreement in the form of an exchange of letters between the European Community, of the one part, and the Kingdom of Norway, of the other part, concerning protocol No 2 to the agreement between the European Economic Community and the Kingdom of Norway.

5. Decisions on petitions

The Committee on Petitions had taken the following decisions:

(a) *petitions ruled inadmissible pursuant to Rule 156(4) and (5), and filed pursuant to Rule 156(6):*

– 552, 555, 556, 558, 559, 563, 564, 567, 568, 569, 572⁽¹⁾, 573, 574, 576, 577, 580, 588⁽²⁾, 589, 591, 592⁽²⁾, 594, 596,

⁽¹⁾ The petitioner had been asked to contact his ombudsman or national petitions committee.

⁽²⁾ The petitioner had been asked to contact the European Commission on Human Rights or his national authorities or courts.

Wednesday, 29 January 1997

598, 599 ⁽¹⁾, 605, 606, 608, 609, 613, 615, 616, 617, 618, 620, 621, 624 ⁽¹⁾, 625, 626, 627, 628, 630, 633, 635, 636, 637, 640, 641, 644, 645, 648, 649, 651, 653, 656, 660, 661, 669, 670 ⁽¹⁾, 672, 674, 677, 678, 682, 686 ⁽¹⁾, 689, 690, 693, 695, 696, 697, 698, 699 ⁽¹⁾, 705, 706 ⁽¹⁾, 707, 708, 709, 710, 716, 722, 724 ⁽²⁾, 725, 728, 731, 733, 735, 737, 743 ⁽¹⁾, 744, 745, 747, 750, 751 ⁽¹⁾, 752 ⁽¹⁾⁽²⁾, 756, 757, L-21, L-22 ⁽¹⁾, L-24, L-25, L-26, L-28 ⁽²⁾, L-29, L-30, L-31 ⁽²⁾ and L-32/96;

(b) *petitions ruled admissible pursuant to Rule 156(4) and (5) (consideration closed):*

— 582, 595, 610, 629, 631, 638, 643, 654, 657, 659, 663, 679, 680, 683, 703, 711, 730, 741, 742, 746, 748 and 754/96:

forwarded to relevant committee or delegation for information or further action;

— 557, 560, 562 ⁽³⁾, 565, 566, 583⁽³⁾, 590⁽³⁾, 614, 639, 647, 655, 720, 721, 727⁽³⁾ and 736/96:

the petitioners had been sent documentation and information supplied by the Commission in connection with previous petitions;

— 718/96: forwarded to the European Ombudsman;

— 602/96: forwarded to the Secretary-General of Parliament for further action;

— 348/94: the petitioner had received information from the Commission;

— 573/94: declared admissible after examination by the Commission; consideration closed on the basis of this information;

— 671 and 702/96: the committee had noted the petitioners' remarks;

(c) *petitions ruled admissible pursuant to Rule 156(4) and (5) (action to be taken)*

— 551, 553, 554, 561, 570, 571, 575, 578 ⁽³⁾, 579, 581, 584, 585, 586, 587, 593, 597, 600, 601, 603, 604, 607, 611, 612, 619, 622, 623, 632, 634, 642, 646, 650, 652, 658, 662, 664, 665, 666, 667, 668, 673, 675, 676, 681, 684, 685, 687, 688, 691, 692, 694, 701, 704, 712, 713, 714, 715, 717, 719, 723, 726, 729, 732, 734, 738, 739, 740, 749, 753, 755, 758, 759, L-27 and L-33/96:

the Commission had been asked for information;

— L-23/96: to be taken in conjunction with petition 411/93 by the same petitioner;

(d) *petitions on which consideration had closed on the basis of information supplied by the Commission pursuant to Rule 157(3):*

— 563/90 ⁽³⁾, 816/92, 548/93, 613/93, 770/93, 368/94, 645/94, 705/94, 376/95, 461/95, 715/95, 872/95, 974/95 ⁽³⁾, 995/95 ⁽³⁾, 1054/95 and 395/96;

— 38/92, 287/94, 1004/94, 551/95, 611/95, 650/95, 746/95, 1046/95 and 1058/95;

— 685/88, 343/89, 523/89, 573/89, 338/90, 686/90, 225/92, 269/92, 455/92, 606/92, 858/93, 933/93, 1039/93, 437/94, 518/94, 976/94, 244/95, 645/95, 1056/95 and 1170/95;

(e) *petitions on which consideration had closed for the following reasons:*

— 177/95 and 678/95: on the basis of information provided by other committees;

— 1205/94 and 831/95: on the basis of information provided by national authorities;

— 122/91: the petitioner's problem had been resolved;

(f) *further information requested from the Commission pursuant to Rule 157(3):*

— 411/89, 458/90, 605/91, 413/92, 605/93, 1036/93, 62/94, 92/94, 163/94, 227/94, 753/94, 904/94, 485/95 and 915/95;

— 73/93, 418/93, 829/93, 117/94, 118/94, 1018/94, 1139/94, 112/95, 392/95, 584/95, 875/95, 1026/95, 1097/95 and 293/96;

— 368/90, 600/90, 212/92, 237/92, 416/92, 225/93, 447/93, 461/93, 674/93, 739/93, 779/93, 793/93, 43/94, 525/95, 864/95, 1020/95, 1101/95, 1168/95 and 1244/95;

(g) *opinions requested from other committees:*

— 1026/95: opinion requested from the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs;

— 392/95, 584/95 and 293/96: opinion requested from the Committee on Budgets;

— 525/95: opinions requested from the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy and the Committee on Transport and Tourism;

— 1020/95: opinions requested from the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection and the Committee on Research, Technological Development and Energy;

(h) *other decisions:*

— 518, 796 and 1227/95: consideration reopened; the Commission had been asked for further information;

— 458/90 together with 605/91, 605/93 together with 92/94, 408/94, 904/94, 953/94 and 1088/95: the President of the European Parliament had been asked in a separate letter to contact the national authorities;

— 1026/95: the President of the European Parliament had been asked in a separate letter to contact the Belgian authorities;

⁽¹⁾ The petitioner had been asked to contact his ombudsman or national petitions committee.

⁽²⁾ the petitioner had been asked to contact the European Commission on Human Rights or his national authorities or courts.

⁽³⁾ Also forwarded to the relevant committee or delegation for information or action to be taken.

Wednesday, 29 January 1997

— 392/95, 584/95 and 293/96: the President of the European Parliament had been asked in a separate letter to contact the German authorities;

— 368/90 and many others: the President of the European Parliament had been asked in a separate letter to contact the Greek authorities;

— 752/94, 493/95 and 726/95: the President of Parliament had been asked in a separate letter to contact the Spanish authorities.

6. Membership of committees and delegations

The President announced that he had received the following nominations from the PPE and UPE Groups:

— Committee on Budgets: Mr Podestà to replace Mr Arroni

— Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy: Mr Arroni to replace Mr Podestà

— Subcommittee on security and disarmament: Mr Chesa

— Subcommittee on monetary affairs: Mr Mezzaroma to replace Mr Podestà

— Delegation to the EU-Turkey Joint Parliamentary Committee: Mr Moorhouse to replace Mr Corrie

— Delegation to the EU-Czech Republic Joint Parliamentary Committee: Mrs Cederschiöld

— Delegation to the EU-Bulgaria Joint Parliamentary Committee: Mrs Mouskouri

— Delegation for relations with Slovenia: Mrs Estevan Bolea

— Delegation for relations with Latvia: Mr Kristoffersen

— Delegation for relations with Switzerland, Iceland and Norway: Mr Pronk

— Delegation for relations with the countries of South Asia and the South Asia Association for regional cooperation (SAARC): Mr Pomés Ruiz

— Delegation for relations with the Palestinian Legislative Council: Mr McMillan-Scott

— ACP-EU Joint Assembly: Mr Corrie to replace Mr Kellett-Bowman.

These appointments would be deemed to have been ratified unless there was opposition to the nominations by the time these Minutes were approved.

7. Order of business

The President reminded the House that the order of business had been established (Minutes of 15.1.1997) (Part I, Item 9).

He announced, however, the following changes or requests for changes:

Wednesday

— The Danesin report on maritime strategy had not been adopted in committee and had consequently been taken off the agenda.

Thursday

— The Committee on Civil Liberties had asked for the debate on the Van Lancker report on Schengen (A4-0014/97 — Item 563) to be held the following day as planned but for the deadline for amendments to be extended to Thursday 13 February and for the vote to be postponed to the next part-session.

The following spoke: Mr Schulz, on behalf of the PSE Group, who asked for the debate to be also postponed to the next part-session, and Mr Nassauer, on behalf of the PPE Group, who asked for the agenda to be followed as agreed, i.e. the debate and vote being held as planned during the current part-session.

The President put Mr Schulz's request for the report to be taken off the agenda to the House.

Parliament approved the request by EV (110 for, 89 against, 3 abstentions).

The President reminded the House that the following points would be added to voting time:

— the vote on the Thomas report on forestry strategy (A4-0414/96) (postponed from the sitting of 16 January (Minutes of that sitting, Part I, Item 19)) (qualified majority required)

— the vote on the outcome of the Fisheries Council (7 motions for resolutions) (the debate had been held at the sitting of 16 January (Minutes of that sitting, Part I, Item 22)).

8. Decision on urgent procedure

The next item was the decision on a request for urgent procedure:

— proposal for a Regulation amending Council Regulation (EEC) No 2377/90 laying down a Community procedure for the establishment of maximum residue limits of veterinary medicinal products in foodstuffs of animal origin (COM(96)0584 — C4-0683/96 — 96/0279(CNS)) *

Mr Kenneth D. Collins, chairman of the Committee on the Environment, spoke.

The request was rejected.

Wednesday, 29 January 1997

9. Urgent political matters (statement followed by questions)

The next item was a Commission statement on urgent political matters.

Mr Oreja, Member of the Commission, made a statement on 'State of progress in the IGC: enhanced cooperation'.

The following put questions which Mr Oreja answered in turn: Mr De Giovanni, Mrs Spaak, Mrs Cederschiöld, Mr Cohn-Bendit, Mr Dell'Alba, Mr David W. Martin, Mrs Schaffner, Mrs Majj-Weggen, Mrs Gebhardt, Mr Lindqvist, Mr Berthu, Mrs Myller, Mr Elliott (Mr Elliott's question was ruled out of order by the President and was not answered) and Mr Cox.

The President closed the item.

10. Racism and xenophobia (annual debate)

The next item was the annual debate on the fight against racism.

Mr Oostlander moved the oral questions which he and Mr Ford had tabled on behalf of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs to the Council (B4-1229/96) and to the Commission (B4-1230/96) on the fight against racism.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ

Vice-President

Mr Dijkstal, President-in-Office of the Council, and Mr Flynn, Member of the Commission, answered the questions.

The following spoke: Mrs d'Ancona, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Pirker, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Caccavale, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Cars, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Mohamed Ali, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, Mrs Roth, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Pradier, on behalf of the ARE Group, and Mr Le Gallou, Non-attached Member.

The President announced that he had received a motion for a resolution pursuant to Rule 40(5) from the following Members:

— Ford and Oostlander, on behalf of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs, on racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism and the European Year against Racism (1997) (B4-0045/97).

The following spoke: Mr Schulz, Mrs Heinisch, Mr Watson, Mrs Pailler, Mr Trizza, Mr Bontempi, Mr Ribeiro, Mrs Larive, Mr Lukas, Mrs Lindeperg, Mrs Ojala, Mrs Zimmermann, Mrs Dury, Mr Elliott, Mr Féret, Mr Fassa, who made a personal statement following the remarks by Mr Trizza.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr ANASTASSOPOULOS

Vice-President

The following spoke: Mr Trizza, on Mr Fassa's remarks, Mr Dijkstal, Mr Flynn, Mr Konrad, who made a personal statement following the remarks by Mr Schulz and Mr Le Gallou, Mr Fassa, who made another personal statement, and Mr Schulz and Mr Le Gallou, who both spoke on Mr Konrad's remarks.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 30.1.1997, Part I, Item 5.

11. Combating terrorism (debate)

Mrs Reding introduced her report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs, on combating terrorism in the European Union (A4-0368/96).

The following spoke: Mr Schulz, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mrs Palacio Vallelersundi, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Andrews, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Wiebenga, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Puerta, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, Mr Orlando, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Pradier, on behalf of the ARE Group, Mr Nicholson, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, Mr Bellerè, Non-attached Member, Mrs Terrón i Cusi, Mrs de Esteban Martín, Mr Lindqvist, Mr Blot, Mrs Löow, Mr De Melo, Mr Moretti, Mr Elliott, Mrs Matikainen-Kallström, Mr McCartin, Mr Imaz San Miguel and Mr Pomés Ruiz.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr David W. MARTIN

Vice-President

Mrs Gradin, Member of the Commission, spoke.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 30.1.1997, Part I, Item 8.

12. Progress by European Union in 1995 (debate)

Mr Valverde López introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Institutional Affairs, on the report of the European Council to the European Parliament on the progress of the European Union in 1995 (pursuant to Article D of the Treaty on European Union) (C4-0409/96) (A4-0396/96).

The following spoke: Mr Schäfer, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Ullmann, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Berthu, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, Mr Corbett, Mr Spiers, Mr Oreja, Member of the Commission, and Mr Spiers, who asked the Council to speak during the debate, which concerned a report by the European Council (the President replied that the Council did not normally participate in this type of debate).

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 30.1.1997, Part I, Item 9.

Wednesday, 29 January 1997

13. Cultural aspects in European Community action (debate)

Mr Escudero introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Culture, Youth, Education and the Media, on the first report by the Commission on the consideration of cultural aspects in European Community action (COM(96)0160 – C4-0249/96) (A4-0410/96).

The following spoke: Mr Aparicio Sánchez, on behalf of the PSE Group, and Mr Perry, on behalf of the PPE Group.

The President announced that, in view of the time, he would give the floor to the group spokesmen and then the Commission before the sitting was suspended.

The following spoke: Mrs Guinebertière, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mrs Rynnänen, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Sjöstedt, on behalf of the V Group, Mrs Leperre-Verrier, on behalf of the ARE Group, Mr Evans, who asked whether it would be worthwhile for the Commission to speak before it had heard all the speakers due to take the floor in this debate (the President replied that he regretted the situation, which had been caused by the organization of business), and Mr Oreja, Member of the Commission.

(The sitting was suspended at 8.10 p.m. and resumed at 9 p.m.)

IN THE CHAIR: Mr MARINHO

Vice-President

The following spoke in the remainder of the debate: Mr Evans, Mrs Vaz da Silva, Mr Monfils, and Mr Evans on proceedings.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 30.1.1997, Part I, Item 10.

14. Pricing and transport costs (debate)

Mrs Schmidbauer introduced her report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Transport and Tourism, on the Commission's Green Paper – 'Towards fair and efficient pricing in transport – Policy options for internalizing the external costs of transport in the European Union' (COM(95)0691 – C4-0610/95) (A4-0012/97).

The following spoke: Mr Sisó Cruellas, draftsman of the opinion of the Economic Affairs Committee, Mr Rübzig, draftsman of the opinion of the Environment Committee, Mr Sindal, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Jarzembowski, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Santini, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Wijsenbeek, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mrs Van Dijk, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Van der Waal, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, Mr Baldarelli, Ms McIntosh, Mr Sindal, on Ms McIntosh's remarks, Mr Stenmarck, Ms McIntosh, to make a personal statement following the remarks by Mr Sindal, and Mr Kinnock, Member of the Commission.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 30.1.1997, Part I, Item 11.

15. Research and sustainable development policy (debate)

Mr Marset Campos introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Research, Technological Development and Energy, on the Community policy for research and sustainable development (A4-0382/96).

The rapporteur, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, asked for the report to be referred back to committee pursuant to Rule 129(1).

The following spoke on this request: Mrs McNally and Mrs Heinisch.

Parliament approved the request by EV (18 for, 10 against, 0 abstentions).

The report was thereby referred back to committee.

16. Statistics on research, development and innovation (debate)

Mr Izquierdo Collado introduced his report, on behalf of the Committee on Research, Technological Development and Energy, on an interim Commission report according to Article 8 of the Council Decision (94/78/EC, Euratom) establishing a multiannual programme for the development of Community statistics on research, development and innovation (COM(96)0042 – C4-0247/96) (A4-0383/96).

Mr Stockmann spoke on behalf of the PSE Group.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr CAPUCHO

Vice-President

The following spoke: Mr Chichester, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Malerba, on behalf of the UPE Group, and Mr Kinnock, Member of the Commission.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 30.1.1997, Part I, Item 12.

17. Thirteenth annual report on monitoring the application of Community law (debate)

Mrs Schaffner introduced her report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Citizens Rights, on the 13th Annual Report on monitoring the application of Community law (1995) (COM(96)0600 – C4-0363/96) (A4-0001/97).

The following spoke: Mrs Miranda de Lage, draftsman of the opinion of the Petitions Committee, Mr Anastassopoulos, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Wijsenbeek, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Ullmann, on behalf of the V Group, and Mr Kinnock, Member of the Commission.

Wednesday, 29 January 1997

The President closed the debate.

9 a.m. to 1 p.m.

Vote: Minutes of 30.1.1997, Part I, Item 13.

9 to 11 a.m.

— Lambraki report on application of Article K.9 TEU

11 a.m.

— voting time

18. Agenda for next sitting

The President announced the following agenda for the sitting of Thursday, 30 January 1997:

(The sitting closed at 11.10 p.m.)

Enrico VINCI
Secretary-General

Renzo IMBENI
Vice-President

Wednesday, 29 January 1997

ATTENDANCE REGISTER

29 January 1997

The following signed:

d'Aboville, Adam, Aelvoet, Ahern, Ahlqvist, Alavanos, Alber, Aldo, Amadeo, Anastassopoulos, d'Ancona, Andersson, André-Léonard, Andrews, Añoveros Trias de Bes, Antony, Anttila, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Augias, Avgerinos, Baggioni, Baldarelli, Baldi, Balfe, Bardong, Barón Crespo, Barthet-Mayer, Barton, Barzanti, Baudis, Bazin, Belleré, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Berger, Bernard-Reymond, Bernardini, Bertens, Berthu, Bertinotti, Bianco, Billingham, van Bladel, Blak, Bloch von Blotnitz, Blokland, Blot, Böge, Bösch, Bonde, Boniperti, Bontempi, Boogerd-Quaak, Botz, Bourlanges, Bowe, de Brémond d'Ars, Breyer, Brok, Burtone, Cabezón Alonso, Caccavale, Caligaris, Camisón Asensio, Campos, Candal, Capucho, Cardona, Carlotti, Camero González, Carniti, Carrère d'Encausse, Cars, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnède, Castagnetti, Castellina, Castricum, Caudron, Cederschiöld, Cellai, Chanterie, Chesa, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coates, Cohn-Bendit, Colajanni, Colli Comelli, Collins Gerard, Collins Kenneth D., Colombo Svevo, Colom i Naval, Corbett, Cornelissen, Correia, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cot, Cox, Crampton, Crawley, Crowley, Cunha, Cunningham, Cushnahan, D'Andrea, Danesin, Dankert, Daskalaki, David, De Clercq, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Giovanni, Dell'Alba, De Luca, De Melo, Deprez, de Vries, Diez de Rivera Icaza, van Dijk, Dillen, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnay, Donnelly Alan John, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Donner, Dührkop Dührkop, Dupuis, Dury, Dybkjær, Ebner, Eisma, Elchlepp, Elles, Elliott, Eriksson, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Ettl, Evans, Fabra Vallés, Fabre-Aubrespy, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Fassa, Fayot, Ferber, Féret, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Fitzsimons, Flemming, Florio, Fontaine, Fontana, Ford, Formentini, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Frischenschlager, Frutos Gama, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Gallagher, García Arias, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gasòliba i Böhm, de Gaulle, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Giansily, Gillis, Gil-Robles Gil-Delgado, Girão Pereira, Glante, Glase, Goepel, Goerens, Görlach, Gomolka, González Álvarez, González Triviño, Graenitz, Graziani, Green, Gröner, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, Guinebertière, Gutiérrez Díaz, Haarder, von Habsburg, Hänsch, Hager, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hatzidakis, Haug, Hawlicek, Heinisch, Hendrick, Herman, Hermange, Hernandez Mollar, Herzog, Hindley, Hoff, Holm, Hoppenstedt, Hory, Howitt, Hughes, Hulthén, Hume, Hyland, Ilaskivi, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jackson, Janssen van Raay, Jarzembowski, Jensen Lis, Jöns, Jové Peres, Junker, Katiforis, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kestelijn-Sierens, Killilea, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kittelmann, Klab, Klironomos, Koch, Kofoed, Konrad, Kouchner, Kranidiotis, Krarup, Krehl, Kreissl-Dörfler, Kristoffersen, Kronberger, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lalumière, La Malfa, Lambraki, Lambrias, Lang Carl, Lange, Langen, Langenhagen, Lannoye, Larive, Le Gallou, Lehne, Lenz, Leopardi, Le Pen, Leperre-Verrier, Le Rachinel, Liese, Ligabue, Lindeperg, Lindholm, Linkohr, Linser, Lööw, Lomas, Lüttge, Lukas, Macartney, McCarthy, McCartin, McGowan, McIntosh, McKenna, McMahon, McMillan-Scott, McNally, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Malone, Manisco, Mann Thomas, Manzella, Marin, Marinho, Marset Campos, Martens, Martin David W., Martin Philippe-Armand, Martinez, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Mendonça, Menrad, Metten, Mezzaroma, Miller, Miranda, Miranda de Lage, Mohamed Ali, Mombaur, Monfils, Moniz, Moorhouse, Morán López, Moretti, Morgan, Morris, Moscovici, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Müller, Mulder, Murphy, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Nencini, Newens, Newman, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nicholson, Novo, Novo Belenguer, Oddy, Ojala, Olsson, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Orlando, Otila, Paasilinna, Paasio, Pack, Pailler, Paisley, Palacio Vallelersundi, Papakyriazis, Papayannakis, Parodi, Pasty, Peijs, Pérez Royo, Perry, Pery, Pettinari, Pex, Piecyk, Piha, Pimenta, Piquet, Pirker, des Places, Plooiij-van Gorsel, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pollack, Pomés Ruiz, Pompidou, Pons Grau, Porto, Pradier, Pronk, Provan, Puerta, van Putten, Rack, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rauti, Read, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rehder, Ribeiro, Riis-Jørgensen, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rocard, Rosado Fernandes, de Rose, Roth, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rübig, Ruffolo, Ryyänen, Saint-Pierre, Sakellariou, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Samland, Sandbæk, Santini, Sanz Fernández, Sarlis, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Scapagnini, Schäfer, Schaffner, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schlechter, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schroedter, Schulz, Schwaiger, Seal, Secchi, Seppänen, Sierra González, Simpson, Sindal, Sisó Cruellas, Sjöstedt, Skinner, Smith, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Sornosa Martínez, Soulier, Spaak, Spencer, Spiers, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stirbois, Stockmann, Striby, Sturdy, Svensson, Swoboda, Tajani, Tamino, Tannert, Tapie, Tatarella, Telkämper, Terrón i Cusí, Teverson, Theato, Theonas, Theorin, Thomas, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Titley, Todini, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Trakatellis, Trizza, Truscott, Ullmann, Väyrynen, Valdivielso de Cué, Vallvé, Valverde López, Vandemeulebroucke, Vanhecke, Van Lancker, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, Vecchi, van Velzen W.G., Verde i Aldea, Verwaerde, Viceconte, Vinci, Viola, Virgin, Virrankoski, Voggenhuber, van der Waal, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watson, Watts, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiebenga, Wiersma, Wijsenbeek, Willockx, Wilson, von Wogau, Wolf, Wurtz, Wynn, Zimmermann.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS OF THE SITTING OF THURSDAY, 30 JANUARY 1997

(97/C 55/02)

PART I**Proceedings of the sitting****IN THE CHAIR: Mr IMBENI***Vice-President**(The sitting opened at 9 a.m.)***1. Approval of Minutes**

Mr Lindqvist had informed the Chair that his name was not on the attendance register although he had been present the previous day.

Mr Andrews noted that it was the 25th anniversary of the tragic events known as 'Bloody Sunday', during which 25 civilians were killed in clashes with security forces in Derry in Northern Ireland, and asked the House to support a motion which was being debated today in the House of Commons and signed by Mr Hume, who was also a Member of the European Parliament (the President pointed out to Mr Andrews that his remarks, although on a very important subject, had nothing to do with the approval of the Minutes, and therefore cut him off).

The Minutes of the previous sitting were approved.

2. Documents received

The President announced that he had received:

(a) from the Council, requests for opinions:

— Proposal for a Council Decision on a framework procedure for implementing Article 366a of the Fourth Lomé Convention (COM(96)0069 — C4-0045/97 — 96/0050(AVC))

referred to
responsible: DEVE
opinion: FASE, RELA

legal basis: Art. 238 EC

— Proposal for a Council Decision concerning the organisation of cooperation around agreed Community energy objectives (COM(96)0431 — C4-0046/97 — 96/0218(CNS))

referred to
responsible: RTDE
opinion: ECON

legal basis: Art. 130(3) EC

— Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Regulation (EEC) No 1442/88 on the granting, for the 1988/89 to 1997/98

wine years, of permanent abandonment premiums in respect of wine-growing areas (COM(96)0706 — C4-0047/97 — 97/0009(CNS))

referred to
responsible: AGRI
opinion: BUDG

legal basis: Art. 043 EC

(b) from the Commission, communications:

— Communication from the Commission to the Council and the European Parliament: The European Union and Space: fostering applications, markets and industrial competitiveness (COM(96)0617 — C4-0042/97)

referred to
responsible: RTDE
opinion: ECON

— Communication from the Commission to the Council, the European Parliament, the Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions on cohesion and the Information Society (COM(97)0007 — C4-0044/97)

referred to
responsible: REGI
opinion: ECON

3. Application of Article K.9 TEU (debate)

Mrs Lambraki introduced her report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs, on the communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council on the possible application of Article K.9 of the Treaty on European Union (COM(95)0566 — C4-0560/95) (A4-0349/96).

The following spoke: Mr Schulz, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mrs Cederschiöld, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mrs Schaffner, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Goerens, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Cohn-Bendit, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Berthu, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, Mr Le Gallou, Non-attached Member, Mrs Lindeperg, Mr Nassauer, Mr Lindqvist, Mrs Lindholm, Mr Krarup, Mr Alavanos, Mr David W. Martin, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Legal Affairs, Mrs Gradin, Member of the Commission, and Mrs Lambraki, rapporteur.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Item 14.

(The sitting was suspended at 10 a.m., as the Van Lancker report had been withdrawn from the agenda, and resumed at 11 a.m.)

Thursday, 30 January 1997

IN THE CHAIR: Mrs FONTAINE

Vice-President

Mr Crowley referred to Mr Andrews' remarks at the start of the sitting (Item 1) and in particular the motion tabled in the House of Commons, signed by Mr Hume, and asked the European Parliament to back this motion; he then made a formal condemnation of terrorism (the President noted these remarks).

4. Communication of a common position of the Council

Pursuant to Rule 64(1), the President announced that he had received from the Council, in accordance with Articles 189b and 189c of the EC Treaty, the following common position, together with the reasons which had led to its adoption, and the Commission's position:

— Common position adopted by the Council with a view to adopting a Council Directive amending Directive 91/439/EEC on driving licences (C4-0011/97 — 96/0040(SYN))

referred to
responsible: TRAN
opinion: LEGA

legal basis: Article 075 EC

The three-month period available to Parliament to deliver its opinion would therefore begin the following day, Friday, 31 January 1997.

VOTING TIME

5. Racism and xenophobia (vote)

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION B4-0045/97:

The President pointed out a mistake in the Italian version of paragraph 4.

Amendments adopted: 13; 1; 6; 7 by EV (184 for, 128 against, 3 abstentions); 8 by split vote; 2 as amended orally; 11; 5 by EV (186 for, 147 against, 25 abstentions); 16 as amended orally; 3; 15

Amendments rejected: 12; 4 by EV (146 for, 157 against, 0 abstentions); 14; 9 by EV (136 for, 142 against, 39 abstentions); 10

The different parts of the text were adopted in order (the 2nd part of para. 10 by EV (181 for, 155 against, 7 abstentions)).

The following spoke during the vote:

— Mr Schulz, who proposed an oral amendment to am. 2, adding the words 'and the Union' after 'Member States'; Mr Oostlander, on behalf of the PPE Group, which had tabled the amendment, agreed to this proposed amendment; the President established that there was no objection to voting on this oral amendment;

— Mr Oostlander proposed an oral amendment to am. 16 which he read out: 'expresses its disappointment at the British Government's objection to a Community basis for the European Union Observatory to monitor racism, xenophobia and anti-semitism; asks it to reconsider its stance'; Mr Schulz, on behalf of the PSE Group, which had tabled the amendment, agreed to this proposed amendment; the President established that there was no objection to voting on this oral amendment.

Separate votes: paras. 11, 15 (V); 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23 and 24 (a single vote was held on the last two paras.) (ARE)

Split votes:

am. 8 (UPE):

1st part: up to 'solidarity'
2nd part: remainder

para. 10 (UPE):

1st part: up to 'Racism'
2nd part: remainder

para. 11 (UPE):

1st part: up to 'Intergovernmental Conference'
2nd part: up to 'as soon as possible'
3rd part: remainder

para. 15 (UPE):

1st part: up to 'Treaty'
2nd part: remainder

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (PPE):

Members voting:	380
For:	345
Against:	11
Abstentions:	24

(Part II, Item 1).

6. Forestry strategy (vote)

Thomas report — A4-0414/96

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

(qualified majority required (314 votes): Article 138b EC)

Amendments rejected: 23; 30 by split vote; 18; 1; 29; 19; 24; 2; 20; 3; 4; 33; 35; 5; 6 by split vote; 31 as amended; 7; 25; 26; 8; 9; 21; 10; 11; 12; 13; 22; 14 by RCV; 32 as an addition; 28; 15; 16 (1st part); 34; 17

Thursday, 30 January 1997

Amendment fallen: 16 (2nd part)

Amendment withdrawn: 27

The different parts of the text were adopted in order (the 2nd part of para. 7 ('to examine the possibilities ... European forest owners') was adopted in a separate vote; para. 8 by EV (326 for, 13 against, 27 abstentions)).

The following spoke during the vote:

- the rapporteur, on the split vote on am. 30; he then pointed out that he would accept am. 32 as an addition;
- Mrs Van Putten withdrew from am. 31 the word 'immediate';
- Mrs Oomen-Ruijten, before the electronic vote on para. 8;
- Mrs Van Putten agreed to the rapporteur's proposal to take am. 32 as an addition.

Separate votes: para. 7 (2nd part) (PPE)

Split votes:

am. 30 (PSE):

1st part: 1st subparagraph
2nd part: 2nd subparagraph

am. 6 (ARE):

1st part: introduction and 1st and 2nd subparagraphs (up to 'forest-damaging pollution')
2nd part: remainder

am. 16 (ELDR):

1st part: text without the words '(for example the 'Forest Stewardship Council')'
2nd part: these words

Results of RCVs:

am. 14 (V):

Members voting:	362
For:	45
Against:	310
Abstentions:	7

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (V):

Members voting:	358
For:	315
Against:	23
Abstentions:	20

(Part II, Item 2).

7. Fisheries Council of 19-20 December 1996 (vote)

Motions for resolutions B4-0029, 0030, 0031, 0032, 0042, 0043 and 0044/97

MOTIONS FOR RESOLUTIONS B4-0029, 0030, 0031, 0032, 0042, 0043 and 0044/97:

- joint motion for a resolution tabled by the following Members:
Baldarelli, on behalf of the PSE Group
Langenhagen, on behalf of the PPE Group
d' Aboville, Gallagher, Tajani and Girão Pereira, on behalf of the UPE Group
Teverson, on behalf of the ELDR Group
Jové Peres, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group
McKenna, on behalf of the V Group
Macartney, on behalf of the ARE Group
to replace these motions with a new text:

Amendments adopted: 3; 5 by EV (164 for, 130 against, 11 abstentions); 4 by EV (183 for, 124 against, 2 abstentions); 1; 2

Amendments rejected: 6; 7

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

The following spoke during the vote:

- Mrs Fraga Estévez, chairman of the Committee on Fisheries, pointed out before the vote that there were a number of significant translation errors affecting the preamble to the joint motion for a resolution, in particular the Spanish and English versions;

- the President pointed out that Mr Gallagher had wanted to modify the beginning of am. 3 to read '— having regard to the report by Mr Gallagher ...', but, as the author of this request and of the amendment was absent, put am. 3 to the vote as it stood; Mr Crowley apologized for Mr Gallagher's absence, and noted that the amendment as originally tabled did in fact read as Mr Gallagher wished (the President replied that it was not customary practice to quote the names of rapporteurs in citations in resolutions).

Separate votes: para. 6 (V)

Parliament adopted the resolution (Part II, Item 3).

8. Combating terrorism (vote)

Reding report — A4-0368/96

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Amendments adopted: 4 by EV (168 for, 122 against, 21 abstentions); 5 by EV (164 for, 150 against, 10 abstentions); 6; 11 as amended orally, by RCV; 2 by EV (146 for, 133 against, 15 abstentions)

Thursday, 30 January 1997

Amendments rejected: 8; 9; 10; 7

Amendments withdrawn: 3; 1

The different parts of the text were adopted in order (the 2nd part of para. 21 by EV (171 for, 126 against, 11 abstentions)).

The following spoke during the vote:

— at the beginning of the vote, Mrs Palacio Vallelersundi noted that ams. 1 and 11 made the same point and called on Mr Schulz to agree not to put to the vote one of the two amendments; Mr Schulz proposed dealing with this matter when the vote on am. 1 was called; when the vote was called, Mr Schulz agreed to withdraw this amendment to make way for am. 11 on condition that the words 'within the meaning of this resolution' were added after 'armed group'; Mrs Reding approved this proposal and the President established that there was no opposition to voting on the oral amendment proposed to am. 11; Mr Cohn-Bendit and Mr Crowley then spoke on Mr Schulz's remarks, and Mr Schulz spoke on Mr Cohn-Bendit's remarks.

Separate votes: recitals A, G, H, paras. 12, 13, 15, 17, 18 (V)

Split votes:

para. 13 (GUE/NGL):

1st part: text without the 1st indent
2nd part: 1st indent

para. 21 (PSE):

1st part: introduction
2nd part: 1st indent
3rd part: 2nd indent

Results of RCVs:

am. 11 (PPE):

Members voting:	316
For:	275
Against:	22
Abstentions:	19

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (PPE):

Members voting:	317
For:	294
Against:	19
Abstentions:	4

(Part II, Item 4).

9. Progress by European Union in 1995 (vote)

Valverde López report — A4-0396/96

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Parliament adopted the resolution (*Part II, Item 5*).

10. Cultural aspects in European Community action (vote)

Escudero report — A4-0410/96

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Amendments adopted: 3 by RCV; 1 by split vote

Amendment rejected: 2 by EV (77 for, 156 against, 18 abstentions)

The different parts of the text were adopted in order (recital H had been deleted in a corrigendum to the report).

Split votes:

am. 1 (ELDR):

1st part: up to 'zero rate of VAT'
2nd part: remainder

Results of RCVs:

am. 3 (GUE/NGL):

Members voting:	240
For:	216
Against:	12
Abstentions:	12

Parliament adopted the resolution (*Part II, Item 6*).

11. Pricing and transport costs (vote)

Schmidbauer report — A4-0012/97

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Amendment adopted: 1 by EV (162 for, 89 against, 0 abstentions)

Amendments rejected: 5; 2

Amendment withdrawn: 3

Amendment not put to the vote (Rule 125(1)(e)): 4

The different parts of the text were adopted in order (the 2nd part of para. 20 by EV (130 for, 91 against, 20 abstentions); para. 21 by EV (133 for, 91 against, 23 abstentions)).

Separate votes: para. 21 (PPE)

Thursday, 30 January 1997

Split votes:

para. 20 (PPE):

1st part: up to 'requirements'
2nd part: remainderParliament adopted the resolution (*Part II, Item 7*).

Mr Robles Piquer spoke.

12. Statistics on research, development and innovation (vote)

Izquierdo Collado report — A4-0383/96

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Parliament adopted the resolution (*Part II, Item 8*).**13. Thirteenth annual report on monitoring the application of Community law (vote)**

Schaffner report — A4-0001/97

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Amendments adopted: 6; 5; 1; 2; 3; 4*Amendments rejected:* 7; 8; 9

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

The following spoke during the vote:

— Mrs Lindholm, at the beginning of the vote, pointed out that ams. 7, 8 and 9 were incomprehensible in English and asked for these amendments to be revised on the basis of the original Swedish version.

Parliament adopted the resolution (*Part II, Item 9*).**14. Application of Article K.9 TEU (vote)**

Lambraki report — A4-0349/96

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Amendments rejected: 1; 2; 3; 4; 5 by EV (89 for, 107 against, 8 abstentions)

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

Separate votes: recital C, para. 3 (V)*Split votes:*

para. 5 (UPE):

1st part: text without the words 'the policy on the crossing of external borders'
2nd part: these wordsParliament adopted the resolution (*Part II, Item 10*).*
* **Explanations of vote:*

Racism and xenophobia (B4-0045/97)

— *oral:* Mr Le Gallou— *in writing:* the following Members: Díez de Rivera Icaza; Caudron; Linser; Berthu; Lindholm, Holm, Schörling

Fisheries

— *oral:* Mr Medina Ortega, on behalf of the PSE Group— *in writing:* Mr Baldarelli

Thomas report (A4-0414/96)

— *in writing:* the following Members: Lindqvist; Wibe, Theorin, Andersson, Ahlqvist; Titley

Reding report (A4-0368/96)

— *in writing:* the following Members: Lindqvist; Svensson, Eriksson; Kirsten M. Jensen, Sindal, Iversen, Blak; Crowley

Valverde López report (A4-0396/96)

— *in writing:* the following Members: Lindqvist; Wibe, Theorin, Ahlqvist

Escudero report (A4-0410/96)

— *in writing:* the following Members: Lindqvist; Ahlqvist, Theorin, Wibe, Andersson, Lööv, Hulthén, Waidelich; Waddington

Schmidbauer report (A4-0012/96)

— *in writing:* the following Members: Caudron; Kirsten M. Jensen, Sindal, Iversen, Blak; Linser; Bernardini

Schaffner report (A4-0001/97)

— *in writing:* the following Members: Svensson, Eriksson

Lambraki report (A4-0349/96)

— *in writing:* the following Members: Lindqvist; Wibe, Theorin, Ahlqvist*
* **Corrections to votes*

Racism (B4-0045/97)

Motion for a resolution as a whole: Mr Donnay had intended to abstain and not vote against.

END OF VOTING TIME**15. Membership of political groups**

The President announced that Mr Caligaris had left the UPE Group with effect from 1 February 1997 and would now sit with the Non-attached Members.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

16. Forwarding of resolutions adopted during the sitting

The President informed Parliament, pursuant to Rule 133(2), that the Minutes of that day's sitting would be submitted to Parliament for its approval at the beginning of its next sitting.

With Parliament's agreement, he stated that he would forward the texts that had just been adopted forthwith to the bodies named therein.

17. Dates for next sittings

The President announced that the next sittings would be held from 17 to 21 February 1997.

18. Adjournment of session

The session was adjourned.

(The sitting closed at 12.30 p.m.)

Enrico VINCI
Secretary-General

José María GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO
President

Thursday, 30 January 1997

PART II

Texts adopted by the European Parliament

1. Racism and xenophobia

B4-0045/97

Resolution on racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism and the European Year against Racism (1997)*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to Article 14 of the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1950) which states that ‘the enjoyment of the rights and freedoms set forth in this Convention shall be secured without discrimination on any ground such as sex, race, colour, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, association with a national minority, property, birth or other status’,
- having regard to Article 19 on the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights adopted within the framework of the United Nations which states that the exercise of the right of freedom of expression carries with it special duties and responsibilities, including respect for the rights of others,
- having regard to the 1966 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination,
- having regard to Article F.2. of the Treaty on European Union which states that ‘the Union shall respect fundamental rights, as guaranteed by the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms ... and as they result from the constitutional traditions common to the Member States, as general principles of Community law’,
- having regard to the joint declaration against racism and xenophobia ⁽¹⁾ of the European Union, the Council, the representatives of the Member States meeting within the Council, and the Commission of 11 June 1986 and all the resolutions adopted on this subject,
- having regard to the conclusions of its Committee of Inquiry into Racism and Xenophobia (A2-160/85 and A3-0195/90) and having regard to its resolutions of 21 April 1993 on the resurgence of racism and xenophobia in Europe and the danger of right-wing extremism ⁽²⁾, of 2 December 1993 on racism and xenophobia ⁽³⁾ of 20 April 1994 on ethnic ‘cleansing’ ⁽⁴⁾, of 21 April 1994 on the situation of gypsies in the Community ⁽⁵⁾, of 27 October 1994 ⁽⁶⁾ and of 27 April 1995 ⁽⁷⁾ on racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism, of 15 June 1995 on a day to commemorate the Holocaust ⁽⁸⁾, of 13 July 1995 on discrimination against the Roma ⁽⁹⁾, of 26 October 1995 on racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism ⁽¹⁰⁾ and of 9 May 1996 on the Commission’s communication on racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism ⁽¹¹⁾ and in particular the recommendations contained therein,
- having regard to the conclusions adopted by the European Council at its meetings in Corfu (24-25 June 1994), Essen (9-10 December 1994), Cannes (25-26 June 1995), Madrid (15-16 December 1995), Florence (21-22 June 1996) and Dublin (13-14 December 1996) on the subject of racism and xenophobia,

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 158, 25.6.1986, p. 1.⁽²⁾ OJ C 150, 31.5.1993, p. 127.⁽³⁾ OJ C 342, 20.12.1993, p. 19.⁽⁴⁾ OJ C 128, 9.5.1994, p. 221.⁽⁵⁾ OJ C 128, 9.5.1994, p. 372.⁽⁶⁾ OJ C 323, 21.11.1994, p. 154.⁽⁷⁾ OJ C 126, 22.5.1995, p. 75.⁽⁸⁾ OJ C 166, 3.7.1995, p. 132.⁽⁹⁾ OJ C 249, 25.9.1995, p. 156.⁽¹⁰⁾ OJ C 308, 20.11.1995, p. 140.⁽¹¹⁾ OJ C 152, 27.5.1996, p. 57.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- having regard to the resolutions of the Council and the representatives of the governments of the Member States, meeting within the Council of 5 October 1995 on combating racism and xenophobia in the field of employment and the social field ⁽¹⁾ and of 23 July 1996 on the European Year against Racism (1997) ⁽²⁾ and the Joint Action of 15 July 1996 adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union, concerning action to combat racism and xenophobia ⁽³⁾,
 - having regard to the reports of the Consultative Committee on Racism and Xenophobia (the Kahn Committee) drawn up for the meetings of the European Council in Essen, Cannes, Madrid and Florence, and the feasibility study submitted by the consultative committee with a view to establishing a European observatory for racism and xenophobia (May 1996),
- A. whereas one of the main *raison d'être* of the European Union is to prevent racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism,
- B. whereas 1997 has been designated European Year Against Racism by the European Union, and the Commission has begun planning activities for this year,
- C. whereas the United Nations designated 1995 International Year of Tolerance and the Council of Europe launched a European youth campaign against racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and intolerance, under the slogan 'All different all equal',
- D. whereas despite the efforts taken over the last few years by the European Union, its Member States, the Council of Europe and the United Nations, racist and xenophobic attitudes continue to prevail within the European Union, and many citizens of the Union are still subjected in their daily lives to racist, xenophobic and anti-semitic attacks and insults, many of which result in death or permanent injury,
- E. whereas this terrible situation is set to deteriorate further owing to the resurgence of egotistical attitudes and the loss of community values and principles,
- F. whereas owing to its role in shaping awareness and in nurturing a sense of social responsibility, education plays an important role in combating racism,
- G. whereas the situation is such that individual governments have based their foreign policies quite clearly on ethnic considerations,
- H. whereas the European Union should itself set a convincing example in combating racism, by carefully scrutinizing its own policies to see whether they contain racist, xenophobic or ethnic tendencies, but above all by promoting initiatives aimed at mutual knowledge and understanding,
- I. whereas the economic problems facing the Member States are being exploited by irresponsible politicians and opinion-shapers to fan racism and xenophobia,
- J. whereas in the last few decades integration policy in the Member States has been insufficient and ineffective, to the detriment of tolerance, harmony and cooperation in society,
- K. whereas the institutions of the European Union and the relevant authorities of the Member States should adopt appropriate and effective practical measures, particularly at local, regional and national level, and coordinate them with other institutions and government authorities,
- L. whereas organizations which are independent of government control, such as trade unions, employers' associations, the media, schools and churches have played a key role in combating racism,

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 296, 10.11.1995, p. 13.

⁽²⁾ OJ 237, 15.8.1996, p. 1.

⁽³⁾ OJ L 185, 24.7.1996, p. 5.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- M. whereas racism cannot be successfully combated by a political debate alone; whereas what is needed is a comprehensive debate encompassing all reaches of society and the active participation of civil society,
- N. whereas it is very important in this connection that representatives of institutions and bodies engaged in combating racism and xenophobia should pool their experience regarding the measures already taken to combat intolerance, discrimination and violence, especially if solidarity within the Community is to be further developed and a close union is to be established between the peoples of Europe,
- O. whereas the Union should insist that the candidate countries for accession attach the greatest possible importance to protecting minorities on their sovereign territory, bearing in mind that this is a key criterion for accession to the European Union,
- P. whereas in its 1997 Budget the European Parliament set aside resources for measures to combat racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism and for the successful organization of a European Year Against Racism (1997),
- Q. whereas the purpose of the European Year Against Racism (1997), is to combat racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism in the long term and to promote the European Idea, namely that harmonious societies characterized by ethnic and cultural diversity are an expression of civilization and that the diversity of the various cultures and traditions constitutes a positive and enriching factor,
- R. whereas the consultative committee on racism and xenophobia (the Kahn committee) has demanded the immediate establishment of a European observatory for racism and xenophobia,
- S. whereas the Intergovernmental Conference is urged to review the Treaties to see if they contain racist, xenophobic or anti-Semitic elements,
1. Welcomes the European Union's official designation of 1997 as 'European Year Against Racism' and hopes that this year will provide an opportunity to combat racism and xenophobia more effectively through the establishment of a European action framework;
 2. Wishes, nevertheless, that the funding of the European Year Against Racism should not be carried out at the expense of the initiatives so far supported by the Commission;
 3. Condemns in the strongest terms all kinds of racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism as flagrant violations of individual rights and as an expression of intolerance and calls on the governments of the Member States to ensure that foreign communities are protected against racist violence and any form of discrimination;
 4. Condemns political leaders who stir up racism and xenophobia for electoral reasons, and expects political parties to remove any kind of racist propaganda from their election programmes;
 5. Condemns vehemently any racist statement or publication in the European Parliament;
 6. Expresses its profound compassion with the families of those who have died following racist or xenophobic attacks and with persons injured in such attacks;
 7. Expresses its regret at racist and xenophobic statements by politicians and parties at national and at European level, and points out that such statements only exacerbate the problem of racism within the Union; distances itself from such politicians and their views and calls on all democratic parties to use all democratic means to ostracize racist movements and groups;
 8. Would like to see a further increase in public awareness of the dangers of racism and xenophobia, since these attitudes are diametrically opposed to all the values embodied in Europe, namely the protection of human dignity and the promotion of mutual respect, understanding and solidarity between peoples;
 9. Expresses its high regard for the various initiatives launched by the Commission in this sphere, and calls for a reinforcement of the legal instruments, in accordance with its declared desire for measures to combat racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism in all areas;
 10. Draws attention to the vital role the media should be playing in denouncing racism and intolerance and promoting tolerance and solidarity, in particular by pointing out the positive contribution which immigrants are making to European society;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

11. Considers that the notion of race has no scientific, genetic or anthropological basis, and that this concept can therefore only serve to underpin ethnic, national and cultural discrimination or discrimination linked to colour, since it is based on the erroneous idea that there are separate 'races' which are hierarchically structured;
12. Urges the Council and the Member States to square their immigration and asylum policy with the objectives of European Year Against Racism; takes the view that many of the recent decisions by the Council and the Member States in the field of immigration and asylum policy have contributed towards exacerbating the climate of suspicion towards nationals of third countries and applicants for asylum;
13. Calls on the Member States and the European Union to develop their asylum and immigration policy in close connection with an adequate integration policy in order to avoid inter-ethnic tensions and to promote mutual acceptance;
14. Notes the intention to incorporate in the Treaty measures to prevent and combat racism and xenophobia as a field of activity of Community significance within the framework of the Intergovernmental Conference; remarks however that, within the framework of the first pillar, the European Union should be given responsibility for the development of measures against racism and xenophobia, so that the Commission is given the right to initiate measures, the Council decides by majority voting and the European Parliament acquires powers of co-decision, in order that, within the framework of the first pillar, an anti-discrimination Directive can be drawn up as soon as possible; calls once more for binding legal instruments to combat racism and xenophobia at European level;
15. Looks to the Member States to make intensive efforts to honour their commitments on the basis of the above Joint Action of 15 July 1996 concerning measures to combat racism and xenophobia and to implement the recommendations set out in the various resolutions in question;
16. Calls on the Member States to take initiatives on the basis of Article K.1(7) of the TEU in order effectively to combat racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism, and the dissemination of negationist theories, by introducing or strengthening penalties and improving the opportunities for prosecution;
17. Calls for non-Community immigrants to enjoy equal treatment with regard to economic and social rights, and the recognition of civic, cultural and political rights, including the right to vote in local elections, for those who have been resident in a Member State for more than five years, in accordance with the Council of Europe convention;
18. Regrets the delays and postponements between the adoption and implementation of legislation, as listed in a comparative study carried out at the behest of the Council of Europe on national legal provisions against racism and xenophobia — in particular in view of the 1966 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, and reminds the Member States of their obligation to implement the Convention in its entirety in national legal provisions;
19. Expresses its satisfaction at the proposal to include an anti-discrimination article in the Treaty, but is opposed to the unanimity needed to introduce measures at European level; urges that the Commission should receive the right of initiative in this field, that the Council should decide by majority voting and that the European Parliament should acquire co-decision rights;
20. Calls on the Council to submit to the European Parliament a report setting out which practical measures and strategies it has so far developed with a view to implementing the recommendations contained in the final report of the consultative committee on racism and xenophobia (the Kahn committee), in particular as regards the fields of education, training, the media and information policy;
21. Urges the Council, under the Dutch Presidency, which has adopted a positive attitude towards the conclusions of the report of the consultative committee, to ensure that full use is made of the committee's work;
22. Supports the establishment of a European observatory for racism and xenophobia which will act as the centre of a network of existing organizations and promote the research of these independent organizations, while at the same time ensuring that the duplication of work can be avoided;
23. Welcomes the decision unanimously adopted by the General Affairs Council of 6 December 1996 to set up the observatory for racism and xenophobia (RAXEN) as rapidly as possible; welcomes the fact that the Commission has submitted a proposal in this connection; intends to deliver its opinion on this proposal as soon as possible, and calls on the Council thereafter to make a rapid decision on this matter in accordance with the wishes expressed by Parliament;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

24. Expects the observatory to be set up very shortly as a permanent and independent institution of the European Union which will work closely with the Council of Europe, and urges the Council rapidly to reach decisions on budgetary matters and the legal basis for the observatory;
25. Expresses its disappointment at the British Government's objection to a Community basis for the European Union Observatory to monitor racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism; asks it to reconsider its stance;
26. Urges the Council and Commission to consider the possibility of setting aside small sums in the 1997 Budget during the second half of the year, in order to provide for the establishment of the observatory (RAXEN) in 1998 — which depends on Parliament's approval of the Commission proposal;
27. Confirms that the Commission must be accountable to the European Parliament, not least for financial matters, in respect of the observatory and that it must submit a detailed annual report on the activities of the observatory;
28. Takes the view that the observatory, as the centre of a network of existing organizations, should undertake a survey of racist, xenophobic and fascist phenomena and their causes and evaluate existing policies, in order successfully to contribute to an exchange of information and pooling of experience; considers that the observatory should also assume the task of coordination and consultation in respect of appropriate measures and strategies which can be developed and implemented by local authorities, national governments and the European Union;
29. Expresses its satisfaction at the fact that the consultative committee on racism and xenophobia (the Kahn committee) will continue its work until the establishment of the European Observatory for Racism and Xenophobia (RAXEN) in 1998;
30. Urges all those Member States which have so far failed to do so to follow Denmark's example and increase the national resources set aside for combating racism and xenophobia;
31. Takes the view that the European Year Against Racism will only be taken seriously if the institutions of the European Union are themselves prepared to make available the necessary resources;
32. Hopes that, in order to reach the largest possible number of persons, practical measures are taken at various levels, based on the principle of communication, partnership and cooperation with non-government organizations, the media, trade unions, employers' organizations, local and regional authorities, religious organizations, educational institutions, etc.;
33. Calls on the Commission to carefully scrutinize its policy of project funding — in particular in view of the European Year Against Racism — in order to ensure that priority is given to projects which actually reach citizens where they live and actively involve them in combating racism;
34. Urges the implementation of a broad range of activities to combat racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism in the Member States and at European level, including various events concerned with the topics of the European Year which will attract substantial publicity, for example:
- the preparation of practical projects on a local and regional basis,
 - high-profile events involving pop groups, sportsmen and other prominent personalities which could take place at the same time in various places in Europe,
 - the public award of special prizes for tolerance and understanding,
 - ambitious political and cultural events with a trans-border dimension,
 - the preparation of exhibitions,
 - the promotion of campaigns in the fields of information and communication, including the use of telematic sites,
 - the development of pedagogical material,
 - youth exchanges,
 - the organization of round-table discussions,

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- a hearing in the European Parliament's Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs involving non-governmental organizations and persons concerned on the subject of racism and xenophobia within the first four months of 1997 as a contribution towards the Year Against Racism (1997);

35. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, the consultative committee on racism and xenophobia (the Kahn committee), the Council of Europe and the governments and parliaments of the Member States and the countries which have applied to join the Union.

2. Forestry strategy

A4-0414/96

Resolution on the European Union's forestry strategy

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the second paragraph of Article 138b of the EC Treaty,
 - having regard to Rule 50 of its Rules of Procedure,
 - having noted that a proposal comparable to this initiative is neither in preparation nor listed in the Annual Legislative Programme,
 - having regard to the report commissioned by the European Parliament which was carried out by Eurofor and the Hearing held by its Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development,
 - having regard to the motions for resolutions by Mr Ephremidis and Mr Theonas on fires in Greece (B4-0051/94), Mr Fernández-Albor on the participation of citizens in the reforestation of forestry zones (B4-0186/94) and Mr Salafranca Sánchez García on a forestry strategy in the Canary Islands (B4-0462/94),
 - having regard to the report of the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development and the opinions of the Committee on Budgets, the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy and the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection (A4-0414/96),
- I. Calls on the Commission to put forward, on the basis of Articles 43, 130s and 235 of the EC Treaty, within two years of the date of adoption of this resolution by the European Parliament, a legislative proposal on European forestry strategy, in accordance with the recommendations set out below:

A. *Principles and objectives of the proposal*

1. Forests are one of the most important renewable resources that Europe has. With their responsible management and care it is possible to produce goods and services indefinitely, based on a market-oriented approach.

In view of the importance of the forestry sector as a source of employment and wealth in the EU, the commercial utilization of forests should be a priority of EU forestry strategy, which should be integrated with the use of forests for other purposes. Forest strategy should be based on the recognition of the diversity of European forests, their multi-functional nature and the need for ecological, economic and social sustainability.

2. The coordination of national policies must be based on respect for the principle of subsidiarity. Subject to this, the basis for the European Union's forestry strategy should be a clearer definition of national policies in the EU (as well as EFTA and CEEC), setting objectives at both national and international levels, re-establishing clearly the responsibilities of the EU and the Member States, with precise procedures for technical cooperation at appropriate levels, establishing a link between forestry strategy and official policies such as environmental and rural policy.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

3. The forestry strategy should respect the resolution approved by the EU and its Member States under the Rio Declaration and the Helsinki resolutions.
4. The EU's forestry strategy should take account of the fact that most of Europe's forests are the property of millions of forest owners who have to ensure a multi-functional management of forests guaranteeing the sustainability of the potential of the associated natural resources; the proprietary rights of these forest owners must be respected.

B. Actions to be proposed

5. The Commission should make proposals for instruments and adequate funding for coherent and complementary implementation at Community, Member State and regional level in order to develop actions dealing with the three main areas of protection, utilization/development and extension of forestry resources as described below:

Protection

6. Forest degradation continues to be a serious problem in Europe. The Commission is asked to make proposals to allow action to be taken wherever required against erosion and desertification, to protect and conserve the economic and biological value of the forestry heritage and enhance its role in maintaining rural equilibrium, with particular reference to problems of specific regions, including mountain regions, to monitor the effective implementation of Community Directives on the reduction of atmospheric pollution, to undertake large-scale monitoring of the health of forests, to increase funding for the conservation of the forest's biological and genetic resources and to take action against disease, in particular using integrated biological control. Further, emphasis should be given, where necessary, to protection of the forest soils from compaction and erosion through appropriate selective timber harvesting methods, as well as measures concerning appropriate regeneration and afforestation, particularly by the promotion of mixed woodlands in suitable sites.
7. Special attention should be paid to the protection of forests against fire. The Commission is asked in particular: to make proposals adjusting the budgetary funding for Regulation (EEC) No 2158/92 ⁽¹⁾ to the real needs of the overall protection plans of the Member States, after all necessary actions at Member State, regional and forest-owner level have been taken, to improve coordination of the utilization of resources from the different structural funds, to give priority to financing a study of the causes of fires, prevention, training and research, to propose conditions for intervention in the reforestation of burnt forests, to examine the possibilities for better coordination of resources to combat fires and to examine whether holding private insurance before European aid is granted could have a positive effect and would not involve discrimination and unfair competition among European forest owners.

Utilization and development

8. The main roles of forests concern economic utilization, environmental importance and recreational activities. These are not mutually exclusive but can often be merged in the same forest areas.
9. The Commission is invited to propose adjustments to the relevant objectives and measures, in particular Regulation (EEC) No 1610/89 ⁽²⁾, to the needs of aid for forest management and exploitation, including the development and enhancement of woodland on farms, and for appropriate technical assistance to forest owners in order to provide economically viable management, while respecting the principle of sustainable development.
10. The Commission is asked to consider the forest and the associated industries as essential elements in rural development policy. The Commission should therefore extend the application of Regulation (EEC) No 867/90 ⁽³⁾ by helping to improve the economic competitiveness of the forest and forest industries sector at European level. It is also essential to encourage the use of small dimension wood for industrial purposes, taking account of the carbon sink function, and for the production of energy in de-centralized energy production systems to be substituted for the use of non-renewable sources of energy.

⁽¹⁾ OJ L 217, 31.7.1992, p. 3.

⁽²⁾ OJ L 165, 15.6.1989, p. 3.

⁽³⁾ OJ L 91, 6.4.1990, p. 7.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

11. The Commission should include proposals for effective promotion of the timber sector at European level; this should include plans to promote opportunities for increased utilization of wood in construction and other industries, and for adding value to biomass in particular for the production of energy and new products. The crucial policy on quality which is an adjunct to this could result in the use of a European quality label. Special attention should also be given to the development of SMEs which are active in this sector and to this end a European campaign for the promotion of wood and wood products should be developed.

Extension

12. Increasing forest resources should take place on an economically sound basis, respecting local biodiversity and traditional landscape and helping to prevent erosion and desertification. It should in particular make it possible to promote the sustainable management of agri-forestry systems and to support associated management programmes such as agri-forestry development programmes. The Commission should also consider the development of advisory services, information and training for forest owners and farmers.

13. In the implementation of the activities described under 2, it is essential that the Commission make provision for a series of accompanying activities, namely:

- (i) The effective implementation of the forestry information and communication system (EFICS). The forestry sector should therefore discuss forthwith the usefulness of a European forestry inventory by state and by region which would provide the Union with the necessary information to continue to ensure sustainable management of forestry resources,
- (ii) Increased efforts and coordination at Community level should be undertaken to encourage research into forest ecosystems and in particular the causes of damage (insects and diseases, atmospheric pollutants), the impact of forestry practices on biodiversity and also their contribution to environmental and economic balance in rural areas and near urban areas,
- (iii) Education and training should be supported, in particular by exchanging knowledge of forestry practices between the various Member States, and there should be information and awareness campaigns for the general public as regards the varied functions of forests; the creation of a European forestry school should be considered; promotion of wood as an environment-friendly, renewable material should be encouraged,
- (iv) The development of economic and social interests of forests, encapsulating an adaptation of forestry utilization and timber products to the needs of the market. The role and value of forests in tourism, recreation, health and the cycle of water supply should be recognized, without unnecessarily restricting the economic use of forests.

14. With a view to the enlargement of the EU, the problems of forests should now be given special attention in the CEEC. In the implementation of the PHARE and TACIS programmes, support is needed for future integration of the forest heritage and in this respect the principles and objectives of European forestry strategy should provide a reference point. In addition, any new EU forestry strategy should take account of the budgetary consequences of EU enlargement.

15. At institutional level the Commission should propose to expand the role of the Standing Forestry Committee so that it becomes the chief instrument in the coordination of forestry matters. It is also asked to set up the advisory committee on forests, which it announced to the EP in 1995. Lastly, the Commission is asked to establish a coherent administrative framework within its services allowing a logical, rational and transparent division of its powers and tasks between the units dealing with forestry strategy and thus to counteract the dispersion of responsibilities and the lack of coordination and organization as regards forestry in the EU.

16. At international level the European Union must play an active role in trade negotiations as they relate to forestry sector problems. It must coordinate forestry related concepts more effectively so that they are taken into account in the Union's general trade policies.

17. The Commission should also submit an effective action plan to combat ecological and social dumping in relation to imports of timber into the EU.

18. The Commission should make proposals, together with the Member States, to continue to work actively towards an international convention on the protection and sustainable management of forests.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

19. The Commission should consider how to create a recognized international certification system as regards the sustainable management of forests. The certification system should be transparent, voluntary and non-discriminatory and should take account of the specific ecological, biological and socio-economic characteristics of each country, including forest ownership patterns. Certification should fully meet the objective assigned to it of enhancing economically, socially and ecologically sustainable use of forests, in full compliance with national, EU and international legislation.

20. Regarding forest management outside the European Union, the Commission is invited to submit proposals for an integrated international strategy seeking to ensure the qualitative and quantitative conservation and sustainable management of forests, and providing the necessary financial aid and technical assistance to support the efforts of the countries concerned to conserve and manage their forests sustainably while respecting the rights and needs of the native and indigenous peoples, who should be involved in the planning of forestry projects from the outset and should benefit from forestry development programmes.

C. Financing

21. With a view to the establishment of a coherent and coordinated Community forestry strategy the Commission should propose, for the sake of budgetary transparency, the reorganization of the budgetary presentation of forestry activities in order to rationalize the entry of the expenditure in the EU budget and to deal with the current dispersal of budget headings relating to forests.

22. The Commission should initially ascertain the funding actually devoted by the EU to forestry measures over the last decade under the various relevant measures and policies. This financial evaluation should be accompanied, as far as possible, by a technical evaluation (cost/efficiency analysis) and it is on this basis that appropriate budget guidelines for the priorities in the various sectors could be proposed, while respecting the principle of subsidiarity in financing of EU forestry activities.

II. Considers that the possibility should be examined of setting up an EP sub-committee on forestry.

III. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council and the Commission.

3. Fisheries Council of 19-20 December 1996

B4-0029, 0030, 0031, 0032, 0042, 0043 and 0044/97

Resolution on the Commission statement on the outcome of the meeting of the Council of Ministers for Fisheries of 19-20 December 1996

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the meeting of the Fisheries Council on 19-20 December 1996,
- having regard to the statement by Commissioner Bonino to Parliament on 16 January 1997,
- having regard to its opinions of 13 December 1996 on:
 - the proposal for a Council Decision concerning the objectives and detailed rules for restructuring the Community fisheries sector for the period from 1 January 1997 to 31 December 2002 with a view to achieving a balance on a sustainable basis between resources and their exploitation (COM(96)0237 — C4-0438/96 — 96/0142(CNS) ⁽¹⁾,

⁽¹⁾ Minutes of that sitting, Part II, Item 4(a).

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Regulation (EEC) No 2847/93 establishing a control system applicable to the Common Fisheries Policy (COM(96)0232 — C4-0337/96 — 96/0140(CNS)) ⁽¹⁾,
 - the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Regulation (EEC) No 2847/93 as regards the deadline for a Council decision on a continuous position monitoring system using satellite communications for Community fishing vessels (COM(96)0386 — C4-0483/96 — 96/0193(CNS)) ⁽¹⁾,
 - having regard to its resolution of 25 October 1996 on the communication from the Commission on the implementation of technical measures in the common fisheries policy ⁽²⁾,
- A. whereas there have been difficulties in applying the European Union's Common Fisheries Policy (CFP),
- B. whereas fisheries are important in social terms as a direct and indirect source of jobs, and are also important to the economy of a number of regions and considering that, despite successive Regulations, economic difficulties in the areas depending on fisheries are increasing, and that such difficulties have a strong social impact;
- C. whereas the fourth Multiannual Guidance Programme (MAGP IV) proposal does not take into account the obvious social consequences to the fishing sector nor the job losses it will entail,
- D. whereas, in order to conclude the existing fisheries agreement with Morocco, the EU made significant concessions external to the agreement; having regard to the desire of Morocco to revise the fisheries agreement and impose a biological moratorium exclusively on Community vessels, and to the statements by the Moroccan Government concerning non-renewal of the existing agreement,
1. Acknowledges that the restructuring of fleets, technical measures and effective programmes for controlling fishing activities are three vital aspects, indissolubly linked to each other, of fisheries management policy;
2. Regrets the lack of progress in the Council on measures which are essential to help achieve an equilibrium between the Community fleet and available resources;

MAGP IV

3. Notes with concern the lack of faith in the Common Fisheries Policy shown by many EU fishermen and calls on Member States to use this period of grace to consult fully and take on board the views of fishermen and their organizations, especially through the creation of experimental projects in which fishermen manage fish stocks themselves, also in cooperation with non-member countries;
4. Considers that restructuring must take account of the impact of the proposed measures in economic, social and employment terms, bearing in mind that it is possible to reduce the fishing effort not only by cutting the capacity of the Union fleet but also, and above all, by reducing the catch efficiency of the fleet itself, while ensuring that the fishing effort becomes compatible with environmental protection;
5. Insists that it is necessary to promote, at the same time, measures that rationalize fishing activity (biological moratoriums, better exploitation of quotas, a shift towards new species, etc.), to encourage greater selectivity of gear, to support any initiative that could encourage the repopulation of fishing grounds, reduction in water pollution, etc., and to strengthen controls on fishing activities;
6. Strongly deplores the fact that, in consequence of postponement of the adoption of the Fourth MAGP, the Commission decided to suspend, as of 1 January 1997, aid for the rebuilding and modernization of vessels, since all that measure does is to directly hit fishermen, who are not to blame for such decisions and who are already suffering the consequences of a crisis in the sector;

⁽¹⁾ Minutes of that sitting, Part II, Item 4(c).

⁽²⁾ Minutes of that Sitting, Part II, Item 12(c).

Thursday, 30 January 1997

Technical measures

7. Reaffirms the need to improve the selectivity of fishing techniques in order to reduce the problem of by-catches, rejects and catches of immature fish;
8. Stresses that any modification or innovation in technical measures should be scientifically justified and be technically and commercially validated by prior experiments co-financed by the Community and carried out under real conditions, with the participation of the fishermen themselves, in the fishing zones concerned;
9. Insists that technical measures must be at the same time simple, cost-effective, technically feasible and practical to operate in commercial conditions, readily understandable by fishermen and uncomplicated to enforce;
10. Believes that innovative approaches should be taken into consideration, including the development of a tangible system of conservation dividends to reward those EU countries which voluntarily adopt conservation measures in their legislation;

Satellite controls

11. Welcomes the Council decision seeking to introduce a satellite system to control fishing activities;

Salmon

12. Is concerned by the continuing failure to find a solution to the EU salmon crisis;

TACs and quotas

13. Regrets that once again the size of TACs was based on political trading and incomplete scientific data;

Final remarks

14. Expresses its concern that compromise documents produced by the Council Presidency are already far removed from the original proposals presented to Parliament and insists on Parliament's right to be consulted if the Council intends to make substantial modifications to the Commission proposals;
15. Stresses that it is important to assess carefully — in both the short term and long term — the socio-economic impact of the introduction of any technical measure or of any new MAGP and to consider additional and specific financial compensation for any loss of income or employment such measures might cause;

*
* *
*

16. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission and the governments of the Member States.

4. Combating terrorism

A4-0368/96

Resolution on combating terrorism in the European Union

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the European Convention on Human Rights, particularly Articles 3, 5, 6 and 8,
- having regard to the European Convention on Extradition of 13 September 1957, the European Convention on Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters of 20 April 1959 and the European Convention for the Suppression of Terrorism of 27 January 1977,

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- having regard to its resolution of 18 April 1985 on measures to combat terrorism ⁽¹⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 11 July 1985 on air traffic safety and international terrorism ⁽²⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 11 September 1986 on terrorism ⁽³⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 10 March 1988 on terrorist attacks on civil aviation ⁽⁴⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 26 May 1989 on problems relating to combating terrorism ⁽⁵⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 13 June 1991 on murders committed by terrorists in the Community ⁽⁶⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 10 March 1994 on terrorism and its effects on security in the Community ⁽⁷⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 4 July 1996 on the communication from the Commission to the Council and the European Parliament on the illicit traffic in radioactive substances and nuclear materials ⁽⁸⁾,
- having regard to the public hearing on combating terrorism held by the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs on 21 February 1996,
- having regard to Title VI of the Treaty on European Union, particularly Article K.1(7) and (9) and Article K.3(2),
- having regard to Article 2(1) and (2) of the Convention based on Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union on the establishment of a European Police Office (Europol Convention) ⁽⁹⁾,
- having regard to Council Regulation (EC) No 3381/94 of 19 December 1994 setting up a Community regime for the control of exports of dual-use goods ⁽¹⁰⁾ and Council Decision 94/942/CFSP of 19 December 1994 on the joint action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article J.3 of the Treaty on European Union concerning the control of exports of dual-use goods ⁽¹¹⁾,
- having regard to the Council Act of 10 March 1995 drawing up the Convention on simplified extradition procedure between the Member States of the European Union ⁽¹²⁾,
- having regard to the Council Act of 27 September 1996 elaborating the Convention on extradition between the Member States of the European Union ⁽¹³⁾,
- having regard to the declaration on terrorism issued by the Ministers of Home Affairs and Justice at the informal Council on 14 October 1995,
- having regard to the 25 measures against terrorism recommended by the Conference of the Seven Leading Industrialized Nations (G-7) and Russia on 30 July 1996 in Paris,
- having regard to the conclusions of the European Council in Dublin on 13 and 14 December 1996 on the fight against terrorism,
- having regard to Petition No 447/95 by Mr Jim Swire (British), on behalf of UK Families Flight 103, bearing 10 250 signatures, on the destruction of PAN-AM flight 103 over Lockerbie in 1988,
- having regard to Rule 148 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs (A4-0368/96),

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 122, 20.5.1985, p. 109.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 229, 9.9.1985, p. 89.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 255, 13.10.1986, p. 135.

⁽⁴⁾ OJ C 94, 11.4.1988, p. 117.

⁽⁵⁾ OJ C 158, 26.6.1989, p. 394.

⁽⁶⁾ OJ C 183, 15.7.1991, p. 278.

⁽⁷⁾ OJ C 91, 28.3.1994, p. 236.

⁽⁸⁾ OJ C 211, 22.7.1996, p. 15.

⁽⁹⁾ OJ C 316, 27.11.1995, p. 1.

⁽¹⁰⁾ OJ L 367, 31.12.1994, p. 1, amended by Regulation (EC) No 837/95, OJ L 90, 21.4.1995, p. 1.

⁽¹¹⁾ OJ L 367, 31.12.1994, p. 8. Decision amended by Decision 95/127/CFSP (OJ L 90, 21.4.1995, p. 2), Decision 95/128/CFSP (OJ L 90, 21.4.1995, p. 3), Decision 96/173/CFSP (OJ L 52, 1.3.1996, p. 1) and Decision 96/423/CFSP (OJ L 176, 13.7.1996, p. 1).

⁽¹²⁾ OJ C 78, 30.3.1995, p. 1.

⁽¹³⁾ OJ C 313, 23.10.1996, p. 11.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- A. whereas in the European Union terrorism should be regarded as a crime intended to alter political, economic and social structures in states where the rule of law prevails by means of the threat or use of force and is thus distinct from resistance campaigns in third countries, the latter being directed against state structures which are themselves of a terrorist character,
- B. whereas acts of terrorism violate numerous fundamental rights of the individual, particularly the right to life, the right to physical integrity and the right to personal freedom, and whereas moreover they are liable to threaten peace in a given region and democratic institutions and their functioning and to undermine aspects of the rule of law and the fundamental principles on which the constitutional traditions and legislation of western democracies are based,
- C. whereas for the purposes of this resolution it is desirable to define as terrorism any act committed by individuals or groups, involving the use or threat of violence, against a country, its institutions or people in general or specific individuals, which is intended to create a state of terror among official agencies, certain individuals or groups in society or the general public, the motives lying in separatism, extremist ideology, religious fanaticism or subjective irrational factors,
- D. whereas, with the continuing and rapid development of information technologies, electronic storage, retrieval, analysis and transmission of information capabilities, new forms of terrorist activity are constantly emerging which — as for example in the case of 'computer terrorism' — can consist in destroying or damaging database or telecommunications systems such as those used by government, civilians, police, banks, business, transport and the scientific, military or private sectors or operating them by means of techniques and methods which may be defined as computer crime, such as hacking or introducing computer viruses or Trojan horses with the aim of destabilizing a state or bringing pressure to bear on public agencies,
- E. whereas some Member States of the European Union are currently confronted by acts of terrorism — in many cases organized and supported across borders — and whereas the other Member States have no guarantee that such acts will not occur in their territory,
- F. whereas the European Union therefore has a duty to adopt a series of consistent measures to combat terrorism in the European Union going beyond ad hoc proposals, which, in addition to improving the clear-up rate and prosecution, should do more to prevent terrorism,
- G. whereas, in the interests of the efficiency of measures to combat terrorism, the competence of Europol should without delay be extended, as provided for by Article 2 of the Europol Convention, to crimes committed or likely to be committed in the course of terrorist activities against life, limb, personal freedom or property, taking particular account of the European Parliament's resolution of 14 March 1996 on Europol ⁽¹⁾,
- H. whereas within the European Union — because of the democratic and constitutional structure of decision-making in its Member States — acts of terrorism cannot remotely be justified by any ideology or other motives, so that, even where they are clearly politically motivated, they must be classified as purely criminal acts and their perpetrators prosecuted in compliance with the European Convention on Human Rights as interpreted by the Strasbourg human rights courts,
- I. whereas therefore — even in the event of maximum provocation by attacks which display disregard or contempt for human life — measures against terrorism should never be based on emergency legislation or emergency procedures, as there is a danger that such exceptional counter-strategies may attribute major importance to acts of terrorism — entirely in accordance with the objectives of terrorists — and hence disproportionately enhance their value,
- J. whereas — contrary to earlier fears — the dismantling of controls at the internal borders has not increased the danger of acts of terrorism, because, as all the experts heard by the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs on 21 February 1996 agreed, the traditional internal border controls virtually never resulted in the arrest of members of terrorist groups,

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 96, 1.4.1996, p. 288.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- K. whereas some acts of terrorism are planned and carried out by internationally organized groups, which are either explicitly or tacitly tolerated by many states and in some cases even receive financial or other support from them,
- L. whereas effective diplomatic, political and economic sanctions and deterrent measures should be adopted against states which support terrorist acts or groups either openly or covertly,

General aspects

1. Reiterates firmly its rejection and condemnation of all acts of terrorism, the principal effect of which is to cause indescribable suffering to the victims and those around them by destroying their personal hopes and expectations and the material basis of their livelihood, injuring and maiming them, inflicting psychological torture and causing death;
2. Rejects in general all use or threats of force by individuals or groups as a means of pursuing separatist or ideological objectives or motivated by religious fanaticism or irrational and incomprehensible factors within the European Union as a serious violation of the fundamental freedoms of its citizens which nothing can justify;
3. Calls on the media, when reporting on acts of terrorism, to be aware of their responsibility to society and of attempts to exploit them for the objectives of the culprits; with this in mind, calls on media self-regulation bodies to work out professional ethical principles and adopt effective measures to ensure adherence to them;
4. Expresses its sincere condolences to the next of kin of those who have been killed by acts of terrorism, and its deepest sympathy with people injured by such acts and their families;
5. Observes that effective material assistance and psychological counselling for the victims of acts of terrorism and their families are essential;

Preventive measures

6. Calls on the Member States to adopt standard measures to investigate and avert acts of terrorism, including:
 - airport surveillance and airline security;
 - better systems for detecting explosives and dangerous substances in hand luggage, hold luggage and general cargo as well as further development of methods of detecting and tracing other hazardous substances such as poisons, biological agents and man-made chemical compounds;
 - efficient, coordinated computer systems to facilitate the surveillance and detection of individuals wanted by the authorities on suspicion of belonging to a terrorist organization in the European Union;
 - protection of organizations likely to be the target of terrorist attacks;
 - prevention of the misuse of data and telecommunications networks for terrorist purposes (e.g. placing of bomb-making instructions on the Internet);
 - protection of data and telecommunications networks from sabotage by terrorist organizations;
 - monitoring of the production, storage, trade, transport, import and export of arms, explosives and weapons intended or suitable for killing, injuring or disabling a large number of people, destroying large numbers of animals or plants or destroying materials in large quantities, in which connection parliamentary control increases the transparency of the systems and thus prevents their misuse;
 - ensuring that the system for monitoring goods which can serve both civil and military purposes (as referred to in Council Regulation (EC) No 3381/94 of 19 December 1994 setting up a Community regime for the control of exports of dual-use goods and the joint action pertaining to it, as most recently amended at any time) operates more effectively;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- prohibiting the development, manufacture, storage, trade, transport, import and export of biological and chemical weapons and radioactive substances;
 - the strictest possible compliance with the international obligations arising from the Non-Proliferation Treaty;
7. Recommends that the Member States improve the training and further training of explosives and bomb disposal experts and nuclear, biological and chemical weapons experts;
8. Considers it necessary to promote democratic dialogue in order to help find political solutions to political, ethnic/national, social and ecological conflicts and to ensure that these conflicts are not used to excuse acts of terrorism and cannot meet with a certain condonation on the part of sections of the public;
9. Recommends that the Member States pursue a deliberate policy of integration, to combat social, economic and cultural exclusion, as a means of preventing terrorism;
10. Calls on the Member States to adopt effective measures to prevent the emergence or persistence of circles of active terrorist sympathizers; these include in particular prevention of active participation in acts of terrorism, preventing intellectual, logistic and material — particularly financial — assistance with acts of terrorism and prohibiting any action which facilitates terrorism or safeguards terrorists against prosecution or the execution of sentences (e.g. hiding them from the investigating authorities, providing hide-outs, etc.);
11. Calls on the Commission, Council and Member States to adopt effective diplomatic, political and economic sanctions and deterrent measures against states which, either openly or covertly, support acts of terrorism or terrorist groups;

Investigation and prosecution

12. Calls on the Member States to ratify the Europol Convention as soon as possible and on the Council to adopt a decision as provided for by Article 2(2) of the Europol Convention to vest in Europol the competence to prevent and combat terrorism as soon as possible, and at all events before the expiry of the period referred to in that paragraph ('within two years at the latest following the entry into force of this Convention') and adopt appropriate measures to improve the effectiveness of the competent authorities of the Member States and their cooperation in combating terrorism, in which connection the demands made by Parliament in its aforementioned resolution of 14 March 1996 on Europol must be taken into account;
13. Calls on the Commission, Council and Member States to put before parliaments provisions laying down technical conditions which can significantly ease investigations into acts of terrorism; these could include, on condition that the fundamental rights of persons who are uninvolved are strictly respected, and subject to parliamentary and judicial control:
- optical and acoustic surveillance of persons, in which connection in particular manufacturers of mobile telephones must be required to render surveillance technically possible,
 - computer-aided scanning of multiple databases,
 - certain precautions to improve the identification of cars used in causing explosions,
 - marking of explosives so that their origin can be determined after an explosion;
14. Calls on the Member States:
- to classify acts of terrorism as serious, extraditable crimes in their respective criminal laws,
 - where an act of terrorism is committed, to prosecute everyone involved in its organization, preparation or commission,
 - to define an apology for terrorism, under their legislation, as a criminal offence,
 - to cooperate actively within the framework of the new European Convention on Extradition, but with due regard for the responsibility of each Member State for the legal certainty enjoyed by its residents;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

Police and judicial cooperation

15. Calls on the Member States:

- to step up police cooperation in combating terrorism, while strongly reinforcing democratic and judicial control and, in so doing, to adopt a course which guarantees maximum participation by the European Parliament,
- to make it possible to exchange information even if there is no specific link with criminal proceedings (e.g. on suspect persons and organizations, documents which may possibly be forged, weapons used or collected, technologies favoured, any new threats, etc.), in which connection the right of self-determination of citizens of the EU in respect of information absolutely must be guaranteed as called for in Parliament's aforementioned resolution of 14 March 1996 on Europol,
- to promote direct exchanges of opinions and experience between the officers of the individual Member States responsible for combating terrorism (e.g. by issuing a directory of departments responsible for combating terrorism, listing seminars and courses, including language courses, on offer throughout Europe),
- to encourage the departments responsible for public transport security to cooperate more (e.g. by exchanging information about air passengers and air freight);

16. Stresses the duty of all Member States to regard European and international agreements against terrorism not as solemn declarations of intent but to accord them the full force of binding legal texts which should provide a basis for consistent and coordinated action within the European Union;

17. Calls on the Member States to ratify without delay the Convention signed on 27 September 1996 on extradition between the Member States of the European Union;

18. Urges the Member States to implement rigorously the principle laid down in Article 2a of the Convention on extradition between the Member States of the European Union, signed on 27 September 1996, according to which not only perpetrators of terrorist acts but also accomplices to terrorism are liable to extradition, and to abolish the requirements of double indictment and exceptionality as conditions for judicial assistance and extradition;

19. Calls on the Council, in the longer term, to seek to harmonize throughout Europe criminal law on serious crime with a cross-border aspect; in the meantime, calls for agreements to be drafted to improve judicial cooperation in response to acts of terrorism, which should take the following points into account:

- facilitating, rendering more flexible and expediting legal assistance by making it possible for the authorities responsible to communicate with one another direct,
- the establishment of central agencies to deal with requests for legal assistance in each Member State, to which — if required — public prosecutors and judges from other Member States, acting as liaison officers, could be posted,
- establishment of the principle that, when legal assistance is provided, evidence is to be gathered in the requested state in accordance with the provisions of the requesting state — in so far as this is compatible with the principles of the requested state — so that it has full evidential force in criminal proceedings in the requesting state,
- making it possible for a national of one Member State to be prosecuted there for serious offences committed in another;

20. Calls on the Council to adopt the necessary agreements and measures to prevent any national of a Member State accused of terrorism or collaboration with an armed group within the meaning of this resolution from obtaining political asylum or refugee status in another Member State;

21. Calls on the Member States, if at all possible, to avoid entering any reservation in respect of terrorism as provided for by Article 7(2) of the convention on extradition between the Member States of the European Union (extradition of a Member State's own nationals);

Thursday, 30 January 1997

22. Calls on the Intergovernmental Conference, in connection with the expected reform of Title VI, to take account of the following points:

- asylum policy may only apply to nationals of third countries,
- there must be a specific provision which includes in the Treaty effective principles for close cooperation in the field of judicial assistance, as a crucial component in the fight against terrorism and other forms of organized crime;

23. Calls on the Intergovernmental Conference to insert two new articles K.1a and K.1b in the EU Treaty, as proposed by the Irish Presidency in its general outline for a draft revision of the treaties (pages 31, 32 and 33 of Doc CONF 2500/96 CAB);

*
* *
*

24. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission and the governments and parliaments of the Member States.

5. Progress by European Union in 1995

A4-0396/96

Resolution on the report of the European Council to the European Parliament on the progress achieved by the European Union in 1995 (pursuant to Article D of the Treaty on European Union) (C4-0409/96)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to Article D of the Treaty on European Union,
- having regard to the report of the European Council to the European Parliament on the progress achieved by the European Union in 1995 (C4-0409/96) and to the activities of the European Council in 1996,
- having regard to its resolution of 18 July 1996 on progress in implementing the common foreign and security policy (January-December 1995) ⁽¹⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 17 May 1995 on the functioning of the Treaty on European Union with a view to the 1996 Intergovernmental Conference — implementation and development of the Union ⁽²⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 14 December 1995 on the agenda for the 1996 Intergovernmental Conference with a view to the Madrid European Council ⁽³⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 14 December 1995 on the progress made in 1995 in the implementation of cooperation in the fields of justice and home affairs pursuant to Title VI of the Treaty on European Union ⁽⁴⁾,
- having regard to the final report of the Reflection Group,
- having regard to its resolution of 13 March 1996 embodying: (i) Parliament's opinion on the convening of the IGC and (ii) an evaluation of the work of the Reflection Group and definition of the political priorities of the European Parliament with a view to the Intergovernmental Conference ⁽⁵⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 27 March 1996 on the report from the European Council to the European Parliament on the progress of the European Union in 1994 (pursuant to Article D of the Treaty on European Union) ⁽⁶⁾,

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 261, 9.9.1996, p. 154.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 151, 19.6.1995, p. 56.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 17, 22.1.1996, p. 149.

⁽⁴⁾ OJ C 17, 22.1.1996, p. 179.

⁽⁵⁾ OJ C 96, 1.4.1996, p. 77.

⁽⁶⁾ OJ C 117, 22.4.1996, p. 16.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- having regard to its resolution of 19 June 1996 on the Florence European Council and the Intergovernmental Conference ⁽¹⁾,
 - having regard to the report of the Committee on Institutional Affairs (A4-0396/96),
- A. whereas the most important challenge of the Treaty has been to base the Union on the strengthening of democratic legitimacy, of which the European Parliament is the most visible expression, and of the legitimacy of states, of which the European Council is the highest expression,
 - B. whereas the dialogue between the European Council and the European Parliament pursuant to Article D of the Treaty on European Union is, therefore, a key element in the new architecture of Europe,
 - C. whereas the construction of this architecture calls for the strengthening of European citizenship and for the genuine practice of subsidiarity as between the Member States and the European institutions,
 - D. whereas the debates in plenary on the state of the Union must not be used by the European Council as a pretext for not fulfilling its formal obligations towards the European Parliament,
 - E. whereas the Treaty has so far not been working satisfactorily in the field of social policy; whereas economic recovery in Europe must take place in a context of social integration,
 - F. whereas the present climate of uncertainty arising from the difficult economic and social situation is increasing the risks of nationalism, and the sole appropriate response is to move ahead with European integration,
 - G. whereas the necessary realization of EMU seems to be reinforcing monetarist policies, and democratic management of the economy is therefore increasingly necessary,
1. Regrets deeply the failure of the European Council's report to go beyond the mere formal enumeration of the legislative and other measures adopted during the period in question; considers that the European Council is effectively not complying with the responsibility laid on it by the third paragraph of Article D of the Treaty;
 2. Recalls that the European Council's duty under the Treaty is to provide the Union with the necessary impetus for its development and to define its general political guidelines; stresses that the functions of the European Council are, therefore, different from those of the Council of the European Union;
 3. Considers that the nature of the annual report which the European Council is obliged to submit to Parliament should, therefore, be in keeping with its functions as thus defined; calls on the European Council, accordingly, in future to include in its annual report a political assessment of the progress achieved and the problems which have arisen;
 4. Calls for the report to be forwarded to Parliament by March each year, and to be accompanied by a description of the measures adopted to deal with the deficiencies pointed out by Parliament in its resolution on the previous year's report;
 5. Considers that the above areas merit special assessment given that the absence of measures required for their functioning impairs the credibility of the Union and its institutions;

Economic and monetary union

6. Welcomes the decisions reached by the European Council concerning the introduction of the single currency; considers that these decisions confirm the irreversible nature of the EMU process, in line with the convergence criteria, the timetable and the procedures laid down in the Treaty; considers that the mechanisms that will allow increased cooperation in the economic, social and fiscal fields must also be strengthened;

Employment

7. Reaffirms its conviction that an effective instrument in the common fight against unemployment would be created by including a chapter on employment in the Treaty, setting out the objectives, principles

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 198, 8.7.1996, p. 78.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

and procedures required to ensure that the Community and the Member States pay due attention to employment when applying all their policies, and creating an 'employment committee' with a similar status to that of the Monetary Committee; reiterates its conviction that more is required than simple coordination between the Member States and that the Union must be given the means to implement common policies in this field;

Internal market

8. Considers that the internal market remains a fundamental asset of the Union, and that the maximum of benefits should be obtained from it through the removal of the remaining obstacles; considers that the Council should come to a decision on the European company statute and on the legal framework for biotechnological inventions;

9. Believes that the national administrations should act to simplify life for business people by eliminating costly and bureaucratic obstacles to job creation;

10. Considers that liberalization must not be introduced to the detriment of the hard-won gains of our society, and that the Treaty text should include a reference to the promotion of services of general interest as an objective;

11. Deplores the questioning of the Union's established and necessary status as a community in law, and the paralysis of the work of the institutions which became a governmental method during the BSE crisis;

Action to combat fraud and protect the Community's financial interests

12. Considers that the effectiveness of action to combat the fraudulent use of Community funds requires that the Treaty should include rules enabling the Union to adopt, by democratic process, the necessary sanctions or other measures;

Transparency

13. Considers that the transparency of the decision-making process and public access to the information it entails constitute basic democratic rights that must be explicitly enshrined in the new Treaty; calls for publication of the result of votes taken in the Council, and calls on the Council to make its meetings open to the public when acting in its legislative capacity;

Citizenship

14. Welcomes the decision adopted in application of Article 8c of the EC Treaty on the protection of Union citizens by diplomatic and consular representations, and recalls that citizenship must acquire a specific legal content and should, therefore, be more precisely defined;

15. Recalls that Article 8a EC states: 'every citizen of the Union shall have the right to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States', but that the essential accompanying measures which should have been adopted via the intergovernmental procedure provided for in Title VI of the EU Treaty are still awaited, while it was not even possible to realize the objective of free movement of persons under Article 7a EC by 1 January 1993, a matter which Parliament has accordingly brought before the Court of Justice;

16. Considers it necessary to define rules on relations with third countries, to determine the rights and duties of third-country citizens residing in the Union and encourage their integration, and to combat racism, xenophobia, intolerance and all forms of discrimination based on religion, belief or sex;

Legislative process and interinstitutional relations

17. Considers it necessary to redefine what has become an overly complex and inefficient decision-making process, via the simplification of the procedures at present existing under the Treaty, reducing them to codecision, assent and consultation;

18. Reaffirms the need to extend the scope of the codecision procedure to all legislative acts in order to guarantee democratization and simplification of the European legislative process;

19. Considers that, on the evidence of the year under review, the codecision procedure is working well and promisingly, thus demonstrating its vitality and potential; believes, however, that this procedure should be improved and simplified, without modifying its nature;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

20. Notes that the problems in respect of codecision in most cases concern the conciliation procedure, and points out that Parliament's delegation has on many occasions had to deal with a Council unwilling to engage in dialogue and bound by a very pronounced 'solidarity' whenever the interests of a Member State or the Council itself were at stake;

21. Regrets the Council's tendency to seek a consensus even where it could proceed to a qualified majority vote, since this factor substantially complicates the negotiations;

22. Deplores the fact that the Conciliation Committee is attended only irregularly by the ministers themselves, and the practice of their being represented by the permanent representatives;

External actions

23. Notes that the Union is the world's largest donor in terms of both multilateral development aid and humanitarian aid and the first to send forces for peace-keeping operations, but that its visibility remains very limited on the international scene because of its lack of powers to implement a real common foreign and security policy;

24. Considers that the Union's external identity must be strengthened; the Union should speak with a single voice on economic matters, ceasing to apply different treatment to trade in goods and trade in services;

CFSP

25. Considers 1995 to have marked a step backward in the implementation of the CFSP, especially as the Union was particularly active in the external field; deplores the fact that the common positions and joint actions were fewer in number and less substantial than in 1994;

26. Stresses the need to set up an analysis centre for evaluating risks and threats from a European perspective;

27. Deplores the failure to reach an interinstitutional agreement on the application of Article J.7 of the EU Treaty, and calls on the Council to keep Parliament regularly informed on CFSP developments and to consult Parliament beforehand on its proposed common positions and joint actions;

Justice and home affairs

28. Notes that Union action in this field is still pointing up the deficiencies of the existing system: lack of democratic control (Article K.6 of the Treaty is being systematically flouted); absence of any legal controls; and the unanimity requirement, which is an obstacle to decision-making;

29. Stresses that decisions adopted under Title VI of the Treaty directly affect citizens and must therefore in all cases be made public;

30. Regrets that the convention setting up Europol, whose adoption has been marked by a whole series of delays, should have admitted the principle of opting out of the jurisdiction of the Court of Justice;

31. Welcomes the efforts which have been made to coordinate anti-terrorist action, in the shape of the La Gomera declaration and the Convention on a simplified procedure for extradition between Member States, and considers that these efforts should be continued in the future; considers that further efforts must be made to coordinate anti-terrorist action;

Enlargement

32. Considers that enlargement is a remarkable opportunity for the political unification of Europe and the strengthening of the guiding principles of the Union, namely liberty, peace, democracy, the protection of human rights and harmonious economic and social development; stresses, however, that the IGC must give the Union the necessary means to enable it to handle enlargement; considers, in addition, that the candidate countries should be aware that the Union is more than the single market and also entails a process of political, economic and monetary unity of the Member States;

Intergovernmental Conference

33. Regrets, accordingly, the Council's decision to exclude Parliament, which is the only Community institution elected by its citizens by direct universal suffrage, from the work of the IGC, even as an observer, despite the endeavours of the Italian presidency;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

34. Deplores the lack of goodwill thus far manifested by the IGC negotiators and the repeated declarations by government figures tending to destabilize the Conference;

35. Reaffirms that there can be no enlargement without far-reaching institutional reform of the Union and categorically rejects any attempt to defer what is really at stake in the IGC until a subsequent reform;

*
* *
*

36. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the European Council, the Council, the Commission and the governments and parliaments of the Member States.

6. Cultural aspects in European Community action

A4-0410/96

Resolution on the first report of the Commission on the consideration of cultural aspects in European Community action (COM(96)0160 – C4-0249/96)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Commission report (COM(96)0160 – C4-0249/96);
- having regard to Articles 3(p), 92(3)(d) and 128 of the EC Treaty;
- having regard to its resolutions of:
 - 18 January 1979 embodying the opinion of the European Parliament on the communication from the Commission of the European Communities to the Council concerning Community action in the cultural sector ⁽¹⁾;
 - 18 November 1983 on stronger Community action in the cultural sphere ⁽²⁾;
 - 17 February 1989 on a fresh boost for Community action in the cultural sector ⁽³⁾;
 - 21 January 1993 on the Commission communication on new prospects for Community cultural action ⁽⁴⁾;
 - 10 January 1994 on Community policy in the field of culture ⁽⁵⁾;
- having regard to the positions it adopted on the revision of the Treaty on European Union, in particular its resolution of 13 March 1996 embodying (i) Parliament's opinion on the convening of the Intergovernmental Conference, and (ii) on evaluation of the work of the Reflection Group and a definition of the political priorities of the European Parliament with a view to the Intergovernmental Conference ⁽⁶⁾;
- having regard to the communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and Council of the European Union – European Community action in support of Culture (COM(94)0356),
- having regard to the report by the Committee on Culture, Youth, Education and the Media and the opinion of the Committee on External Economic Relations (A4-0410/96),

⁽¹⁾ OJ 39, 12.2.1979, p. 50.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 342, 19.12.1983, p. 127.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 69, 20.3.1989, p. 180.

⁽⁴⁾ OJ C 42, 15.2.1993, p. 173.

⁽⁵⁾ OJ C 44, 14.2.1994, p. 184.

⁽⁶⁾ OJ C 96, 1.4.1996, p. 77.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- A. whereas Article 128(4) of the EC Treaty states that 'the Community shall take cultural aspects into account in its action under other provisions of this Treaty',
- B. whereas in its communication referred to above, the Commission announced that it planned a report on the cultural dimension of Community policy,
- C. whereas the Commission also announced that internal measures would be taken to enable account to be taken of cultural requirements in drafting and implementing Community policies with implications in the field of culture,
- D. whereas the Commission's first report on the consideration of cultural aspects in European Community action does not cover the cultural actions undertaken by the Community on the basis of Article 128 and notably the Kaleidoscope programme which entered into force in March 1996 and the Ariane and Raphael programmes currently being considered by the European Parliament and the Council,
- E. whereas the Commission's report seeks to answer the following four questions:
- '— Which Community texts and policies have taken and take cultural matters into account, which ones have had and may have an impact in cultural areas, and which have acquired a cultural dimension?
 - '— In texts or policies of the above type, how have the objectives pursued and objectives of a cultural nature been reconciled? To what extent have cultural aspects been taken into account?
 - '— Have the guidelines implemented and decisions taken at Community level consolidated, adversely affected or weakened cultural policy guidelines and decisions implemented and taken at regional or national level?
 - '— What forthcoming deadlines are there which particularly require 'cultural aspects' to be taken into account?'
- F. whereas, after surveying the development of Community law, internal policies, audiovisual policies and the Community's external policies, the Commission briefly considers ways and means of addressing the new tasks entrusted to the Community by the Treaty and proposes a general method for taking into account cultural aspects in drawing up acts and in charting out and pursuing policies which may have an impact on the cultural domain,
- G. whereas, although this first Commission report does not represent a comprehensive survey of cultural aspects in actions undertaken by the European Community, it nevertheless allows an assessment of the cultural dimension in the various sectors in which the Union has the right to intervene, the shortcomings of Community action and the obstacles encountered in progress towards satisfactorily implementing Article 128(4) of the EC Treaty and a comparative study of Community acts dealing with cultural matters,
- H. whereas the conclusions reached by the Commission merely note that the legislative acts and the case law of the Court of Justice have attempted to reconcile the attainment of the objectives of the Treaty and the specific aims of cultural policies, and that the great majority of policies and actions undertaken by the Community have a cultural dimension — but without acting on these two findings by proposing specific solutions; and whereas these conclusions merely reiterate the principles of compatibility of acts of secondary legislation and the coherence of internal policies with the objectives of cultural policy within the meaning of Article 128 of the Treaty,
- I. whereas the principle of subsidiarity must be interpreted as an appropriate guarantee of respect for priority action in the cultural sphere of States and regions, but must not impede Union action within the framework of Article 128,
- J. whereas there are symbols of the European cultural identity which are expressed in different ways according to the characteristics of the individual peoples and which are based on the Graeco-Roman/Judaean-Christian tradition, which upholds the principles of democracy, the rule of law, the value of the individual, freedoms and solidarity,
- K. having regard to the European Union's self-appointed task of strengthening the solidarity of the people of Europe while respecting their historical identity, their linguistic diversity, their cultural identity — both regional and national — and their dignity and freedom,

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- L. having regard to the need to maintain humanist values, the teaching of the humanities and the languages of classical antiquity as a basis of European culture in a world threatened by technology and pragmatism,
- M. whereas Europe is and will remain plurinational, multilingual, multicultural and multi-ethnic and this represents an indispensable part of the heritage which the Union is duty-bound to preserve,
- N. whereas culture provides cohesion, brings people together, promotes human dignity and a spirit of tolerance and is a driving force behind development, for which reason it should be recognized and endorsed as such in the Treaty on European Union,
- O. whereas it is more important than ever to offer to the rest of the world cooperation based on the principles on which the European Union is founded: freedom, human rights, democracy, tolerance, respect for differences between peoples, the value of the individual, and moral and human principles,
- P. having regard to the paucity of the financial resources allocated to cultural policy, which is jeopardizing the attainment of the objectives of the European Union,
- Q. whereas it is accepted that the role of culture should be enhanced within the parameters of the Treaty on European Union,
- R. whereas it is now accepted that the citizens of Europe have an inalienable right of access to culture and to affirm and express their cultural identity;
- S. whereas culture is now an activity that has a legal basis under the Treaty; whereas it is accepted that culture forms an integral part of Community action and as such must be accorded parity of treatment with other actions under the Treaty;
- T. whereas it is accepted that culture can contribute to the objectives of the Community through enhancement of citizenship, personal and human development, greater economic and social cohesion, improvement of employment opportunities, elimination of exclusion and enrichment of the quality of life of European citizens;
1. Is convinced that the establishment of a genuine European cultural dimension will only be possible through the introduction of qualified-majority voting in decision-taking at Council level;
 2. Considers that the taking into account of cultural aspects will in future be a requirement imposed on the European Community and that compliance with this requirement involves the establishment of a clause whereby all Community acts and actions which may have a cultural impact must be compatible with cultural objectives;
 3. Considers that, unless it is to be stripped of all substance, Article 128 should constitute the legal basis or one of the legal bases of all legislation whose purpose is essentially cultural;
 4. Stresses that the safeguarding of cultural and linguistic diversity forms part of the conservation and safeguarding of cultural heritage, as provided for in Article 128;
 5. Considers, furthermore, that changes should be made to that article to enlarge its scope, in particular by including a reference to the safeguarding and protection of European languages both inside and outside Europe and by replacing the reference to 'non-commercial cultural exchanges' by the expression 'predominantly cultural objectives';
 6. Stresses that it is important for the subsidiarity principle to be interpreted in a positive sense which encourages Community intervention, provided that this is beneficial to European cultures and helps create the conditions for the full involvement of the general public and local, regional and national bodies in the creation of a strong, united Europe;
 7. Recalls the need for ever-closer relations with the Council of Europe, Unesco and specialized NGOs in the cultural sphere, while respecting the identity and autonomy of each of those organizations;
 8. Endorses the view that cultural policy is an important component of international relations and foreign policy and considers that the Community should promote cultural actions outside the European Union in order to enhance European cultural models, taking particular account of the fact that a European-based cultural heritage exists outside Europe;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

9. Calls on the Commission to submit, in future, 'integrated' cultural programmes, i.e. ones which ensure consistency between the cultural actions provided for in Article 128 of the EC Treaty and the other Community instruments provided for in the same Treaty, in particular in Articles 126 and 127 (education and training), Articles 130a to 130e (economic and social cohesion) and Article 130g (research and technology);
10. Welcomes the resolution put before the Council of Culture Ministers on 16 December 1996 which set the Council the task of establishing effective and coherent procedures by which the impact of other Community policies in the field of culture can be monitored and adjusted as necessary;
11. Calls on the Commission to develop appropriate procedures for assessing, when embarking on drawing up policies under other provisions of the Treaty, what proposals are likely to have an impact on culture and to identify these in its annual work programme;
12. Emphasizes the need to ensure greater coordination in the Commission between all sectors of Community action — and especially between the funds granted to the cultural sphere — while maintaining the present system of differentiated interventions which make it possible to guarantee the multiplication of resources and the integration of the cultural dimension in the Community's internal policies;
13. Reiterates its conviction of the need to increase the overall funding allocated to the cultural sector or having a cultural impact, without integrating it in a single specific fund for Community cultural policy;
14. Recalls Article 10 of the ERDF Regulation, but emphasizes the very limited financial impact of this article and the need to ensure in practical terms that cultural aspects are taken into account in implementing the ERDF as a whole;
15. Calls on the Commission to put cultural policy at the heart of EU Structural Funds in order to strengthen the creative economy which can assist in job creation and economic and social regeneration;
16. Draws attention to the fact that a considerable proportion of Community action in the cultural field could be undertaken according to the principle of conditionality, and that activities undertaken in accordance with that principle should supplement those effected through direct action;
17. Is concerned that certain major infrastructure projects whose implementation still requires specific decisions by the Council of the Union may undermine the principle of compatibility of European action with the cultural dimension, and calls on the Commission to guarantee that this principle is respected; considers that compensatory measures might be granted in certain cases;
18. Calls on the Commission to introduce a law to ensure that in tenders for any public construction project (road infrastructure, other installations, etc.) which is cofinanced by the European Union, 0,5 or 1% of the budget provided from European funds is allocated to the production of a work of art (painting, sculpture or one of the other fine arts) to adorn the construction project in question;
19. Recognizes that it is important to enhance the European dimension of education, TV and film in order for EU citizens to have a better understanding of the diverse cultures of the EU;
20. Recalls the role of NGOs and civil society in the development of Europe's cultural dimension and calls on the Commission to establish with these organizations a genuine and constructive cultural dialogue, and declares its readiness to contribute to this dialogue by studying the possibility of creating, under the aegis of the European Parliament, an ad hoc structure to give it proper substance;
21. Calls on the Commission to continue support for cultural networks which are vital to achieve involvement of all cultural organizations of the creative community in the formulation and implementation of EU cultural policies, a key part of achieving real European citizenship;
22. Calls on the Commission to encourage European cooperation by establishing a constructive dialogue and a system of cooperation between European cultural foundations; stresses the importance of the role of academies and universities in achieving the European cultural dimension; welcomes the positive results of the Commission's intervention within the framework of the 'Jean Monnet' scheme and draws attention to the advisability of setting up other chairs named after the Europe's founding fathers, such as Schuman, Spaak, De Gasperi, Adenauer, Madariaga and Spinelli; reiterates its call that the European University Institute should be converted into a fully fledged Union establishment;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

23. Calls on the Commission, with these objectives again in mind, to turn its attention to the pre-university stages of education within the European Union and to draw up a school textbook on the history of Europe (art, thought, science, politics etc.) which, following approval by the Council, would be recommended for study in all the Member States;
24. Calls on the Commission to develop a cultural policy with the prime aim of eradicating illiteracy and promulgating books, with measures being promoted to use the zero rate of VAT and apply fixed prices for books within homogeneous language areas;
25. Calls on the Council of Education Ministers to fulfil its commitment in individual Member States under the 1988 Resolution adopted by the Council on the European dimension in education;
26. Calls on the Commission to report annually to Parliament on the way in which it has taken cultural aspects into account in Community actions undertaken under other provisions of the Treaty;
27. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission, the Council, the Economic and Social Committee, the Committee of the Regions, the governments of the Member States, the Council of Europe and Unesco.

7. Pricing and transport costs

A4-0012/97

Resolution on the Commission Green Paper 'Towards fair and efficient pricing in transport – policy options for internalizing the external costs of transport in the European Union' (COM(95)0691 – C4-0610/95)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Commission Green Paper (COM(95)0691 – C4-0610/95),
- having regard to the Commission Green Paper on 'sustainable mobility' (COM(92)0046), the Commission White Paper on the future development of the common transport policy (COM(92)0494), Parliament's resolutions of 18 September 1992 on transport matters ⁽¹⁾ and 18 January 1994 on the future development of the common transport policy ⁽²⁾ and the conclusions of the Council of Transport Ministers on this subject,
- having regard to its resolution of 6 June 1996 ⁽³⁾ on the communication from the Commission to the Council, the European Parliament, the Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions on the common transport policy action programme 1995-2000,
- having regard to the Commission communication on a future strategy for the control of atmospheric emissions from road transport taking into account the results from the Auto/Oil Programme (COM(96)0248) and the European Programme on Emissions, Fuels and Engine Technologies (EPEFE) and having regard to the Eurostat report 'Road transport and the environment – energy and tax aspects', which reveals the link between lower energy prices in the European Union and rising average energy consumption per capita in the transport sector,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Transport and Tourism and the opinions of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection and the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy (A4-0012/97),

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 284, 2.11.1992, p. 164-179.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 44, 14.2.1994, p. 53.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 181, 24.6.1996, p. 21.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- A. whereas the safeguarding of sustainable mobility is the guiding principle of European transport policy,
 - B. whereas European transport policy and improved traffic management, particularly through the use of telematics, must satisfy the mobility requirements of individuals and businesses,
 - C. whereas efficient and cost-effective transport networks form the basis for the internal market, freedom of movement and the free movement of goods, the integration and development of the entire European continent and its economic recovery and improvements in the employment situation,
 - D. whereas demand for transport has risen virtually in line with GDP and whereas transport services employ about 7 million people and account for about 4% of GDP,
 - E. whereas the aim of the ideas set out in the Green Paper is not to increase the Member States' and EU's revenue but rather to enable EU citizens and enterprises to obtain tax relief where they opt for sustained mobility and improved transport logistics,
 - F. whereas resource-conserving traffic management, rewarded by the general conditions attached to the internalization of external costs, is to help strengthen the competitive position of European undertakings worldwide in the future and so improve the EU economy in the long term,
1. Welcomes the Green Paper as a step towards preserving and developing sustainable mobility and as a first approach to dealing with the problem of internalizing the external costs of transport;
 2. Points out that it must be viewed in conjunction with other transport policy measures, in particular the various Directives, the development of the citizens' network, trans-European networks and the application of telematics;
 3. Stresses that a coherent transport policy must apply the same costing principles to all modes of transport (road, inland waterway, rail and air) and points out to the Commission that particular account should be taken of the direct relations between the different modes of transport, and suggests therefore that a more comprehensive approach covering all transport modes be taken;
 4. Reminds the Commission that combined transport in particular must be a competitive option in the integrated approach to road and rail transport and inland waterway and coastal shipping and calls on the Commission to take account of this in the charging of costs;
 5. Points out that a balanced transport policy must create equal conditions of competition for all modes of transport, so that each of them bears the external costs to which they give rise; the Green Paper lacks, for example, a concept for charging full infrastructure costs for rail, inland waterway and air transport;
 6. Recognizes that congestion, accident, environmental and noise-related costs have been inadequately recorded and passed back to those responsible; yet no account has been taken of the fact that some of the costs mentioned have already been borne by road-users in the past;
 7. Stresses that the purpose of quantifying external costs must not be to make transport 'more expensive', but only to ensure the efficient apportionment of existing costs, which the higher revenue must be used to offset;
 8. Emphasizes that the proposed measures are in no way intended to banish the transport of goods from the roads, since the HGV is essential for the distribution of goods over land; the transport of goods by road is and remains a necessary component of all economic activity, although it too must be assessed in accordance with the polluter-pays principle;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

9. Considers that, with a few exceptions, the principles and methods developed by the Commission are basically suitable for internalizing external costs and so correcting the distortions in the transport sector and for ensuring the more rational and efficient use of infrastructure and modes of transport;
10. Takes the view that external costs must be apportioned among all modes of transport at the same time so that fresh distortions of competition may be avoided and calls on the Commission to develop a flexible basis for calculation which enables advances in environmental compatibility to be reflected in the apportionment of external costs as a reduction in costs;
11. Considers the idea of electronic road-pricing also to be a suitable method in principle for apportioning road transport costs to users;
12. Considers that appropriate rules must be drawn up to ensure data protection;
13. Does not, however, underestimate the difficulties associated with introducing and operating such a system and therefore views it only as a medium-term option for internalizing costs;
14. Takes the view, therefore, that in the short term transport policy measures must be taken which, on the basis of the Green Paper, result in a fairer distribution of transport costs and the harmonization of conditions of competition for all modes of transport, but that it must also be ensured that they are acceptable to users and do not lead to distortions at social level; the public and the business community must be able to rely on a predictable framework;
15. Considers it necessary, as a first step, to harmonize the current transport policy instruments (motor vehicle taxes, mineral oil duties, infrastructure charges, registration fees and tolls) throughout Europe with due regard for the specific situation in each country, so that they can subsequently be completely replaced by road-pricing systems;
16. Calls on the Commission and the Member States, therefore, until such time as telematic methods of charging have been introduced throughout the EU, to harmonize rates of mineral oil duty and motor vehicle tax in the Community;
17. Calls on the Commission to include CO₂ emissions and their global impact on the environment in the deliberations on and measures relating to the internalization of external costs;
18. Calls on the Commission and the Member States, when harmonizing rates of motor vehicle tax, to take account of the materials from which the vehicle is made, fuel consumption, potential emissions, noise levels, damage to the roads and vehicle safety as important criteria in the calculation of the tax rate;
19. Calls on the Member States to increase checks on the emission of harmful substances, noise and vehicle safety and on work and rest periods;
20. Supports the idea of stricter vehicle inspection and maintenance requirements and the introduction of producer responsibility for the long-term performance of engines and exhaust systems;
21. Believes that scrappage programmes would promote earlier disposal of the most polluting vehicles;
22. Calls on the Member States, when Directive 93/89/EEC on the application by Member States of taxes on certain vehicles used for the carriage of goods by road and tolls and charges for the use of certain infrastructures (OJ L 279, 12.11.1993, p. 32) is amended, to take account of the differences in infrastructure charges to HGVs and passenger cars and to accept differentiation of road charges for HGVs as a function of the damage they do to the roads and the atmospheric emissions they produce;
23. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to draw up special arrangements for corridors in which the environment is particularly badly degraded and further proposes that Directive 93/89/EEC be amended so as to permit higher charges for the financing of alternative solutions; the corridors in which the environment is particularly badly degraded will be designated by Community law;
24. Calls on the Commission, with regard to the internalization of accident costs, to examine the costing methods it advocates and proposes that insurance premiums should be differentiated to a greater extent in order to reflect the specific risks;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

25. Calls on the Commission to close at the earliest opportunity and as far as possible the gaps which exist in relation to both data and the method of internalization and to refine and consolidate the system, taking account of the success achieved by the various modes of transport in the further development of sustainable mobility through advances in technology, organization and infrastructure;
26. Calls on the Commission to draw up a comprehensive study showing unequivocally the external costs caused by individual modes of transport as a reliable basis on which to draw conclusions in the forthcoming White Paper;
27. Calls on the Commission to draw up guidelines for applying the rules of competition which would allow a road-pricing system to be introduced;
28. Points out that the internalization of external costs is a very important step for the European Union's legislation, but that in the overall context there is also a need to bring the Central and Eastern European countries progressively closer; believes that the association agreements, the accession negotiations now beginning and the Pan-European Transport Conferences represent a potential forum;
29. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission, the Council, the Economic and Social Committee and the governments and parliaments of the Member States.

8. Statistics on research, development and innovation

A4-0383/96

Resolution on an interim Commission report according to Article 8 of Council Decision 94/78/EC, Euratom establishing a multiannual programme for the development of Community statistics on research, development and innovation (COM(96)0042 – C4-0247/96)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the interim Commission report (COM(96)0042 – C4-0247/96),
 - having regard to its resolutions of 14 March 1996 on the Commission communication on Biotechnology and the White Paper on Growth, Competitiveness and Employment: Preparing the next stage ⁽¹⁾ and of 6 June 1996 on the Green Paper on innovation ⁽²⁾,
 - having regard to its opinion of 12 March 1993 on the proposal for a Council Decision establishing a multiannual programme for the development of Community statistics on research, development and innovation ⁽³⁾,
 - having regard to its opinion of 25 May 1993 on the proposal for a Council Decision on the framework programme for priority actions in the field of statistical information (1993 – 1997) ⁽⁴⁾,
 - having regard to the report of the Committee on Research, Technological Development and Energy (A4-0383/96),
- A. whereas a European statistical system for research, technological development and innovation represents a basic tool for the definition and orientation of Community R&D policy, the achievement of complementarity and coordination with scientific and technological activities in the Member States and in other international organizations, as well as contributing to improving the potential of European science,

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 96, 1.4.1996, p. 277.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 181, 24.6.1996, p. 35.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 115, 26.4.1993, p. 213.

⁽⁴⁾ OJ C 176, 28.6.1993, p. 37.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- B. whereas an important aspect of statistical information is the analysis of public opinion and public trends and attitudes concerning decisions or implementing measures in respect of Community policies in the field of science; whereas the conclusions reached on the basis of questionnaires and surveys — and not only on the basis of specific parameters and objectives — can contribute to improved adaptation of the policy for science and technology already or still to be defined in the context of the Community framework programmes in the areas of research, technological development, demonstration and teaching, the administration of the Structural Funds, the encouragement of technological innovation and the coordination of national policies,
- C. whereas members of the public can become clients of the statistical service when acting as economic agents (whether workers, managers or investors) who wish to acquire information on the existing state of science and technology and the relevant social and economic implications,
- D. whereas encouragement must be given to the dissemination and interpretation of Community statistics on science and technology, firstly by applying standardized indices and indicators in the Member States, and secondly by processing and disseminating the information obtained in the most comprehensible form which can be achieved without affecting quality, and ensuring rapid and easy access for industrial, economic, scientific and social agents, especially SMUs,
1. Welcomes the fact that the Commission's interim report is sufficiently detailed to explain the actions carried out so far under the multiannual programme for the development of Community statistics on research, development and innovation, and to include comments on future prospects which are both interesting and necessary, together with praiseworthy attempts to harmonize national statistics and surveys, while not refraining from some degree of self-criticism;
 2. Recalls the continuing validity of its abovementioned opinion of 12 March 1993, in which it:
 - called on the Commission to establish monitoring arrangements with a view to evaluating the impact of the Community's science and technology programmes in such a way as to supply detailed quantitative indicators covering, for instance, commercial and social repercussions, evolution of market share, global cost-benefit analyses, coverage in technical and trade publications, etc, taking the view that this proposal should remain valid under the framework programme for priority actions in the field of statistical information for 1993-1997;
 - proposed the collection, analysis and publication of international comparisons of global registers concerning the number, types and profile of researchers who are still university students;
 - favoured the collection of information on the number of graduating students finding employment in technological professions and their levels of qualification, on individual Member State spending on educational material in the R&D field and on companies' training expenditure;
 - called for the publication of data on Community R&D measures (and the contribution to basic research) in the field of science and technology, including, for example, the commercialization index of Community-funded projects (patents, publications, etc), especially those financed under the framework programmes, and, if possible, comparative figures for third countries;
 - considered that regular statistics should be published on the number and types of participations in the specific programmes (e.g. SMUs, universities and private research institutes) distinguishing, where possible, between basic and applied research);
 3. Supports the Commission's proposal concerning a legal basis for regular Union-wide surveys in the field of science, technology and innovation, which would provide a permanent foundation for data harmonization and comparability, survey procedures and nomenclature in this field as between Member States; considers that this would help the internal market function properly and may be justified in terms of the requirements of the development of competition policy as set out in Title XIII of the Treaty;
 4. Calls on the Commission, in the context of the moves to establish a Community statistical information system, to make all efforts to create a database and bibliometric indicator listing science and technology essays and articles of specifically European impact, possibly by amplifying the European report on science and technology indicators which appeared in 1994;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

5. Notes the need for specific reference to other types of indicator reflecting organizational changes and other forms of expenditure classified as non-material or intangible assets, which are increasingly perceived as key factors for the competitiveness of companies and industries, and include, among other types of spending, investment in technology;
6. Stresses the informational value of European innovation indicators defined on the basis of size in relation to number of patents, the visible and invisible trade balance in technology and the evolution of the factors of production, as pointed out in the Commission report;
7. Stresses the importance of using indicators with a territorial, sectoral, institutional or other basis, to facilitate the understanding of the values concerned;
8. Calls on the Commission, accordingly, to develop a new method suited to the collection of data of this type — a task which will certainly prove difficult if the relevant headings are not included in companies' accounts — and, ultimately, to collect the data concerned;
9. Calls on the Commission, in its analysis and monitoring of the request for statistical information, possibly in the context of the mandate for pilot surveys referred to in Council Decision 94/78/EC, Euratom⁽¹⁾, to include sources for data concerning public attitudes and awareness in relation to Community-level research and technological development activities;
10. Considers it essential to remove the existing methodological differences between Member States in the preparation of science and technology statistics, and to continue the endeavours towards achieving harmonization and comparability of data in respect of countries belonging to the OECD, Unesco, EEA, the Nordic group, Central and Eastern Europe and the CIS; proposes that, in the wake of the impetus given by the Barcelona conference of November 1995 to the renewal of relations between countries on either side of the Mediterranean, contacts should be made for this purpose with third countries in the Euro-Mediterranean area where the activities concerned are not covered by the relevant bilateral association agreements;
11. Calls on the Commission to analyse and evaluate Parliament's request in this field, in both the short and the medium term, utilizing the facilities for the evaluation of scientific and technological options provided by the STOA unit and the assistance mandate received by the JRC's Institute for Prospective Technological Studies;
12. Welcomes the timely publication in 1995 of the 'Canberra Manual', drawn up jointly by the OECD and Eurostat, which offers a method for the collection and analysis of data concerning human resources dedicated to science and technology, as well as the 'methodological manual on the regional dimension of R&D and innovation statistics'; suggests that these should be brought into use immediately, with the employment of techniques and registers for the automatic exchange of data between public administrations, utilizing the framework offered by the IDA scheme;
13. Calls on the Commission systematically to include Parliament in the interlinking of data networks referred to in the programme;
14. Calls on the Commission to compensate for the lack of a sufficient volume of data for users in the area of science and technology statistics for specific programmes and for the framework programmes for research, technological development, demonstration and teaching;
15. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission and Council.

⁽¹⁾ OJ L 38, 9.2.1994, p. 34.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

9. Thirteenth annual report on monitoring the application of Community law

A4-0001/97

Resolution on the Commission's 13th Annual Report to Parliament on monitoring the application of Community law – 1995 (COM(96)0600 – C4-0363/96)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Commission's Thirteenth Annual Report (COM(96)0600 – C4-0363/96) ⁽¹⁾,
- having regard to Declaration 19 on the implementation of Community law, annexed to the Final Act of the Treaty on European Union,
- having regard to the Council resolution of 7 December 1992 on making the single market work ⁽²⁾,
- having regard to the Council resolution of 8 June 1993 on the quality of drafting of Community legislation ⁽³⁾,
- having regard to the Commission communication to the Council and Parliament of 16 February 1994 on the development of administrative cooperation in the implementation and enforcement of Community legislation in the internal market (COM(94)0029 – C3-0108/94),
- having regard to the Council resolution of 16 June 1994 on the development of administrative cooperation in the implementation and enforcement of Community legislation in the internal market ⁽⁴⁾,
- having regard to the Commission report of 29 January 1996 to the Council and the European Parliament on cooperation between administrations for enforcement of internal market law – a progress report (COM(96)0020),
- having regard to the Council resolution of 20 June 1994 on the electronic dissemination of Community law and national implementing laws and on improved access conditions ⁽⁵⁾,
- having regard to the Interinstitutional Agreement of 20 December 1994 on an accelerated working method simplifying decision-making procedures with regard to legislative codification ⁽⁶⁾,
- having regard to certain proposals in the report by the Molitor Group on legislative and administrative simplification, submitted to the European Council in Cannes in June 1995,
- having regard to its resolution of 4 July 1996 on the report of the group of independent experts on simplification of Community legislation and administrative provisions ('Deregulation') ⁽⁷⁾,
- having regard to the Commission communication to the Council and Parliament of 3 May 1995 on the role of penalties in implementing Community internal market legislation (COM(95)0162),
- having regard to the Council resolution of 29 June 1995 on the effective uniform application of Community law and on the penalties applicable for breaches of Community law in the internal market ⁽⁸⁾,
- having regard to the case law of the Court of Justice concerning the liability of a Member State for damage caused to individuals by violations of Community law ⁽⁹⁾,

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 303, 14.10.1996.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 334, 18.12.1992, p. 1.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 166, 17.6.1993, p. 1.

⁽⁴⁾ OJ C 179, 1.7.1994, p. 1.

⁽⁵⁾ OJ C 179, 1.7.1994, p. 3.

⁽⁶⁾ OJ C 293, 8.11.1995, p. 2.

⁽⁷⁾ OJ C 211, 22.7.1996, p. 23.

⁽⁸⁾ OJ C 188, 22.7.1995, p. 1.

⁽⁹⁾ CJEC, Judgment du 19.11.1991, Case C-6/90 and C-9/90, Francovich et Bonifaci, ECR I-5357;
 CJEC, Judgment of 5.3.1996, Case C-46/93 and C-48/93, Brasserie du pêcheur et Factortame, ECR I-1029;
 CJEC, Judgment of 26.3.1996, Case C-392/93, British Telecommunications, ECR I-1631;
 CJEC, Judgment of 23.5.1996, Case C-5/94, Hedley Lomas;
 CJEC, Judgment of 8.10.1996, Case C-178/94, C-179/94, C-188/94 – C-190/94, Erich Dillenkofer;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- having regard to the case law of the Court of Justice and of the Court of First Instance concerning the Community's extra-contractual liability, in particular that of the last five years ⁽¹⁾,
- having regard to the Commission proposal for a Council Decision on a Joint Action adopted by the Council on the basis of Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union on a programme of incentives and exchanges for practitioners in the justice area (COM(96)0253 — 96/0146(CNS)),
- having regard to the report 'Better law-making' from the Commission to the European Council on the application of the subsidiarity and proportionality principles, on simplification and on consolidation (CSE(95)0580),
- having regard to its resolution of 14 October 1981 on the responsibility of the Court of Justice of the European Communities for the uniform application of Community law in the Member States ⁽²⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 9 February 1983 on the responsibility of the Member States for the application of and compliance with Community law ⁽³⁾,
- having regard to the Commission communication of 5 June 1996 on the implementation of Article 171 of the Treaty ⁽⁴⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 20 April 1994 on the Commission's 10th Annual Report on monitoring the application of Community law ⁽⁵⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 20 January 1995 on the Commission's 11th Annual Report on monitoring the application of Community law ⁽⁶⁾,
- having regard to its resolution of 13 February 1996 on the Commission's 12th Annual Report on monitoring the application of Community law ⁽⁷⁾,
- having regard to certain petitions submitted to the Committee on Petitions on faulty transposition of certain Community Directives,
- having regard to the Commission's report of 20 February 1996 to the Council and Parliament on the single market in 1995 (COM(96)0051),

⁽¹⁾ CFI, Judgment of 18.5.95, Case T-478/93, 'Wafer Zoo', ECR II-1479
 CFI, Judgment of 6.7.95, Case T-572/93, 'Odigitria', ECR II-2025
 CFI, Judgment of 15.3.95, Case T-514/93, 'Cobrecraf', ECR II-0621
 CJEC, Judgment of 13.3.92, Case C-282/90, 'Industrie- en Handelsonderneming Vreugdenhil', ECR I-1937
 CJEC, Judgment of 8.4.92, Case C-55/90, 'James Joseph Cato', ECR I-2533
 CJEC, Judgment of 7.5.92, joined cases C-258/90 and C-259/90, 'Pesqueras de Bermeo', ECR I-2901
 CJEC, Judgment of 3.12.92, Case C-97/91, 'Oleificio Borelli', ECR I-6313
 CJEC, Judgment of 29.4.93, Case C-182/91, 'Forafrique Burkinabe', ECR I-2161
 CJEC, Judgment of 25.5.93, Case C-370/89, 'Société générale d'entreprises électro-mécaniques', ECR I-2583
 CJEC, Judgment of 15.9.94, Case C-146/91, 'Koinopraxia Enóseon Georgikon', ECR I-4199
 CFI, Judgment of 15.12.94, Case T-489/93, 'Unifruit Hellas', ECR II-1201
 CFI, Judgment of 21.2.95, Case T-472/93, 'Campo Ebro Industrial', ECR II-0421
 CFI, Judgment of 14.9.95, joined cases T-480/93 and T-483/93, 'Antillean Rice Mills NV', ECR II-2305
 CFI, Judgment of 14.9.95, Case T-571/93, 'Lefebvre frères and soeurs', ECR II-2379
 CFI, Judgment of 18.9.95, Case T-167/94, 'Dandief Nölle', ECR II-2589
 CFI, Judgment of 18.9.95, Case T-168/94, 'Blackspur DIY', ECR II-2627
 CFI, Judgment of 13.12.95, joined cases T-481/93 and T-484/93, 'Vereniging van Exporteurs in Levende Varkens', ECR II-2941
 CFI, Judgment of 21.3.96, Case T-230/94, 'Frederick Farrugia', ECR II-195
 CFI, Judgment of 16.1.96, Case T-108/94, 'Elena Candiotte', ECR II-87
 CJEC, Judgment of 18.5.93, Case C-220/91 P., 'Stahlwerke Peine-Salzgitter', ECR I-2393
 CFI, Order of 26.11.93, Case T-460/93, 'Étienne Tête', ECR II-1257
 CFI, Order of 29.11.94, joined cases T-479/93 and T-559/93, 'Giorgio Bernardi', ECR II-1115
 CFI, Judgment of 9.1.96, Case T-575/93, 'Casper Koelman', ECR II-1
 CJEC, Judgment of 2.12.92, Case C-370/89, 'Société générale d'entreprises électro-mécaniques', ECR I-6211
 CJEC, Judgment of 19.5.92, joined cases C-104/89 and C-37/90, 'J. M. Mulder et Autres', ECR I-3061
 CFI, Judgment of 16.11.94, Case T-451/93, 'San Marco Impex Italiana', ECR II-1061
 CJEC, Judgment of 17.9.96, Case C-19/95 P., 'San Marco Impex Italiana'
 CFI, Judgment of 17.10.96, Case T-336/94, 'Efisol'
 CJEC, Order of 21.6.93, Case C-257/93, 'Leon Van Parijs', ECR I-3335, which granted the application insofar as it sought reparation; that case became Case T-517/93 and was then deleted from the register.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 287, 9.11.1981, p. 47.

⁽³⁾ OJ C 68, 14.3.1983, p. 32.

⁽⁴⁾ OJ C 242, 21.8.1996, p. 6.

⁽⁵⁾ OJ C 128, 9.5.1994, p. 192.

⁽⁶⁾ OJ C 43, 20.2.1995, p. 122.

⁽⁷⁾ OJ C 65, 3.6.1996, p. 37.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- having regard to the Commission staff working paper of 31 May 1996 entitled 'CELEX (interinstitutional computerized documentation system for Community law) — 1995 Annual Management Report' (SEC(96)0955);
 - having regard to its resolution of 12 October 1995 on the transparency of Council decisions and Community legislative procedures ⁽¹⁾,
 - having regard to the Code of Conduct concerning public access to Council and Commission documents (93/730/EC) ⁽²⁾,
 - having regard to the Code of Conduct of the Council of 2 October 1995 concerning the publishing of Council minutes and statements in the minutes,
 - having regard to the report of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Citizens' Rights and the opinions of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection, the Committee on Petitions, the Committee on External Economic Relations and the Committee on Women's Rights (A4-0001/97),
- A. whereas the European Community is 'a Community based on the rule of law, inasmuch as neither its Member States nor its institutions can avoid a review of the question whether the measures adopted by them are in conformity with the basic constitutional charter, the Treaty' ⁽³⁾,
- B. whereas the annual Commission reports on monitoring the application of Community law have two main functions, i.e. establishing the state of transposition of Directives by the Member States and giving an account of the use which the Commission has made of its discretionary power to initiate infringement proceedings; whereas, in that connection, the use the Commission makes of its discretionary power is not consistent with the fundamental requirements regarding transparency, particularly at the pre-litigation stage provided for in Article 169 of the EC Treaty,
- C. whereas consideration of the annual Commission report on monitoring the application of Community law allows Parliament, at the same time, to reflect in more general terms on the nature of and the outlook for Community law and the manner in which it is applied by members of the various legal professions, the public authorities and, in particular, by national judges, who are the Community's everyday judges,
- D. whereas, when set against the total number of Directives in force, the average notification rate for transposition measures taken by the Member States as a whole is 90,7%; whereas, however, account should be taken primarily of the effective application of Directives under national legal systems,
- E. whereas the notification rates for transposition measures vary from area to area and from Member State to Member State,
- F. whereas the requirement that the Member States apply Community law implies not only that transposition should be carried out correctly, but also that Community acts should be implemented by the competent administrative authorities of each Member State in such a way that they produce the effects envisaged by the Community legal system,
- G. whereas it is essential to establish permanent dialogue at different levels between the EU authorities and national authorities in order to create a Community genuinely based on the rule of law,
- H. whereas, in its report of 29 January 1996 on cooperation between administrations for enforcement of internal market law, the Commission notes that the most frequent causes of delays in the application of Community law include:
- (a) the complex nature of the decision-making process in the Member States, which involves, at various levels, both the central administrative authorities and regional and local authorities;
 - (b) the difficulties in translating texts into the various official EU languages,
- I. whereas there is a need to improve the public image of the European integration process, not least by making Community legislation simpler, more transparent and more accessible to the public,

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 287, 30.10.1995, p. 179.

⁽²⁾ OJ L 340, 31.12.1993, p. 41.

⁽³⁾ CJEC, judgment of 23.4.1986, Case 294/83, 'Les Verts', ECR I, p. 1339, paragraph 23.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- J. having regard to the responsibility borne by national parliaments when they transpose Community Directives into national law and the need for that transposition to be carried out correctly,
 - K. whereas Community law may even become ineffective if the legal professions are unaware of the latest developments,
 - L. whereas the European Union should help to finance the dissemination of Community law if it wishes to ensure its effective application,
 - M. whereas proceedings for compensation against a Member State which has failed to transpose Community law is often the only remedy which individuals have if they suffer loss or damage as a result of that failure; whereas, in this connection, it is vital that citizens, to whom Community law is addressed, should be aware of their rights so that they can play a role in the application of Community law,
 - N. whereas the right to reparation depends primarily on national law as regards its basic conditions and formal requirements,
 - O. whereas the number of judgments establishing a breach of Community law by a Member State which have not been implemented is too high and has increased further,
 - P. whereas, in its communication of 5 June 1996, the Commission laid down the criteria for the implementation of Article 171 of the EC Treaty, stressing, at the same time, that penalty payments represent the most appropriate means of forcing the Member States to take the measures needed to implement Court of Justice judgments and that these measures must be drawn up as objectively as possible,
1. Notes that there are problems with regard to the transposition of Community law in a number of Member States and a number of areas;
 2. Takes the view that the Member State bodies responsible for transposing Community law into national law must be encouraged by the Commission to request its technical assistance whenever necessary so as to ensure that transposition is carried out correctly;
 3. Expresses its concern at the fact that some Member States deliberately do not transpose Directives, thereby taking a unilateral decision not to honour their obligations and undermining the very idea of a Community based on the rule of law;
 4. Is deeply concerned by the fact that in several cases, especially in the areas of the single market and the environment, Member States have not complied with judgments of the Court of Justice; welcomes the recent Commission decision, implementing the Treaty on European Union, defining the method of calculation that it will apply for proposing financial penalties to be paid by Member States that do not carry out a ruling by the Court of Justice; insists that the Commission makes early use of this instrument (Article 171 EC);
 5. Stresses, as co-legislator, the priority it attaches to the fact that Directives adopted should be consistent with the subsidiarity principle, and should also be clear and concise to avoid problems of all kinds when they are transposed;
 6. Takes the view that cooperation and the exchange of information between the Commission and the national authorities, both at the pre-legislative stage and at the stage when Community acts are implemented, will facilitate the correct application of Community law;
 7. Expresses its concern at the lack of public enthusiasm for the European integration process and takes the view that this phenomenon might be due both to a lack of appropriate information and the adoption of acts which sometimes have no bearing on public concerns;
 8. Notes with concern that the Commission's annual report reveals that in the environment, transport, energy and agriculture sectors the transposition rate is particularly unsatisfactory as regards Directives adopted to implement the White Paper on the internal market;
 9. Reiterates its call for the Commission to draw up, with regard to the Union's external economic and trade relations, a specific annual report assessing the degree of application of Community law deriving from external commitments;
 10. Reiterates its calls for greater transparency in infringement proceedings, particularly as regards the Commission's reasons for taking action in certain cases and not doing so in others, and calls for the annual report to outline those reasons clearly;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

11. Calls on the Commission to ensure that complaints and petitions are dealt with more rapidly by exercising more stringent control over the deadlines for replies from Member States;
12. Calls on the Commission to take the necessary measures to implement a uniform and more extensive checking procedure system of its own, with a view to increasing the efficiency of its monitoring role;
13. Takes the view that with regard to the content and presentation of future annual reports the Commission should:
 - explain the criteria used for identifying of the origins of suspected infringements;
 - indicate how many and which complaints and cases detected by the Commission originally emanate from or have also been registered as petitions;
 - indicate the average time between the letter of formal notice and the reasoned opinion;
 - indicate the average time between the reasoned opinion and the point at which infringement cases cease or are referred to the Court of Justice;
 - take account of the distribution of competences between the state and regional and local authorities in the various Member States in following and monitoring the application of Community law;
14. Considers that the 'package meetings' increase the Commission's ability to pass on information, but takes the view that they must not be used for the purpose of transactions on the application of Community law;
15. Proposes that national courts should be equipped with the means to access the CELEX system and that the Community should help to fund the relevant measures;
16. Welcomes the results obtained through the Karolus and Mathaeus programmes dealing with exchanges of national civil servants;
17. Applauds the Commission for having put forward the 'Robert Schuman Action', which answers calls made by Parliament on a number of occasions, and strongly encourages it to continue that action;
18. Applauds the Council's determination to establish a programme of incentives and exchanges for practitioners in the justice area ('Grotius' programme);
19. Points out that programmes such as 'Schuman' and 'Grotius' must be endowed with adequate financial resources;
20. Urges the Member States to ensure that during their university studies lawyers acquire a thoroughgoing knowledge of Community law, and considers it essential that members of the legal professions in the Member States should receive training in Community law before starting to practise;
21. Draws attention to the fundamental role in the application of Community law played by citizens aware of their rights, who assert their right to compensation against a Member State which has failed to comply with its obligations under Community law;
22. Welcomes the 'Citizens of Europe' initiative launched by the Commission and Parliament on 26 November 1996, which answers a call made by Parliament in its resolution of 13 February 1996 on monitoring the application of Community law concerning the publication of a practical guide to citizens' rights which reflects the case law of the Court of Justice and the Court of First Instance, and stresses the importance of including in it a specific section dealing with means of redress in all cases where Community law is not applied effectively; takes the view that this initiative, which is designed to inform citizens about their rights, will also enable the Commission to draw lessons regarding the shortcomings in the operation of the internal market;
23. Welcomes the fact that the Court of Justice has established the principle that one of the conditions justifying an action for compensation has been met if a Member State takes no steps to transpose a Directive;
24. Urges consideration of the danger that the right to compensation may become illusory, in cases where national legislators have broad discretionary powers, if the three conditions governing the right to compensation laid down by Community case law were to correspond in substance to those which the Court has laid down by way of interpretation of the second paragraph of Article 215;

Thursday, 30 January 1997

25. Urges in-depth consideration of the consequences which a damages judgment awarded on the basis of the national law of the Member State responsible for the infringement may have for the principle of the uniform application of Community law;
26. Regrets the fact that there are 93 judgments which have not been implemented by Member States, calls on the Member States concerned to fulfil their obligations without delay and, in this connection, urges the Commission to apply Article 171 of the EC Treaty;
27. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission, the Council, the Court of Justice and the governments and parliaments of the Member States.

10. Application of Article K.9 TEU

A4-0349/96

Resolution on the Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council on the possible application of Article K.9 of the Treaty on European Union (COM(95)0566 – C4-0560/95)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Commission Communication to the European Parliament and the Council (COM(95)0566 – C4-0560/95),
- having regard to the Commission report of 27 October 1993 on the possible application of Article K.9 of the Treaty on European Union to asylum policy (SEC(93)1687),
- having regard to its resolutions of 17 May 1995 on the functioning of the Treaty on European Union with a view to the 1996 Intergovernmental Conference ⁽¹⁾ and 13 March 1996 embodying (i) Parliament's opinion on the convening of the Intergovernmental Conference and (ii) an evaluation of the work of the Reflection Group and definition of the political priorities of the European Parliament with a view to the Intergovernmental Conference ⁽²⁾, according to which the following should be dealt with through Community procedures and institutions:
 - asylum policy (Article K.1(1));
 - the rules governing the crossing of the external borders of the Member States (K.1(2));
 - immigration policy and policy towards nationals of third countries (Article K.1(3));
 - action to combat drug-trafficking (Article K.1(9)), with the inclusion in that article of an explicit reference to trafficking in human beings, especially women and children;
 - action to combat international fraud and organized crime (Article K.1(5)), and
 - judicial cooperation in civil matters (Article K.1(6));
- having regard to the report of the Reflection Group with a view to the 1996 Intergovernmental Conference,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Civil Liberties and Internal Affairs and the opinions of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Citizens' Rights and the Committee on Institutional Affairs (A4-0349/96),

⁽¹⁾ OJ C 151, 19.6.1995, p. 56.

⁽²⁾ OJ C 96, 1.4.1996, p. 77.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

- A. whereas the Commission and the European Parliament agree that cooperation in the fields of justice and home affairs does not always work satisfactorily and that a majority of the areas of policy covered by this cooperation, in particular asylum and immigration policy, should be communitized,
- B. whereas, in seeking to achieve this objective, use of the provisions of Article K.9 does not resolve the problems referred to, especially as this article cites Article 100c as the legal basis, which means that Parliament's role in the legislative process is confined to mere consultation and that the requirement for unanimity in the Council continues to apply,
- C. whereas the Reflection Group set up in connection with the Intergovernmental Conference regards reforms to cooperation in the field of justice and home affairs as an urgent priority and whereas it can therefore be assumed that the Intergovernmental Conference will discuss these matters,
- D. whereas the communitization of various areas of Title VI at the Intergovernmental Conference offers the opportunity to give the Community institutions a stronger role than would have been possible by the application of Article K.9, e.g. by providing for codecision powers for the European Parliament,
- E. whereas the application of Article K.9 does not offer any procedural advantages as against a Treaty amendment by an Intergovernmental Conference, since in both cases unanimity and ratification by all Member States are required,
1. Reiterates its view that the obvious shortcomings of cooperation under Title VI of the TEU, such as inefficiency of decision-making procedures and the lack of democratic controls, transparency and legal certainty make it necessary to bring essential areas of policy within the Community's terms of reference;
 2. Regrets once more that the Commission has not long ago taken an initiative to this effect under Article K.9, as called for on many occasions by the European Parliament;
 3. Agrees with the Commission that there is no point in communitizing various areas of the Third Pillar simultaneously both at the Intergovernmental Conference and by an initiative under Article K.9, given the risks of duplication and dispersal of effort this would involve;
 4. Takes the view, therefore, that the proposal contained in the Commission Communication to the European Parliament and the Council on the possible application of Article K.9 of the Treaty on European Union should be approved;
 5. Looks to the Intergovernmental Conference to provide concrete results as regards the definition of clear political objectives, and, inter alia, the communitization of asylum policy, immigration policy, the policy on the crossing of external borders, the fight against drug trafficking, trafficking in human beings, fraud and international corruption, especially where it affects the financial interests of the Communities, and certain areas of judicial cooperation in civil matters;
 6. Calls on the Intergovernmental Conference to extend Article K.9 to all remaining areas of Article K.1 and to provide for the Council to decide by qualified majority on the application of Article K.9;
 7. Calls on the Commission to examine, immediately after the closure of the Intergovernmental Conference, the results of, and any progress made by, the conference with regard to the communitization of certain areas in the field of justice and home affairs, to report thereon to Parliament and to take an initiative pursuant to Article K.9 if these results do not meet the expectations of the European Parliament;
 8. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission and the governments and parliaments of the Member States.
-

Thursday, 30 January 1997

ATTENDANCE REGISTER

30 January 1997

The following signed:

d'Aboville, Adam, Aelvoet, Ahlqvist, Alavanos, Alber, Amadeo, Anastassopoulos, d'Ancona, André-Léonard, Andrews, Anttila, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arroni, Avgerinos, Baggioni, Baldarelli, Baldi, Balfe, Bardong, Barón Crespo, Barthet-Mayer, Barton, Barzanti, Bazin, Bellère, Berend, Berès, Berger, Bernard-Reymond, Bernardini, Bertens, Berthu, Bertinotti, Bianco, Billingham, van Bladel, Bloch von Blottnitz, Blokland, Blot, Bösch, Bonde, Boniperti, Bontempi, Boogerd-Quaak, Botz, Bourlanges, de Brémond d'Ars, Breyer, Brok, Burtone, Cabezón Alonso, Caccavale, Caligaris, Camisón Asensio, Campos, Capucho, Cardona, Carlotti, Carnero González, Carniti, Cars, Casini Carlo, Casini Pier Ferdinando, Cassidy, Castagnède, Castagnetti, Castricum, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chesa, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coates, Cohn-Bendit, Colajanni, Colli Comelli, Collins Gerard, Collins Kenneth D., Colombo Svevo, Colom i Naval, Corbett, Cornelissen, Correia, Corrie, Costa Neves, Cot, Cox, Crampton, Crawley, Crowley, Cunha, Cunningham, Cushnahan, Danesin, Dankert, Darras, Dary, Daskalaki, De Clercq, De Coene, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Giovanni, Dell'Alba, De Melo, Deprez, Desama, de Vries, Díez de Rivera Icaza, van Dijk, Dillen, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Alan John, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Dührkop Dührkop, Dupuis, Dury, Dybkjær, Ebner, Eisma, Elchlepp, Elles, Elliott, Eriksson, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Ettl, Evans, Fabra Vallés, Fabre-Aubrespy, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Farassino, Fassa, Fayot, Ferber, Féret, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Florio, Fontaine, Ford, Formentini, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Frutos Gama, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Gallagher, García Arias, Garosci, Garriga Polledo, Gasòliba i Böhm, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Giansily, Gillis, Gil-Robles Gil-Delgado, Girão Pereira, Glante, Glase, Goepel, Goerens, Görlach, Gollnisch, Gomolka, González Álvarez, González Triviño, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Graenitz, Graziani, Green, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, Guinebertière, Gutiérrez Díaz, von Habsburg, Hänsch, Hager, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hatzidakis, Haug, Hautala, Hawlicek, Heinisch, Hendrick, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Herzog, Hindley, Hoff, Holm, Hoppenstedt, Hory, Howitt, Hughes, Hulthén, Hume, Hyland, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jackson, Janssen van Raay, Jarzembowski, Jensen Kirsten M., Jöns, Jové Peres, Junker, Katiforis, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kerr, Kestelijn-Sierens, Killilea, Kindermann, Kittelmann, Klaß, Klironomos, Koch, Kofoed, Konrad, Kouchner, Kranidiotis, Krarup, Krehl, Kreissl-Dörfler, Kronberger, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lalmière, La Malfa, Lambraki, Lambrias, Lang Carl, Lange, Langen, Langenhagen, Lannoye, Larive, Le Gallou, Lenz, Leopardi, Le Pen, Leperre-Verrier, Le Rachinel, Ligabue, Lindeperg, Lindholm, Lindqvist, Linkohr, Linser, Lööw, Lomas, Lulling, Macartney, McCarthy, McCartin, McGowan, McIntosh, McKenna, McNally, Majj-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Malone, Manisco, Mann Erika, Mann Thomas, Manzella, Marin, Marinho, Marinucci, Marselet Campos, Martens, Martin David W., Martin Philippe-Armand, Mather, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Mendonça, Menrad, Metten, Mezzaroma, Miranda, Miranda de Lage, Mohamed Ali, Mombaur, Monfils, Moniz, Moorhouse, Morán López, Moretti, Morgan, Morris, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Müller, Mulder, Murphy, Musumeci, Myller, Napoletano, Nassauer, Needle, Nencini, Newens, Newman, Nicholson, Novo, Novo Belenguier, Oddy, Ojala, Olsson, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Orlando, Otila, Paasilinna, Pack, Pailler, Paisley, Papakyrizis, Papayannakis, Parodi, Pasty, Perry, Peter, Pettinari, Pex, Piecyk, Piha, Pimenta, Piquet, Pirker, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Podestà, Poettering, Pollack, Pomés Ruiz, Pompidou, Pons Grau, Porto, Posselt, Pradier, Pronk, Provan, Puerta, van Putten, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rauti, Read, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rehder, Ribeiro, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rosado Fernandes, de Rose, Roth-Behrendt, Rothley, Rübig, Ruffolo, Ryynänen, Sakellariou, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Samland, Sandbæk, Santini, Sanz Fernández, Sarlis, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Scapagnini, Schäfer, Schaffner, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schlechter, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schnellhardt, Schörling, Schröder, Schulz, Schwaiger, Secchi, Seillier, Seppänen, Sierra González, Simpson, Sindal, Sisó Cruellas, Skinner, Smith, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Sonneveld, Sornosa Martínez, Soulier, Spaak, Spencer, Spiers, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Stockmann, Striby, Sturdy, Svensson, Tajani, Tamino, Tannert, Tappin, Tatarella, Telkämper, Terrón i Cusi, Teverson, Theato, Theonas, Theorin, Thomas, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Titley, Todini, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Trakatellis, Trizza, Truscott, Ullmann, Väyrynen, Vallvé, Valverde López, Vandemeulebroucke, Vanhecke, Van Lancker, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vecchi, van Velzen W.G., van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Verwaerde, Viceconte, Vinci, Viola, Virrankoski, Voggenhuber, van der Waal, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watson, Watts, Weiler, West, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiebenga, Wiersma, Wijsenbeek, Willockx, Wilson, von Wogau, Wolf, Wynn, Zimmermann.

Thursday, 30 January 1997

ANNEX

Result of roll-call votes

- (+) = For
 (-) = Against
 (O) = Abstention

1. B4-0045/97

Whole

(+)

ARE: González Triviño, Lalumière, Vandemeulebroucke**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Dybkjær, Eisma, Farassino, Goerens, Kestelij-n-Sierens, Kofoed, Lindqvist, Monfils, Moretti, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Spaak, Teverson, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek**GUE/NGL:** Carnero González, Eriksson, Gutiérrez Díaz, Jové Peres, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Puerta, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson**I-EDN:** Blokland, van der Waal**NI:** Hager, Kronberger, Linser, Trizza**PPE:** Alber, Areitio Toledo, Bardong, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bernard-Reymond, Bianco, Boulranges, de Brémond d'Ars, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Cunha, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Ferrer, Flemming, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Garriga Polledo, Glase, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klauf, Koch, Konrad, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Menrad, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Robles Piquer, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, van Velzen W.G., von Wogau**PSE:** Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Bontempi, Botz, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Hughes, Hulthén, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten, Jöns, Junker, Kerr, Kindermann, Kinnock, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhne, Lange, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Löow, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Manzella, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Myller, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Pery, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Read, Rehder, Roth-Behrendt, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Spiers, Stockmann, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Marques, Truscott, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, West, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wynn, Zimmermann**V:** Aelvoet, Bloch von Blottnitz, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Hautala, Holm, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Orlando, Roth, Schörling, Telkämper, Ullmann, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(-)

I-EDN: Berthu**NI:** Dillen, Féret, Gollnisch, Lang Carl, Le Gallou, Vanhecke**UPE:** Donnay, Giansily, Pasty, Schaffner

Thursday, 30 January 1997

(O)

ARE: Barthes-Mayer, Dary, Hory, Pradier

I-EDN: Nicholson, Sandbæk, Seillier

PPE: Chichester, Corrie

UPE: Arroni, Baldi, van Bladel, Crowley, Danesin, Florio, Garosci, Guinebertière, Marin, Podestà, Santini, Scapagnini, Tajani, Todini, Viceconte

2. *Thomas report A4-0414/96*

Amendment 14

(+)

ELDR: Lindqvist

GUE/NGL: Carnero González, Eriksson, Gutiérrez Díaz, Jové Peres, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Novo, Ojala, Puerta, Seppänen, Sornosa Martínez, Svensson

I-EDN: Blokland, van der Waal

NI: Hager, Kronberger, Linser

PPE: Pimenta

PSE: Baldarelli, Berger, Bösch, Ettl, Graenitz, Hawlicek, Kuhne, Megahy, Pollack

V: Aelvoet, Bloch von Blottnitz, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Hautala, Holm, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Roth, Schörling, Telkämper, Ullmann, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(-)

ARE: Barthes-Mayer, González Triviño, Lalumière, Macartney, Novo Belenguer

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Dybkjær, Eisma, Farassino, Goerens, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Monfils, Moretti, Mulder, Neyts-Uytbroeck, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Ryyänen, Spaak, Teverson, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

GUE/NGL: Sierra González

I-EDN: Berthu, Fabre-Aubrespy, Nicholson, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby

NI: Dillen, Féret, Vanhecke

PPE: Alber, Aretio Toledo, Bardong, Bannasar Tous, Berend, Bernard-Reymond, Bianco, Bourlanges, de Brémond d'Ars, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Donnelly Brendan, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Ferrer, Flemming, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Garriga Polledo, Glase, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Koch, Lambrias, Langen, Lenz, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Menrad, Moorhouse, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pirker, Poettering, Porto, Posselt, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Robles Piquer, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sonneveld, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barton, Berès, Bernardini, Billingham, Bontempi, Botz, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Correia, Cot, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Evans, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Green, Gröner, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten, Jöns, Junker, Kerr, Kindermann, Kinnock,

Thursday, 30 January 1997

Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Lange, Linkohr, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morris, Murphy, Myller, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Pérez Royo, Pery, Peter, Piecyk, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Read, Rehder, Roth-Behrendt, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schlechter, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Spiers, Stockmann, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, West, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wynn, Zimmermann

UPE: Arroni, van Bladel, Cardona, Colli Comelli, Crowley, Danesin, Donnay, Florio, Garosci, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Ligabue, Marin, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner

(O)

PPE: Corrie**PSE:** Ahlqvist, Hulthén, Löow, Theorin, Waidelich, Wibe

3. Thomas report A4-0414/96

Resolution

(+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Dary, González Triviño, Lalumière, Macartney, Novo Belenguer, Pradier**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Farassino, Goerens, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Monfils, Moretti, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Olsson, Ryynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek**GUE/NGL:** Carnero González, Gutiérrez Díaz, Jové Peres, Miranda, Novo, Puerta, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez**I-EDN:** Berthu, Blokland, Nicholson, Sandbæk, Seillier, Striby, van der Waal**NI:** Hager, Kronberger, Linser

PPE: Alber, Areitio Toledo, Bardong, Bannasar Tous, Berend, Bernard-Reymond, Bianco, Bourlanges, de Brémond d'Ars, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Donnelly Brendan, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Ferber, Ferrer, Flemming, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Garriga Polledo, Glase, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Koch, Lambrias, Langen, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Menrad, Moorhouse, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pirker, Poettering, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Robles Piquer, Rübige, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sonneveld, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., von Wogau

PSE: Adam, d'Ancona, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barton, Berès, Bernardini, Billingham, Bontempi, Botz, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carlotti, Carniti, Castricum, Caudron, Colajanni, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Correia, Cot, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Evans, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Green, Gröner, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Iversen, Izquierdo Rojo, Jensen Kirsten, Jöns, Junker, Kerr, Kindermann, Kinnock, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhne, Lange, Linkohr, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miranda de Lage, Morris, Murphy, Myller, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Pery, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Read, Rehder, Roth-Behrendt, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schlechter, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Smith, Spiers, Stockmann, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Walter, Watts, West, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wynn

UPE: Arroni, van Bladel, Cardona, Colli Comelli, Crowley, Danesin, Donnay, Florio, Garosci, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Ligabue, Marin, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner

Thursday, 30 January 1997

(—)

ELDR: Lindqvist

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Ojala, Seppänen, Svensson

PSE: Morán López

V: Aelvoet, Bloch von Blottnitz, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Hautala, Holm, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Roth, Schörling, Telkämper, Ullmann, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(O)

ELDR: Boogerd-Quaak, Dybkjær, Eisma

NI: Dillen, Féret, Vanhecke

PPE: Cederschiöld

PSE: Ahlqvist, Baldarelli, Berger, Bösch, Ettl, Graenitz, Hawlicek, Hulthén, Löow, van Putten, Theorin, Waidelich, Wibe

4. Reding report A4-0368/96

Amendment 11

(+)

ARE: González Triviño

ELDR: André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Cars, Cox, de Vries, Dybkjær, Goerens, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Lindqvist, Monfils, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Ryyänänen, Spaak, Teverson, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijzenbeek

GUE/NGL: Camero González, Gutiérrez Díaz, Jové Peres, Ojala, Puerta, Seppänen, Sornosa Martínez

I-EDN: Fabre-Aubrespy, Nicholson, Seillier, Striby

NI: Blot, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Le Gallou, Linser

PPE: Alber, Areitio Toledo, Bardong, Bannasar Tous, Bernard-Reymond, Bianco, Bourlanges, de Brémond d'Ars, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Donnelly Brendan, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Ferrer, Flemming, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grosseleté, Günther, von Habsburg, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Klaß, Koch, Lambrias, Langen, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mendonça, Menrad, Moorhouse, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pirker, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Robles Piquer, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schwaiger, Sonneveld, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., von Wogau

PSE: Adam, Ahlqvist, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barton, Berès, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Botz, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Carlotti, Carniti, Castricum, Caudron, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Correia, Cot, Crampton, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Dührkop Dührkop, Dury, Elchlepp, Ettl, Evans, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Kerr, Kindermann, Kinnock, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhne, Lange, Linkohr, Löow, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Marinho, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morris, Murphy, Myller, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Pery, Peter, Piecyk, Rapkay, Read, Rehder, Roth-Behrendt, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schlechter, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Spiers, Stockmann, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Titley, Tomlinson, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Willockx

UPE: Donnay, Pasty, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

Thursday, 30 January 1997

(—)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Dupuis, Hory, Pradier**UPE:** Crowley, Hyland**V:** Aelvoet, Bloch von Blottnitz, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Hautala, Holm, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Roth, Schörling, Telkämper, Ullmann, Voggenhuber

(O)

ARE: Lalumière, Macartney**GUE/NGL:** Eriksson, Svensson**I-EDN:** Berthu, Blokland, Sandbæk, van der Waal**PSE:** Donnelly Alan John, Falconer, Pollack, Skinner, Smith, Wynn**UPE:** Colli Comelli, Danesin, Garosci, Podestà, Santini

*5. Reding report A4-0368/96**Resolution*

(+))

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Dupuis, González Triviño, Hory, Lalumière, Macartney, Pradier**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Cars, Cox, de Vries, Dybkjær, Goerens, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Monfils, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Ryyänänen, Spaak, Teverson, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijzenbeek**GUE/NGL:** Carnero González, Gutiérrez Díaz, Jové Peres, Ojala, Puerta, Seppänen, Sornosa Martínez**I-EDN:** Blokland, Nicholson, Seillier, Striby, van der Waal**NI:** Blot, Dillen, Féret, Hager, Kronberger, Linser**PPE:** Alber, Areitio Toledo, Bardong, Bannasar Tous, Bernard-Reymond, Bianco, Bourlanges, de Brémond d' Ars, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Donnelly Brendan, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Ferrer, Flemming, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grosse-tête, Günther, von Habsburg, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Klaß, Koch, Lambrias, Langen, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mendonça, Menrad, Moorhouse, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Otila, Pack, Palacio Vallelersundi, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pirkker, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Robles Piquer, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schwaiger, Sonneveld, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G.**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barton, Berès, Berger, Bernardini, Billingham, Botz, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Carlotti, Carniti, Castricum, Caudron, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Correia, Cot, Crampton, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Dury, Elchlepp, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fayot, Ford, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Imbeni, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Kerr, Kindermann, Kinnock, Krehl, Kuckelkorn, Kuhne, Lange, Linkohr, Löow, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Marinho, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miranda de Lage, Morán López, Morris, Murphy, Myller, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Pery, Piecyk, Pollack, Rapkay, Read, Rehder, Roth-Behrendt, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schlechter, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Simpson, Skinner, Smith, Spiers, Stockmann, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Titley, Tomlinson, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Willockx, Wynn**UPE:** Baldi, Danesin, Donnay, Garosci, Hyland, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner

Thursday, 30 January 1997

(—)

ELDR: Lindqvist

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Svensson

PSE: Iversen

V: Aelvoet, Bloch von Blottnitz, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Hautala, Holm, Lannoye, Lindholm, McKenna, Müller, Roth, Schörling, Telkämper, Ullmann

(O)

I-EDN: Berthu, Fabre-Aubrespy, Sandbæk

UPE: Crowley

6. Escudero report A4-0410/96

Amendment 3

(+)

ARE: Barthet-Mayer, Dupuis, González Triviño, Hory, Lalumière, Macartney

ELDR: André-Léonard, Cars, Dybkjær, Goerens, Kofoed, Monfils, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Spaak, Wijsenbeek

I-EDN: Blokland, van der Waal

PPE: Alber, Bardong, Bennasar Tous, Bernard-Reymond, Bianco, Bourlanges, Camisón Asensio, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Cornelissen, Cushnahan, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Donnelly Brendan, Elles, Escudero, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Ferrer, Flemming, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Günther, von Habsburg, Heinisch, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Jarzembowski, Klauf, Koch, Lambrias, Langen, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, Majj-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mendonça, Menrad, Moorhouse, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Pirker, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Robles Piquer, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schwaiger, Sonneveld, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Sturdy, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G.

PSE: Adam, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Baldarelli, Barón Crespo, Barton, Berès, Berger, Bernardini, Botz, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Carlotti, Carniti, Castricum, Colom i Naval, Correia, Cot, Crampton, Cunningham, Darras, David, De Coene, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Elchlepp, Ettl, Evans, Fayot, Frutos Gama, García Arias, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hawlicek, Hendrick, Hoff, Hughes, Imbeni, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Kerr, Kindermann, Krehl, Kuhne, Lange, Linkohr, McGowan, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Marinho, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miranda de Lage, Murphy, Myller, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Pery, Pollack, Rapkay, Read, Rehder, Roth-Behrendt, Samland, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schlechter, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Skinner, Spiers, Stockmann, Tannert, Titley, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wynn

UPE: Baldi, Danesin, Donnay, Garosci, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner

V: Lannoye

(—)

ELDR: Boogerd-Quaak, Lindqvist

GUE/NGL: Eriksson, Ojala, Svensson

I-EDN: Sandbæk

PPE: de Brémond d'Ars, Grossetête, Stasi

PSE: Ahlqvist, Lööw, Simpson

Thursday, 30 January 1997

(O)

ELDR: Cox, Rynnänen, Virrankoski, Väyrynen

I-EDN: Nicholson

NI: Hager, Kronberger, Linser

PPE: Ilaskivi, Matikainen-Kallström, Otila, Piha
