

II

(Preparatory Acts)

ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COMMITTEE

Opinion of the Economic and Social Committee on basic Community social rights

(89/C 126/04)

In a letter dated 9 November 1988 from Mr Delors and Mr Marin, the Commission requested the Economic and Social Committee to debate and undertake a general appraisal of the possible components of a Community Charter of Basic Social Rights.

At its 24 November 1988 session, the Plenary Committee decided, under Article 17 of its Rules of Procedure, to set up a sub-committee to carry out the relevant work. On 8 February 1989 the sub-committee adopted a draft opinion (rapporteur: Mr Staedelin; co-rapporteur: Mr Vassilaras).

At its 263rd Plenary Session (meeting of 22 February 1989), the Economic and Social Committee adopted the following opinion by 135 votes to 22 with eight abstentions:

I. Pillars of a social Europe

1. The Economic and Social Committee, taking the view that implementation of the Single Act shapes a European economic and social area founded primarily on improved industrial relations, reiterates its support for the creation of a large single market which, besides strengthening the economy, trade, industry, crafts and services, must establish a common platform for increasing the well-being of all Europeans, bringing down high unemployment and facilitating the development of consumer protection and environment policies.

Basic social rights for the citizens of the Community can only be achieved in a free, democratic and peace-loving society, where individuals enjoy equal social status, regardless of their sex, race, language, nation, religion, political opinions or any other circumstances. Men and women will then be able to develop their full potential and participate effectively in the political, economic, social and cultural organization of society.

Our corner of the world shares a tradition of culture, democracy and freedom, indeed a whole way of life, that cannot be rejected for other visions of progress.

The Committee therefore welcomes the Commission's decision to seek its opinion on the basic social rights to be safeguarded in this non-frontier Europe.

However, a comprehensive, detailed reply to this request would be tantamount to framing a European constitution or basic laws. Such a task, however exciting, cannot be accomplished in a few weeks.

2. Accordingly, bearing in mind that in their letter requesting an opinion, Mr Delors and Mr Marin asked for a clear-cut message on the future of the Community and the fundamental values that it seeks to promote, the Committee feels that the questions it has to examine should be confined to three categories:

(a) protection of fundamental values in terms of social rights enshrined in Community legislation;

(b) the social dimension of the internal market;

(c) Community social dialogue.

3. Under a broad social policy sweep, basic social rights affect not only:

— the various components of society, in particular the most vulnerable groups (e.g. the disabled, migrants, ethnic and other minorities, groups on the fringes of society, the elderly),

— all social and occupational categories (e.g. employees, managers, the self-employed, liberal professions, public sector workers, craftsmen, pensioners),

- all areas of activity (e.g. agriculture, industry, commerce, services, the social economy),
- various kinds of undertakings, SMEs and cooperatives, but also the consumer, environment and collective sectors.

4. These basic social rights are also part and parcel of the rights inherent in a People's Europe and encompass, more generally, the shared values of European society. They relate to the various aspects of the lives of all Europeans (right to work; right to adequate living conditions; right to a decent retirement; access to education; consumer information, education and protection; family rights; rights in the cultural sphere; health and environmental protection; freedom to reside, work, form associations, take up and pursue activities on an employed or self-employed basis and study in any Member State, etc.) as already stated by the Committee (¹).

5. However, the terms of the referral and the tight deadline assigned have prompted the Committee to focus its attention, for the time being, more particularly on basic social rights of key importance in the light of the entry into force of the Single Act and the specific new requirements accompanying completion of the Community-wide market. The Committee reserves the right to give its views on other matters in the future.

II. 1992: Guarantee of basic social rights

1. In supporting the attainment of a single market, the Committee, on account of the need for coordination between economic and social policies, has constantly pressed for measures envisaged in the industrial, trade, agricultural, financial and tax sectors to go hand-in-hand with the concurrent adoption of social measures.

2. In addition, the Committee has repeatedly stated that completion of a Community-wide internal market must not undermine basic social rights and that the fundamental principles of the Community include a commitment to promote the well-being of all Europeans and to foster economic and social cohesion (²).

(¹) In this connection, see the opinion on social developments in 1987 (OJ No C 208, 8. 8. 1988).

(²) See in particular the following opinions: opinion on making a success of the Single Act (OJ No C 180, 8. 7. 1987); annual opinions on the economic situation and social developments; opinion and information report on the social aspects of the internal market (OJ No C 356, 31. 12. 1987 and CES 225/87 fin.)

3. The single market cannot stop short at a free trade area; the recommended outline plan for European integration will be devoid of meaning or purpose unless the living and working conditions of all sections of the population are enhanced.

4. This approach was recently endorsed in the conclusions of the Hanover and Rhodes European Councils, namely:

- that, by removing the obstacles to growth, the large single market offers the best prospect for promoting employment and increasing the general prosperity of the Community to the advantage of all its citizens. (Hanover)

- Completion of the single market cannot be regarded as an end in itself; it pursues a much wider objective, namely to ensure the maximum well-being of all, in line with the tradition of social progress which is part of Europe's history.

This tradition of social progress should be a guarantee that all citizens, whatever their occupation, will have effective access to the direct benefits expected from the single market as a factor of economic growth, and as the most effective means of combating unemployment. (Rhodes)

5. Similarly, the Committee resolution adopted on 23 November 1988 declared that the completion of the single market, an indispensable requirement if Europe is to secure its rightful place in the world, should make it possible to preserve and promote a model of life and development which will provide Europe's citizens with:

- in the pursuit of social justice, an area of liberty allowing for private initiative and the development of collective undertakings,

- the possibility of gradually and reliably improving employment levels, living standards and quality of life,

- security based on the affirmation of a Europe in which economic and social cohesion is assured (³).

6. The Committee observes that governments and the social partners have reached consensus on the definition of basic social rights within a number of international organizations (United Nations, ILO, Council of Europe and OECD). Looking ahead to the single market, it is particularly urgent for certain social rights to be laid

(³) CES 1267/88.

down in the Member States so as to incorporate a coherent, interdependent set of rules into the Member States' common heritage.

7. The aim is therefore not to devise new rules but, first and foremost, to take account of established rules already approved at other levels. The next stage is to define these rules via principles taking heed of the new requirements generated by implementation of the single market and conducive to its smooth operation. In determining their scope, the goal must be to secure basic social rights for all economic and social groups and all categories of workers throughout the Community.

8. Although the Committee does not feel that all areas of social policy have to be regulated by Community legislation, it stresses the need to adopt basic social rights founded on a common heritage of experience, taking due account of national differences.

9. To ensure concurrent economic and social development on a Community scale, a set of fundamental social guarantees⁽¹⁾ must be determined in order to boost Community action to secure the extension and effective application of citizens' rights⁽²⁾ and prevent competition being distorted as a result of differing conditions.

10. The Member States, occupational sectors, firms and services normally retain responsibility, through national legislation and/or collective bargaining, for determining how the basic principles and rights endorsed at Community level are to be implemented in practice.

11. The Committee is keenly interested in the promotion of social dialogue at all levels, with a view to devising framework agreements, taking due heed of the independence of the social partners.

12. All workers, regardless of the nature or terms of their work contract, must have the right to conduct collective bargaining negotiations with their employers at all levels (notably at the level of their firm, group of firms and occupational branch, and at sectoral, regional and national level).

13. All Member States share a broadly similar social model in the shape of:

⁽¹⁾ Doc. 6736/87 (Press 85) Social Affairs Council Declaration of 26 May 1987.

⁽²⁾ OJ No C 208, 8. 8. 1988.

(a) the respective role of States and collective bargaining negotiations as regards recognition of basic social rights in establishing a hard core of standards from which no derogation may be made;

(b) the respective role of States and collective bargaining negotiations in protecting the workforce at the workplace, (in particular by basic standards in respect of working conditions and working hours, protection of earnings, health and safety) and the State's role in safeguarding consumer and environmental rights;

(c) recognition of:

- freedom of association and the right to organize,
- collective bargaining as a key component of industrial relations,
- the workforce's right to be represented within the firm, through either elected bodies or delegated representatives of labour organizations.

III. Attainment of the European social model

1. Guarantee of basic principles in terms of social rights within the Community legal system

Since the ESC's opinion has to be delivered early in 1989, the Committee feels that the most constructive approach is to compile a list of basic social principles and rights which should be guaranteed by all Member States. To avoid lengthy, fruitless discussion that could delay the schedule for implementation and disturb social consensus, the ESC urges the Community institutions to take the procedural steps necessary to ensure that the scope of these basic principles and rights is interpreted with due respect for the standards already recognized in other international social legal instruments⁽³⁾.

The Committee reiterates that it attaches great importance to respect for the social partners' autonomy and to the right of Member States to legislate in the social sector. The intention is not to devise a new instrument but to enshrine fundamental social guarantees in the Community legal system, with its distinctive supra-national features. Each of the guaranteed rights or principles listed below will therefore be accompanied by the

⁽³⁾ A list of the key instruments and titles of the documents referred to in the following pages is appended. Not all the international instruments listed under section III headings A and B have been adopted by all Member States. The references are given to facilitate consultation of existing international instruments concerning a particular right.

corresponding reference to existing international conventions.

A. Generally applicable standards

- right of all sections of society to social security cover (**ILO**: Conventions 102, 118, 121, 128, 130 and 157; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Articles 12 and 13; European Code of Social Security and the Protocol thereto; European Convention on Social Security; Additional Protocol to the Social Charter, Article 4; **UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 9),
- right of all sections of society to social welfare, safety and health protection (**ILO**: Conventions 81, 115, 120, 129, 139, 148, 155 and 161; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Articles 3 and 11; European Code of Social Security, Articles 31 to 38 and the Protocol thereto; Additional Protocol in the Social Charter, Articles 3 and 4; **UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 12),
- right to education, (**Council of Europe**: First Additional Protocol to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, Article 2; **UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Articles 6, 13, 14 and 15),
- right to protection of privacy and the integrity of the personal sphere, in particular in connection with the use of computerized systems and data banks (**Council of Europe**: Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to automatic processing of personal data),
- right to protection of personal property and definition of the restrictions placed thereon by society (**Council of Europe**: Additional Protocol to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, Article 1),
- right to equality of opportunity and treatment, and elimination of any form of discrimination (**ILO**: Conventions 100, 111 and 156; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Articles 1 (2) and 4 (3); Additional Protocol, Article 1; **UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Articles 2 (2), 3 and 7),
- rights of the child, mother and family to legal and economic protection (**ILO**: Convention 103; **UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 10; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Articles 16 and 17),
- rights of the elderly (**Council of Europe**: Additional Protocol to the Social Charter, Article 4),
- right of workers, producers and consumers to form associations freely for the purpose of setting up undertakings such as cooperatives and mutual societies founded on the solidarity principle (**ILO**:

Recommendation 127; **UN**: Resolution 2459 (20. 12. 1968 on the role of the cooperative movement in economic and social development),

- right of consumers to health protection; full and objective financial information and free choice of goods and services (**UN**: Consumer Protection Guidelines — 1985),
- right to protection of the environment (**ILO**: Convention 148 and Recommendation 156; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Article 11),
- right to preservation of the cultural heritage (**Council of Europe**: European Cultural Convention and Convention for the Protection of the Architectural Heritage of Europe).

B. Standards governing industrial relations, the labour market and working conditions

- (including craftsmen, managers and the self-employed where concerned)
- right of freedom of association and the right to organize, including recourse to collective action (**ILO**: Conventions 87 and 135; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Articles 5 and 6 (4); Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, Article 11; **UN**: International Covenant on the Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 8),
 - right to organize and bargain collectively (**ILO**: Conventions 98, 151 and 154; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Article 6 (2)),
 - prohibition and abolition of forced labour (**ILO**: Conventions 29 and 105; **UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 6; **Council of Europe**: Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, Article 4),
 - right freely to choose and exercise an occupation; right to a freely negotiated contract of employment,
 - right to participate in the determination of conditions of employment (**ILO**: Recommendations 94, 113 and 129; **Council of Europe**: Additional Protocol to the Social Charter, Article 3),

- right to a freely negotiated wage (**ILO**: Conventions 94 and 95; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Article 4; **UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 7),
- right to basic and in-service vocational training and retraining (**ILO**: Conventions 140, 142 and 159; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Articles 7, 9, 10 and 15; Additional Protocol to Social Charter, Article 1; **UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 6),
- right to protection of child labour (**ILO**: Convention 138; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Article 7),
- right of the workforce to information and consultation at decision-making levels, particularly in connection with the introduction of new technologies or changes affecting structures, organization of the production process or employment (**ILO**: Convention 154 and Recommendation 113; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Article 6 (1) and (2); Additional Protocol to the Social Charter, Article 2),
- workers' right to protection in the event of individual or collective dismissal (**ILO**: Convention 158; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Article 4 (4)),
- right to similar safeguards, especially as regards the possibility for workers in part-time, temporary or other forms of employment to be covered by collective bargaining or occupational agreements and to contribute to and be covered by social security schemes (**UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 2 (2); **ILO**: Conventions 29, 87, 98, 100, 105 and 111; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Articles 5 and 6),
- right to annual leave (**ILO**: Convention 132; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Article 2 (3); **UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 7),
- right to weekly rest period; (**ILO**: Conventions 14 and 106; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Article 2 (5)),
- right to protection of safety and health at the workplace (**ILO**: Conventions 102, 121, 155 and 161; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Article 3; European Code of Social Security, Articles 31 to 38; Additional Protocol to the Social Charter, Articles 3 and 4; **UN**: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 7),
- right to protection in the event of sickness (**ILO**: Conventions 102, 118, 121, 130 and 157; **Council of Europe**: Social Charter, Articles 12 and 13; European Code of Social Security and Protocol thereto; European Convention on Social Security; Additional Protocol to the Social Charter, Article 4),
- right to free employment services (**ILO**: Conventions 88 and 96; **Council of Europe**, Social Charter, Article 1 (3)).

2. Social dimension of the internal market

The second category of legal safeguards must address the social dimension of the single market, in response to the need to reconcile two interdependent aims:

- (a) respect for national differences in labour, social security and industrial relations legislation (where consistent with the European social model);
- (b) while recognizing the need to adopt common rules.

Community legal instruments, which take due account of the need for flexibility, cooperation and decentralization, will have to be framed in order to enshrine social guarantees vital for smooth implementation of the single market. The aim will have to be (a) to avoid the pitfalls of unfair competition and (b), with a view to improving economic and social cohesion in the Community, to align, stage by stage, conditions of employment and direct and indirect social charges in sectors affected by the future Community-wide market. Here the proposals and comments contained in the opinion and information report on the social aspects of the internal market should be borne in mind ⁽¹⁾.

Article 118a of the Single Act requires the Community authorities to legislate in areas concerning the working environment, in particular matters relating to hygiene, health and safety at work. Observing that these spheres now fall within the Community's competence, the Committee calls on the Commission to frame the requisite implementing instruments without delay, and

⁽¹⁾ OJ No C 356, 31. 12. 1987 and CES 225/87 fin.

on the Council of Ministers to adopt them, bearing in mind that the purpose is not merely to harmonize the status quo but to provide for an upward alignment.

To make a success of the single market, it is particularly urgent to adopt instruments on:

- the dismissal of cross-frontier workers and unfair exploitation of their non-typical terms of employment ⁽¹⁾,
- the right to information and consultation in the event of the restructuring or merger of firms,
- the application of existing social legislation and collective bargaining agreements when awarding public contracts.

3. The consumer policy dimension of the European internal market

The European internal market has a consumer policy dimension in addition to the social dimension. In several opinions the Committee has endorsed the Commission's approach to the completion of the internal market in foodstuffs and consumer goods. And the Committee is equally emphatic in calling for Community rules to ensure the safety and protection of consumers, product quality, protection against fraud, and the provision of consumer information, education and advice.

4. Community social dialogue

The role of Community social dialogue is to express the above two aims in a rapidly changing industrial and economic society: respect for national differences and adoption of Community rules. The Committee reiterates the importance it attaches to Community social dialogue, which should be developed on a sectoral basis, including public services, and calls on the Commission to press ahead with the implementation of Article 118b of the Treaty, particularly with a view to arriving as far as possible at European framework and collective bargaining agreements.

It is necessary to guarantee all components of the social fabric, in particular consumer, mutual and cooperative associations, in such a way as to involve representatives of the key socio-economic groups in appropriate forums, suitable scope to allow them to negotiate and, more broadly, exercise their functions.

⁽¹⁾ See ESC own-initiative opinion on cross-frontier labour market problems (OJ No C 95, 11. 4. 1988).

IV. Comments on the implementation of basic social rights

The Committee feels that it is important not to classify the legal status of the instruments enshrining the basic social guarantees to be enjoyed by Europeans by using such traditional international social law terms as charter, treaty, convention or covenant. Any other course of action would be tantamount to relegating Community social policy to second place in the completion of the single market ⁽²⁾.

In the Committee's view, the instruments and procedures specified in the Treaty are the ones to be deployed to (a) ensure that basic social rights are protected under the Member States' legal systems and (b) facilitate implementation of those social measures which are a *sine qua non* for the internal market to operate smoothly. Such action should be conducted in close liaison with the representatives of the social partners. The instrument guaranteeing protection of basic social rights will have to be adopted by the end of 1989 and the social measures which are crucial to smooth operation of the single market will have to observe a fixed timetable geared to the deadlines set for completion of the Community-wide market.

Future measures taken in accordance with this opinion should in no way compromise any existing or future national legislation, collective agreements or treaty provisions according more favourable treatment to protected persons.

Without wishing to anticipate, at this stage in its work, the methodology for defining and implementing basic social rights, the Committee, as the spokesman for the economic and social forces, intends to undertake an annual review of the follow-up to future measures adopted in this field.

Done at Brussels, 22 February 1989.

*The Chairman
of the Economic and
Social Committee*

Alberto MASPRONE

⁽²⁾ This would be inconsistent with the conclusions of the Social Council meeting on 22 June 1984 on the social area, namely that the Community will not be able to strengthen its economic cohesion in the face of international competition if it does not strengthen its social cohesion at the same time. Social policy must therefore be developed at Community level on the same basis as economic, monetary and industrial policy (OJ No C 175, 4. 7. 1984).

*APPENDIX I***List and titles of key international social law instruments already adopted by the United Nations, ILO and the Council of Europe****UN**

International Covenant on economic, social and cultural rights — adopted on 16 December 1966 and entered into force on 3 January 1976

Convention on the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women — adopted on 18 December 1979 and entered into force on 3 September 1981

Convention on the elimination of all forms of racial discrimination — adopted on 21 December 1965 and entered into force on 4 January 1969

ILO**Conventions**

- 14 — Weekly rest (industry) (1921)
- 26 — Minimum wage fixing machinery (1928)
- 29 — Forced labour (1930)
- 44 — Unemployment provision (1936)
- 81 — Labour inspection (1947)
- 87 — Freedom of association and the right to organize (1948)
- 88 — Employment service (1948)
- 89 — Night work (women) (1948)
- 90 — Night work of young persons employed in industry (1948)
- 94 — Labour clauses (public contracts) (1949)
- 95 — Protection of wages (1949)
- 98 — Right to organize and collective bargaining (1949)
- 100 — Equal remuneration (1951)
- 102 — Social security (minimum standard) (1952)
- 103 — Maternity protection (revised) (1952)
- 105 — Abolition of forced labour (1957)
- 106 — Weekly rest (commerce and offices) (1957)
- 111 — Discrimination (employment and occupation) (1958)
- 115 — Radiation protection (1960)
- 118 — Equal treatment (social security) (1962)
- 120 — Hygiene (commerce and offices) (1964)
- 121 — Employment injury benefit (1964)
- 122 — Employment policy (1964)
- 129 — Labour inspection (agriculture) (1969)
- 130 — Medical care and sickness benefit (1969)
- 132 — Holidays with pay (amended) (1970)
- 135 — Workers' representatives (1971)
- 138 — Minimum age (1973)
- 139 — Occupational cancer (1974)
- 140 — Paid educational leave (1974)

- 142 — Human resources' development (1975)
- 143 — Migrant workers (1975)
- 144 — Tripartite consultation (1976)
- 148 — Working environment: Air pollution, noise, vibration (1977)
- 151 — Labour relations (public service) (1978)
- 154 — Collective bargaining (1981)
- 155 — Occupational safety and health (1981)
- 156 — Workers with family responsibilities (1981)
- 157 — Maintenance of rights in social security (1982)
- 158 — Termination of work contract (1982)
- 159 — Vocational rehabilitation and employment of the disabled (1983)
- 161 — Occupational health services (1985)

Recommendations

- 94 — Cooperation at the level of the undertaking (1952)
- 113 — Consultation (industrial and national levels) (1960)
- 129 — Communication within the undertaking (1967)
- 156 — Working environment (air pollution, noise and vibration)

Council of Europe

Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms — signed on 4 November 1950 and entered into force on 3 September 1953

European Social Charter — adopted on 18 October 1961 and entered into force on 26 February 1965

European Cultural Convention — signed on 19 December 1954 and entered into force on 5 May 1955

European Code of Social Security and Protocol thereto — adopted on 16 April 1964 and entered into force on 17 March 1968

European Convention on Social Security and Supplementary Agreement for the application of the European Convention on Social Security — adopted on 14 December 1972 and entered into force on 1 March 1977

Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data — adopted on 28 January 1981 and entered into force on 1 October 1985

European Convention on the legal status of migrant workers — adopted on 24 November 1977 and entered into force on 1 May 1983

Convention for the Protection of the Architectural Heritage of Europe — adopted on 3 October 1985 and entered into force on 1 December 1987

Additional Protocol to the European Social Charter — adopted on 5 May 1988. Not yet in force

APPENDIX II

The following amendments, which received a quarter of the votes cast, were defeated during the debate:

Section III.1

In the heading, delete 'under Community legislation'.

Voting

For: 38

Against: 91

Abstentions: 17

Second paragraph, sixth line

Replace 'Community legal system' by 'legal systems of the Member States'.

Reasons

The earlier paragraphs deal with the incorporation of standards from international agreements and other documents into national legislation. The preceding paragraph refers once again to the Member States' legislative autonomy.

The word 'Community' could give the false impression that international standards must first be laid down in a kind of Community charter.

Voting

For: 37

Against: 96

Abstentions: 6

APPENDIX III

Result of the vote on the opinion as a whole

The following members (present or represented) voted for the opinion:

Mr/Mrs/Miss

ALEXOPOULOS	KAZAZIS
AMATO	KIRCHFELD
ARENA	KITSIOS
ARETS	KRÖGER
ATAIDE FERREIRA	LAKA MARTIN
BAZIANAS	LANDABURU
BELTRAMI	LAPPAS
BENTO GONÇALVES	LARSEN
BERETTA	LAUR
BLESER	LIVERANI
BODDY	LÖW
BOS	LUCHETTI
BREDIMA SAVOPOULOU	LUSTENHOUWER
BREYIANNIS	MADDOCKS
BRIGANTI	MAINETTI
BROICHER	MANTOVANI
BURNEL	MAGALEF MASIA
LOBO BRANDÃO R. CAL	MARGOT
CALVET CHAMBON	MARVIER
CARROLL	MATTEOLI
CAVAZZUTI	MEYER-HORN
CEBALLO HERRERO	MORALES
CEYRAC	MORSELLI
CHRISTIE	MUHR
CLAVEL	MULLER
COLLAS	MUÑIZ GUARDADO
ALVES CONDE	MURPHY
CORTOIS	NIELSEN B.
VAN DAM	NIELSEN P.
DASSIS	NIERHAUS
DELHOMENIE	NIEUWENHUIZE
DELLA CROCE	NOORDWAL
DE TAVERNIER	NUGEYRE
DONCK	ORSI
DOS SANTOS	PARDON
DRAGO	PELLETIER
DRILLEAUD	PETERSEN
DROULIN	PETROPOULOS
VAN EEKERT	POLYZOS
ELSTNER	PROENÇA
EULEN	PROUMENS
FLUM	QUEVEDO ROJO
FORGAS	RAFTOPOULOS
FRANDI	RAMAEKERS
FREEMAN	RANGONI-MACCHIARELLI
FRESI	RIBIERE
GAYETOT	ROLÃO GONÇALVES
GERMOZZI	ROMOLI
GEUENICH	ROSEINGRAVE
GLESENER	SAÛ
GÓMEZ MARTÍNEZ	SALMON
GREDAL	SANTILLÁN CABEZA
GREEN	SCHADE-POULSEN
HAAS	SCHMITZ
HAGEN	SCHOEPGES
HILKENS	SERRA CARACCILO
HÖRSKEN	SILVA
HOUTHUYS	SMITH A. R.
JAKOBSEN	SMITH L. J.
JASCHICK	SOLARI
JENKINS	SPIJKERS
KAARIS	STAEDELIN

The following members (present or represented) voted for the opinion (*contd.*):

TIEMANN
TUKKER
VALLEJO CALDERÓN
VANDENBROUCKE
VASSILARAS
VELASCO MANCEBO

VERCELLINO
VIDAL
VLASSOPOULOS
YVERNEAU
ZUFIAUR NARVAIZA

The following members (present or represented) voted against the opinion:

Mr/Mrs/Miss

APARICIO BRAVO
BERNASCONI
BLACK
CAMPBELL
DECAILLON
DODD
FLATHER
GARDNER
GIACOMELLI
HANCOCK
MACHADO VON TSCHUSI

MORELAND
NETO da SILVA
de NORMANN
POETON
RIERA MARSÀ
ROBINSON
SPIERS
STORIE-PUGH
TELLES
TIXIER
WHITWORTH

The following members (present or represented) abstained:

Mr/Mrs/Miss

ASPINALL
BAGLIANO
CORELL AYORA
ETTY

MOURGUES
PRONK
ROUZIER
STRAUSS
