

COMMISSION DECISION (EU) 2022/776**of 13 April 2022****on the consistency of the performance targets contained in the draft performance plan submitted by Spain pursuant to Regulation (EC) No 549/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council with the Union-wide performance targets for the third reference period***(notified under document C(2022) 2300)***(Only the Spanish text is authentic)****(Text with EEA relevance)**

THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION,

Having regard to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union,

Having regard to Regulation (EC) No 549/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 10 March 2004 laying down the framework for the creation of the single European sky (the framework Regulation) ⁽¹⁾, and in particular Article 11(3) point (c), first paragraph, thereof,Having regard to Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317 of 11 February 2019 laying down a performance and charging scheme in the single European sky ⁽²⁾, and in particular Article 14(2) thereof,

Whereas:

GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS

- (1) Pursuant to Article 11 of Regulation (EC) No 549/2004, a performance scheme for air navigation services and network functions is to be set up. Furthermore, pursuant to Article 10 of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, Member States are to draw up, either at national level or at the level of functional airspace blocks ('FABs'), binding performance targets for each reference period of the performance scheme for air navigation services and network functions. Those performance targets have to be consistent with the Union-wide targets adopted by the Commission for the reference period concerned. The Commission is responsible for assessing whether the proposed performance targets contained in the draft performance plans drawn up by the Member States are consistent with the Union-wide performance targets using the assessment criteria set out in Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317.
- (2) These performance targets have to be consistent with the Union-wide targets adopted by the Commission for the reference period concerned. The Commission is responsible for assessing whether the proposed performance targets contained in the draft performance plans are consistent with the Union-wide performance targets using the assessment criteria set out in Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317.
- (3) The outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic has, since the first quarter of calendar year 2020, significantly impacted the air transport sector and has considerably reduced air traffic volumes as compared to pre-pandemic levels, due to the measures taken by the Member States and third countries to contain the pandemic.

⁽¹⁾ OJ L 96, 31.3.2004, p. 1.

⁽²⁾ Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317 of 11 February 2019 laying down a performance and charging scheme in the single European sky and repealing Implementing Regulations (EU) No 390/2013 and (EU) No 391/2013 (OJ L 56, 25.2.2019, p. 1).

- (4) Union-wide performance targets for the third reference period ('RP3') were originally set out in Commission Implementing Decision (EU) 2019/903 ⁽³⁾. As those Union-wide performance targets and the draft RP3 performance plans subsequently submitted by the Member States were drawn up before the outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic, they could not take account of the resulting significantly changed circumstances for air transport.
- (5) In response to the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the provision of air navigation services, exceptional measures for RP3, which derogate from the provisions of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, were set out in Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2020/1627 ⁽⁴⁾. Pursuant to Article 2(1) of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2020/1627, the Commission adopted, on 2 June 2021, Implementing Decision (EU) 2021/891 ⁽⁵⁾ setting revised Union-wide performance targets for RP3.
- (6) The Commission notes that the October 2021 base traffic forecast of the Eurocontrol's Statistics and Forecast Service ('STATFOR') projects that air traffic at Union-wide level will reach its pre-pandemic levels in the course of 2023 and will exceed those levels in 2024. However, the level of uncertainty regarding traffic development remains particularly high because of the risks related to the evolution of the COVID-19 epidemiological situation. The Commission also notes that the traffic recovery is expected to be uneven across Member States.
- (7) All Member States have developed and adopted draft performance plans containing revised local performance targets for RP3, which were submitted to the Commission for assessment by 1 October 2021. Following the verification of completeness of those draft performance plans, the Commission requested Member States to submit updated draft performance plans by 17 November 2021. The Commission's assessment presented in this Decision is based on the updated draft performance plan submitted by Spain.
- (8) The performance review body, assisting the Commission in the implementation of the performance scheme pursuant to Article 11(2) of Regulation (EC) No 549/2004, has submitted to the Commission a report containing its advice on the assessment of RP3 draft performance plans.
- (9) In accordance with Article 14(1) of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, the Commission has assessed the consistency of local performance proposed by Spain on the basis of the assessment criteria laid down in point 1 of Annex IV to that Implementing Regulation, and taking account of local circumstances. In respect of each key performance area and the related performance targets, the Commission has complemented the assessment by reviewing the draft performance plan in respect of the elements set out in point 2 of Annex IV to that Implementing Regulation.

COMMISSION ASSESSMENT

Assessment of draft performance targets in the key performance area of safety

- (10) Concerning the key performance area of safety, the Commission has assessed the consistency of the targets submitted by Spain regarding the effectiveness of safety management of air navigation service providers based on the criterion laid down in point 1.1 of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317. That assessment was conducted taking account of local circumstances and was complemented by the review of measures planned for the achievement of the safety targets in respect of the elements set out in point 2.1.(a) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317.

⁽³⁾ Commission Implementing Decision (EU) 2019/903 of 29 May 2019 setting the Union-wide performance targets for the air traffic management network for the third reference period starting on 1 January 2020 and ending on 31 December 2024 (OJ L 144, 3.6.2019, p. 49).

⁽⁴⁾ Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2020/1627 of 3 November 2020 on exceptional measures for the third reference period (2020-2024) of the single European sky performance and charging scheme due to COVID-19 pandemic (OJ L 366, 4.11.2020, p. 7).

⁽⁵⁾ Commission Implementing Decision (EU) 2021/891 of 2 June 2021 setting revised Union-wide performance targets for the air traffic management network for the third reference period (2020-2024) and repealing Implementing Decision (EU) 2019/903 (OJ L 195, 3.6.2021, p. 3).

- (11) The draft performance targets in the key performance area of safety proposed by Spain in respect of the effectiveness of safety management, broken down per safety management objective and expressed as a level of implementation, are as follows:

Spain	Targets on the effectiveness of safety management, expressed as a level of implementation, ranging from EASA level A to D				
Air navigation service providers concerned	Safety management objective	2021	2022	2023	2024
ENAIRES, FERRONATS	Safety policy and objectives	C	C	C	C
	Safety risk management	C	C	C	D
	Safety assurance	C	C	C	C
	Safety promotion	C	C	C	C
	Safety culture	C	C	C	C

- (12) In respect of the draft safety targets proposed by Spain for the air navigation service providers (ENAIRES and FERRONATS), the Commission has found that the level of the Union-wide performance target is planned to be achieved in 2024 with regard to the safety risk management objective, whilst for the other safety management objectives the local performance targets meet the level of the Union-wide performance target for each calendar year from 2021 to 2024.
- (13) The Commission notes that the draft performance plan submitted by Spain sets out measures for the ANSPs for the achievement of the local safety targets, such as the reinforcement of just culture and the implementation of the 'Digital Sky' strategic plan to modernise the communication, navigation and surveillance services for ENAIRES, as well as the advancement of safety culture and improvement of the safety management systems audit and survey procedures for FERRONATS.
- (14) On the basis of the findings set out in recitals 12 and 13, and considering that the Union-wide safety performance targets set in Implementing Decision (EU) 2021/891 must be achieved by the final year of RP3, namely 2024, the draft targets included in the draft performance plan of Spain should be assessed as consistent with the Union-wide performance targets in the key performance area of safety.

Assessment of draft performance targets in the key performance area of environment

- (15) Concerning the key performance area of environment, the consistency of the targets submitted by Spain regarding the average horizontal *en route* flight efficiency of the actual trajectory has been assessed based on the criterion laid down in point 1.2 of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317. Accordingly, the proposed targets contained in the draft performance plan of Spain have been compared to the relevant *en route* horizontal flight efficiency reference values set out in the European Route Network Improvement Plan ('ERNIP') available at the time of adopting the revised Union-wide performance targets for RP3, that is on 2 June 2021. That assessment was conducted taking account of local circumstances and was complemented by the review of measures planned for the achievement of the environment targets under point 2.1(a) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317.
- (16) In respect of the calendar year 2020, the Union-wide performance target for RP3 in the key performance area of environment, which was initially set out in Implementing Decision (EU) 2019/903, was not revised by Implementing Decision (EU) 2021/891, considering that the time period for the application of that target had expired and that its implementation had thus become definitive leaving no possibility for retroactive adjustments. Accordingly, Member States were not requested to revise, in the draft performance plans submitted by 1 October 2021, their local performance targets for calendar year 2020 in the key performance area of environment. Therefore the consistency of the local environment performance targets with the corresponding Union-wide performance targets should be assessed with regard to calendar years 2021, 2022, 2023 and 2024.

- (17) The draft performance targets in the key performance area of environment proposed by Spain and the corresponding national reference values for RP3 from the ERNIP, expressed as the average horizontal *en route* flight efficiency of the actual trajectory, are as follows:

	2021	2022	2023	2024
Draft <i>en route</i> environment targets of Spain, expressed as the average horizontal <i>en route</i> flight efficiency of the actual trajectory	3,08 %	3,08 %	3,08 %	3,08 %
Reference values for Spain	3,08 %	3,08 %	3,08 %	3,08 %

- (18) The Commission observes that the draft environment targets proposed by Spain are equal to the corresponding national reference values for each calendar year from 2021 to 2024.
- (19) In respect of point 2.1(a) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, the Commission notes that Spain has presented in the draft performance plan measures for the achievement of the local environment targets which include several route network improvements, changes in respect of sectors within the Canarias Area Control Centre (ACC), a reorganisation of the Madrid and Palma Terminal Manoeuvring Areas as well as measures to increase cross-border collaboration.
- (20) Furthermore, the Commission notes that Spain has already implemented free route airspace (FRA) within the Madrid Flight Information Region sectors of Santiago and Asturias (FRASAI project) and has initiated several FRA implementation projects (e.g. HISPAFRA).
- (21) On the basis of the findings set out in recitals 18 to 20, the draft targets included in the draft performance plan of Spain should be assessed as consistent with the Union-wide performance targets in the key performance area of environment.

Assessment of draft performance targets in the key performance area of capacity

- (22) Concerning the key performance area of capacity, the consistency of the targets submitted by Spain regarding the average *en route* air traffic flow management ('ATFM') delay per flight has been assessed based on the criterion laid down in point 1.3 of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317. Accordingly, the proposed targets contained in the draft performance plan of Spain have been compared to the relevant reference values set out in the Network Operations Plan available at the time of adopting the revised Union-wide performance targets for RP3, that is on 2 June 2021. That assessment was conducted taking account of local circumstances and was complemented by the review of measures planned for the achievement of the capacity targets under point 2.1(a) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317.
- (23) In respect of the calendar year 2020, the Union-wide performance target for RP3 in the key performance area of capacity, which was initially set out in Implementing Decision (EU) 2019/903, was not revised by Implementing Decision (EU) 2021/891, considering that the time period for the application of that target had expired and that its implementation had thus become definitive leaving no possibility for retroactive adjustments. Accordingly, Member States were not requested to revise, in the draft performance plans submitted by 1 October 2021, their local performance targets for calendar year 2020 in the key performance area of capacity. Therefore, the consistency of the local capacity performance targets with the corresponding Union-wide performance targets should be assessed with regard to calendar years 2021, 2022, 2023 and 2024.
- (24) The draft *en route* capacity targets proposed by Spain for RP3, expressed in minutes of ATFM delay per flight, as well as the corresponding reference values from the Network Operations Plan, are as follows:

	2021	2022	2023	2024
Draft <i>en route</i> capacity targets of Spain , in minutes of ATFM delay per flight	0,12	0,20	0,19	0,19
Reference values for Spain	0,12	0,20	0,19	0,19

- (25) The Commission observes that the draft capacity targets proposed by Spain are equal to the corresponding national reference values for each calendar year from 2021 to 2024.
- (26) In respect of point 2.1(a) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, the Commission notes that Spain has presented in the draft performance plan a range of measures for the achievement of the local *en route* capacity targets. Those measures include a comprehensive modernisation of the air traffic management system, an increase in sector capacities, optimisation of arrivals, recruitment of air traffic controllers (ATCOs) to replace retiring staff as well as efficiency improvements in the ATCO rostering process.
- (27) On the basis of the findings set out in recitals 25 and 26, the draft targets included in the draft performance plan of Spain should be assessed as consistent with the Union-wide performance targets in the key performance area of capacity.

Review of draft capacity targets for terminal air navigation services

- (28) With regard to airports which fall within the scope of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317 as set out in Articles 1(3) and (4) of that Regulation, the Commission has complemented its assessment of draft *en route* capacity targets by the review of the draft capacity targets for terminal air navigation services in accordance with point 2.1(b) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317. Those draft targets were not found to raise any concerns in respect of Spain.

Assessment of draft performance targets in the key performance area of cost-efficiency

- (29) Concerning the key performance area of cost-efficiency, the consistency of the targets submitted by Spain regarding the determined unit costs ('DUC') for *en route* air navigation services has been assessed based on the criteria laid down in points 1.4(a), (b) and (c) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317. Those criteria consist of the DUC trend over RP3, the long-term DUC trend over the second reference period ('RP2') and RP3 (2015-2024), and the baseline value for the DUC at charging zone level compared with the average value of the charging zones where air navigation service providers have a similar operational and economic environment.
- (30) The assessment of *en route* cost efficiency targets was conducted taking account of local circumstances. It was complemented by the review of the key factors and parameters underpinning those targets as specified in point 2.1 (d) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317.
- (31) The draft *en route* cost-efficiency targets proposed by Spain for the Spain Continental and Spain Canarias charging zones for RP3 are as follows:

<i>En route</i> charging zones of Spain	2014 baseline value	2019 baseline value	2020 -2021	2022	2023	2024
Draft <i>en route</i> cost-efficiency targets of Spain Continental , expressed as determined <i>en route</i> unit cost (in real terms at 2017 prices)	69,88 EUR	52,06 EUR	107,71 EUR	53,64 EUR	51,69 EUR	48,19 EUR

Draft <i>en route</i> cost-efficiency targets of Spain Canarias , expressed as determined <i>en route</i> unit cost (in real terms at 2017 prices)	70,11 EUR	52,39 EUR	104,97 EUR	66,92 EUR	58,97 EUR	53,93 EUR
---	------------------	------------------	-------------------	------------------	------------------	------------------

- (32) Concerning the criterion laid down in point 1.4(a) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, the Commission observes that Spain's *en route* DUC trend over RP3 at the charging zone levels of Spain Continental (-1,9 %) and Spain Canarias (+ 0,7 %) both outperform the Union-wide trend of +1,0 % over the same period.
- (33) Concerning the criterion laid down in point 1.4(b) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, the Commission observes that Spain's long-term *en route* DUC trend over RP2 and RP3 at the charging zone level of Spain Continental (-4,0 %) and Spain Canarias (-2,9 %) both outperform the long-term Union-wide trend of -1,3 % over the same period.
- (34) Concerning the criterion laid down in point 1.4(c) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, the Commission observes that Spain's average baseline value for the DUC of the Spain Continental and Spain Canarias charging zones of EUR 52,11 in real terms at 2017 prices ('EUR2017') is 17,2 % lower than the average baseline value of EUR 62,97 in EUR2017 of the relevant comparator group. The Commission notes that the determined *en route* unit cost of Spain remains below the average of the comparator group during the whole RP3, with a difference of -16,8 % observed for 2024.
- (35) On the basis of the findings set out in recitals 32 to 34, the draft targets included in the draft performance plan of Spain should be assessed as consistent with the Union-wide performance targets in the key performance area of cost-efficiency.

Review of draft cost-efficiency targets for terminal air navigation services

- (36) With regard to airports which fall within the scope of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317 as set out in Articles 1(3) and (4) of that Regulation, the Commission has complemented its assessment of draft *en route* cost-efficiency targets with the review of the draft cost-efficiency targets for terminal air navigation services in accordance with point 2.1(c) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317. Those draft targets were not found to raise concerns in respect of Spain.

Review of the incentive schemes referred to in Article 11 of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317 complementing the Commission's assessment of draft capacity targets

- (37) In accordance with point 2.1(f) of Annex IV to Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, in relation to the draft capacity targets, the Commission has complemented its assessment by a review of the draft incentive schemes referred to in Article 11 of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317. In this respect, the Commission has examined whether the draft incentive schemes fulfil the substantive requirements set out in Article 11(1) and (3) of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317. The draft incentive schemes contained in the draft performance plan of Spain were found to raise concerns.
- (38) The Commission observes that both the *en route* capacity incentive scheme and the terminal capacity incentive scheme proposed in Spain's draft performance plan comprises a maximum financial disadvantage amounting to 0,50 % of determined costs, and a maximum financial advantage amounting to 0,00 % of determined costs.
- (39) In respect of those incentive schemes, the Commission, on the basis of expert advice provided by the performance review body, has strong doubts whether the proposed maximum financial disadvantages, which amount to 0,50 % of determined costs respectively, would have any material impact on the revenue at risk, as required pursuant to Article 11(3), point (a) of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317.

- (40) Therefore, Spain should revise, in connection with the adoption of its final performance plan in accordance with Article 16, point (a) of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, its incentive schemes for achieving *en route* and terminal capacity targets so that the maximum financial disadvantages stemming from those incentive schemes are set at a level having a material impact on the revenue at risk, as required under Article 11(3), point (a) of Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/317, which in the Commission's view should lead to a maximum financial disadvantage equal to or higher than 1 % of determined costs.

CONCLUSIONS

- (41) On the basis of the assessment set out in recitals 10 to 40, the Commission has found that the performance targets contained in the draft performance plans submitted by Spain are consistent with the Union-wide performance targets.
- (42) The Commission notes that some Member States have indicated their intention to include cost items relating to airport drone detection in their RP3 cost bases. It has not been possible to precisely establish, based on the elements contained in the draft performance plans, to what extent Member States have included such determined costs in their RP3 cost bases and, where such costs have been included, to what extent they are incurred in relation to the provision of air navigation services and could thus be deemed eligible under the performance and charging scheme. The Commission services have sent an ad hoc information request to all Member States in order to gather relevant information, and will further examine the reported airport drone detection costs in the context of unit rate compliance verification. This Decision is without prejudice to the findings and conclusions of the Commission on the topic of drone detection costs.
- (43) In response to Russia's military aggression against Ukraine, which started on 24 February 2022, the Union has adopted restrictive measures prohibiting Russian air carriers, any Russian-registered aircraft and any non-Russian-registered aircraft which is owned or chartered, or otherwise controlled by any Russian natural or legal person, entity or body from landing in, taking off from, or overflying the territory of the Union. Those measures are leading to a reduced air traffic in the airspace over the territory of the Union. The impact at the Union-wide level should however not be comparable to the reduction of air traffic which resulted from the outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic in March 2020. Therefore, it is appropriate to maintain the existing measures and processes for the implementation of the performance and charging scheme in RP3,

HAS ADOPTED THIS DECISION:

Article 1

The performance targets contained in the draft performance plan submitted by Spain, pursuant to Regulation (EC) No 549/2004, and listed in the Annex to this Decision, are consistent with the Union-wide performance targets for the third reference period set out in Implementing Decision (EU) 2021/891.

Article 2

This Decision is addressed to the Kingdom of Spain.

Done at Brussels, 13 April 2022.

For the Commission
Adina VĂLEAN
Member of the Commission

ANNEX

Performance targets included in the draft performance plan, submitted by Spain pursuant to Regulation (EC) No 549/2004, found to be consistent with the Union-wide performance targets for the third reference period

KEY PERFORMANCE AREA OF SAFETY**Effectiveness of safety management**

Spain	Targets on the effectiveness of safety management, expressed as a level of implementation, ranging from EASA level A to D				
Air navigation service providers concerned	Safety management objective	2021	2022	2023	2024
ENAIRES, FERRONATS	Safety policy and objectives	C	C	C	C
	Safety risk management	C	C	C	D
	Safety assurance	C	C	C	C
	Safety promotion	C	C	C	C
	Safety culture	C	C	C	C

KEY PERFORMANCE AREA OF ENVIRONMENT**Average horizontal *en route* flight efficiency of the actual trajectory**

	2021	2022	2023	2024
Draft <i>en route</i> environment targets of Spain , expressed as the average horizontal <i>en route</i> flight efficiency of the actual trajectory	3,08 %	3,08 %	3,08 %	3,08 %
Reference values for Spain	3,08 %	3,08 %	3,08 %	3,08 %

KEY PERFORMANCE AREA OF CAPACITY**Average *en route* ATFM delay in minutes per flight**

	2021	2022	2023	2024
Draft <i>en route</i> capacity targets of Spain , in minutes of ATFM delay per flight	0,12	0,20	0,19	0,19
Reference values for Spain	0,12	0,20	0,19	0,19

KEY PERFORMANCE AREA OF COST-EFFICIENCY

Determined unit cost for *en route* air navigation services

<i>En route</i> charging zones of Spain	2014 baseline value	2019 baseline value	2020 -2021	2022	2023	2024
Draft <i>en route</i> cost-efficiency targets of Spain Continental, expressed as determined <i>en route</i> unit cost (in real terms at 2017 prices)	69,88 EUR	52,06 EUR	107,71 EUR	53,64 EUR	51,69 EUR	48,19 EUR
Draft <i>en route</i> cost-efficiency targets of Spain Canarias, expressed as determined <i>en route</i> unit cost (in real terms at 2017 prices)	70,11 EUR	52,39 EUR	104,97 EUR	66,92 EUR	58,97 EUR	53,93 EUR