



COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

Brussels, 22.07.1997  
COM(97) 384 final

## **FINAL REPORT**

### **ON THE FORCE PROGRAMME**

**– Action Programme for the  
Development of Continuing Vocational Training  
in the European Community –  
(presented by the Commission)**



## **CONTENTS**

1. Council Decision and Context
2. Objectives and Content of FORCE
3. Institutional Structures
4. Transnational Measures
5. Outputs and Dissemination
6. Continuing Vocational Training in Enterprises: Facts and Figures
7. Linking Continuing Vocational Training to Community Policies
8. Financial Resources
9. Results from the External Evaluation
10. Conclusion

**Annex I:** Key Figures on the FORCE Network

**Annex II:** List of FORCE Publications

# **Final Report**

## **on the FORCE Programme**

### **for the Development of Continuing Vocational Training**

### **in the European Community**

#### **INTRODUCTION**

The interim report prepared by the Commission (document COM(94)418 final of 13 October 1994) set out the development of the FORCE Programme from 1 January 1991 to 31 December 1993.

This final report, while summarising the overall implementation of the FORCE Programme between 1 January 1991 and 31 December 1994, focuses more specifically on the issues related to outcomes: evaluation, exploitation, monitoring and dissemination of the results, and the conclusions to be drawn for the development of Community policy in the field of continuing vocational training.

#### **1. COUNCIL DECISION AND CONTEXT**

- 1.1. FORCE was launched on 1 January 1991, for a period of four years, on the basis of Council Decision 90/267/EEC establishing an action programme for the development of continuing vocational training in the European Community.
- 1.2. FORCE evolved as part of the growing consensus throughout the Community on the importance of continuing vocational training as a decisive factor in the economic and social strategies of the Member States, expressed in particular through the Council Resolution of 5 June 1989 on continuing vocational training, in which it requested the Commission to lay before it as soon as possible an action programme on continuing vocational training.
- 1.3. In line with these developments, the Commission proposal COM(89) 567 final of 8 December 1989 was submitted to the Council, the European Parliament and the Economic and Social Committee; on this basis, FORCE was adopted on 29 May 1990 (Decision 90/267/EEC) with the aim of supporting and complementing the policies and activities developed by and in the Member States in the area of continuing vocational training.

#### **2. OBJECTIVES AND CONTENT OF FORCE**

- 2.1. The objectives of the FORCE Programme, as stated in Article 2 of the Decision, were as follows:
  - a) to encourage a greater and more effective investment effort in continuing vocational training and an improved return from it, in particular by developing partnerships designed to encourage greater awareness on the part of the public authorities, undertakings – in particular small and medium-sized undertakings – both sides of industry and individual workers, of the benefits accruing from investment in continuing vocational training;
  - b) to encourage continuing vocational training measures by, for example, demonstrating and disseminating examples of good practice in continuing vocational training to those economic sectors or regions of the Community where access to, or investment in, such training is currently inadequate;

- c) to encourage innovations in the management of continuing vocational training, methodology and equipment;
- d) to take better account of the consequences of the completion of the internal market, in particular by supporting transnational and transfrontier continuing vocational training projects and the exchange of information and experience;
- e) to contribute to greater effectiveness of continuing vocational training mechanisms and their capacity to respond to changes in the European labour market, by promoting measures at all levels, in particular to monitor and analyse the development of continuing vocational training and identify better ways of forecasting requirements in terms of qualifications and occupations.

2.2. FORCE was made up of two sets of measures, set out in Article 3 of the Decision:

- firstly, a 'common framework of guidelines' aiming at the promotion of common targets between the Member States, particularly as far as incentives to invest in continuing vocational training and wider access to it were concerned (Art. 5 of the FORCE Decision); Art. 11 of the FORCE Decision required the Member States to report to the Commission on the steps taken to implement the common framework of guidelines, including information on current arrangements to promote and finance continuing vocational training.
- secondly, the transnational measures backing up the Member State initiatives (Art. 6 and the Annex to the Decision).

### 3. INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURES

- 3.1. The Commission was assisted in the implementation of the Programme by an Advisory Committee (after 1 July 1992, on the basis of the Council Decision of 16 March 1992, a Single Advisory Committee for EUROTECNET and FORCE) made up of two representatives from each Member State, usually from the Ministries of Labour and Education, and twelve observers from both sides of industry at European level (UNICE/CEEP and ETUC). This composition helped to ensure effective interplay between Community action and Member State policies and practice, and the Committee played an active role in advising the Commission on the operational guidelines governing FORCE, the allocation of budgetary resources and the overall balance between different measures.
- 3.2. To ensure effective implementation of FORCE at national level, the Commission assigned to the FORCE Committee members the task of setting up National Coordination Units in each Member State. These Units carried out widespread information and advisory activities on the programme: publicizing calls for proposals, working closely with promoters on the presentation and management of projects, monitoring the projects throughout their implementation, and disseminating the results of the programme at national level; in addition, they played a key role in the implementation of the surveys/analyses strand of FORCE, particularly as far as contacts with the social partners and evaluation of the findings at national level were concerned. They met regularly at the invitation of the Commission to coordinate their activities at Community level.
- 3.3. Most Member States also set up National Committees composed of the national representatives of the FORCE Committee, representatives of other administrations, both sides of industry, and usually the National Coordination Unit. Their role varied from country to country but involved essentially bringing together the principal institutional actors in continuing vocational training for the approval or validation of FORCE activities and dissemination of their results. This implied a two-way information flow between the Commission and the Member States and a forum for the coordination of Community and national priorities.

- 3.4. The FORCE Technical Assistance Office, numbering 18-20 persons, provided technical assistance to the Commission at European level, carrying out a wide range of project-based tasks and specific expert and technical activities.

#### **4. TRANSNATIONAL MEASURES**

- 4.1. At the core of the transnational measures is the principle of the transfer of knowledge, innovation, experience and know-how throughout the Community, on the basis of active partnerships between companies, the social partners and research and training institutes. FORCE provided the first testing ground for a collaborative approach to the development of Community continuing training policy and practice.
- 4.2. The transnational measures described in Article 6 and in the Annex to the FORCE Decision comprised Action I – Support for innovation in continuing vocational training and Action II – Analysis, monitoring, assessment and forecasting.
- 4.3. In practice these activities were grouped into 'direct' and 'research' projects. After consultation of the FORCE Committee, two types of procedure were adopted to develop these two distinct strands of the Programme, and set out in the FORCE VADEMECUM. Briefly, the Type 1 procedure, referring to the 'direct' projects, involved publication of an open call for proposals in the Official Journal, and a three-fold selection process before consultation of the Advisory Committee and final decision by the Commission. The Type 2 procedure for the 'research' projects operated according to a restricted choice: the members of the Advisory Committee indicated expert organisations to carry out the work and were consulted on approach, content and methodology; findings were submitted to the FORCE National Coordination Units and the Advisory Committee for evaluation at national and European levels respectively.

#### **4.4. "Direct" projects**

- 4.4.1. So called because application was made directly to the Commission following a call for proposals published in the Official Journal (see OJ Nos C 111 of 26.04.91, C 1 of 04.01.92 and C 92 of 02.04.93), the direct projects covered:

- 1) pilot projects focused on the development and dissemination of innovative training management, techniques and materials;
- 2) qualification projects centred on the analysis of enterprise skill and training needs;
- 3) exchanges between human resource managers, trainers, workers' representatives, unions and employers' associations, designed to promote the rapid dissemination of innovation in continuing vocational training.

- 4.4.2. Three calls for proposals were announced during the life of FORCE, resulting in the selection of 720 projects (out of a total of some 2400 submitted). Priorities were adjusted from call to call, but consistently addressed the quality of projects assessed from the point of view of their potential contribution to investment in continuing vocational training by companies and access to it for all groups of workers; the direct involvement of companies in priority, particularly SMEs, and of the social partners; the design, development and implementation of training plans as part of companies' business strategy; the significance of the transnational partnerships.

- 4.4.3. The third and last call in 1993, it should be recalled, comprised two strands with a specific focus of particular significance for the development of continuing vocational training within the Community: Strand I centred on the development of training and qualification in companies as a response to the challenge of industrial changes and the dissemination and transfer of innovative

solutions in the Member States; Strand II linked the 'direct' projects with the action-oriented research carried out under FORCE by focusing on the testing, dissemination and development of the results of the sectoral surveys of continuing vocational training plans (on the retail trade, agro-food and car repair sectors) and of the analysis of contractual policy on continuing vocational training. This was an initiative with a high potential for multiplier effects. The results are examined below.

4.4.4. The 720 projects selected under the three calls created a highly significant transnational network of companies, social partners and training institutes (and, after 1993, public authorities) for the transfer of expertise and innovation in continuing vocational training. The network comprises over 7000 members of which 50% are companies, in large part SMEs or groupings of SMEs, and some 15% represent the social partners. (Direct company and social partner involvement in fact increased from call to call.). The key figures on the FORCE Network are presented in Annex I to this report.

4.4.5. Overall distribution of FORCE projects according to the country of origin of the contractor was as follows:

Country	N° projects	Amount allocated (ECU)
B	58	5,063,000
D	75	6,640,500
DK	31	2,770,000
E	82	6,602,600
F	90	6,480,375
GR	70	5,428,500
I	77	6,777,000
IRL	48	3,536,000
L	12	1,026,500
NL	34	2,730,000
P	43	3,421,475
UK	89	7,343,400
	709	57,819,350

#### 4.5. "Research" projects

4.5.1. The transnational 'research' projects comprise the FORCE Sectoral Surveys of continuing vocational training plans, the Analysis of contractual policy on continuing vocational training, the Statistical Survey of company continuing vocational training, the Reporting System – access, quality and volume of continuing vocational training in Europe – and the European Continuing Training Report. Together these activities provide a concentration of data on national systems and practices and a substantial fund of information for both sides of industry, companies and policy-makers at all levels.

4.5.2. A number of innovations in respect of methodology and dissemination of results were introduced into the **sectoral surveys**, whose aims and procedures were described in the Interim Report on the FORCE Programme:

- following the intermediate external evaluation, the **methodological tools** (overall examination of the sector, case-study analysis) developed for the first three surveys (retail trade, agro-food and car repair) were reinforced and simplified, then tested in the course of the fourth European survey on the road transport sector; the results confirmed the aptness of the approach and the transferability of the methodology;
- the proposal to **link the results of the surveys to the calls for proposals in respect of the "direct" projects** was tested out in 1993 with the launch of a specific call for proposals tied in

with the results of the first three sectoral surveys; the final external evaluation shows that the 'specific call' approach is not conclusive and that the real added value of the surveys lies in a structured European debate with the parties concerned (enterprises, public authorities, social partners), as part of a systematic process of monitoring, evaluation and dissemination of the work (including pilot projects and exchange programmes) initiated by the Commission in liaison with the Member States and the sector's major players;

- two further experiments in 1993-94 focused on carrying out sectoral analyses through the **networking of "direct" projects accepted in the wake of the call for proposals** in the motor vehicle construction and tourism sectors; the main benefit from this approach is not so much the identification of innovative, meaningful practices as the setting up of a common reference framework for transnational cooperation between the various parties directly involved (e.g. persons responsible for in-house training).

4.5.3. The **analysis of contractual policy** gave rise to consideration of the mechanisms for disseminating "good practices" and the development of methodological tools relating to transferability; one outcome has been the setting up, on the initiative of the social partners and in the context of the Social Dialogue, of the support mechanism.

4.5.4. The **Synoptic Report** on continuing vocational training access, quality and volume in Europe, the **Community Statistical Survey** on continuing vocational training in companies and the **European Report** on the current situation and future perspectives for continuing training in Europe are three essential and complementary instruments for pursuing the aims of Article 127 EC, namely to "develop exchanges of information and experience on issues common to the training systems of the Member States". The convergent perspectives emerging from these activities may be summarised as follows:

- \* **Broadening of access** to continuing vocational training – It is acknowledged without question that wider access to continuing vocational training for the working population first and foremost places responsibility on individuals who require such training in order to maintain or enhance their employability. Improving access is not so much a matter of granting leave for training purposes (a measure which cannot be guaranteed to be effective) as of providing individual guidance, ensuring transparency of the training market, devising new ways of acquiring key skills, and developing a framework to promote the individualisation of training.

This does not obviate the need for action on a number of fronts by public authorities and companies with a view to building an attractive, transparent and efficient mechanism to encourage individual awareness and to provide clarification of responsibilities as regards financing.

It has also been found that, in various countries, access to continuing training in companies is enhanced through greater participation by categories of employees other than supervisory or managerial staff. The growing significance of training at the workplace reflects this development, even though various questions relating to validation of the skills thus acquired remain open.

- \* **Decentralisation** – At national level, this amounts to regionalisation, i.e. greater responsibility in training matters for the Regions, while at company level (especially the large companies) there is a loosening of hierarchical structures, i.e. greater responsibility for training is given to the different production units, departments, etc. within the company.
- \* **Financing** – Two trends are apparent. Firstly, there is a discernible move, both within companies and on the part of the public authorities of certain countries, towards cost control (proof of the usefulness of a continuing training course is of growing significance in this context) and, secondly, development of mixed financing systems.

It should be noted that the question of greater cost control is considered in different countries not only from the point of view of company financing of continuing training but also in terms



of financing of the training activities of individuals on the labour market, for whom it is deemed necessary to redefine the concepts of financing and the methods of allocating resources.

As for the other "serious" trend, the development of co-financing, it should be pointed out that the concept is not in itself a new one (there have for some time been systems based on "time invested by one party, money invested by the other") but its formalisation – and hence clarification of "who pays what?" – represents a strategic challenge for the countries concerned.

- \* **Quality assurance** – There is a risk of the debate getting bogged down in rhetoric, although there is a real need to develop "Quality Charters" or even suitably standardised approaches to continuing training in accordance with national practices. (The ISO 9000 standards are but one example).

A further requirement, no less important, is to clarify or even codify the status of the trainer, with particular reference to workers who spend part of their time training other people involved in reintegration or further vocational training courses.

These perspectives are in line with the challenges identified and recognised generally for continuing training: access, development of skills, raising of the general level of qualifications, granting of a minimum qualification to groups at risk and all-round high-quality continuing training, with due regard for efficient achievement of the different objectives.

## 5. OUTPUTS AND DISSEMINATION

5.1. It was during the final year of FORCE that the majority of the findings and products of the 'direct' projects and of the research strand started to become available and that attention turned in priority to capitalising on these findings and products: to their evaluation and validation, to the most effective means of dissemination and, where appropriate, commercialisation, and to their significance for the future development of Community vocational training policy.

### 5.2. 'Transnational Product' label

5.2.1. FORCE pilot and qualification project promoters were contractually obliged to develop a tangible 'product' such as a manual, software, interactive computer system or a report, analysis or methodology. End 1994 saw the finalisation of some 620 such products developed by the projects implemented under the three calls for proposals. It was therefore necessary for the Commission to introduce a procedure for the evaluation of these products in terms of the objectives of the FORCE programme.

5.2.2. This process resulted in the identification of high-quality products and recognition of their quality through the allocation of a 'label'. It also called for a first analysis of the product commercialisation plans submitted by promoters and so served as a test of the initial strategy adopted by the Commission concerning the commercialisation of continuing training products.

5.2.3. Evaluation was carried out both internally (by the Commission assisted by the Technical Assistance Office) and externally by independent continuing vocational training experts nominated by the members of the FORCE/EUROTECNET Committee. For products resulting from Strand II of the 1993 call, which was based on the results of the sectoral surveys and analyses of contractual policy, the Commission also consulted experts in the areas concerned.

5.2.4. The core of the exercise was the adoption by the Commission, after consultation of the independent experts, of the relevant criteria for evaluation. It was agreed that there were two overall priorities in terms of FORCE objectives: a) quality and innovativeness and b) interest for transfer and dissemination. The final evaluation, while involving overall analysis of project

management and project characteristics in terms of thematic area and target groups, focused more specifically on the nature and quality of the project outcome or product, the effectiveness of the planned methods of transfer and dissemination and the relevance of the commercialisation plan where submitted.

5.2.5. Overall positive assessment in terms of quality/innovativeness and dissemination/transfer was the basis of the decision on whether the product should be allocated the 'Transnational product' label. The Commission also placed particular importance on two technical criteria, i.e. the number of languages in which the product existed and its accessibility in terms of technical standards and user-friendliness.

5.2.6. Following the internal and external evaluations, the members of the former FORCE/EUROTECNET Committee were consulted before a final decision list was drawn up, resulting in the allocation of the 'Transnational product' label to some 56% of the products eligible for consideration.

### 5.3. Publication

5.3.1. An essential first step towards the effective Europe-wide dissemination of FORCE results has been the systematic publication of information on the programme's outputs.

5.3.2. As far as the 'direct' projects are concerned, the FORCE PRODUCT CATALOGUE provides a precise and accessible guide to the results: there is an entry for each project describing the product objectives, content, target groups and potential users, equipment necessary for use, languages and availability.

5.3.3. The findings of the surveys and analyses strand of FORCE were systematically evaluated at national and European level by the relevant authorities and subsequently published and distributed. The FORCE DIRECTORY OF RESEARCH ON CONTINUING VOCATIONAL TRAINING IN EUROPE summarizes the content of the surveys and analyses carried out, notes the rapporteurs and central research teams involved in each case, and indicates where these works can be acquired. The Directory also reports on the findings of the European thematic and sectoral conferences organised by the Commission, usually in association with the National Coordination Units.

5.3.4. The Data of the Continuing Vocational Training Survey are available at EUROSTAT and will be presented in the relevant EUROSTAT publications collection.

5.3.5. A list of FORCE publications is presented in Annex II to this report.

### 5.4. Dissemination and commercialisation

5.4.1. The promoters of FORCE pilot and qualification projects were contractually obliged to provide for dissemination measures; in general these included existing networks (professional or sectoral federations or associations, chambers of commerce, regional consortia...), thematic or sectoral seminars, conferences and meetings, integration into course syllabuses, publication of information in the general press or professional journals.

5.4.2. Commercialisation was however optional though dependent on the authorisation of the Commission; this raised the question of the appropriate conditions for commercialisation, conditions which would ensure that only quality projects received a 'seal of approval' from the Commission and which would take account both of the interest of the Community in exploiting the results and of the legitimate commercial rights of the individual promoter.

5.4.3. Consequently a pilot experiment was launched under FORCE to test the appropriate terms for commercialisation; this involved the preparation of a supplementary contract to the original contract signed by the promoter, inspired by the provisions of Council Decision 94/762/EC concerning the rules for the dissemination of the research results from the specific programmes of research, technological development and demonstration of the European Community.

5.4.4. Under this supplementary contract the Commission waived all rights to remuneration and, dependent on satisfactory evaluation of the product (see paragraph 5.2 above), gave its authorisation for commercialisation in return for

- submission of a satisfactory commercialisation plan agreed by all project partners,
- availability of the product to all partners, and to third parties on appropriate terms,
- allocation to the Commission of information and demonstration rights in the product.

5.4.5. About one-third of promoters submitted commercialisation plans of which the majority were approved. The Commission reserved the right to ask for a progress report after one year so as to test the results of this strategy and learn more about the practical issues confronting promoters in this area.

5.4.6. This exercise could provide input to thinking on the preparation of a Community Instrument which would constitute a coherent and coordinated framework for the dissemination and exploitation of training products as the basis of an effective response to the Europe-wide need for vocational training and qualification. This Instrument would define

1) the interests of the Community, and in particular

- respond to the objectives of Community vocational training policy as set out in Article 127 of the Treaty on European Union,
- contribute to the strengthening of the competitiveness of European industry,
- promote economic and social cohesion,
- respond to the needs of other Community policies;

2) the legal, commercial and industrial rights of individual promoters.

## 5.5. Dissemination at national level

5.5.1. FORCE National Coordination Units had a special responsibility for the dissemination of products at national level and were asked by the Commission to prepare national dissemination plans including information on

- national networks, existing or to be set up, for the dissemination of training products;
- analysis of the procedures and methods of dissemination and commercialisation of products prepared by each project;
- priority projects (which could be the basis of LEONARDO multiplier-effect projects);
- dissemination events, e.g. thematic or sectoral seminars, product fairs, organised at national level.

5.5.2. Most Units had good relationships with the existing regional, sectoral and professional networks operating in the continuing training field in their countries and had set up more or less close-knit networks of FORCE promoters; a number had prepared national data bases, catalogues of products and newsletters; knowledge of and contacts with project promoters were generally good. However, it did emerge from this exercise that for the future reinforced cooperation between projects and National Coordination Units is necessary in this area: it is important for promoters to plan their dissemination and commercialisation activities in operational and financial terms from the outset of the project and for them to be able to consult the Coordination Units on the

possibilities available and the obligations incurred in this field; Units should be encouraged by the Commission to take a more proactive line in promoting product dissemination.

## 5.6. Impact Conferences

5.6.1. The FORCE Impact Conferences, organised at the request of the Commission by the National Coordination Unit in each Member State, represented an opportunity to assess the outcomes of FORCE at national level and their significance for future Community vocational training policy.

5.6.2. The Impact Conferences brought together the principal actors in the continuing vocational training area in each Member State. Organised around one theme of particular significance for the country concerned, often relating to industrial change in the national context, all Conferences examined both the achievements of FORCE and the transition to future programmes, focusing on:

- presentation of the practical results and products of projects and research, including organisation of a products fair;
- discussion of the programme's added value as a Community programme;
- analysis of its impact at national, sectoral, regional and enterprise level; to what extent had FORCE met the needs of companies, the national authorities, the social partners?
- analysis of transnational cooperation in the framework of FORCE, particularly as far as the composition, development and functioning of transnational partnerships was concerned;
- examination of the questions of dissemination and commercialisation;
- promotion of new partnerships and networks in the context of LEONARDO and ADAPT.

5.6.3. The reports on the individual Impact Conferences are available. They indicate a wide range of – largely positive – experience of FORCE impact on continuing vocational training at different levels. Analysis of the extent of this impact, its importance for different countries, and the levels on which it can be perceived, is a matter for the external evaluation of the programme (see Chapter 9 below). However, it should be stated that nearly all national representatives of the programme noted its impact on continuing vocational training policy, mechanisms and infrastructure in their Member States.

## 6. CONTINUING VOCATIONAL TRAINING IN ENTERPRISES: FACTS AND FIGURES

6.1. Training provided by enterprises is one of the many ways in which learning experiences can be pursued throughout one's lifetime. The survey on Continuing Vocational Training (hereinafter referred to as CVT) carried out by enterprises employing 10 or more persons has recently been completed by EUROSTAT. This survey covers the year 1993 and consequently provides a snapshot of the situation at the time. It addresses only the then 12 Member States.

### 6.2. Nearly 60% of enterprises provided CVT in 1993 .....

Within the European Union (EUR 12), nearly 60% of enterprises with 10 or more employees carried out various forms of CVT in 1993.

% of enterprises (10 +) providing CVT

B	DK	D	GR	E	F	IRL	I	L	NL	P	UK	EUR
46	87	85	16	27	64	77	15	60	56	13	81	58

### 6.3. .... through different forms of CVT

In those enterprises which provided CVT in 1993, 67% did so through external courses, and 40% through internal courses. CVT in the work situation was provided by 66% of enterprises, and conferences by 59%. Finally, CVT occurred through job rotation in 24% and through self-learning in 22% of enterprises providing CVT. These forms of training are not mutually exclusive; some enterprises could be involved in all forms of CVT.

% of enterprises (10 +) providing CVT

External courses	Internal courses	CVT in the work situation	Conferences	Job rotation	Self-learning
67	40	66	59	24	22

#### 6.4. CVT Opportunities varied with the enterprise size .....

On average, opportunities of participating in a CVT course seem to be higher in large enterprises than in small. In the total EUR 12, in enterprises employing up to 100, employees have less than half the chance of attending CVT courses by comparison with enterprises employing 500 or more in 1993. Employees of enterprises employing up to 50 have less than a one in six chance of attending a CVT course while those in enterprises employing 500 and over have better than a one in three chance of attending CVT courses.

participation in CVT courses in % of total employment

10-49	50-99	100-249	250-499	500-999	1000 +	All enterprises
13	18	23	31	34	43	28

6.5. .... in nearly all the Member States

participation in CVT courses in % of total employment

Size of enterprise	10 - 49 employees	50 - 59 employees	100 - 249 employees	250 - 499 employees	500 - 999 employees	1000 + employees
<b>EUR 12</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>23</b>	<b>31</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>43</b>
Belgium	14	15	16	30	46	42
Denmark	37	32	37	34	33	28
Germany	17	16	16	22	22	34
Greece	4	12	17	19	24	18
Spain	7	9	15	26	31	45
France	11	24	31	43	45	54
Ireland	24	32	46	59	47	59
Italy	2	5	9	15	23	31
Luxembourg	14	17	23	30	14	39
Netherlands	13	19	24	30	30	38
Portugal	5	6	11	12	23	32
UK	20	28	36	43	48	52

6.6. **The average participation rate in CVT courses was 28 %, with major differences between Member States.**

Having combined the different approaches to CVT in different Member States, one observes that in 1993, employees of enterprises which provided CVT accounted for between 39% (Portugal) and 96% (Germany) of all employees. High levels of employees working for enterprises providing training are in Germany, Denmark, the UK, France, Ireland, Luxembourg and the Netherlands, each of which has 80% and upwards of employees working for such companies. At the other end of the scale, enterprises providing training accounted for between 39% and 67% of employees in Portugal, Italy, Greece, Spain and Belgium.

The percentage of employees of enterprises which provide CVT and who attended CVT courses ranges from 49% (Ireland) to 24% (Greece). Most EUR 12 Member States have participation above 32%, while 4 stand at 41% or higher (Ireland - 49%, France - 42%, Belgium - 41%, UK- 41%).

The probability of working for an enterprise which provided CVT in 1993 ranged from almost 100% in Germany, Denmark and the United Kingdom to above 50% for virtually all the other EUR 12 Member States. The probability of being an employee of a CVT provider and of participating in a CVT course in 1993 ranged from 24% to 49%.

	Employees of CVT providers as % of employees of all enterprises	Employees who participated in CVT courses as % of employees of CVT providers	Employees who participated in CVT courses as % of employees of all enterprises
<b>EUR 12</b>	82	35	28
Belgium	67	41	25
Denmark	93	37	34
Germany	96	25	24
Greece	54	24	13
Spain	57	36	20
France	87	42	36
Ireland	87	49	43
Italy	53	27	14
Luxembourg	80	30	24
Netherlands	82	32	26
Portugal	39	35	13
UK	93	41	39

## 7. LINKING CONTINUING VOCATIONAL TRAINING TO COMMUNITY POLICIES

### 7.1. CVT AND INDUSTRIAL CHANGE

7.1.1. Against the background of the new Treaty on European Union, in particular Art. 127 EC, and the White Paper on Growth, Competitiveness and Employment, the FORCE programme aimed at addressing one of their main objectives: the adaptation of the workforce to industrial change.

7.1.2. In 1993, a **special call for proposals** was organised in the framework of the programme. Here, industrial change was defined as the ongoing process of change in all aspects of economic activity, brought about by developments in technology, production systems, work organisation and market and information strategies. Promoters were invited to submit innovative and transnational project proposals focusing on:

- \* SME training needs;
- \* the anticipation of companies' medium-term qualification needs and the response to these needs in terms of innovative training and qualification products, methods and content;
- \* the design, development and implementation of training plans which are part of companies' development strategies;
- \* access to continuing vocational training by low-skilled or unqualified workers.

7.1.3. In addition to the funding of the projects selected in the above call, the debate on industrial change concentrated on three perspectives:

- \* the **institutional perspective**: In the framework of the Single Advisory Committee for FORCE and EUROTECNET, a working group was set up to prepare a report containing a short analysis of the main focus of industrial change projects in each Member State and a brief description of national strategies in the context of industrial change. Social Partner contributions on this issue complement Member State views. A European overview aims to provide a synopsis and to draw some conclusions for future activity.
- \* the **perspective of project promoters**: discussions took place with project promoters on continuing vocational training projects dealing with industrial change. This debate resulted in

the definition of six main thematic fields of activity which are of particular importance in facing up to industrial change:

- Provision of key competencies or multiskilling and the development of self-learning-competence. Development of training-on-the-job methods to ensure that the delivery of training meets companies' needs.
  - Analysis of economic development and labour market trends in order to anticipate qualification needs at regional or enterprise level or to define new job profiles.
  - Training for unqualified or low-skilled workers, including those directly threatened by unemployment, to improve their job stability or to prepare them for new occupations. Especially companies or branches with a high rate of unqualified workers are developing specific measures in this field.
  - Training plans for an enterprise workforce as a whole or for the management level in the frame of a Human Resource Development strategy.
  - Design of training to meet the specific needs and problems of SMEs, with an emphasis on co-operation between suppliers and customers and with common continuing training strategies.
  - Intensive transfer of know-how in single project networks and dissemination of results and products on a regional, sectoral and transsectoral level.
- \* the perspective towards structural policy: Building on experience with the reinforcement of FORCE in the EUROFORM initiative (cf. Interim Report COM(94) 418 final), FORCE aimed at stimulating a complementary approach towards training and industrial change. This tie-in with structural policy was important to ensure a coherent strategy towards adaptation to industrial change and contributed to the successful implementation of the new Objective 4 of the European Social Fund and the Community Initiative ADAPT.

7.1.4. There are a number of conclusions which can be drawn from the FORCE debates on vocational training and industrial change; the following themes in particular merit future analysis and development, in order to transfer innovation into mainstream policy:

- \* training plans and the ongoing improvement of skills and qualification in the process of industrial change;
- \* the development and provision of key competencies and their incorporation into vocational training and qualifications (the EUROTECNET programme has produced an important publication on this issue which complements the work on industrial change);
- \* the quality of vocational training supply will be an issue of particular importance for the future;
- \* training and retraining of unqualified workers, those who are first victims of industrial change, must remain on the agenda and new ways of providing training have to be devised;
- \* systematic skill needs analysis and innovative training measures must be transferred into mainstream policies and programmes if they are to have a real impact; there is a need for effective linkage with structural policy;
- \* training in the context of industrial change requires the setting up of national systems of vocational qualification to improve the internal and external flexibility of workers and employees.



The FORCE programme permitted a strategic view of these issues and so contributed to the development of an overall Community approach on continuing vocational training in the context of industrial change.

## 7.2. CVT AND INDUSTRIAL COMPETITIVENESS OF THE AUTOMOTIVE INDUSTRY

7.2.1. In its Communication on the automobile industry of February 1994 (COM(94) 49 final), the European Commission announced that a transnational network including automotive companies would be established in the field of vocational training. The aims of this network would be to encourage co-operation in the industry and to ensure a high level of participation of the automobile industry in the training programmes of the European Community. First efforts to create this network were undertaken within the framework of the FORCE programme. Starting in September 1994, a project was set up with two main objectives: On the one hand it aimed to ensure a wider and more effective dissemination and transfer of existing work in the automobile industry supported by the European Commission. On the other hand, its aim was to prepare new transnational projects with the participation of companies. The project was completed in the summer of 1995 and a final report presented in September 1995.

7.2.2. The network explored three thematic clusters into which most of the training activity can be gathered. **Training for new work structures** is concerned with the new qualifications needed to work in team organisations, both in production and in product development. **Training for co-makership** is concerned with the transfer of knowledge between car manufacturers and suppliers: training in relation to quality management, new logistics and simultaneous engineering. The third cluster refers to the development of training methods and training material, which are suitable for **training while working**. This is becoming increasingly necessary as training is now extended to much larger numbers of employees than in the past.

7.2.3. The two main recommendations flowing from the network are:

- \* A substantial number of transnational training projects aimed at helping industry in its efforts to cope with the completion of the Internal Market in the automobile industry and its supplying sectors should be supported in the future. There is a clear interest in the industry in participating in such projects and there is widespread agreement that the industry can profit from **co-operation** in this field.
- \* A serious effort should be undertaken to support networking between these and other training projects in order to improve the exchange of information and experiences between enterprises, and ultimately to promote and develop future initiatives in response to **jointly identified needs** in the industry.

7.2.4. Building on the existing experience, the most important players in the European automotive industry – both manufacturers and suppliers under the lead of their European federations ACEA and CLEPA – set up enhanced networks in the Leonardo da Vinci programme. The Commission, in its recent Communication on the European automobile industry (COM(96) 327 final), has already welcomed this work leading to **common training approaches of the European industry**.

## 7.3. SURVEY OF CVT IN THE ROAD TRANSPORT SECTOR

7.3.1. The final sectoral survey carried out under FORCE analyses in depth the forces of change affecting CVT in a sector for which the Community has a special responsibility, the training needs of this sector and examples of best practice. It sets out to examine what strategies are being adopted by companies to cope with, in particular, safety concerns and regulations, quality programmes, European legislation, technology developments, customer demand and environmental concerns.

7.3.2. The procedure adopted for the implementation of this survey – the methodology, choice of significant themes for analysis and case-studies – was closely monitored by the social partners of

the sector (the European secretariats and members of the national federations of the International Road Transport Union and the Committee of Transport Unions' Workers in the EC).

7.3.3. The survey reveals a **dramatic lack of investment in CVT**, whatever the Member State or size of company concerned. Small companies in particular, for a variety of reasons, suffer from a lack of sophisticated or innovative CVT; in larger companies it tends to be more effective because such companies are obliged to design formal training plans to ensure that all employees can deliver service to a set standard.

7.3.4. The need for improvement in utilisation or take-up of training is generally admitted, particularly in the following areas:

- \* **New Technology Management:** employees have to be trained in the operation and management of IT, EDI, satellite tracking and logistics systems.
- \* **Customer Service:** customers have a strong influence on the type and level of CVT undertaken, often demanding the adoption of ISO 9000 and quality training programmes. What is more, while the core functions of the driver's job still include the transport of goods from place of origin to destination, loading and unloading, knowledge of transport goods and the relevant rules, increasingly he – or she – has to play the role of ambassador of the company and needs training in the area of customer relations.
- \* **Safety Standards:** drivers need to learn to cope with stress, dangerous traffic conditions, advanced vehicle technologies, etc.
- \* **Foreign languages:** the need for training in foreign languages is expected to grow along with the trend towards internationalisation of road transport.

7.3.5. The report makes **recommendations** in four major areas:

- \* **Overall strategy:** the allocation of responsibility for training at a high level in the organisation would ensure that training policy forms an integral part of overall corporate strategic development. Procedures for assessment of individual training needs and feedback from CVT participants should be formalised as part of this strategy;
- \* **Development of CVT plans and evaluation:** CVT plans should be designed in relation to **strategic objectives and related goals** and existing employee skills matched against the targets. As far as the selection of CVT themes and purchase or design of CVT programmes are concerned, specific targets should be set in relation to these for the expected results of training; such targets could include, for example, reduction in road accidents, reduction in late goods deliveries, 100% utilisation of a new computer system, number of drivers reaching a certain level of fluency in a chosen language. Training results should be evaluated against the goals and targets originally set;
- \* **Training materials and techniques:** innovative materials and training techniques should be investigated, for example, simulator driving machines, interactive videos, role play, case studies, group discussions; it is important to examine the potential of distance learning programmes which allow drivers to learn without significantly disrupting their schedules. This should lead to increased awareness of the capabilities and expertise of external training organisations and improved transparency regarding their operations. Important techniques would include the creation of innovative partnerships between training entities and small companies, and close contacts with customers so that training content can be continuously adapted to their needs;
- \* **Training culture:** the **corporate culture** should be infiltrated with themes from the training programmes so that training becomes a continuous process. For example, quality programmes are continued with standards being set on a regular basis; training on satisfying customer needs will be more effective if there are few barriers between the employee and the customer;

CVT courses on safety are more meaningful if safety records are subsequently published on a regular basis. In addition, reward schemes can be set up after relevant CVT. Building relationships with the drivers in particular is important as they spend much of their working hours alone and can become isolated from the corporate culture.

- 7.3.6. The findings of the survey were welcomed by the social partners of the sector, who have also expressed the wish to ensure the dissemination of the good practice identified in the report. Furthermore, a **European analysis of the training and qualification needs of both companies and workers** in the sector and a **cost/benefit analysis** of training in road transport are cofinanced under the LEONARDO da VINCI programme. It is to be expected that these activities will help decision-makers to put training at the top of the road transport agenda.

## 8. FINANCIAL RESOURCES

- 8.1. Financial support for FORCE over the four-year period 1991-1994 amounted to around 83.4 MECU. While financial resources increased each year, owing in large part to the continued support of the European Parliament, they did not keep pace with the demand for projects.
- 8.2. Allocation of financial resources to the different activities of the Programme are summarized below (round figures):

	MECU			
	1991	1992	1993	1994
Projects	9.5 <sup>(1)</sup>	13.3	17.9 <sup>(2)</sup>	17.4 <sup>(3)</sup>
Sectoral surveys	0.5	1.2	0.6	1.3
Contractual policy	0.5	0.3	0.4	0.4
Statistical survey	0.1	0.5	1.5	3.2
Managing Chart	0.3	0.1	-	0.3
Art. 11 reports	-	0.2	0.6	0.3
National Coordination Units	0.9	1.0	2.3	2.3
Network activities (Conferences, seminars ...)	0.2	0.5	0.4	0.8
Evaluation <sup>(4)</sup>	-	-	0.3	-
Technical assistance	1.8	1.8	<sup>(5)</sup>	<sup>(6)</sup>
Mini-budget <sup>(7)</sup>	0.2	0.5	-	-
TOTAL	14.0	19.4	24.0	26.0

<sup>(1)</sup> Includes specific budget line of 1 MECU for projects originating in the 5 New Länder.

<sup>(2)</sup> Includes 8 MECU allocated to the second year renewal of 1991 and 1992 pilot and qualification projects.

<sup>(3)</sup> 9.9 MECU allocated to the renewal of 1992 projects and 7.5 MECU for projects accepted under Strand II of the 1993 call for proposals.

<sup>(4)</sup> Does not include the amount spent for the final external evaluation (0.18 MECU) which was paid on budget line B3-1021 in 1995.

<sup>(5)</sup> 1,080,960 MECU on Technical Assistance "Personnel" budget line (Article A1178 of the General Budget) and 868,500 ECU on the "Operations" line (Article A0238).

<sup>(6)</sup> 1,041,709 MECU on Technical Assistance "Personnel" budget line (Article A01178) and 847,500 ECU on the "Operations" line (Article A02380).

<sup>(7)</sup> Administrative costs linked to the programme (financed under budget line B8).

8.3. Comparison between commitment appropriations and payment appropriations is as follows:

	Commitment appropriations	Amounts committed	Payment appropriations	Amounts paid
1991 <sup>(8)</sup>	13,846,000	13,845,289	13,846,000	13,768,026
1992 <sup>(8)</sup>	18,920,000	18,918,195	18,920,000	18,773,648
1993 <sup>(8)</sup>	24,000,000	23,996,220	19,200,000	19,199,999
1994 <sup>(8)</sup>	26,000,000	25,997,556	25,044,000	24,699,492
1995 <sup>(9)</sup>	-----	-----	-----	4,707,779
1996 <sup>(9)</sup>	-----	-----	-----	583,929

8.4. The audit work carried out under the FORCE Programme has been analysed on two levels, firstly in more specific financial terms and secondly with regard to the lessons to be learned in connection with the operational management of a programme such as FORCE.

8.4.1. As far as **financial transparency** is concerned, there is a demonstrable need to adopt a number of specific measures, in priority:

- stricter rules for eligibility of expenditure (especially for personnel costs);
- revised budget forming part of the agreement on the basis of the allocation determined;
- compilation of an administrative and financial manual to clarify the reporting rules and relations with the partners;
- form of agreement for subcontracted tasks.

8.4.2. As regards **project evaluation practices**, it is proposed that the interim evaluation be reinforced. It should be of a substantial nature, focusing on four elements: content innovation, financial report and budget for the second phase, transnationality of the partnership and quality of the training product; it should involve independent experts and be carried out according to a procedure whereby inadequate projects can be adapted or halted. As for the final evaluation, it should be more output-related, i.e. focused on the evaluation of training products (content innovation, educational quality, utilisation of new technologies and multimedia) and the financial report; it should incorporate an enhanced procedure for labelling of training products with a view to large-scale dissemination.

8.4.3. As regards **project follow-up**, three specific activities to assist promoters are advocated:

- development by the Commission of a training tool covering the various aspects of management of a transnational training project, with priority given to a module on the contractual and financial aspects;
- training of experts on the Commission's accounting and financial procedures; they could operate as a "resource group" which promoters could call upon where necessary;
- broadening of the tasks of the group of external evaluators which assists the Commission in evaluating proposals and products; they could visit each project – in accordance with a schedule set out by the Commission – in order to take stock of the activities and to advise the promoters on questions concerning the Commission's accounting and financial procedures.

<sup>(8)</sup> Budget line B3-1023 (Development of Continuing Vocational Training – FORCE Programme).

<sup>(9)</sup> Budget line B3-1021 (LEONARDO da VINCI Programme).

## 9. RESULTS OF THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION <sup>(10)</sup>

9.1. This evaluation has highlighted many of the undoubted strengths of the FORCE Programme. In particular:

- Project contractors and partners were overwhelmingly positive about the benefits they enjoyed from participating in the programme.
- New CVT knowledge was generated through project-based needs analyses, networks and surveys and studies.
- Innovations occurred in the way training was delivered in many projects, in particular through a new focus on work-based learning.
- The transnational dimension of FORCE has been strong both with regard to transnational goals and awareness and in terms of cooperation between partners.
- Most projects reported that they achieved their immediate objectives and dissemination activity was among project partners.
- The programme was able to involve large numbers of SMEs, either through intermediary bodies or as pilot "test sites" – though less frequently as active partners.
- The structuring of the Article 11 and CVT Survey exercise ensured comparability at a European level about national CVT policy and enterprise CVT practice.
- FORCE was perceived to have reinforced and supported Member State CVT policies and to have been one of the most important sources of experience and inspiration for a number of successor European programmes including LEONARDO and ADAPT.

9.2. The FORCE Programme was inevitably less successful in achieving some of its objectives and its potential results were not always fully realised. In particular:

- Knowledge from FORCE surveys and studies was not widely taken up by FORCE partners.
- There is a lack of evidence so far of uptake of training outputs and products by intended beneficiaries – though this may be partly a problem of timescale.
- There was an under-representation of beneficiaries with labour market disadvantage – i.e. the less skilled, women, etc., though it has been argued (see Interim Evaluation Report) that this is difficult to achieve within a mainstream enterprise-based programme.
- Commercial exploitation of CVT products and services has not been common, although instances can be identified. FORCE experience tends to confirm that the European training market is not yet well developed.
- Third Call priorities were less influential than might have been expected: Sectoral actors were already involved in FORCE prior to the Third Call for projects; and industrial change was very broadly interpreted.

9.3. It is important to recognise that FORCE, as a relatively small programme, was effective because for the most part it supplemented and reinforced other CVT actions. Projects appeared to include a high proportion of partners already committed to vocational training in general, and CVT in particular. Many Member States were also becoming aware of the importance of CVT during the programme's lifetime, and FORCE was able to "multiply", give focus to, and raise awareness of CVT possibilities and needs.

---

<sup>(10)</sup> Final evaluation of the FORCE Programme, prepared by the Evaluation Consortium The Tavistock Institute, Bernard Brunhes Consultants & Danish Technological Institute, London, August 1996.

- 9.4. Finally, this evaluation confirms what other studies have shown: that transnational cooperation and joint working between project partners is a learned activity. Thus those with previous transnational experience worked most closely together within FORCE. Many new enterprises, training providers, sectoral bodies and intermediary organisations were brought into a transnational programme for the first time through the FORCE Programme. They and their networks are likely to have become more effective participants in transnational cooperation as a result of the FORCE experience.

## **10. CONCLUSION**

The FORCE Programme has achieved certain tangible results in relation to the investment made and the available resources. In particular, enterprises have featured prominently in the projects, genuine transnational training partnerships have been set up, a systematic policy for comparable information on national continuing training systems and arrangements has been devised, and a substantial contribution has been made to the development of knowledge on training practices, especially through the sectoral surveys and networks. This is due mainly to the fact that the Programme formed part of the strategy for the development of continuing training, encompassing national policies and Community activities (Social Dialogue, Access, Objective 4, etc.).

**Key recommendations concerned with improving the effectiveness of the Programme's management include:**

- stepping up Commission action for monitoring and evaluating transnational projects, taking into account the four elements of content innovation, financial report, transnationality of the partnership and quality of the training product;
- developing a European capacity for research activity in the field of vocational training and upgrading the methodological tools for sectoral surveys;
- systematising action to disseminate training products, providing legal certainty (property rights, etc.), backed up by professional dissemination mechanisms (specialist fairs, networks, publishers, resource centres).

**Key recommendations concerned with improving the impact of the Programme include:**

- systematising the methodologies for anticipating qualifications and skills needs, making such tools widely available to those responsible for training within enterprises, groups of enterprises, training organisations, professional institutes, etc.;
- making a concerted effort with the Member States and specialist bodies to establish quality standards for the provision of continuing training;
- developing new occupational profiles for specialists in continuing training, with particular reference to trainers and supervisors;
- carrying out a Community statistical survey on available training facilities, thereby building up a complete picture of the continuing training field, supplementing the comparable statistical data already available in respect of individuals (Household Panel, Labour Force Survey) and enterprises (CVTS).

Finally, as regards recommendations concerned with improving the impact of Community action in the continuing training field, attention should be paid in particular to establishing a more meaningful link between those responsible for a Community Programme such as FORCE and public officials at national and regional level with responsibility for selecting projects under the Structural Funds' Objective 4 and the Community Initiative ADAPT – in the context of their responsibilities for implementing the Community Support Frameworks and in accordance with the provisions governing operation of the Structural Funds.

ANNEX 1-A:  
Key Figures on the FORCE Network

**FORCE PROGRAMME:**  
**NUMBER OF PROJECT CONTRACTORS, COORDINATORS AND PARTNERS**  
**PER CALL AND PER COUNTRY**

	1991				1992				1993A				1993B				Total			
	E	P	Q		E	P	Q		E	P	Q		E	P	Q		E	P	Q	
B	12	39	33	84	23	89	69	181	11	80	47	138	3	53	67	123	49	261	216	526
D	26	124	44	194	32	123	81	236	1	143	94	238	0	61	66	127	59	451	285	795
DK	15	41	8	64	11	54	32	97	4	52	16	72	2	30	47	79	32	177	103	312
E	34	74	34	142	49	141	127	317	12	153	81	246	5	119	95	219	100	487	337	924
F	44	129	29	202	68	159	149	376	6	168	114	288	17	83	94	194	135	539	386	1060
GR	65	64	25	154	7	106	117	230	4	49	47	100	0	92	31	123	76	311	220	607
I	45	77	26	148	18	173	134	325	8	129	125	262	14	72	62	148	85	451	347	883
IRL	15	59	9	83	29	68	58	155	10	77	20	107	5	47	18	70	59	251	105	415
L	3	8	0	11	6	14	4	24	0	3	16	19	0	2	10	12	9	27	30	66
NL	4	40	11	55	14	98	38	150	11	38	29	78	0	43	44	87	29	219	122	370
P	28	42	23	93	22	121	43	186	0	43	38	81	0	67	33	100	50	273	137	460
UK	53	122	20	195	54	235	84	373	6	204	46	256	4	91	59	154	117	652	209	978
X	0	1	1	2	1	6	0	7	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	7	1	8
Total	344	820	263	1427	334	1387	936	2657	73	1139	673	1885	50	760	626	1436	801	4106	2498	7405

**ANNEX 1-B:**  
**Key Figures on the FORCE Network**

**FORCE Programme**  
**Calls 91, 92, 93A, 93B**

		AUEF	C	E	GE	GRE	O	OE	OF	OP	OS	PME	U	PP	CR	X	Total
<b>B</b>	91	0	0	8	8	1	12	5	21	2	6	15	6	0	0	0	84
	92	5	1	6	18	10	17	16	40	5	25	25	12	0	0	1	181
	93A	1	1	1	16	14	11	9	24	2	9	34	8	0	1	7	138
	93B	0	0	3	5	5	12	24	14	4	25	28	2	1	0	0	123
<b>D</b>	91	6	12	12	22	6	22	1	48	0	4	44	15	0	0	2	194
	92	3	17	13	26	7	38	5	38	2	11	66	8	0	0	2	236
	93A	0	23	2	17	10	18	3	40	0	3	106	15	0	0	1	238
	93B	0	3	3	16	7	12	5	13	0	16	44	6	2	0	0	127
<b>DK</b>	91	1	1	9	6	3	8	4	17	0	6	8	0	0	0	1	64
	92	1	0	14	2	5	13	7	18	1	14	21	1	0	0	0	97
	93A	0	1	1	7	3	3	4	24	2	5	20	1	0	0	1	72
	93B	0	1	1	5	1	6	12	18	1	15	17	1	0	0	1	79
<b>E</b>	91	7	1	11	22	21	17	14	22	0	7	15	4	0	0	1	142
	92	11	2	21	26	50	32	15	40	1	23	67	14	6	0	9	317
	93A	3	3	3	30	33	18	14	22	1	15	75	7	18	2	2	246
	93B	1	0	3	12	16	20	17	25	2	33	78	4	3	0	5	219
<b>F</b>	91	1	6	29	26	7	16	11	64	3	6	32	1	0	0	0	202
	92	8	14	27	36	16	36	19	78	16	27	76	14	0	0	9	376
	93A	4	7	0	31	20	24	19	54	8	8	94	8	8	0	3	288
	93B	2	1	7	18	9	11	21	37	12	14	47	3	6	0	6	194
<b>GR</b>	91	1	0	19	27	14	11	4	28	0	8	38	3	0	0	1	154
	92	5	5	14	16	25	22	12	39	2	14	64	9	2	0	1	230
	93A	0	0	4	14	21	8	3	11	0	8	20	2	6	2	1	100
	93B	0	0	3	3	17	12	10	13	1	12	43	6	0	2	1	123
<b>I</b>	91	3	0	22	6	19	11	13	28	5	16	24	0	0	0	1	148
	92	5	4	23	17	29	40	30	52	2	47	63	6	2	0	5	325
	93A	1	4	10	22	15	25	17	35	7	24	82	3	6	5	6	262
	93B	0	1	2	12	9	10	16	22	0	39	34	1	0	1	1	148
<b>IRL</b>	91	2	0	6	7	2	7	3	23	3	5	19	6	0	0	0	83
	92	2	0	11	11	3	13	4	37	4	8	53	8	0	0	1	155
	93A	3	0	1	3	3	10	1	26	1	9	41	6	2	0	1	107
	93B	1	0	2	7	1	5	4	8	2	10	24	5	0	0	1	70
<b>L</b>	91	0	1	0	0	2	0	0	3	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	11
	92	0	1	1	0	3	4	0	6	0	1	7	0	0	0	1	24
	93A	0	4	0	0	0	2	0	3	0	2	7	0	1	0	0	19
	93B	0	0	0	1	0	1	2	1	0	2	5	0	0	0	0	12
<b>NL</b>	91	1	0	7	6	1	7	0	13	0	0	8	3	0	0	9	55
	92	2	0	5	7	5	14	7	34	9	6	55	4	0	0	2	150
	93A	0	1	0	6	5	9	3	21	5	4	21	2	1	0	0	78
	93B	0	0	0	7	1	9	5	21	3	5	24	2	1	0	9	87
<b>P</b>	91	6	1	9	3	7	7	9	28	3	6	13	1	0	0	0	93
	92	6	1	15	5	22	17	17	30	2	6	52	9	0	0	4	186
	93A	2	1	5	3	4	1	8	15	0	4	32	3	2	0	1	81
	93B	2	1	1	2	12	3	9	12	1	9	37	3	3	0	5	100
<b>UK</b>	91	2	1	13	23	11	19	2	52	1	7	39	21	0	0	4	195
	92	6	5	30	37	40	32	14	68	6	22	76	30	1	0	6	373
	93A	3	2	1	29	32	18	8	53	2	24	59	16	5	2	2	256
	93B	0	1	1	24	10	12	8	25	4	18	40	7	1	1	2	154
<b>X</b>	91	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	2
	92	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	7
	93A	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	93B	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>		<b>107</b>	<b>128</b>	<b>380</b>	<b>647</b>	<b>558</b>	<b>675</b>	<b>434</b>	<b>1365</b>	<b>125</b>	<b>588</b>	<b>1897</b>	<b>286</b>	<b>77</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>122</b>	<b>7405</b>



## ANNEX 1-A: KEY FIGURES ON THE FORCE NETWORK

### Abbreviations Legend

<i>CODE</i>	<i>ORGANISATION TYPE</i>
AUEF	University Enterprise Training Partnership
C	Chamber of Commerce
E	Enterprise
GE	Large Enterprise (more than 500 workers)
GRE	Group or Association of Companies
O	Other Organisations
OE	Employer Organisation
OF	Training Organisation
OP	Joint Body
OS	Trade Union Organisation
PME	Small and Medium Sized Enterprise (less than 500 workers)
U	University
PP	Public Authorities
CR	Regional Consortium
X	Others

## ANNEX II: List of Publications

### A. Analysis of European Systems and Collection of Data

Brandsma, J., Kessler, F., Münch, J., *Continuing Vocational Training in Europe : State of the art and perspectives*, Uitgeverij LEMMA BV, Utrecht, 1995. (ISBN 90-5189-553-4) (EN, FR, DE) <sup>(\*)</sup>

European Commission, *Continuing Vocational Training : Europe, Japan and the United States*, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg, 1996 (forthcoming)

EUROSTAT, *Continuing Vocational Training Survey in Enterprises 1994 (CVTS) : Methods and Definitions*, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg, 1996. (ISBN 92-827-8740-0) (EN, FR, DE)

EUROSTAT, *Continuing Vocational Training Survey in Enterprises 1994 (CVTS) : Results*, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg (forthcoming) <sup>(\*)</sup>

European Commission, *Continuing Vocational Training Survey - A report on the procedures adopted and the steps taken to implement the Survey*, Working Document, Brussels, 1996 (forthcoming) (EN, FR, DE)

European Commission, *FORCE - "Tableau de bord" on Continuing Vocational Training*, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg, 1994. (ISBN 92-826-8712-0) (EN, FR, DE)

Ant, M., Kintzclé, J., Van Haecht, A., Walther, R., *Reporting System on Access, Quality and Volume of Continuing Vocational Training in Europe*, Luchterhand Verlag, Neuwied, 1996. (ISBN 3-472-02699-5) (EN, FR, DE)

### B. European Sectoral Reports

Bertrand, O., Homs, O., Kruse W., Méndez-Vigo, M., Van den Tillaart, H., *Training in the Retail Sector - European Report*, European Commission, Brussels, 1993 (EN, FR, DE) <sup>(\*)</sup>

Burns, J. & King, R. (University of Reading), Delay, F. (CREGE Management, Paris), Mallet, L. (CEJEE, Toulouse), *Training in the Agrofood Sector - European Report*, European Commission, Brussels, 1993 (EN, FR, DE) <sup>(\*)</sup>

King, R.D. and Burns, J.A., *Quality Management Systems and Training Policy in the Food and Beverage Industry in Europe*, Food Technology Centre, University of Reading, 1994. (ISBN 0-7049-0536-1)

Rauner, F. & Spöttl, G. (ITB), Olesen, K. & Clematilde, B. (DTI), *Employment, Work and Training in the European Automobile Repair and Distribution Sector - European Report*, European Commission, Brussels, 1993 (EN, FR, DE) <sup>(\*)</sup>

Spöttl, G., Rauner, F. & Moritz, E.F., *Vom Kfz-Handwerk zum Qualitätsservice - Der US-amerikanische Kfz-Sektor nach der Trendwende*, Donat Verlag, Bremen, 1996. (ISBN 3-931737-22-5) (Also available as ITB Working Document in EN and FR)

Moritz, E.F., Rauner, F. & Spöttl, G., *Austauschen statt reparieren - Der Erfolg des japanischen Kfz-Service*, Donat Verlag, Bremen, 1996. (ISBN 3-931737-09-8) (Also available as ITB Working Document in EN and FR)

Dankbaar, B., *Learning to Meet the Global Challenge - A Contribution to the Debate on CTT in the Automotive Industry*, Maastricht Economic Research Institute on Innovation and Technology (MERIT), Maastricht, 1995

European Commission, *Continuous Vocational Training in the Road Freight and Passenger Transport Sectors*, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg, 1996 (forthcoming) (EN, FR, DE) <sup>(\*)</sup>

### C. Contractual Policy on Continuing Training

Blair Main, R., Engels, C., Pellegrini, C., (Editors), *Contractual Policies Concerning Continued Vocational Training in the European Community Member States*, Peters Press, Leuven, 1994, (ISBN 90-6831-582-X), (EN, FR, DE, IT) <sup>(\*)</sup>

Ehrenberg, E., Felger, S., Heidemann, W., Kruse, W., Paul-Kohlhoff, A., *Continuous Vocational Training in Europe - Documentation on the Social Dialogue*, Edition Sigma, Berlin, 1995, (ISBN 3-89404-410-1) (EN, FR, DE, IT, ES)

Luttringer, J.-M., *Development of Resources Allocation Techniques for Continuous Training in Europe - Joint Investments & Branch Funds - Implication of the Social Partners*, Working document, CIRCE, Puteaux (France), 1995 (EN, FR)

### D. Thematic Areas

European Commission, *Industrial Change in the FORCE Programme - a Contribution to the Discussion on the Role of Continuing Vocational Training in adapting to Industrial Change*, Working Document, Brussels, 1995 (EN, FR, DE)

European Commission, *Continuing Vocational Training in Small and Medium-sized Enterprises. Results of the FORCE Programme*, LEONARDO DA VINCI Document, Brussels, 1995 (EN, FR, DE)

European Commission, *Anticipation of Training and Skill Qualification Needs - A synthesis of the results gained in the FORCE and EUROTETNET programmes*, LEONARDO DA VINCI Document, Brussels, 1995 (EN, FR, DE)

Severing, E., Stahl, T., *Quality Assurance in In-house Continuing Training - Case Studies from Europe - Joint FORCE and EUROTETNET report*, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg, 1996, (ISBN 92-827-7131-8), (EN, FR, DE, IT, DA, NL, ES, PT, EL)

European Commission, *The Human Resource at the Heart of Company Strategies - Conference Report* (Rome, Italy, 23-24 June 1994), LEONARDO DA VINCI Document, Brussels, 1996 (forthcoming)

### E. CEDEFOP publications

CEDEFOP was closely associated in the implementation of FORCE sectoral surveys.

*Training in the Retail Sector - European Report*, CEDEFOP, Thessaloniki, 1994, (Cat. N° : HX-80-93-727-EN-C) (DA, DE, EN, ES, FR, IT, NL, PT) <sup>(\*)</sup>

*Guide to Training in the Retail Trade*, CEDEFOP, Thessaloniki, 1995, (Cat. N° HX-85-94-858-EN-C) (EN, ES)

*Training in the Motor Vehicle and Sales Sector - European Report*, CEDEFOP, Thessaloniki, 1995, (Cat. N° HX-85-94-866-EN-C) (DE, EN, ES, FR, IT, NL, PT) <sup>(\*)</sup>

*La Formation dans les Industries Alimentaires et des Boissons - Rapport Européen*, CEDEFOP, Thessaloniki, 1994, (Cat. N° HX-85-94-648-FR-C) (DE, ES, FR) <sup>(\*)</sup>

## F. Directory/Catalogue/Evaluation

European Commission, *Directory of Action-Oriented Research on Continuing Vocational Training in Europe*, LEONARDO DA VINCI Document, Brussels, 1995.

European Commission, *Catalogue of FORCE Training Products 1991-94, Volumes I-III*, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg, 1996. (ISBN 92-826-8051-7) (Multilingual, EN, FR, DE)

European Commission, *Final Evaluation of the FORCE Programme*, prepared in 1996 by the Evaluation Consortium The Tavistock Institute, Bernard Brunhes Consultants, & Danish Technological Institute, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg (forthcoming)

---

(\*) National reports are also available for each of the then 12 Member States.



ISSN 0254-1475

COM(97) 384 final

# DOCUMENTS

EN

15 16 04

---

Catalogue number : CB-CO-97-387-EN-C

ISBN 92-78-23005-7

---

Office for Official Publications of the European Communities

L-2985 Luxembourg