

Tuesday 10 March 1998

## 1998/99 SESSION

Sittings of 10 to 13 March 1998  
PALAIS DE L'EUROPE — STRASBOURG

## MINUTES OF THE SITTING OF TUESDAY 10 MARCH 1998

(98/C 104/02)

## PART I

## Proceedings of the sitting

IN THE CHAIR: Mr CAPUCHO

*Vice-President**(The sitting opened at 9 a.m.)***1. Opening of session**

The 1998/99 session of the European Parliament was opened pursuant to Rule 10 of the Rules of Procedure.

**2. Approval of Minutes**

Mr Sisó Cruellas and Mr Balfe had informed the Chair that they had been present the previous day but that their names were not on the attendance register.

*The following spoke:*

— Mr Habsburg-Lothringen, who referred to the President's reply to his remarks concerning safety problems in Brussels (Item 2), questioned the first part of the reply and asked not to receive a reply in writing but rather for the matter to be debated in plenary (the President pointed out that this matter was not on the agenda and that the President of Parliament would make all the necessary contacts with the Belgian authorities);

— Mr McMahon, who asked for his question on the Structural Funds (No.102) due to be taken at Question Time to the Commission to be moved to the batch of questions to Mrs Wulf-Mathies (the President replied that this request would be considered but that the order of the questions was a matter for the Commission);

— Mr Andrews, who welcomed the release of Róisín McAliskey (whose case he had raised at several previous sittings) and paid tribute to the British presidency for the release.

The Minutes of the previous sitting were approved.

**3. Documents received**

The President had received the following texts:

*(a) committees, the following reports:*

— \* Report on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 3070/95 of 21 December 1995 on the establishment of a pilot project on satellite tracking in the NAFO Regulatory Area (COM(97)0671 — C4-0666/97 — 97/0346(CNS)) — Committee on Fisheries

Rapporteur: Mr Varela Suanzes-Carpegna  
(A4-0086/98)

— Report on the Commission proposals for Council Decisions on the principles, priorities, intermediate objectives, and conditions contained in the accession partnerships with the applicant countries (COM(98)0053 — C4-0130/98) — Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy

Rapporteur: Mr Oostlander  
(A4-0087/98)

*(b) Members, oral questions (Rule 40):*

— Poggiolini, on behalf of the PPE Group, to the Commission: Community programme to combat Alzheimer's disease and related syndromes (B4-0170/98);

— Gutiérrez Díaz, González Alvarez, Papayannakis and Ojala, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group to the Commission: Community programme of research into and prevention and treatment of Alzheimer's disease (B4-0171/98);

— Kouchner and Lalumière, on behalf of the ARE Group, to the Commission: Combating Alzheimer's disease (B4-0172/98);

— Cabrol, on behalf of the UPE Group, to the Commission: Alzheimer's disease (B4-0173/98);

Tuesday 10 March 1998

- Swoboda and Titley, on behalf of the PSE Group, to the Council: ASEM process (B4-0174/98);
- Swoboda and Titley, on behalf of the PSE Group, to the Commission: ASEM process (B4-0175/98);
- Bertens, on behalf of the ELDR Group, to the Council: The next Asia-Europe meeting (ASEM) (B4-0176/98);
- Van Dijk, on behalf of the Committee on Women's Rights, to the Commission: International Women's Day — 8 March 1998: A violation of women's rights (B4-0177/98);
- Jarzembowski, Rinsche, Bernard-Reymond, Argyros, Kittelmann, Martens, on behalf of the PPE Group: to the Council: The ASEM process (B4-0178/98);
- De Vries, on behalf of the ELDR Group, to the Council: Establishment of an International Criminal Court (B4-0179/98);
- Telkämper, Aelvoet, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, Kerr, Gahrton, Holm, on behalf of the V Group: to the Council: The second Asia-Europe Meeting (ASEM II) in London in April (B4-0180/98);

#### 4. Petitions (decisions)

The President had received the following decisions from the Committee on Petitions pursuant to Rule 158(1), taken at its meeting of 24-25 November 1997:

- (a) *petitions ruled inadmissible pursuant to Rule 156(4) and (5), and filed pursuant to Rule 156(6):*
  - Nos 678, 681, 682, 685 <sup>(1)</sup>, 688, 692, 693, 694 <sup>(1)</sup>, 695, 696, 697, 698, 700, 701, 702, 703, 704, 706, 707, 708, 713, 714, 715 <sup>(1)</sup>, 718, 720, 721, 722, 739, 745 and 748/97;
- (b) *petitions ruled admissible pursuant to Rule 156(4) and (5) (consideration closed):*
  - Nos 684, 690, 691, 705, 716, 717, 719, 732 and 736/97: forwarded to the relevant committee for information or further action;
  - Nos 679 <sup>(2)</sup>, 683 <sup>(3)</sup>, 687, 689, 712 <sup>(2)</sup>, 723, 733 <sup>(2)</sup>, 738 <sup>(2)</sup>, 741 and 742/97: petitioners had been sent documentation;
- (c) *petitions ruled admissible pursuant to Rule 156(4) and (5) (action to be taken):*
  - Nos 680, 686, 709, 710, 711, 725 <sup>(2)</sup>, 726, 727, 728, 729, 730, 731, 734, 740, 744 <sup>(2)</sup> and 746/97: the Commission had been asked for information;

(d) *petitions on which consideration had closed on the basis of information supplied by the Commission pursuant to Rule 157(3):*

- Nos 73/93, 1018/94, 13/95 <sup>(2)</sup>, 130/95, 739/95, 752/95, 820/95, 1059/95, 1095/95, 1129/95, 1237/95, 71/96, 72/96, 155/96, 160/96, 298/96, 341/96, 351/96, 444/96, 545/96, 619/96, 726/96, 766/96 and 804/96;

(e) *further information requested from the Commission pursuant to Rule 157(3):*

- Nos 1049/93, 224/94, 532/94, 948/94, 1025/94, 354/95, 292/96, 297/96, 483/96, 571/96, 658/96, 704/96, 732/96, 742/96, 761/96, 789/96, 808/96 and 919/96;

(f) *decision on admissibility postponed:*

- No 747/97: the Commission had been asked for its opinion on whether these petitions fell within the sphere of activities of the European Union;

(g) *other decisions:*

- No 570/97: consideration had been reopened and the Commission asked for further information.

#### 5. Referral to committees

The Committee on the Rules of Procedure, the Verification of Credentials and Immunities had been asked for its opinion on the implementing provisions for the Regulations and general conditions governing the ombudsman's duties with a view to their being annexed to the Rules of Procedure.

The following committees had been asked for opinions:

- BUDG on a proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 1628/96 of 25 July 1996 relating to aid for Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia and the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (COM(98)0018 — C4-0105/98 — 98/0023(CNS) (committee responsible: FASE; already asked for opinions: CONT, RELA);
- ECON on a proposal for a European Parliament and Council Directive on the harmonization of certain aspects of copyright and related rights in the information society (COM(97)0628 — C4-0079/98 — 97/0359(COD)) (committee responsible: LEGA; already asked for an opinion: ENVI, CULT);
- PETI on the Commission communication on an action plan for free movement of workers (COM(97)0586 — C4-0650/97) (committee responsible: ESOC; already asked for opinions: LEGA, CIVI);

<sup>(1)</sup> The petitioner had been advised to contact his ombudsman or national petitions committee.

<sup>(2)</sup> Also forwarded to the relevant committee or delegation for information or action to be taken.

<sup>(3)</sup> The petitioner had been advised to contact the national authorities or courts or the European Commission on Human Rights.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

— LEGA, on the declaration on comitology to be added to the Final Act of the Treaty of Amsterdam (authorized to draw up a report: INST; already asked for an opinion: CIVI, BUDG);

— ECON, RTDE, ENVI, CULT, on the procedure under Article 189b of the EC Treaty (authorized to draw up a report: INST; already asked for an opinion: CIVI).

## 6. Topical and urgent debate (motions for resolutions tabled)

The President announced that he had received from the following Members or political groups requests for the inclusion in the debate on topical and urgent subjects of major importance of motions for resolutions pursuant to Rule 47(1):

— Martens, Perry, Rübig and Schwaiger, on behalf of the PPE Group, on measures recently taken by the Slovak Government (B4-0319/98);

— Goerens and Bertens, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on Cambodia (B4-0320/98);

— André-Léonard, Bertens and Fassa, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on the situation in Congo (B4-0321/98);

— Bertens and Fassa, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on the situation in Sierra Leone (B4-0322/98);

— Galeote Quecedo, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, De Esteban Martín and Oomen-Ruijten, on behalf of the PPE Group, on the situation in Cuba following the visit by His Holiness Pope John Paul II (B4-0323/98);

— Moorhouse, on behalf of the PPE Group, on Lebanese prisoners held in Syria (B4-0324/98);

— Lenz and Oomen-Ruijten, on behalf of the PPE Group, on the assassination in Colombia of Jesús María Valle Jaramillo (B4-0325/98);

— Galeote Quecedo, De Esteban Martín, Lenz, Porto and Fernández-Albor, on behalf of the PPE Group, on the problems facing Peru and Ecuador as a result of the 'EL Niño' phenomenon (B4-0326/98);

— Rübig, Langen, Schierhuber, Lehne, Pack, Mayer, Rack, Lucas Pires, Kellett-Bowman, Pimenta, Malangré, Poettering, Günther, Funk, Pex, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rinsche, Wieland, Schröder, Tillich, Thomas Mann, Hoppenstedt, Ferber, Lenz, Kittelmann, Pirker, von Habsburg, Mosiek-Urbahn, Theato, Berend, Liese, Heinisch, von Wogau and Flemming, on security (B4-0327/98);

— Blokland and Van Dam, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, on Slovakia (B4-0328/98);

— Herman, Pack, Pex and Perry, on behalf of the PPE Group, on discrimination as regards the sale of tickets for the 1998 World Cup finals in France (B4-0329/98);

— Blokland and Van Dam, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, on Cuba (B4-0330/98);

— Habsburg-Lothringen, on behalf of the PPE Group, on the human rights situation in Angola (B4-0331/98);

— Tindemans, on behalf of the PPE Group, on the food crisis in North Korea (B4-0332/98);

— Habsburg-Lothringen, Rinsche and Oomen-Ruijten, on behalf of the PPE Group, on Cambodia (B4-0333/98);

— Robles Piquer and Maij-Weggen, on behalf of the PPE Group, on the situation in Sierra Leone (B4-0334/98);

— Bertens, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on Colombia (B4-0335/98);

— André-Léonard and Fassa, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on Algeria (B4-0336/98);

— Cars, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on the situation in North Korea (B4-0337/98);

— Bertens, Watson and Monfils, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on the violation of competition rules by the World Cup organizing committee (B4-0338/98);

— Bertens, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on the situation in Cuba (B4-0339/98);

— Cars and Bertens, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on Jamaica's withdrawal from the ICCPR (B4-0340/98);

— Thors, Frischenschlager and Bertens, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on the situation in Slovakia (B4-0341/98);

— Wiersma, Bösch and Swoboda, on behalf of the PSE Group, on the situation in Slovakia (B4-0342/98);

— Swoboda, Titley, Harrison and Pollack, on behalf of the PSE Group, on the situation in Cambodia (B4-0343/98);

— Vecchi, on behalf of the PSE Group, on the situation in Sierra Leone (B4-0344/98);

— De Coene, on behalf of the PSE Group, on discrimination in the sale of tickets for the 1998 World Cup finals in France (B4-0345/98);

— Ford, on behalf of the PSE Group, on the food crisis in North Korea (B4-0346/98);

— Dury, on behalf of the PSE Group, on the expulsion of Mrs Chantal Mputu Tshimanga (B4-0347/98);

— Dury, on behalf of the PSE Group, on the release of Mr Kim Seong-Man (B4-0348/98);

— Cabezon Alonso, Newens and Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, on behalf of the PSE Group, on Nicaragua's external debt (B4-0349/98);

— Howitt, on behalf of the PSE Group, on human rights in Colombia (B4-0350/98);

— Pasty and Azzolini, on behalf of the UPE Group, on the situation in Cambodia (B4-0351/98);

— Pasty, Azzolini and Girão Pereira, on behalf of the UPE Group, on Cuba (B4-0352/98);

— Van Dijk and Schroedter, on behalf of the V Group, on the Slovak-Hungarian agreement on the Danube river (B4-0353/98);

**Tuesday 10 March 1998**

- Kreissl-Dörfler, Aelvoet, McKenna, Telkämper and Müller, on behalf of the V Group, on Colombia (B4-0354/98);
- McKenna and Schroedter, on behalf of the V Group, on pending US nuclear tests (B4-0355/98);
- Holm, Müller and Bloch von Blottnitz, on behalf of the V Group, on the famine in North Korea (B4-0356/98);
- Wolf, Telkämper and Aelvoet, on behalf of the V Group, on Angola (B4-0357/98);
- Aelvoet, Telkämper and McKenna, on behalf of the V Group, on Sierra Leone (B4-0358/98);
- Aelvoet and Telkämper, on behalf of the V Group, on the situation in the Congo (B4-0359/98);
- Hory and Macartney, on behalf of the ARE Group, on the situation in Sierra Leone (B4-0360/98);
- Dupuis, Dell'Alba and Hory, on behalf of the ARE Group, on Cuba (B4-0361/98);
- Hory, on behalf of the ARE Group, on the political situation in Slovakia (B4-0362/98);
- Dupuis, on behalf of the ARE Group, on the famine in North Korea (B4-0363/98);
- Hory, on behalf of the ARE Group, on the situation in Cambodia (B4-0364/98);
- Hory, on behalf of the ARE Group, on the system for distributing tickets for the World Cup finals (B4-0365/98);
- Marset Campos, Ojala and Carnero González, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, on the situation in Slovakia (B4-0366/98);
- Pettinari and Sierra González, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, on the situation in Cambodia (B4-0367/98);
- Puerta, Sornosa Martínez, Manisco, Novo, Vinci, Ainardi, Alavanos, Ephremidis and Svensson, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, on human rights in Colombia (B4-0368/98);
- González Álvarez, Novo, Vinci, Sjöstedt, Seppänen and Mohamed Alí, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, on Nicaragua (B4-0369/98);
- González Álvarez, Wurtz and Novo, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, on the expulsion of a French priest from Chiapas (B4-0370/98);
- Pettinari and Jové Peres, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, on the situation in Sierra Leone (B4-0371/98);
- Castellina, Manisco, Puerta, Gutiérrez Díaz and Sjöstedt, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, on the distribution of tickets for the World Cup finals (B4-0372/98);
- Roth, Cohn-Bendit, Ripa di Meana and Kerr, on behalf of the V Group, on the World Cup (B4-0373/98);

- Kreissl-Dörfler and Telkämper, on behalf of the V Group, on Nicaragua's external debt (B4-0374/98);
- Schroedter, Van Dijk and Aelvoet, on behalf of the V Group, on the political situation in Slovakia (B4-0375/98);
- Telkämper and McKenna, on behalf of the V Group, in Cambodia (B4-0376/98);
- Pasty and Azzolini, on behalf of the UPE Group, on the situation in Sierra Leone (B4-0381/98);

The President announced that, pursuant to Rule 47(2), first subparagraph, Parliament would be informed at the end of the morning's sitting of the list of subjects to be included on the agenda for the next debate on topical and urgent subjects of major importance to be held from 3 to 6 p.m. on Thursday 12 March.

## **7. Decision on urgent procedure**

The next item was a decision on a request for urgent procedure.

- proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 3070/95 of 21 December 1995 on the establishment of a pilot project on satellite tracking in the NAFO Regulatory Area (COM(97)0671 — C4-0666/97 — 97/0346(CNS)) (Varela Suanzes-Carpegna report — A4-0086/98) \*

Parliament approved the request.

This item would be added to Friday's agenda and taken in a joint debate with the Teverson report (A4-0019/98, Item 660)

The deadline for amendments would be 10 a.m. on Wednesday, 11 March.

## **8. Euro and public administrations — Euro and tourism — Legal convergence (debate)**

The next item was a joint debate on 3 reports by the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy.

Mr Arroni introduced his report on the Commission communication — practical aspects of the introduction of the euro (COM(97)0491 — C4-0524/97) and the Commission working paper entitled 'Preparations for the changeover of public administrations to the euro' (SEC(97)2384 — C4-0025/98) (A4-0061/98).

Mrs Torres Marques introduced her report on the euro and tourism (A4-0078/98).

Mr Wolf introduced his report on the report of the European Monetary Institute on legal convergence in the Member States of the European Union (as at August 1997) (C4-0560/97) (A4-0070/98).

Tuesday 10 March 1998

The following spoke: Mrs Randzio-Plath, chairman of the subcommittee on monetary affairs, who also spoke on behalf of the PSE Group, Mrs Thyssen, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Garosci, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Gasòliba i Böhm, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Ribeiro, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, Mrs Hautala, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Castagnède, on behalf of the ARE Group, Mrs de Rose, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, Mr Antony, Non-attached Member, Mr Harrison, Mr Rübig, Mr Gallagher, Mrs Ewing, Mr Berthu, Mr Trizza, Mr Caudron, Mrs Peijs, Mr Kaklamanis, Mrs Boogerd-Quaak and Mr Nicholson.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr IMBENI

*Vice-President*

The following spoke: Mrs Raschhofer, Mr Hendrick, Mr von Wogau, chairman of the Committee on Economic Affairs, Mrs Van Bladel, Mr Teverson, Mr Féret, Mr Fayot, Mr Herman, Mrs Kestelijn-Sierens, Mr Pérez Royo, Mr Porto, Mr Pomés Ruiz, Mr Hoppenstedt, Mr Secchi, Mr Cornelissen, Mr de Silguy, Member of the Commission, Mr Cornelissen, who put a question to the Commission with a request for an answer the same day, Mr Sisó Cruellas and Mr de Silguy, who undertook to answer Mr Cornelissen's question as quickly as possible.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Item 16.

## 9. Promoting road safety in EU (debate)

The next item was the report by Mr Cornelissen, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Transport and Tourism, on the communication from the Commission 'Promoting road safety in the EU — the programme for 1997-2001' (COM(97)0131 — C4-0180/97) (A4-0065/98).

The President announced that the Commissioner responsible for transport, Mr Kinnock, had been caught up in a traffic jam on the way to Strasbourg caused by a road accident and would arrive later. In the meantime, Mr de Silguy would represent the Commission in the debate.

Mr Cornelissen introduced his report.

The following spoke: Mr Watts, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Jarzembowski, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Santini, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Wijzenbeek, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mrs Van Dijk, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Van Dam, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, Mr Baldarelli, Mrs McIntosh and Mr Fitzsimons.

As it was now voting time the debate was adjourned to 3 p.m. (Item 18).

IN THE CHAIR: Mrs FONTAINE

*Vice-President*

Mr Rübig again raised the matter of security in Brussels (the President replied that the President of Parliament would very shortly be contacting the Belgian authorities and that the College of Quaestors had added this matter to the agenda of their meeting the following day).

VOTING TIME

## 10. Western Sahara (Rule 92)

Mendiluce Pereiro recommendation, on behalf of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy, on Western Sahara (A4-0066/98).

The President announced that in the absence of opposition in writing from one-tenth of Parliament's component Members the recommendation was deemed to have been adopted (*Part II, Item 1*).

## 11. Karolus programme \*\*\*II (Rule 66(7))

Recommendation for second reading drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy in the form of a letter on the common position adopted by the Council with a view to adopting a European Parliament and Council Decision amending Council Decision 92/481/EEC on the adoption of an action plan for the exchange between Member State administrations of national officials who are engaged in the implementation of Community legislation required to achieve the internal market (Karolus programme) (C4-0037/98 — 97/0214(COD))

COMMON POSITION OF THE COUNCIL C4-0037/98 — 97/0214(COD):

The President declared the common position approved (*Part II, Item 2*).

## 12. Sale of consumer goods and associated guarantees \*\*\*I (vote)

Kuhn report — A4-0029/98  
(Simple majority)

PROPOSAL FOR A DIRECTIVE COM(95)0520 — C4-0455/96 — 96/0161(COD):

*Amendments adopted:* 1; 2; 3, 4, 5 and 10 collectively; 6 by EV (252 for, 213 against, 10 abstentions); 7; 8; 9 (1st part) by EV (390 for, 78 against, 7 abstentions); 11; 12; 13; 14; 15, 16 and 21 collectively; 17; 18; 19; 20; 22; 23; 24; 25 by EV (283 for, 206 against, 4 abstentions); 26; 27 by EV (262 for, 223 against, 1 abstention); 45 by RCV; 29 by EV (270 for, 215 against, 1 abstention); 30; 31; 32; 33; 48; 36 by EV (287 for, 210 against, 1 abstention); 38 to 40 collectively; 42; 43

*Amendments rejected:* 61 by RCV; 63 by RCV; 9 (2nd part) by EV (226 for, 232 against, 11 abstentions); 55; 62 by RCV; 56; 58 by RCV; 50; 52; 57; 28 (1st part); 28 (2nd part); 46 by EV (244 for, 244 against, 3 abstentions); 59 by RCV; 60 by RCV; 34; 53 by EV (179 for, 299 against, 14 abstentions); 35; 37; 41; 54 by EV (234 for, 264 against, 1 abstention)

*Amendments fallen:* 49; 51

Tuesday 10 March 1998

*Amendment withdrawn:* 44

*Amendment cancelled:* 47

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

*The following spoke during the vote:*

— Mr Falconer asked during a number of votes for his presence to be recorded; Mr Corbett took the floor — after Mr Falconer had protested at what he considered the President's lighthearted treatment of his remarks pointing out that he had been present at certain roll-call votes — and noted that, when Members did not wish to vote either for or against but wished to indicate the fact they were present, they merely had to abstain (the President replied that there was in her opinion an important distinction between abstaining and not taking part in the vote); Mr Falconer then expressed the hope that Mr Corbett would acknowledge this distinction;

— Mr Argyros, before the vote on am 59, raised the matter of the Bureau instruction concerning participation in roll-call votes;

*Separate votes:* ams. 2 (ELDR), 6 (PPE), 7 (ELDR), 8 (UPE, PPE), 13 (ELDR), 14 (UPE), 17 (ELDR), 18 (UPE), 19 (ELDR, UPE), 20 (ELDR, UPE), 22 (ELDR), 23 (UPE), 25, 27 (PPE), 32 (ELDR), 33 (I-EDN), 35 (I-EDN, ELDR, UPE, PPE), 36 (UPE, PPE), 37 (ELDR, UPE, PPE), 43 (UPE)

*Split votes:*

am 9 (PPE):

1st part: up to 'service'  
2nd part: remainder

am 28 (ELDR):

1st part: 1st subparagraph  
2nd part: 2nd subparagraph

*Results of RCVs:*

am 61 (V):

Members voting:	462
For:	36
Against:	419
Abstentions:	7

am 63 (V):

Members voting:	473
For:	32
Against:	437
Abstentions:	4

am 62 (V):

Members voting:	491
For:	82
Against:	398
Abstentions:	11

am 58 (V):

Members voting:	498
For:	30
Against:	457
Abstentions:	11

am 45 (PSE):

Members voting:	502
For:	369
Against:	108
Abstentions:	25

am 59 (V):

Members voting:	497
For:	58
Against:	435
Abstentions:	4

am 60 (V):

Members voting:	499
For:	63
Against:	431
Abstentions:	5

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended by EV (299 for, 154 against, 47 abstentions) (*Part II, Item 3*).

#### DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution by RCV (PPE):

Members voting:	507
For:	320
Against:	128
Abstentions:	59

(*Part II, Item 3*).

### 13. Propagating material of ornamental plants \* (Rule 99) (vote)

Proposal for a Council Directive on the marketing of propagating material of ornamental plants (COM(97)0708 — C4-0044/98 — 97/0367(CNS))  
(*Simple majority*)

referred to  
responsible: AGRI  
opinion: ENVI

PROPOSAL FOR A DIRECTIVE COM(97)0708 — C4-0044/98 — 97/0367(CNS)

Parliament approved the Commission proposal (*Part II, Item 4*).

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**14. Decentralized Community agencies \* (vote)**

Kellett-Bowman report — A4-0035/98  
(Simple majority)

**I. PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(97)0489 — C4-0601/97 — 97/0253(CNS):**

*Amendments adopted:* 1 to 8 collectively;

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended  
(*Part II, Item 5*).

**DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:**

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (*Part II, Item 5*).

**II. PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(97)0489 — C4-0602/97 — 97/0254(CNS):**

*Amendments adopted:* 9 to 16 collectively

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended  
(*Part II, Item 5*).

**DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:**

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (*Part II, Item 5*).

**III. PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(97)0489 — C4-0603/97 — 97/0255(CNS):**

*Amendments adopted:* 17 to 24 collectively

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended  
(*Part II, Item 5*).

**DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:**

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (*Part II, Item 5*).

**IV. PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(97)0489 — C4-0604/97 — 97/0256(CNS):**

*Amendments adopted:* 25 to 32 collectively

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended  
(*Part II, Item 5*).

**DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:**

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (*Part II, Item 5*).

**V. PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(97)0489 — C4-0605/97 — 97/0258(CNS):**

*Amendments adopted:* 33 to 38 collectively

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended  
(*Part II, Item 5*).

**DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:**

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (*Part II, Item 5*).

**VI. PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(97)0489 — C4-0606/97 — 97/0259(CNS):**

*Amendments adopted:* 39 to 44 collectively

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended  
(*Part II, Item 5*).

**DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:**

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (*Part II, Item 5*).

**VII. PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(97)0489 — C4-0607/97 — 97/0260(CNS):**

*Amendments adopted:* 45 to 50 collectively

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended  
(*Part II, Item 5*).

**DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:**

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (*Part II, Item 5*).

**VIII. PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(97)0489 — C4-0608/97 — 97/0261(CNS):**

*Amendments adopted:* 51 to 56 collectively

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended  
(*Part II, Item 5*).

**DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:**

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (*Part II, Item 5*).

**IX. PROPOSAL FOR A REGULATION COM(97)0489 — C4-0609/97 — 97/0262(CNS):**

*Amendments adopted:* 57 to 62 collectively

Parliament approved the Commission proposal as amended  
(*Part II, Item 5*).

**DRAFT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION:**

Parliament adopted the legislative resolution (*Part II, Item 5*).

Tuesday 10 March 1998

## 15. Green Paper on food law (vote)

Graenitz report — A4-0009/98  
(Simple majority)

### MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

*Amendments adopted:* 2 by EV (272 for, 199 against, 11 abstentions); 15; 16; 18; 19 by EV (269 for, 222 against, 3 abstentions); 20 as an addition; 6; 14 by EV (283 for, 194 against, 13 abstentions); 7; 28 as an addition; 3 by EV (243 for, 242 against, 7 abstentions); 13 by EV (254 for, 245 against, 4 abstentions); 4 by EV (269 for, 225 against, 7 abstentions); 10 by RCV; 11 by RCV; 12 (1st part) by RCV; 12 (2nd part) by RCV; 5

*Amendments rejected:* 17 by EV (242 for, 242 against, 12 abstentions); 23; 24; 21 by EV (208 for, 286 against, 2 abstentions); 25; 26; 27; 22 by EV (235 for, 253 against, 8 abstentions); 9; 1

*Amendment withdrawn:* 8

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

*The following spoke during the vote:*

— the rapporteur pointed out before the vote that am. 19 in fact concerned para. 19, not para. 18. She also pointed out that am. 28 should be taken as an addition to para. 45.

She subsequently stated during the vote that she could accept am. 20 on condition it be taken as an addition.

The President established, when amendments 20 and 28 were put to the vote, that there was no opposition to taking these amendments as additions.

*Split votes:*

para. 18 (ELDR):

1st part: up to 'take part'  
2nd part: remainder

para. 21 (I-EDN):

1st part: up to 'standard'  
2nd part: remainder

am 12 (V)

1st part: up to 'Regulation'  
second part: remainder

*Results of RCVs:*

am. 10 (V):	
Members voting:	510
For:	336
Against:	169
Abstentions:	5

am. 11 (V):

Members voting:	507
For:	323
Against:	182
Abstentions:	2

am. 12, 1st part (V):

Members voting:	512
For:	506
Against:	3
Abstentions:	3

am. 12, 2nd part (V):

Members voting:	511
For:	253
Against:	237
Abstentions:	21

Parliament adopted the resolution (*Part II, Item 6*).

## 16. Euro and public administrations — Euro and tourism — Legal convergence (vote)

Arroni report (A4-0061/98), Torres Marques report (A4-0078/98) and Wolf report (A4-0070/98)  
(Simple majority)

(a) A4-0061/98

### MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

*Amendments adopted:* 11; 1; 5 by EV (235 for, 232 against, 10 abstentions)

*Amendments rejected:* 3; 12; 13; 4; 2 (1st part) by EV (204 for, 257 against, 40 abstentions); 2 (2nd part); 10 by EV (238 for, 260 against, 6 abstentions); 14 by EV (206 for, 269 against, 28 abstentions); 6; 15; 7

*Amendments cancelled:* 8; 9

The different parts of the text were adopted in order (para. 10 by EV (239 for, 238 against, 8 abstentions), para. 15 by EV (244 for, 230 against, 32 abstentions)).

The 2nd part of para. 7 was rejected by EV (237 for, 240 against, 6 abstentions).

*The following spoke during the vote:*

— the rapporteur pointed out a translation error in the Dutch version of the first part of am 2.

*Separate votes:* paras. 10, 18 (V)



Tuesday 10 March 1998

*Split votes:*

para. 7 (PSE):

1st part: up to 'as soon as possible'

2nd part: remainder

am. 2 (PSE):

1st part: up to 'free of charge'

2nd part: 'should no such ... transparent'

Parliament adopted the resolution by EV (242 for, 216 against, 45 abstentions) (*Part II, Item 7(a)*).

(Mr Fitzsimons had intended to vote for.)

*(b) A4-0078/98*

## MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

*Amendments adopted:* 6; 8; 1; 9; 10; 12; 11 by EV (240 for, 206 against, 26 abstentions); 4 by EV (230 for, 225 against, 13 abstentions); 13

*Amendments rejected:* 2; 5*Amendment fallen:* 3*Amendment withdrawn:* 7

The different parts of the text were adopted in order.

*The following spoke during the vote:*

— the rapporteur pointed out at the beginning of the vote that there were translation errors affecting ams 11 and 5 (the President said they would be corrected); the rapporteur subsequently spoke on the two amendments when they were put to the vote.

*Separate votes:* paras 17, 18, 19 (V)*Split votes:*

para. 16 (V):

1st part: text as a whole less the words 'especially in the field of taxation'

2nd part: these words

Parliament adopted the resolution by RCV (PSE):

Members voting:	469
For:	400
Against:	21
Abstentions:	48

*(Part II, Item 7(b)).**(c) A4-0070/98*

## MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

Mr Herman requested a separate vote on para. 4 which the President granted.

*Amendment adopted:* 1

The different parts of the text were adopted in order (para. 4 by EV (244 for, 195 against, 8 abstentions).

Parliament adopted the resolution (*Part II, Item 7(c)*).

\*  
\*       \*

*Explanations of vote were made by the following Members:*

Recommendation by Mr Mendiluce Pereiro (A4-0066/98)

— *in writing:* Lis Jensen, Bonde, Sandbæk

Kuhn report (A4-0029/98)

— *in writing:* Jackson; Rübig; Souchet; Wibe; Valverde López; Lienemann; Ferrer, Bébear, Buffetaut

Ornamental plants

— *in writing:* Wibe; Ahlqvist; Theorin

Kellett-Bowman report (A4-0035/98)

— *orally:* Bourlanges— *in writing:* Valverde López

Graenitz report (A4-0009/98)

— *in writing:* Souchet, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, Díez de Rivera Icaza; Ephremidis; Røvsing; Holm; Wibe; Lindqvist; Blak, Sindal

Arroni report (A4-0061/98)

— *in writing:* Fourçans; Theonas; Ahlqvist, Wibe, Theorin; Titley; Lis Jensen, Sandbæk, Schörling, Holm, Sjöstedt, Gahrton, Bonde, Eriksson, Seppänen; Blokland

Torres Marques report (A4-0078/98)

— *orally:* Berthu, on behalf of the I-EDN Group

— *in writing:* Gallagher; Holm; Theonas; Ahlqvist, Wibe, Theorin; Blak, Sindal; Blokland

Wolf report (A4-0070/98)

— *orally:* Berthu, on behalf of the I-EDN Group

— *in writing:* Fourçans; Lienemann; Ahlqvist, Wibe, Theorin; Ribeiro; Blokland

\*  
\*       \*

**Tuesday 10 March 1998**

*Corrections to votes — Members not voting although present*

Mr Grosch had informed the Chair that he had been present during the voting time just concluded.

Mr Haarder had informed the Chair that he had mistakenly voted with a card that was not his in the first few votes and that subsequently he had missed other roll-call votes when he went to fetch his own card.

Kuhn report (A4-0029/98)

- ams 61 and 63  
Present but did not vote: Falconer and Blak
- ams 62, 58 and 45  
Present but did not vote: Blak  
Asked for their presence to be recorded: Falconer
- am. 59  
Asked for their presence to be recorded: Argyros, Falconer

Kellett-Bowman report (A4-0035/98)

Mr Antony had informed the Chair that although present he would not take part in the vote.

Graenitz report (A4-0009/98)

The President established that Mr Falconer had been present during the roll-call votes on ams 10, 11 and 12 (1st part).

Torres Marques report (A4-0078/98)

- whole of the resolution  
Present but did not vote: Falconer and Chichester

The following spoke: Mr Corbett, who referred to the President's reply to his remarks during the vote on the Kuhn report (Part I, Item 12), in which reply it was said that abstaining was not the same as not taking part in the vote, and asked for the Committee on the Rules of Procedure to be asked for its opinion on the matter, Mr Falconer, who repeated his request for the Bureau's decision concerning checks on Members' attendance to be submitted to the plenary, and Mr Watson who announced he had not been able to take part in certain votes as he had been delayed by air traffic problems.

**END OF VOTING TIME**

**17. Topical and urgent debate** (list of subjects selected)

The President informed Parliament that, in accordance with Rule 47(2), the list of subjects for the debate on topical and urgent subjects of major importance to be held on Thursday had been drawn up.

It contained 45 motions for resolutions grouped together as follows:

**I. POLITICAL SITUATION IN SLOVAKIA**

B4-0319/98 by the PPE Group  
B4-0328/98 by the I-EDN Group  
B4-0341/98 by the ELDR Group  
B4-0342/98 by the PSE Group  
B4-0362/98 by the ARE Group  
B4-0366/98 by the GUE/NGL Group  
B4-0375/98 by the V Group

**II. SITUATION IN CAMBODIA**

B4-0320/98 by the ELDR Group  
B4-0333/98 by the PPE Group  
B4-0343/98 by the PSE Group  
B4-0351/98 by the UPE Group  
B4-0364/98 by the ARE Group  
B4-0367/98 by the GUE/NGL Group  
B4-0376/98 by the V Group

**III. HUMAN RIGHTS**

*Colombia*

B4-0325/98 by the PPE Group  
B4-0335/98 by the ELDR Group  
B4-0350/98 by the PSE Group  
B4-0354/98 by the V Group  
B4-0368/98 by the GUE/NGL Group

*Cuba*

B4-0323/98 by the PPE Group  
B4-0330/98 by the I-EDN Group  
B4-0339/98 by the ELDR Group  
B4-0352/98 by the UPE Group  
B4-0361/98 by the ARE Group

*North Korea*

B4-0332/98 by the PPE Group  
B4-0337/98 by the ELDR Group  
B4-0346/98 by the PSE Group  
B4-0356/98 by the V Group  
B4-0363/98 by the ARE Group

*Congo*

B4-0321/98 by the ELDR Group  
B4-0359/98 by the V Group

*Jamaica*

B4-0340/98 by the ELDR Group

**IV. SIERRA LEONE**

B4-0322/98 by the ELDR Group  
B4-0334/98 by the PPE Group  
B4-0344/98 by the PSE Group  
B4-0358/98 by the V Group  
B4-0360/98 by the ARE Group  
B4-0371/98 by the GUE/NGL Group  
B4-0381/98 by the UPE Group

Tuesday 10 March 1998

# **V. DISTRIBUTION OF TICKETS FOR THE WORLD CUP IN FRANCE**

B4-0329/98 by the PPE Group  
 B4-0338/98 by the ELDR Group  
 B4-0345/98 by the PSE Group  
 B4-0365/98 by the ARE Group  
 B4-0372/98 by the GUE/NGL Group  
 B4-0373/98 by the V Group

In accordance with Rule 47(3), the overall speaking time for Thursday's debate had been allocated as follows, subject to modification of the list:

For one of the authors:	1 minute
Members:	60 minutes in total

Pursuant to Rule 47(2), second subparagraph, objections to the list would have to be justified and tabled in writing by a political group or at least 29 Members before 8 p.m. that evening. The vote on this objection would be taken without debate at the start of the next day's sitting.

*(The sitting was suspended at 1.35 p.m. and resumed at 3 p.m.)*

IN THE CHAIR: Mr MARINHO

*Vice-President*

## **18. Promoting road safety in EU (continuation of debate)**

The following spoke: Mr Piecyk, Mr Sisó Cruellas, Mr Paasio, Mr Koch, Mr Morris, Mrs Schierhuber, Mr Sindal, Mr Kinnock, Member of the Commission, who also presented his apologies for his late arrival caused by a serious accident on the motorway, Mr Wijsenbeek who put a question to the Commission which Mr Kinnock answered, the rapporteur who also put questions to the Commission which Mr Kinnock answered, Mrs McIntosh, who repeated the question she had asked before voting time, and Mr Kinnock on this question.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 11.3.1998, Part I, Item 13.

## **19. Registration of persons sailing on board passenger ships \*\*II (debate)**

Mr Watts introduced his recommendation for second reading, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Transport and Tourism, on the common position adopted by the Council with a view to the adoption of a Council Directive on the registration of persons sailing on board passenger ships operating to or from ports of the Member States of the Community (C4-0620/97 — 96/0281(SYN)) (A4-0068/98).

The following spoke: Mr Kironomos, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Stenmarck, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mrs Berès, Mrs McIntosh, Mr Provan, Mr Kinnock, Member of the Commission, and the rapporteur.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 11.3.1998, Part I, Item 8.

## **20. Multilateral agreement on investments (MAI) (debate)**

Mr Kreissl-Dörfler introduced his report, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on External Economic Relations, containing Parliament's recommendations to the Commission on negotiations in the framework of the OECD on a multilateral agreement on investments (MAI) (A4-0073/98).

The following spoke: Mr García-Margallo y Marfil, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Economic Affairs, Mrs Ahern, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Legal Affairs, Mr Elchlepp, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Culture, Mrs McKenna, draftsman of the opinion of the Committee on Fisheries, Mrs Mann, on behalf of the PSE Group, and Mr Valdivielso de Cué, on behalf of the PPE Group.

IN THE CHAIR: Mrs HOFF

*Vice-President*

The following spoke: Mrs Baldi, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mrs Plooi-j-van Gorsel, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mrs Castellina, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, Mr Lannoye, on behalf of the V Group, Mrs Leperre-Verrier, on behalf of the ARE Group, Mr Souchet, on behalf of the I-EDN Group, Mr Sichrovsky, Non-attached Member, Mr Falconer, Mr Porto, Mrs Daskalaki, Mr Teverson, Mrs Moreau, Mrs Schörling, Mr Sainjon, Mr Van Dam, Mrs Lienemann, Mr Habsburg-Lothringen, Mr Monfils, Mr Seppänen, Mrs Hautala, Mr Vecchi, Mrs Thors, Mrs Pailler, Mr Blak, Mr Nordmann, Mr Sjöstedt, Mrs Karamanou, Mr Theonas, Mrs Pollack, Mr Caudron, Mrs Kinnock, Sir Leon Brittan, Vice-President of the Commission, and Mrs Plooi-j-van Gorsel, who put a question to the Commission which Sir Leon Brittan answered.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 11.3.1998, Part I, Item 14.

IN THE CHAIR: Mr GUTIÉRREZ DÍAZ

*Vice-President*

## **21. Question Time (Commission)**

Parliament considered a number of questions to the Commission (B4-0260/98).

The President apologized to the House and the Commission for the 35-minute delay to the start of Question Time.

**Tuesday 10 March 1998**

*First part*

Mr McMahon referred to his remarks that morning concerning his Question 102 (Part I, Item 2). The President repeated that the order of questions was decided by the Commission and that, according to the information provided by the Commission, the Commissioner responsible for question 102 was not Mrs Wulf-Mathies but Mr de Silguy.

**Question 41** by Mrs Izquierdo Rojo: Women and employment in the regional and local context

Mr Flynn, Member of the Commission, answered the question and supplementaries by Mrs Izquierdo Rojo and Mrs Sornosa Martínez.

**Question 42** by Mr McCartin: Beef market

Sir Leon Brittan, Vice-President of the Commission, answered the question and a supplementary by Mr McCartin.

**Question 43** by Mr Murphy: Sport and Alcohol Sponsorship

Sir Leon Brittan answered the question.

Mr Murphy spoke.

Sir Leon Brittan answered supplementaries by Mr von Habsburg and Mrs Larive.

**Question 44** by Mr Watson: Ticket allocation for the 1998 Football World Cup

Sir Leon Brittan answered the question and supplementaries by Mr Watson and Mr Evans.

*Second part*

**Question 45** Mr Titley: Anti-dumping duties

Sir Leon Brittan answered the question and supplementaries by Mr Titley, Mrs McCarthy and Mrs Hardstaff.

**Question 46** by Mrs Schörling: Salmonella

Mr Fischler, Member of the Commission, answered the question and supplementaries by Mrs Schörling, Mrs Redondo Jiménez and Mr Lindqvist.

**Question 47** by Mr Wibe: Salmonella inspections

Mr Fischler answered the question and a supplementary by Mr Wibe.

**Question 48** by Mr Watts: Reform of the common agricultural policy and farm animal welfare

Mr Fischler answered the question and supplementaries by Mr Watts and Mrs Ferrer.

**Questions 49 to 61** would receive written answers.

**Question 62** Mrs McIntosh: The future of the Konver Community Initiative

Mrs Wulf-Mathies, Member of the Commission, answered the question and supplementaries by Mrs McIntosh, Mr Elliott and Mr Howitt.

**Question 63** by Mr White: Urban II

Mrs Wulf-Mathies answered the question and supplementaries by Mr White and Mr Spiers.

**Question 64** by Mr Apolinário: Application of Interreg II C

Mrs Wulf-Mathies answered the question and supplementaries by Mr Apolinário and Mr Pimenta.

**Questions 65 to 109** would receive written answers.

The President closed Question Time to the Commission.

*(The sitting was suspended at 7.45 p.m. and resumed at 9 p.m.)*

IN THE CHAIR: Mrs FONTAINE

*Vice-President*

## **22. Minimum requirements for vessels carrying dangerous or polluting goods \*\*II (debate)**

Mr Novo Belenguer introduced his recommendation for second reading, drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Transport and Tourism, on the common position adopted by the Council with a view to adopting a Council Directive amending Directive 93/75/EEC concerning minimum requirements for vessels bound for or leaving Community ports and carrying dangerous or polluting goods (C4-0621/97 — 96/0231(SYN)) (A4-0069/98)

The following spoke: Mr Ferber, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Kaklamanis, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Tamino, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Camisón Asensio, Mr Sarlis and Mr Flynn, Member of the Commission.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 11.3.1998, Part I, Item 9.

## **23. Statistical returns in respect of carriage of goods by road \* (debate)**

Mr Wijsenbeek, deputizing for the rapporteur, introduced the report drawn up by Mr Bazin, on behalf of the Committee on Transport and Tourism, on the draft Council Regulation on statistical returns in respect of carriage of goods by road (COM(97)0443 — C4-0514/97 — 97/0233(CNS)) (A4-0072/98).

Tuesday 10 March 1998

The following spoke: Mr Stenmarck, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Flynn, Member of the Commission, Mr Wijzenbeek and Mr Flynn.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 11.3.1998, Part I, Item 11.

## **24. Injury prevention — Rare diseases — Pollution-related diseases — Health protection requirements in Community policies — Alzheimer's disease \*\*\*I (debate)**

The next item was a joint debate on four reports by the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection and five oral questions to the Commission.

— report by Mr Trakatellis on the proposal for a European Parliament and Council Decision adopting a programme of Community action from 1999 to 2003 on injury prevention in the context of the framework for action in the field of public health (COM(97)0178 — C4-0229/97 — 97/0132(COD)) (A4-0067/98)

— report by Mr Viceconte on the proposal for a European Parliament and Council Decision adopting a programme of Community action 1999-2003 on rare diseases in the context of the framework for action in the field of public health (COM(97)0225 — C4-0236/97 — 97/0146(COD)) (A4-0074/98)

— report by Mr Cabrol on the proposal for a European Parliament and Council Decision adopting a programme of Community action 1999-2003 on pollution-related diseases in the context of the framework for action in the field of public health (COM(97)0266 — C4-0276/97 — 97/0153(COD)) (A4-0075/98)

— report by Mrs Flemming on the second report from the Commission to the Council, the European Parliament, the Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions on the integration of health protection requirements in Community policies (COM(96)0407 — C4-0663/96) (A4-0022/98)

— oral question by Mr Poggiolini, on behalf of the PPE Group, on the Community programme to combat Alzheimer's disease and related syndromes (B4-0170/98)

— oral question by Mr Gutiérrez Díaz, Mrs González Álvarez, Mr Papayannakis and Mrs Ojala, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, on the Community programme of research into and prevention and treatment of Alzheimer's disease (B4-0171/98)

— oral question by Mr Kouchner and by Mrs Lalumière, on behalf of the ARE Group, on combating Alzheimer's disease (B4-0172/98)

— oral question by Mr Cabrol, on behalf of the UPE Group, on Alzheimer's disease (B4-0173/98)

— oral question by Mrs McKenna, Mr Lannoye, Mrs Breyer and Mr Tamino, on behalf of the V Group, on Alzheimer's disease (B4-0266/98)

Mr Trakatellis, Mr Viceconte, Mr Cabrol and Mrs Flemming introduced their reports.

Mr Poggiolini, Mrs González Álvarez, Mr Cabrol and Mrs McKenna moved the oral questions.

Mr Flynn, Member of the Commission, answered the questions.

The President announced that she had received motions for resolutions pursuant to Rule 40(5) from the following Members:

— Roth-Behrendt and Needle, on behalf of the PSE Group, on Alzheimer's disease (B4-0291/98)

— Pasty, Azzolini and Cabrol, on behalf of the UPE Group, on Alzheimer's disease (B4-0292/98)

— Eisma and Plooi-j-van Gorsel, on behalf of the ELDR Group, on Alzheimer's disease (B4-0301/98)

— Poggiolini, Oomen-Ruijten, Valverde López, Flemming and Chanterie, on behalf of the PPE Group, on Alzheimer's disease (B4-0302/98)

— McKenna, Lannoye, Breyer and Tamino, on behalf of the V Group, on Alzheimer's disease (B4-0307/98)

— Lalumière and Pradier, on behalf of the ARE Group, on Community measures to combat Alzheimer's disease (B4-0308/98)

— Gutiérrez Díaz, González Álvarez, Papayannakis, Ojala, Theonas and Marset Campos, on behalf GUE/NGL Group, on Alzheimer's disease (B4-0317/98).

The following spoke: Mr Needle, on behalf of the PSE Group, Mr Liese, on behalf of the PPE Group, Mr Parodi, on behalf of the UPE Group, Mr Eisma, on behalf of the ELDR Group, Mr Marset Campos, on behalf of the GUE/NGL Group, Mr Tamino, on behalf of the V Group, Mr Martinez, Non-attached Member, Mrs Marinucci, Mr Lindqvist, Mr Lannoye, Mr Aparicio Sánchez, Mr Filippi, Mr Hyland, Mr Cars, Mr Graefe zu Baringdorf, Mrs Myller, Mr Whitehead, Mrs Malone, Mr Flynn, Member of the Commission, and Mr Graefe zu Baringdorf who put a question to the Commission which Mr Flynn answered.

The President closed the debate.

Vote: Minutes of 11.3.1998, Part I, Items 10 and 15.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

## 25. Agenda for next sitting

The President announced the following agenda for the sitting of Wednesday 11 March 1997:

*9 a.m. — 12 noon, 12.30 — 1 p.m., 3 — 7 p.m. and 9 p.m. — 12 midnight:*

*9 — 11.30 a.m., and 3 — 4.30 p.m.:*

- topical and urgent debate (objections)
- joint debate on two reports by Mr Oostlander on accession partnerships \*
- Council statement on the situation in Kosovo (with debate)
- joint debate on eight oral questions on ASEM
- joint debate on seven oral questions on an International Criminal Court

*11.30 a.m.:*

- voting time

*12 noon:*

- formal sitting

*12.30 p.m.:*

- continuation of votes

*4.30 — 5.30 p.m.:*

- Council communication on competitiveness (with questions)

*5.30 — 7 p.m.:*

- Question Time to the Council

*9 p.m. — midnight:*

- Cabezón Alonso report on the 1997 demographic report
- Boogerd-Quaak report on the European Training Foundation \*
- joint debate on two reports by Mr Titley and Mrs Hoff on Ukraine
- Verde i Aldea recommendation on protection of consumers' interests \*\*\*II

*(The sitting closed at 11.30 p.m.)*

---

Julian PRIESTLEY  
*Secretary-General*

José María GIL-ROBLES GIL-DELGADO  
*President*

---

Tuesday 10 March 1998

## PART II

## Texts adopted by the European Parliament

## 1. Western Sahara (Rule 92)

A4-0066/98

## European Parliament recommendation to the Council on Western Sahara

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to Rule 92 of its Rules of Procedure,
  - having regard to Article J.7, second paragraph, of the EU Treaty,
  - having regard to its resolutions of 16 March 1995 on Western Sahara <sup>(1)</sup> and 13 July 1995 on the trial of eight demonstrators in Morocco <sup>(2)</sup>,
  - having regard to United Nations Security Council resolutions 658 and 691,
  - having regard to the draft recommendation of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Security and Defence Policy (A4-0066/98),
- A. having regard to the peace plan for Western Sahara drawn up and adopted in United Nations Security Council resolutions 658 and 691 on the establishment of the United Nations Mission for the Referendum in Western Sahara (Minurso), and United Nations Security Council Resolution 1113 extending Minurso's mandate and welcoming the agreements concluded between the parties in Houston,
- B. having regard to the unique opportunity offered by the results achieved during the negotiations between Morocco and the Polisario Front, where a compromise was reached which could lead to the holding of the referendum on self-determination towards the end of the current year,
- C. having regard to the complexity of the agreements and the fragile nature of all the planned stages before the holding of the referendum,
- D. having regard to the special historical responsibility which certain EU Member States have in this region and the importance of peace between the Kingdom of Morocco and the Polisario Front in the interests of the stability of the Maghreb region,
- E. whereas the EU must give firm support to the revived peace plan and strive to ensure that the resumed process develops as scheduled, in a free and democratic manner,
- F. whereas the Council should draw up a common position reaffirming Europe's determination that the referendum should be held and creating a framework for the EU to participate as fully as possible in meeting the economic and human needs deriving from the peace plan,
- G. expressing its willingness to send, at the appropriate moment, an observer delegation to the referendum on self-determination in Western Sahara,
1. Recommends that the Council:
- (a) take note of the European Parliament's concern that the European Union should firmly support the full application of the peace plan, the agreements which have revived it and the holding of the planned referendum, the preparations for which should ensure conditions of equal opportunity for both sides and security for voters;

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 89, 10.4.1995, p. 159.<sup>(2)</sup> OJ C 249, 25.9.1995, p. 159.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

- (b) draw up a common position reaffirming the European Union's full support for the peace plan and all its intermediary stages (identification of voters, quartering of troops, exchange of prisoners, release of political detainees and 'disappeared persons', repatriation of refugees, organization of the electoral campaign, etc.), as well as playing an active part in the holding of a free and transparent referendum on self-determination on the scheduled date, contributing to ensuring that both sides observe their undertakings before and during the voting and respect the outcome and, at all events, guaranteeing the fundamental rights of persons irrespective of the referendum result;
  - (c) in any case, provide and facilitate the necessary humanitarian aid, both through the United Nations and its specialized agencies (particularly the UNHCR) and other humanitarian organizations so as to assist with the proper resettlement of the Saharan people in the disputed zone and, in general, organize EU participation in the tasks of Minurso by providing funds, observers and, if necessary, staff and equipment;
  - (d) draw up a programme for future long-term cooperation with a view to full and sustainable development of Western Sahara.
2. Instructs its President to forward this recommendation to the Council and, for information, to the Commission and the governments of the Member States.

## 2. Karolus programme \*\*\*II (Rule 66(7))

**Common position adopted by the Council with a view to adopting a European Parliament and Council Decision amending Council Decision 92/481/EEC on the adoption of an action plan for the exchange between Member State administrations of national officials who are engaged in the implementation of Community legislation required to achieve the internal market (Karolus programme) (C4-0037/98 — 97/0214(COD))**

(Codecision procedure: second reading)

The common position was approved.

The Council is therefore requested to adopt the act definitively as soon as possible in accordance with its common position.

## 3. Sale of consumer goods and associated guarantees \*\*\*I

**A4-0029/98**

**Proposal for a European Parliament and Council Directive on the sale of consumer goods and associated guarantees (COM(95)0520 — C4-0455/96 — 96/0161(COD))**

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION (\*)

AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 1)

*Citation 1*

Having regard to the Treaty establishing the European Community, and in particular *Article* 100a thereof,

Having regard to the Treaty establishing the European Community, and in particular **Articles** 100a and **129a** thereof,

(\*) OJ C 307, 16.10.1996, p. 8.



Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 2)

*Recital 3a (new)*

**Whereas the sale of consumer goods should cover all types of contract whereby goods are supplied by the seller to the consumer, including contracts where goods are supplied in exchange for another asset in place of the purchase price, contracts of hire and contracts where payments are made by instalments and ownership of the goods is not transferred to the consumer until all instalments due have been paid;**

(Amendment 3)

*Recital 6*

Whereas the goods must, above all, conform with the contractual specifications; whereas the notion of conformity with the contract may be considered as common to the different national legal traditions; whereas the seller *should be* directly liable to the consumer for the conformity of the goods with the contract; whereas, nevertheless, the seller should be free to pursue remedies against his own seller or the producer when the non-conformity is the result of an act of commission or omission on their part;

Whereas the goods must, above all, conform with the contractual specifications; whereas the notion of conformity with the contract may be considered as common to the different national legal traditions; whereas the seller **is normally** directly liable to the consumer for the conformity of the goods with the contract; whereas, nevertheless, the seller should be free to pursue remedies against his own seller or the producer when the non-conformity is the result of an act of commission or omission on their part;

(Amendment 4)

*Recital 6a (new)*

**Whereas as a result of the internal market more and more consumers are purchasing goods abroad; whereas this trend should be encouraged; whereas, with a view to efficient operation of the internal market, the consumer must have a simple means of exercising his rights in respect of goods purchased in another Member State; whereas in certain cases it can be difficult or even impossible for the consumer to exercise his rights against the seller of the goods; whereas in such cases it is desirable that the consumer, in the event of non-conformity with the sales contract, should be able to take action directly against the producer or, if possible, the producer's representative in the consumer's Member State;**

(Amendment 5)

*Recital 7*

Whereas, in the case of non-conformity of the product with the contract, *consumers should be entitled to request that the product be repaired or replaced, or to a reduction in the price paid by way of damages or cancellation of the contract of sale; whereas, however, exercise of these rights should be limited in time and time-limits laid down during which these rights may be invoked against the seller;*

Whereas, in the case of non-conformity of the product with the contract, **the seller or, where appropriate, the producer must bring it into conformity therewith within a reasonable period; whereas, depending on the type of product and the defect, he shall determine how this can be done most quickly and most effectively; whereas the consumer may demand an appropriate price reduction or rescission of the contract of sale if the product cannot be repaired free of charge without loss of value or replaced within a reasonable period or if the product after initially being repaired or replaced is still defective;**

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 6)

*Recital 7a (new)*

**Whereas consumers using the single market and purchasing moveable goods in another Member State need to be better protected, and the manufacturer must therefore enclose with consumer goods that are sold in several Member States a list with at least one claims office in each Member State in which the product is marketed; whereas consumers must be able to notify that office of cases of contractual non-conformity;**

(Amendment 7)

*Recital 8*

*Whereas, in the interest of a stable business environment and good faith in the relations between the Contracting Parties, it should be incumbent on the consumer to notify the seller of any non-conformity he detects within a short period; whereas in order to allow the parties to reach amicable settlements without immediately having to institute legal proceedings to safeguard their rights the limitation period should be interrupted once the consumer draws attention to the lack of conformity of the goods;*

**Deleted**

(Amendment 8)

*Recital 9*

Whereas it is current practice, for certain categories of goods, for sellers and producers to offer guarantees on their products designed to insure consumers against any defect which becomes manifest within a certain period; whereas this practice can stimulate competition; whereas, however, these guarantees may be a simple publicity ploy and deceive the consumer; whereas to ensure market transparency *certain* common principles applicable to the guarantees offered by the economic operators should be laid down;

Whereas it is current practice, for certain categories of goods, for sellers and producers to offer **commercial** guarantees on their products designed to insure consumers against any defect which becomes manifest within a certain period; whereas this practice can stimulate competition; whereas, however, these guarantees may be a simple publicity ploy and deceive the consumer; whereas to ensure market transparency common principles applicable to the guarantees offered by the economic operators should be laid down;

(Amendment 9)

*Recital 10a (new)*

**Whereas consumers are entitled to reliable information on the availability of an appropriate after-sales service;**

(Amendment 10)

*Recital 11*

Whereas legislation and case-law in this area in the various Member States show that there is growing concern to ensure a high level of consumer protection; whereas in the light of these

Whereas legislation and case-law in this area in the various Member States show that there is growing concern to ensure a high level of consumer protection; whereas in the light of these

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

trends and the experience acquired in implementing this Directive it *may* be necessary to envisage more far-reaching harmonization, notably by stipulating the producer's direct liability for defects for which he is responsible;

trends and the experience acquired in implementing this Directive it **will** be necessary to envisage more far-reaching harmonization, notably by stipulating the producer's direct liability for defects for which he is responsible;

(Amendment 11)

## Article 1(2)(a)

(a) 'Consumer' means any natural person who, in the contracts covered by this Directive, is acting for purposes which are not *directly* related to his trade, business or profession;

(a) 'Consumer' means any natural person who, in the contracts covered by this Directive, is acting for purposes which are not related to his trade, business or profession;

(Amendment 12)

## Article 1(2)(b)

(b) 'Consumer goods' means any goods, excluding buildings, *normally intended for final use or consumption*;

(b) 'Consumer goods' means any **moveable** goods, excluding buildings, **that are supplied by sellers to consumers**;

(Amendment 13)

## Article 1(2)(c)

(c) 'Seller' means any natural or legal person who sells consumer goods in the course of his trade, business or profession;

(c) 'Seller' means any natural or legal person who sells consumer goods in the course of his trade, business, profession or **statutory activity or supplies them in exchange for another asset in place of the purchase price**;

(Amendment 14)

## Article 1(2)(d)

(d) 'Guarantee' means any *additional* undertaking given by a seller or producer, *over and above the legal rules governing the sale of consumer goods, to reimburse the price paid, to exchange, repair or handle a product in any way, in the case of non-conformity of the product with the contract.*

(d) '**Commercial** guarantee' means any **special** undertaking given by a seller or producer to **put things right if the goods do not match the characteristics described in the guarantee statement or the relevant advertising.**

(Amendment 15)

## Article 1(2)(da) (new)

(da) '**Producer**' means the manufacturer of the goods, the person importing the goods into Community territory, or any person purporting to be the producer by putting his/her name, trade mark or other distinguishing mark on the goods.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 16)

*Article 1(2)(db)(new)*

(db) 'Producer's representative' means the natural or legal person who acts as the official distributor and/or official service provider of the producer, with the exception of independent sellers who operate exclusively as retailers;

(Amendment 17)

*Article 1(2a) (new)*

**2a. Contracts for the delivery of goods to be manufactured or produced shall be equated with purchase contracts.**

(Amendment 18)

*Article 2(2)(a)*

(a) they comply with the description given by the seller and possess the qualities of the goods which the seller has held out to the consumer as a sample or model;

(a) they comply with the description given by the seller **or producer** and possess the qualities of the goods which the seller **or producer** has held out to the consumer as a sample or model;

(Amendment 19)

*Article 2(2)(c)*

(c) they are fit for any particular purpose for which the consumer requires them and which he had made known to the seller at the time of conclusion of the contract, *except where the circumstances show that the buyer did not rely on the seller's explanations;*

(c) they are fit for any particular purpose for which the consumer requires them and which he had made known to the seller at the time of conclusion of the contract;

(Amendment 20)

*Article 2(2)(d)*

(d) their quality and performance are *satisfactory given the nature of the goods and the price paid and taking into account the public statements made about them* by the seller, the producer or his representative.

(d) their quality and performance are **such as consumers were entitled to expect, partly on the grounds of** the public statements made about **the product in advertising or labelling** by the seller, the producer or his representative.

(Amendment 21)

*Article 2(2a) (new)*

**2a. Goods shall be deemed to be in conformity with the contract as defined in this Article if at the time of purchase the consumer agreed to conclude the contract although aware of the lack of conformity.**

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 22)

*Article 2(2b) (new)*

**2b. For the purposes of paragraph 2(b), fitness for purpose shall include consideration inter alia of the following aspects of the quality of the goods: appearance and finish, freedom from minor defects, safety and durability.**

(Amendment 23)

*Article 2(3)*

3. Any lack of conformity resulting from incorrect installation of the goods shall be considered to be equivalent to lack of conformity of the goods with the contract, if the goods were installed by the seller or under his responsibility.

3. Any lack of conformity resulting from incorrect installation of the goods shall be considered to be equivalent to lack of conformity of the goods with the contract, if the goods were installed by the seller or under his responsibility. **This shall apply equally if the product is installed by the consumer and the incorrect installation is due to a lack of conformity in the written installation instructions.**

(Amendment 24)

*Article 3(1)*

1. The seller shall be liable to the consumer for any lack of conformity which exists when the goods are delivered to the consumer and which becomes manifest within a period of two years *unless, at the moment of conclusion of the contract of sale, the consumer knew or could not be unaware of the lack of conformity.*

1. The seller shall be liable to the consumer for any lack of conformity which exists when the goods are **actually** delivered to the consumer and which becomes manifest within a period of two years.

(Amendment 25)

*Article 3(1a) (new)*

**1a. By derogation from paragraph 1, the consumer may apply directly to the producer or, where applicable, to his representative in the consumer's Member State, if:**

- **the seller of the goods is established in another Member State,**
- **the seller has ceased trading or has established himself elsewhere without giving notice of this fact,**
- **the seller cannot be informed in good time of the lack of conformity.**

(Amendment 26)

*Article 3(2)*

2. When the goods are not in conformity with the public statements made by the producer or his representative, the seller shall not be liable if:

- the seller shows that he did not know and could not reasonably know the statement in question,
- *the seller shows that at the time of sale he corrected the statement, or*
- *the seller shows that the decision to buy the goods could not have been influenced by the statement.*

2. When the goods are not in conformity with the public statements made by the producer or his representative, the seller shall not be liable if the seller shows that he did not know and could not know the statement in question.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 27)

*Article 3(3)*

3. Until proof of the contrary any lack of conformity which becomes manifest within six months of delivery shall be presumed to have existed at the time of delivery, unless this presumption is incompatible with the nature of the goods or the nature of the lack of conformity.

3. Until proof of the contrary any lack of conformity which becomes manifest within six months of **actual** delivery shall be presumed to have existed at the time of delivery, unless this presumption is incompatible with the nature of the goods or the nature of the lack of conformity.

(Amendment 45)

*Article 3(4)*

4. When a lack of conformity is notified to the seller, *pursuant to Article 4, the consumer shall be entitled to ask the seller either to repair the goods free of charge within a reasonable period, or to replace the goods, when this is possible, or to demand an appropriate price reduction or rescission of the contract. Exercise of the right of rescission or replacement of the good is limited to one year*

4. When a lack of conformity is notified to the seller, **the latter must without unreasonable delay offer to repair the goods free of charge or to replace the goods. The consumer shall have the right to choose either of these options unless, in view of the particular nature of the case, only one specific option appears economically appropriate having regard to the seller's interests, and reasonable to the consumer. The consumer need not accept an offer to repair the goods where this would result in a reduction in their value; in such an event he may demand a replacement.**

*Member States may provide that the scope of the rights referred to in the first subparagraph be limited in the case of a minor lack of conformity.*

**If neither of these is possible, or if the lack of conformity is not made good after the attempted repair, the consumer shall have the right to demand an appropriate price reduction or rescission of the contract.**

(Amendment 29)

*Article 3(4), subparagraphs 2a and 2b (new)*

**The same provisions shall apply to goods supplied by way of replacement as to newly purchased goods.**

**Where the goods are replaced, the guarantee period pursuant to paragraph 1 shall recommence. Where a defect is remedied, this guarantee period shall recommence in respect of the remedied defect.**

(Amendment 30)

*Article 3(4), subparagraph 2c (new)*

**The seller shall bear any costs incurred, such as for transport, travelling, labour or materials.**

Tuesday 10 March 1998

---

 TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION
 

---



---

 AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT
 

---

(Amendment 31)

*Article 3(5)*

5. When the final seller is liable to the consumer because of a lack of conformity resulting from an act of commission or omission by the producer, a previous seller in the same chain of contracts or any other intermediary, the final seller shall be entitled to pursue remedies against the *responsible person*, under the conditions laid down by national law.

5. When the final seller is liable to the consumer because of a lack of conformity resulting from an act of commission or omission by the producer, a previous seller in the same chain of contracts or any other intermediary, the final seller shall be entitled to pursue remedies against the **persons liable**. **The right to pursue remedies shall be exercised under the conditions laid down by national law; however, the persons designated as liable shall not be entitled to invoke contractual safeguard clauses whereby the final seller may not lawfully decline liability vis-à-vis the buyer.**

(Amendment 32)

*Article 3a (new)***Article 3a****Payment by instalments**

**If the seller and consumer agree to payment by instalments, such payments may be suspended until a lack of contractual conformity is put right.**

(Amendment 33)

*Article 3b (new)***Article 3b****Suspension of periods of liability**

**Where the consumer notifies the seller or the address mentioned in Article 3c of a lack of conformity, the period under Article 3(1) shall be suspended until the seller's obligations are fulfilled. If the consumer has recourse to an existing extrajudicial complaints system in the Member States or takes legal action, the period under Article 3(1) shall likewise be suspended until a decision is taken under the extrajudicial complaints system or a judicial decision is made.**

(Amendment 48)

*Article 3c (new)***Article 3c****Information**

**In the case of goods sold in several Member States the producer shall provide a contact address in each Member State that can provide consumers with relevant information for asserting their claims when notified about a lack of conformity.**

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 36)

*Article 5*

## Guarantees

1. Any guarantee offered *by a seller or producer* shall legally bind the offerer under the conditions laid down in the guarantee document and the associated advertising and must place the beneficiary in a more advantageous position than that resulting from the rules governing the sale of consumer goods set out in the national provisions applicable.
2. The guarantee must feature in a written document which must be freely available for consultation before purchase and must clearly set out the essential particulars necessary for making claims under the guarantee, notably the duration and territorial scope of the guarantee, as well as the name and address of the guarantor.

**Commercial guarantees**

1. Any guarantee offered shall legally bind the offerer under the conditions laid down in the guarantee document and the associated advertising and must place the beneficiary in a more advantageous position than that resulting from the rules governing the sale of consumer goods set out in the national provisions applicable.
2. The guarantee must feature in a written document which must be freely available for consultation before purchase and must clearly set out the essential particulars necessary for making claims under the guarantee, notably the duration and territorial scope of the guarantee, **the name and address of the person to be contacted, the procedure to be followed in order to make a claim under the guarantee**, as well as the name and address of the guarantor. **It must also advise consumers that they have legal rights and that the guarantee does not affect those rights in any way. A guarantee only on specific parts of the product must clearly indicate this limitation, otherwise the limitation shall be invalid.**

(Amendment 38)

*Article 5a (new)***Article 5a****Consumer information**

**Member States shall provide for measures to inform consumers of the national law adopted to transpose this Directive and shall where appropriate ask professional organizations to inform consumers of their rights.**

(Amendment 39)

*Article 5b (new)***Article 5b****Implementation**

**Two years after the deadline for transposition has expired the Commission shall submit a report on the implementation of this Directive to the European Parliament and the Council.**

(Amendment 40)

*Article 5c (new)***Article 5c****Legislation**

**After expiry of the period provided for in Article 8(1), the following point shall be added to the annex to Directive 98/.../EC on actions for restraint to protect the interests of consumers:**

- ‘9a. Directive 98/.../EC on the sale of consumer goods and associated guarantees (OJ L ...)’.**



Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 42)

*Article 6(2)*

2. Member States shall take the necessary measures to ensure that, *irrespective of the law applicable to the contract, and when the contract has a close connection with the territory of the Member States*, consumers are not deprived of the protection afforded by this Directive.

2. Member States shall take the necessary measures to ensure that consumers are not deprived of the protection afforded by this Directive **if the law of a third country has been chosen as the law to be applied to the contract and** the contract has a close connection with the territory of the Member States.

(Amendment 43)

*Article 7a (new)***Article 7a****Legal remedies and complaints**

1. The Member States shall, in cooperation with consumer associations and industrial and professional organizations, devise complaints systems which guarantee the independent, impartial and effective processing of complaints.

2. In the case of cross-border contracts within the European Union, the Member States shall ensure that appropriate and effective complaints procedures and remedies are in place to settle any disputes between consumers and sellers. In the case of defective goods consumers shall be entitled to use the complaints agency as mediator or to refer their claims arising from the contract of sale to the complaints agency.

**Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a European Parliament and Council Directive on the sale of consumer goods and associated guarantees (COM(95)0520 – C4-0455/96 – 96/0161(COD))**

(Codecision procedure: first reading)

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission proposal to Parliament and the Council, COM(95)0520 – 96/0161(COD) <sup>(1)</sup>,
- having regard to Articles 189b(2) and 100a of the EC Treaty, pursuant to which the Commission submitted the proposal to Parliament (C4-0455/96),
- whereas the proposed legal basis is inappropriate; whereas reference should also be made to Article 129a of the EC Treaty,
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection and the opinions of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy and the Committee on Legal Affairs and Citizens' Rights (A4-0029/98),

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 307, 16.10.1996, p. 8.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

1. Approves the Commission proposal, subject to Parliament's amendments;
2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, pursuant to Article 189a(2) of the EC Treaty;
3. Calls on the Council to incorporate Parliament's amendments in the common position that it adopts in accordance with Article 189b(2) of the EC Treaty;
4. Should the Council intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament, calls on the Council to notify Parliament and requests that the conciliation procedure be initiated;
5. Points out that the Commission is required to submit to Parliament any modification it may intend to make to its proposal as amended by Parliament;
6. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and Commission.

#### 4. Propagating material of ornamental plants \* (Rule 99)

**Proposal for a Council Directive on the marketing of propagating material of ornamental plants**  
(COM(97)0708 – C4-0044/98 – 97/0367(CNS))

(Consultation procedure)

The proposal was approved.

#### 5. Decentralized Community agencies \*

A4-0035/98

##### I.

**Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 40/94 of 20 December 1993 on the Community trade mark (COM(97)0489 – C4-0601/97 – 97/0253(CNS))**

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION (\*)

AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 1)

*Recital 2a (new)*

**Whereas, since the Office may receive funding from the budget, all its revenues are to be budgetized and, as such, considered as preallocated resources of the Union;**

(\*) OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 13.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

## (Amendment 2)

*Recital 3*

Whereas, since the Office is a body governed by Community law, provision should be made for *any resources remaining after the constitution, where appropriate, of a reserve to cover future expenditure and after any revision of the fees charged by the Office to be paid into the general budget of the European Communities.*

Whereas, since the Office is a body governed by Community law, provision should be made for **all resources received by the Office in accordance with its financial regulation to be entered into the general budget of the Union; whereas the Office may constitute** a reserve to cover future expenditure; **whereas the fees charged by the Office shall be subject to revision; whereas all surplus revenues shall be paid into the general budget of the Union;**

## (Amendment 3)

*Recital 4*

Whereas the entering of amounts in the said reserve should be made subject to the agreement of the Commission, and whereas the Commission should inform the Council and Parliament of its decisions in this respect;

Whereas the entering of amounts in the said reserve should be made subject to the agreement of the Commission **pursuant to Article 28 of the Financial Regulation**, and whereas the Commission should inform the Council and Parliament of its decisions in this respect;

## (Amendment 4)

*Recital 6*

Whereas the Commission's Financial Controller is the person best placed to perform the tasks of Financial Controller of the Office;

Whereas the Commission's Financial Controller is the person best placed to perform the tasks of Financial Controller of the Office, **subject to the necessary practical arrangements being in place to ensure swift and effective processing of financial transactions and to prevent excessive recourse to the use of imprest accounts;**

## (Amendment 5)

*Recital 7*

Whereas *is it desirable* to involve the European Parliament in the discharge procedure;

Whereas **it is a prerequisite** to involve the European Parliament in the discharge procedure, **pursuant to Article 206 of the Treaty;**

## (Amendment 6)

## ARTICLE 1(1)

## Article 134(4) (Regulation (EC) No 40/94)

4. Any revenue *surplus to expenditure* during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the *European Communities* as *miscellaneous* revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.

4. **All** revenues during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the **Union** as **preallocated** revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve **and taken out of it** only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

**After three years, the Commission shall evaluate the level of the fees received by the Office which may be revised after consultation of Parliament.**

(Amendment 7)

ARTICLE 1(2)

Article 136 (Regulation (EC) No 40/94)

Control of commitment and payment of all expenditure and control of the *existence* and recovery of all revenue of the Office shall be carried out by the Commission's Financial Controller.

**To ensure a maximum of transparency and harmonisation between the decentralised agencies**, control of commitment and payment of all expenditure and control of the **establishment** and recovery of all revenue of the Office shall be carried out by the Commission's Financial Controller, who shall ensure that the necessary practical arrangements are in place to allow swift and effective processing of the Office's financial transactions and to prevent excessive recourse to the use of imprest accounts.

(Amendment 8)

ARTICLE 1(3)

Article 137(2) (Regulation (EC) No 40/94)

2. The Budget Committee shall, *on* the recommendation of the European Parliament, give *a* discharge to the President of the Office in respect of the implementation of the budget.

2. The **Office's** Budget Committee shall, **subject to** the recommendation of the European Parliament, give discharge to the President of the Office in respect of the implementation of the budget.

**Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 40/94 of 20 December 1993 on the Community trade mark (COM(97)0489 — C4-0601/97 — 97/0253(CNS))**

(Consultation procedure)

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(97)0489 — 97/0253(CNS)) <sup>(1)</sup>,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 235 of the EC Treaty (C4-0601/97),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control and the opinion of the Committee on Budgets (A4-0035/98),

1. Approves the Commission proposal, subject to Parliament's amendments;
2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, pursuant to Article 189a(2) of the EC Treaty;
3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and the Commission.

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 13.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

## II.

**Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 2100/94 of 27 July 1994 on Community plant variety rights (COM(97)0489 — C4-0602/97 — 97/0254(CNS))**

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION (\*)

AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 9)

*Recital 2a (new)*

**Whereas, since the Office may receive funding from the budget, all its revenues are to be budgetized and, as such, considered as preallocated resources of the Union;**

(Amendment 10)

*Recital 3*

Whereas, since the Office is a body governed by Community law, provision should be made for *any* resources *remaining after the constitution, where appropriate, of* a reserve to cover future expenditure and after any revision of the fees charged by the Office to be paid into the general budget of the *European Communities*;

Whereas, since the Office is a body governed by Community law, provision should be made for **all** resources **received by the Office in accordance with its financial regulation to be entered into the general budget of the Union; whereas the Office may constitute** a reserve to cover future expenditure; **whereas** the fees charged by the Office **shall be subject to revision; whereas all surplus revenues shall** be paid into the general budget of the Union;

(Amendment 11)

*Recital 4*

Whereas the entering of amounts in the said reserve should be made subject to the agreement of the Commission, and whereas the Commission should inform the Council and Parliament of its decisions in this respect;

Whereas the entering of amounts in the said reserve should be made subject to the agreement of the Commission **pursuant to Article 28 of the Financial Regulation**, and whereas the Commission should inform the Council and Parliament of its decisions in this respect;

(Amendment 12)

*Recital 6*

Whereas the Commission's Financial Controller is the person best placed to perform the tasks of Financial Controller of the Office;

Whereas the Commission's Financial Controller is the person best placed to perform the tasks of Financial Controller of the Office, **subject to the necessary practical arrangements being in place to ensure swift and effective processing of financial transactions and to prevent excessive recourse to the use of imprest accounts;**

(Amendment 13)

*Recital 7*

Whereas *is it desirable* to involve the European Parliament in the discharge procedure;

Whereas **it is a prerequisite** to involve the European Parliament in the discharge procedure, **pursuant to Article 206 of the Treaty;**

(\*) OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 14.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 14)

## ARTICLE 1(1)

Article 108(5) (Regulation (EC) No 2100/94)

5. Any revenue *surplus to expenditure* during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the *European Communities* as *miscellaneous* revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.

5. All revenues during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the **Union** as **preallocated** revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve **and taken out of it** only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.

**After three years, the Commission shall evaluate the level of the fees received by the Office which may be revised after consultation of Parliament.**

(Amendment 15)

## ARTICLE 1(2)(a)

Article 111(1) (Regulation (EC) No 2100/94)

Control of commitment and payment of all expenditure and control of the *existence* and recovery of all revenue of the Office shall be carried out by the Commission's Financial Controller.

**To ensure a maximum of transparency and harmonisation between the decentralised agencies**, control of commitment and payment of all expenditure and control of the **establishment** and recovery of all revenue of the Office shall be carried out by the Commission's Financial Controller, **who shall ensure that the necessary practical arrangements are in place to allow swift and effective processing of the Office's financial transactions and to prevent excessive recourse to the use of imprest accounts.**

(Amendment 16)

## ARTICLE 1(2)(b)

Article 111(3) (Regulation (EC) No 2100/94)

The Administrative Council shall, *on* the recommendation of the European Parliament, give a discharge to the President of the Office in respect of the implementation of the budget.

The Administrative Council shall, **subject to** the recommendation of the European Parliament, give discharge to the President of the Office in respect of the implementation of the budget.

**Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 2100/94 of 27 July 1994 on Community plant variety rights (COM(97)0489 — C4-0602/97 — 97/0254(CNS))**

(Consultation procedure)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(97)0489 — 97/0254(CNS)) <sup>(1)</sup>,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 235 of the EC Treaty (C4-0602/97),

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 14.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
  - having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control and the opinion of the Committee on Budgets (A4-0035/98),
1. Approves the Commission proposal, subject to Parliament's amendments;
  2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, pursuant to Article 189a(2) of the EC Treaty;
  3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
  4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and the Commission.

### III.

**Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EEC) No 2309/93 of 22 July 1993 laying down Community procedures for the authorisation and supervision of medicinal products for human and veterinary use and establishing a European Agency for the Evaluation of Medicinal Products (COM(97)0489 — C4-0603/97 — 97/0255(CNS))**

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION (\*)

AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 17)

*Recital 2a (new)*

**Whereas, since the Agency may receive funding from the budget, all its revenues are to be budgetized and, as such, considered as preallocated resources of the Union;**

(Amendment 18)

*Recital 3*

Whereas, since the Agency is a body governed by Community law, provision should be made for *any resources remaining after the constitution, where appropriate, of a reserve to cover future expenditure and after any revision of the fees charged by the Agency to be paid into the general budget of the European Communities;*

Whereas since the Agency is a body governed by Community law, provision should be made for **all resources received by the Agency in accordance with its financial regulation to be entered into the general budget of the Union;** whereas **the Agency may constitute** a reserve to cover future expenditure; **whereas the fees charged by the Agency shall be subject to revision; whereas all surplus revenues shall be paid into the general budget of the Union;**

(Amendment 19)

*Recital 4*

Whereas the entering of amounts in the said reserve should be made subject to the agreement of the Commission, and whereas the Commission should inform the Council and Parliament of its *decision* in this respect;

Whereas the entering of amounts in the said reserve should be made subject to the agreement of the Commission **pursuant to Article 28 of the Financial Regulation**, and whereas the Commission should inform the Council and Parliament of its **decisions** in this respect;

(\*) OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 15.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 20)

*Recital 6*

Whereas the Commission's Financial Controller is the person best placed to perform the tasks of Financial Controller of the Agency;

Whereas the Commission's Financial Controller is the person best placed to perform the tasks of Financial Controller of the Agency, **subject to the necessary practical arrangements being in place to ensure swift and effective processing of financial transactions and to prevent excessive recourse to the use of imprest accounts;**

(Amendment 21)

*Recital 7*

Whereas *is it desirable* to involve the European Parliament in the discharge procedure;

Whereas **it is a prerequisite** to involve the European Parliament in the discharge procedure, **pursuant to Article 206 of the Treaty;**

(Amendment 22)

*ARTICLE 1(a)**Article 57(6a) (Regulation (EC) No 2309/93)*

6a. Any revenue *surplus to expenditure* during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the *European Communities* as *miscellaneous* revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.

6a. **All** revenues during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the **Union** as **preallocated** revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve **and taken out of it** only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.

**After three years, the Commission shall evaluate the level of the fees received by the Agency which may be revised after consultation of Parliament.**

(Amendment 23)

*ARTICLE 1(b)**Article 57(8) (Regulation (EC) No 2309/93)*

8. Control of commitment and payment of all expenditure and control of the establishment and recovery of all revenue of the Agency shall be carried out by the Commission's Financial Controller.

8. **To ensure a maximum of transparency and harmonisation between the decentralised agencies,** control of commitment and payment of all expenditure and control of the establishment and recovery of all revenue of the Agency shall be carried out by the Commission's Financial Controller, **who shall ensure that the necessary practical arrangements are in place to allow swift and effective processing of the Agency's financial transactions and to prevent excessive recourse to the use of imprest accounts.**



Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 24)

ARTICLE 1(d)

Article 57(10) (Regulation (EC) No 2309/93)

10. The Management Board shall, *on* the recommendation of the European Parliament, give *a* discharge to the President of the Office in respect of the implementation of the budget.

10. The Management Board shall, **subject to** the recommendation of the European Parliament, give discharge to the President of the Office in respect of the implementation of the budget.

**Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EEC) No 2309/93 of 22 July 1993 laying down Community procedures for the authorisation and supervision of medicinal products for human and veterinary use and establishing a European Agency for the Evaluation of Medicinal Products (COM(97)0489 — C4-0603/97 — 97/0255(CNS))**

(Consultation procedure)

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(97)0489 — 97/0255(CNS)) <sup>(1)</sup>,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 235 of the EC Treaty (C4-0603/97),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control and the opinion of the Committee on Budgets (A4-0035/98),

1. Approves the Commission proposal, subject to Parliament's amendments;
2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, pursuant to Article 189a(2) of the EC Treaty;
3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and the Commission.

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 15.

## IV.

**Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90 of 7 May 1990 on the establishment of the European Environment Agency and the European Environment Information and Observation Network (COM(97)0489 — C4-0604/97 — 97/0256(CNS))**

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION (\*)AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 25)

Recital 3

Whereas the Commission's Financial Controller is the person best placed to perform the tasks of Financial Controller of the *Office*;

Whereas the Commission's Financial Controller is the person best placed to perform the tasks of Financial Controller of the **Agency, subject to the necessary practical arrangements being in place to ensure swift and effective processing of financial transactions and to prevent excessive recourse to the use of imprest accounts;**

(\*) OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 16.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 26)

*Recital 4*

Whereas *is it desirable* for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Management Board,

Whereas **it is a prerequisite** for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Management Board, **pursuant to Article 206 of the Treaty**;

(Amendment 27)

*ARTICLE -1(a)(new)**Recital 9a (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90)*

(a) **The following recital is added after the ninth recital of Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90:**

**‘Whereas, since the Agency may receive funding from the budget, all its revenues are to be budgetized and, as such, considered as preallocated resources of the Union;’**

(Amendment 28)

*ARTICLE -1(b) (new)**Article 11(3a) and (3b) (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90)*

(b) **The following paragraphs 3a and 3b are added to Article 11 of Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90:**

**‘3a. Since the Agency is a body governed by Community law, provision shall be made for all resources received by the Agency in accordance with its financial Regulation to be entered into the general budget of the Union.**

**3b. The Agency may constitute a reserve to cover future expenditure. The fees charged by the Agency shall be subject to revision. All surplus revenues shall be paid into the general budget of the Union.’**

(Amendment 29)

*ARTICLE -1(c) (new)**Article 11(3c) (new) (Regulation (EEC) 1210/90)*

(c) **The following paragraph 3c is added to Article 11 of Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90:**

**‘3c. The entering of amounts in the said reserve shall be subject to the agreement of the Commission pursuant to Article 28 of the Financial Regulation, and the Commission shall inform the Council and Parliament of its decisions in this respect.’**

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 30)

ARTICLE -1(d)

*Article 11(3d) (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90)*(d) **The following paragraph 3d is added to Article 11 of Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90:**

**'3d. All revenues during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the Union as preallocated revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve and taken out of it only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.**

**After three years, the Commission shall evaluate the level of the fees received by the Agency which may be revised after consultation of Parliament.'**

(Amendment 31)

ARTICLE 1(a)

*Article 13(2) (Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90)*

2. Control of commitment and payment of all expenditure and control of the establishment and recovery of all revenue of the Agency shall be carried out by the Commission's Financial Controller.

**2. To ensure a maximum of transparency and harmonisation between the decentralised agencies, control of commitment and payment of all expenditure and control of the establishment and recovery of all revenue of the Agency shall be carried out by the Commission's Financial Controller, who will ensure that the necessary practical arrangements are in place to allow swift and effective processing of the Agency's financial transactions and to prevent excessive recourse to the use of imprest accounts.**

(Amendment 32)

ARTICLE 1(b)

*Article 13(4) (Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90)*

4. The European Parliament shall, on the recommendation of the Management Board, give discharge to the Executive Director in respect of the implementation of the budget.

4. The European Parliament shall, **subject to** the recommendation of the Management Board, give discharge to the Executive Director in respect of the implementation of the budget.

**Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EEC) No 1210/90 of 7 May 1990 on the establishment of the European Environment Agency and the European Environment Information and Observation Network (COM(97)0489 — C4-0604/97 97/0256(CNS))**

(Consultation procedure)

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(97)0489 — 97/0256(CNS)) <sup>(1)</sup>,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 130s of the EC Treaty (C4-0604/97),

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 16.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
  - having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control and the opinion of the Committee on Budgets (A4-0035/98),
1. Approves the Commission proposal, subject to Parliament's amendments;
  2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, pursuant to Article 189a(2) of the EC Treaty;
  3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
  4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and the Commission.

## V.

### **Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 2062/94 of 18 July 1994 establishing a European Agency for Safety and Health at Work (COM(97)0489 – C4-0605/97 – 97/0258(CNS))**

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED BY THE COMMISSION (*)	AMENDMENTS BY PARLIAMENT
(Amendment 33)	
<i>Recital 3</i>	
Whereas <i>is it desirable</i> for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Administrative Board,	Whereas <b>it is a prerequisite</b> for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Administrative Board, <b>pursuant to Article 206 of the Treaty;</b>
(Amendment 34)	
<i>ARTICLE –1(a)(new)</i>	
<i>Recital 13a (new) (Regulation (EC) No 2062/94)</i>	
	(a) <b>The following recital is added after the 13th recital of Regulation (EC) No 2062/94:</b> <b>‘Whereas, since the Agency may receive funding from the budget, all its revenues are to be budgetized and, as such, considered as preallocated resources of the Union;’</b>
(Amendment 35)	
<i>ARTICLE –1(b)(new)</i>	
<i>Article 12(3a) and (3b) (new) (Regulation (EC) No 2062/94)</i>	
	(b) <b>The following paragraphs 3a and 3b are added to Article 12 of Regulation (EC) No 2062/94:</b> <b>‘3a. Since the Agency is a body governed by Community law, provision shall be made for all resources received by the Agency in accordance with its financial regulation to be entered into the general budget of the Union.</b>

(\*) OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 17.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION

AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

**3b. The Agency may constitute a reserve to cover future expenditure. The fees charged by the Agency shall be subject to revision. All surplus revenues shall be paid into the general budget of the Union.'**

(Amendment 36)

*ARTICLE -1(c)*

*Article 12(3c) (new) (Regulation (EC) No 2062/94)*

**(c) The following paragraph 3c is added to Article 12 of Regulation (EC) No 2062/94:**

**'3c. The entering of amounts in the said reserve shall be made subject to the agreement of the Commission pursuant to Article 28 of the Financial Regulation, and the Commission shall inform the Council and Parliament of its decisions in this respect.'**

(Amendment 37)

*ARTICLE -1(d)*

*Article 12(3d) (new) (Regulation (EC) No 2062/94)*

**(d) The following paragraph 3d is added to Article 12 of Regulation (EC) No 2062/94:**

**'3d. All revenues during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the Union as preallocated revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve and taken out of it only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.**

**After three years, the Commission shall evaluate the level of the fees received by the Agency which may be revised after consultation of Parliament.'**

(Amendment 38)

*ARTICLE 1*

*Article 14(4) (Regulation (EC) No 2062/94)*

4. The European Parliament shall, *on* the recommendation of the Administrative Board, give discharge to the Director in respect of the implementation of the budget.

4. The European Parliament shall, **subject to** the recommendation of the Administrative Board, give discharge to the Director in respect of the implementation of the budget.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 2062/94 of 18 July 1994 establishing a European Agency for Safety and Health at Work (COM(97)0489 — C4-0605/97 — 97/0258(CNS))**

(Consultation procedure)

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(97)0489 — 97/0258(CNS)) <sup>(1)</sup>,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 235 of the EC Treaty (C4-0605/97),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control and the opinion of the Committee on Budgets (A4-0035/98),

1. Approves the Commission proposal, subject to Parliament's amendments;
2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, pursuant to Article 189a(2) of the EC Treaty;
3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and the Commission.

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p.17.

**VI.**

**Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EEC) No 302/93 of 8 February 1993 establishing a European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction (COM(97)0489 — C4-0606/97 — 97/0259(CNS))**

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION (\*)

AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 39)

*Recital 3*

Whereas *is it desirable* for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Management Board,

Whereas **it is a prerequisite** for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Management Board, **pursuant to Article 206 of the Treaty**;

(Amendment 40)

*ARTICLE -1(a) (new)*

*Recital 16a (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 302/93)*

**(a) The following recital is added after the 16th recital of Regulation (EEC) No 302/93:**

**'Whereas, since the Centre may receive funding from the budget, all its revenues are to be budgetized and, as such, considered as preallocated resources of the Union;**

(\*) OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 17.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 41)

*ARTICLE -I(b) (new)**Article 11(4a) and (4b) (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 302/93)*

(b) The following paragraphs 4a and 4b are added to Article 11 of Regulation (EEC) No 302/93:

**‘4a. Since the Centre is a body governed by Community law, provision shall be made for all resources received by the Centre in accordance with its financial regulation to be entered into the general budget of the Union.**

**4b. The Centre may constitute a reserve to cover future expenditure. The fees charged by the Centre shall be subject to revision. All surplus revenues shall be paid into the general budget of the Union.’**

(Amendment 42)

*ARTICLE -I(c) (new)**Article 11(4c) (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 302/93)*

(c) The following paragraph 4c is added to Article 11 of Regulation (EEC) No 302/93:

**‘4c. The entering of amounts in the said reserve shall be made subject to the agreement of the Commission pursuant to Article 28 of the Financial Regulation, and the Commission shall inform the Council and Parliament of its decisions in this respect;’**

(Amendment 43)

*ARTICLE -I(d) (new)**Article 11(4d) (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 302/93)*

(d) The following paragraph 4d is added to Article 11 of Regulation (EEC) No 302/93:

**‘4d. All revenues during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the Union as preallocated revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve and taken out of it only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.**

**After three years, the Commission shall evaluate the level of the fees received by the Centre which may be revised after consultation of Parliament.’**

(Amendment 44)

*ARTICLE 1**Article 11(11) (Regulation (EEC) No 302/93)*

11. The European Parliament shall, *on the recommendation of the Management Board, give a discharge to the Director of the Centre in respect of the implementation of the budget.*

11. The European Parliament shall, **subject to the recommendation of the Management Board, give discharge to the Director of the Centre in respect of the implementation of the budget.**

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EEC) No 302/93 of 8 February 1993 establishing a European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction (COM(97)0489 — C4-0606/97 — 97/0259(CNS))**

(Consultation procedure)

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(97)0489 — 97/0259(CNS)) <sup>(1)</sup>,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 235 of the EC Treaty (C4-0606/97),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control and the opinion of the Committee on Budgets (A4-0035/98),

1. Approves the Commission proposal, subject to Parliament's amendments;
2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, pursuant to Article 189a(2) of the EC Treaty;
3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and the Commission.

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 17.

**VII.**

**Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90 of 7 May 1990 establishing a European Training Foundation (COM(97)0489 — C4-0607/97 — 97/0260(CNS))**

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION (\*)

AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 45)

*Recital 3*

Whereas *is it desirable* for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Governing Board,

Whereas **it is a prerequisite** for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Governing Board, **pursuant to Article 206 of the Treaty;**

(Amendment 46)

*ARTICLE -I(a) (new)*

*Recital 8a (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90)*

(a) **The following recital is added after the 8th recital of Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90:**

**'Whereas, since the Foundation may receive funding from the budget, all its revenues are to be budgetized and, as such, considered as preallocated resources of the Union;'**

(\*) OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 18.



Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION

AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 47)

*ARTICLE –1(b) (new)*

*Article 10(2a) and (2b) (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90)*

**(b) The following paragraphs 2a and 2b are added to Article 10 of Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90:**

**‘2a. Since the Foundation is a body governed by Community law, provision shall be made for all resources received by the Foundation in accordance with its financial regulation to be entered into the general budget of the Union.**

**2b. The Foundation may constitute a reserve to cover future expenditure. The fees charged by the Foundation shall be subject to revision. All surplus revenues shall be paid into the general budget of the Union.’**

(Amendment 48)

*ARTICLE –1(c) (new)*

*Article 10(2c) (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90)*

**(c) The following paragraph 2c is added to Article 10 of Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90:**

**‘2c. The entering of amounts in the said reserve shall be made subject to the agreement of the Commission pursuant to Article 28 of the Financial Regulation, and the Commission shall inform the Council and Parliament of its decisions in this respect;’**

(Amendment 49)

*ARTICLE –1(d) (new)*

*Article 10(2d) (new) (Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90)*

**(d) The following paragraph 2d is added to Article 10 of Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90:**

**‘2d. All revenues during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the Union as preallocated revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve and taken out of it only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.**

**After three years, the Commission shall evaluate the level of the fees received by the Foundation which may be revised after consultation of Parliament.’**

(Amendment 50)

*ARTICLE 1*

*Article 11(4) (Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90)*

4. The European Parliament shall, *on* the recommendation of the Governing Board, give a discharge to the Director of the Foundation in respect of the implementation of the budget.

4. The European Parliament shall, **subject to** the recommendation of the Governing Board, give discharge to the Director of the Foundation in respect of the implementation of the budget.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90 of 7 May 1990 establishing a European Training Foundation (COM(97)0489 — C4-0607/97 — 97/0260(CNS))**

(Consultation procedure)

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(97)0489 — 97/0260(CNS)) <sup>(1)</sup>,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 235 of the EC Treaty (C4-0607/97),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control and the opinion of the Committee on Budgets (A4-0035/98),

1. Approves the Commission proposal, subject to Parliament's amendments;
2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, pursuant to Article 189a(2) of the EC Treaty;
3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and the Commission.

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 18.

**VIII.**

**Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 2965/94 of 28 November 1994 setting up a Translation Centre for Bodies of the European Union (COM(97)0489 — C4-0608/97 — 97/0261(CNS))**

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION (\*)

AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 51)

*Recital 3*

Whereas *is it desirable* for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Management Board,

Whereas **it is a prerequisite** for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Management Board, **pursuant to Article 206 of the Treaty;**

(Amendment 52)

*ARTICLE -1 (a) (new)*

*Recital 6a (new) (Regulation (EC) No 2965/94)*

**(a) The following recital is added after the sixth recital of Regulation (EC) No 2965/94:**

**'Whereas, since the Centre may receive funding from the budget, all its revenues are to be budgetized and, as such, considered as preallocated resources of the Union;'**

(\*) OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 19.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 53)

*ARTICLE –I(b) (new)**Article 10(2d) and (2e) (new) (Regulation (EC) No 2965/94)*

(b) The following paragraphs 2d and 2e are added to Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 2965/94:

‘2d. Since the Centre is a body governed by Community law, provision shall be made for all resources received by the Centre in accordance with its financial regulation to be entered into the general budget of the Union.

2e. The Centre may constitute a reserve to cover future expenditure. The fees charged by the Centre shall be subject to revision. All surplus revenues shall be paid into the general budget of the Union.’

(Amendment 54)

*ARTICLE –I(c) (new)**Article 10(2f) (new) (Regulation (EC) No 2965/94)*

(c) The following paragraph 2f is added to Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 2965/94:

‘2f. The entering of amounts in the said reserve shall be made subject to the agreement of the Commission pursuant to Article 28 of the Financial Regulation, and the Commission shall inform the Council and Parliament of its decisions in this respect;’

(Amendment 55)

*ARTICLE –I(d) (new)**Article 10(2g) (new) (Regulation (EC) No 2965/94)*

(d) The following paragraph 2g is added to Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 2965/94:

‘2g. All revenues during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the Union as preallocated revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve and taken out of it only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.

After three years, the Commission shall evaluate the level of fees received by the Centre which may be revised after consultation of Parliament.’

(Amendment 56)

*ARTICLE 1**Article 14(4) (Regulation (EC) No 2965/94)*

4. The European Parliament shall, on the recommendation of the Management Board, give a discharge to the Director of the Centre in respect of the implementation of the budget.

4. The European Parliament shall, **subject to** the recommendation of the Management Board, give discharge to the Director of the Centre in respect of the implementation of the budget.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 2965/94 of 28 November 1994 setting up a Translation Centre for Bodies of the European Union (COM(97)0489 — C4-0608/97 97/0261(CNS))**

(Consultation procedure)

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(97)0489 — 97/0261(CNS)) <sup>(1)</sup>,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 235 of the EC Treaty (C4-0608/97),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control and the opinion of the Committee on Budgets (A4-0035/98),

1. Approves the Commission proposal, subject to Parliament's amendments;
2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, pursuant to Article 189a(2) of the EC Treaty;
3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and the Commission.

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 19.

**IX.**

**Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 1035/97 of 2 June 1997 establishing a European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (COM(97)0489 — C4-0609/97 — 97/0262(CNS))**

The proposal was approved with the following amendments:

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSION (\*)

AMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 57)

*Recital 3*

Whereas *is it desirable* for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Management Board,

Whereas **it is a prerequisite** for the power to grant discharge to be assigned to the European Parliament on the recommendation of the Management Board, **pursuant to Article 206 of the Treaty;**

(\*) OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 19.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

(Amendment 58)

*ARTICLE –1(a) (new)**Recital 25a (new) (Regulation (EC) No 1035/97)*

- (a) The following recital is added after the 25th recital of Regulation (EC) No 1035/97:

‘Whereas, since the Centre may receive funding from the budget, all its revenues are to be budgetized and, as such, considered as preallocated resources of the Union;’

(Amendment 59)

*ARTICLE –1(b) (new)**Article 12(3a) and (3b) (Regulation (EC) No 1035/97)*

- (b) The following paragraphs 3a and 3b are added to Article 12 of Regulation (EEC) No 1035/97:

‘3a. Since the Centre is a body governed by Community law, provision shall be made for all resources received by the Centre in accordance with its financial regulation to be entered into the general budget of the Union.

3b. The Centre may constitute a reserve to cover future expenditure. The fees charged by the Centre shall be subject to revision. All surplus revenues shall be paid into the general budget of the Union.’

(Amendment 60)

*ARTICLE –1(c) (new)**Article 12(3c) (new) (Regulation (EC) No 1035/97)*

- (c) The following paragraph 3c is added to Article 12 of Regulation (EC) No 1035/97:

‘3c. The entering of amounts in the said reserve shall be made subject to the agreement of the Commission pursuant to Article 28 of the Financial Regulation, and the Commission shall inform the Council and Parliament of its decisions in this respect.’

(Amendment 61)

*ARTICLE –1(d) (new)**Article 12(3d) (new) (Regulation (EC) No 1035/97)*

- (d) The following paragraph 3d is added to Article 12 of Regulation No 1035/97:

‘3d. All revenues during a particular financial year shall, after account has been taken of the decrease in the Community subsidy, be entered in the general budget of the Union as preallocated revenue. However, the Budget Committee may authorise the establishment of a reserve to cover future expenditure. Amounts may be entered in the said reserve and taken out of it only with the agreement of the Commission, after Parliament has been consulted.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

TEXT PROPOSED  
BY THE COMMISSIONAMENDMENTS  
BY PARLIAMENT

**After three years, the Commission shall evaluate the level of the fees received by the Centre which may be revised after consultation of Parliament.'**

(Amendment 62)

*ARTICLE 1**Article 12(11) (Regulation (EC) No 1035/97)*

11. The European Parliament shall, *on* the recommendation of the Management Board, give *a* discharge to the Director of the Centre in respect of the implementation of the budget.

11. The European Parliament shall, **subject to** the recommendation of the Management Board, give discharge to the Director of the Centre in respect of the implementation of the budget.

**Legislative resolution embodying Parliament's opinion on the proposal for a Council Regulation amending Council Regulation (EC) No 1035/97 of 2 June 1997 establishing a European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (COM(97)0489 — C4-0609/97 — 97/0262(CNS))**

(Consultation procedure)

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(97)0489 — 97/0262(CNS)) <sup>(1)</sup>,
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 235 of the EC Treaty (C4-0609/97),
- having regard to Rule 58 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control and the opinion of the Committee on Budgets (A4-0035/98),

1. Approves the Commission proposal, subject to Parliament's amendments;
2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, pursuant to Article 189a(2) of the EC Treaty;
3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament should it intend to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
4. Instructs its President to forward this opinion to the Council and the Commission.

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 335, 6.11.1997, p. 19.

## **6. Green Paper on food law**

**A4-0009/98**

**Resolution on the Commission Green Paper on the general principles of food law in the European Union (COM(97)0176 — C4-0213/97)**

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission Green Paper (COM(97)0176 — C4-0213/97),
- having regard to the Commission communication on consumer health and food safety (COM(97)0183),

Tuesday 10 March 1998

- having regard to the outcome of two conferences held jointly by the European Parliament and the Commission, viz.: the Conference on animal-meal (1 and 2 July 1997, in Brussels) and the Conference on food law and food policy (3 and 4 November 1997, in Brussels),
  - having regard to the report by the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection and the opinions of the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development and the Committee on Fisheries (A4-0009/98),
- A. whereas the purpose of the Commission Green Paper is to launch a public debate on the existing state of food law at Community level; whereas the question that needs to be asked in particular is whether the existing legislative setup is meeting the needs and expectations of consumers, producers (agriculture and industry) and traders,
- B. whereas the legislation currently under discussion concerning liability and guarantees for all products including primary products requires detailed consultations with the groups affected thereby;
- C. whereas the Green Paper has been submitted at a time when changes are being made to the organizational structure of Commission departments and scientific consultation, and an overhaul of the areas of food safety and consumer protection is being conducted in the wake of the BSE crisis,
- D. whereas the abovementioned Commission communication on consumer health and food safety, adopted at the same time as the Green Paper on food law, represents a very important supplement to the latter,
- E. whereas the Commission progress report on the results secured by the BSE Committee of Inquiry and the report by the BSE monitoring committee will have to be taken into consideration in the legislative proposals, thereby responding explicitly to the many criticisms made by Parliament's Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection about the preliminary report submitted by the Commission,
- F. whereas the amendments to Articles 129 (in particular paragraph 4b thereof) and 129a of the Treaty adopted at the Amsterdam intergovernmental conference represent a fundamental extension to and legal basis for Community policies on preventive health protection and consumer protection,
- G. whereas the fact that the Commission has separated scientific advice and control from food policy making and has adopted an inter-service working manual to ensure the systematic integration of consumer and public health concerns in the definition and implementation of food policy is not enough to guarantee food safety,
- H. whereas the external dimension is assuming ever increasing importance as a result of the conclusion of the World Trade Agreement (WTO), including those aspects relating to European food law,
- I. whereas the same standards are to be laid down for food imports from, and exports to, third countries as are applied to foodstuffs produced within the Community for the internal market,
- J. whereas future reform of the Common Agriculture Policy together with Agenda 2000 and preparations for the enlargement of the Community to the east, should be conducted in conjunction with the framework of principles established as a result of the Green Paper,
- K. whereas high public health standards are crucially dependent on the implementation of stringent food and veterinary hygiene provisions,
- L. whereas the Commission has already embarked on a number of welcome initiatives to consolidate 14 individual directives concerning the production and marketing of food derived from animals,
- M. whereas most Member States are not implementing Directive 92/117/EEC on measures against zoonoses (for instance salmonella), leading to the appalling and unacceptable reaction from the Council to delay the implementation dates,

Tuesday 10 March 1998

- N. whereas food quality also depends very strongly on the state of the environment (e.g. drinking water, air and soil quality and treatment of waste), and consequently on environmental legislation,
  - O. whereas considerable progress has already been made in the past towards creating an internal market with a high level of consumer protection and whereas ensuring the free movement of goods will continue to be of great importance in the future,
  - P. whereas quality is, moreover, heavily dependent on farming and stock-raising methods, with intensive production inevitably necessitating recourse to various chemical inputs, pharmaceuticals and additives, the residues of which are encountered in food,
  - Q. whereas it is essential to rectify the current profoundly muddled state of Community food law by making it transparent and user-friendly, thereby also helping to improve the competitiveness and further development of the internal market,
  - R. whereas the Commission is to examine in what manner the national authorities apply the relevant rules in the Member States and is planning a communication on the implementation of Community rules,
  - S. whereas the competitiveness of European industry and export opportunities for foods produced are closely bound up with questions of quality,
  - T. whereas reciprocal recognition promotes the free movement of goods and thereby helps to ensure variety of supply and distribution of regional specialities,
  - U. whereas voluntary agreements or self-imposed commitments by industry are a suitable mechanism for supplementing the general principles and minimum requirements for guaranteeing consumer protection as laid down by law; whereas, however, in addition to the necessary transparency of the agreements and the special situation of SMEs, care must be taken to ensure that such arrangements guarantee the necessary consumer protection,
  - V. whereas the legislation now under consideration on liability and guarantees for all products, including primary products, is an important step towards winning back consumer confidence,
  - W. whereas a number of issues raised in the Green Paper have already been discussed in such detail that legislative proposals could be drawn up (e.g. as a framework directive on food); whereas others require further elaboration through a Commission communication (e.g. food policy),
  - X. whereas many illnesses, in particular chronic illnesses, are attributable to nutritional factors,
  - Y. whereas foodstuffs are not commodities like any others, since consumers often associate food with numerous, often deeply personal, feelings and values,
- 
- 1. Welcomes the Commission Green Paper as an important contribution to launching a debate on the existing condition and the future of Community food law;
  - 2. Calls on the Commission to submit proposals, within a framework Directive for, *inter alia*, clear and comprehensive definitions of the concepts used (e.g. foodstuffs, placing on the market, consumers, additives etc.), which must also apply uniformly to all special and detailed rules;
  - 3. Calls on the Commission to submit proposals making it a general legal requirement that only safe, wholesome food fit for human consumption may be placed on the market;
  - 4. Calls on the Commission also to submit proposals for structuring a food policy at Community level, having regard to healthy eating and quality of food;
  - 5. Calls on the Commission to promote education on nutrition and health on the basis of preventive health-care action programmes so that consumers can go better armed with information from different sources and make responsible choices in terms of both buying behaviour and food-product selection and calls on the Commission to ensure that consumers have access to healthy and high-quality food;



Tuesday 10 March 1998

6. Notes that in the rapidly growing market in regional products, basic principles must be laid down in relation to safety, health and labelling; and calls on the Commission to submit proposals in that connection;

*Simplification and review of existing Community provisions*

7. Insists that the choice of mechanisms — legislation, reciprocal recognition, voluntary agreements — must always be such as to ensure that high standards of food safety and preventive health care can be maintained in the most efficient and consumer-friendly manner possible;

8. Supports the view, as set out in the Green Paper, that a regulated food sector is essential to ensuring a high level of consumer and public health protection, and that existing safeguards should be maintained;

9. Calls on the Commission and the Member States, in areas that require absolute uniformity, such as provisions governing labelling and drinking-water quality, to adopt Regulations on the legal basis of Article 100a of the EC Treaty;

10. Calls on the Commission to submit a proposal on a framework directive on food;

11. Calls on the Commission to supplement and/or adapt accordingly the legislation on hygiene to bring it into line with the prospective framework Directive on food and thereby create greater certainty in the application of legislation on food;

12. Calls on the Commission, in conducting the review of Community provisions, to take special care to identify contradictory legislation and loopholes in the law and, where appropriate, to submit proposals for reform, particularly in the areas of authorization and labelling (production methods, new additives, enzymes, added vitamins, GMOs, health claims, allergy compatibility etc.); this review should aim to increase clarity and provide the necessary consolidation of the legislation;

13. Calls on the Commission to increase the transparency of Community legislation and to strengthen structured consultation of representatives of consumers, farmers, trade and industry;

14. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to improve the clarity and transparency of the comitology system;

15. Calls on the Commission to ensure the effective implementation of the internal market provisions in the non-harmonized area of the food sector, and in particular to take consumer needs into account;

16. Calls on the Commission to ensure consistent application of the principle of mutual recognition; notes in this connection that it is essential to introduce Community-wide uniform codification in line with the pronouncements of the European Court of Justice;

*Ensuring a high level of protection*

*(a) Scientific basis*

17. Insists that the operative assumption must always be that authorized food products placed on the market must comply with the principles of quality, food safety and preventive health protection;

18. Calls on the Commission to adopt a coordinating structure to prevent the marketing of foodstuffs posing a potential threat to the consumer and establish a food alert network and a system for the rapid withdrawal of products from the market;

19. Welcomes the Commission's idea to set up a special forum for public discussion of the transposition and application of Community rules in which appropriate organizations of producers, industry, commerce and consumers — as well as representatives of the Commission and Member States — take part; takes the view, however, that provision must also be made for the participation of Members of the European Parliament in order to guarantee the consistency of legislation;

20. Calls on the Commission to continue with the process of reorganizing the scientific committees so as to secure greater transparency, enhance specialist competence and ensure the independence of their members;

Tuesday 10 March 1998

21. Recognises the importance of ensuring that the scientific committees are adequately resourced and supported so that they are able to perform their function to the highest possible standard; calls on the Commission to recognise the need for consumer representation on these committees;
22. Notes that European food law rests on the principle of preventive health care and consumer protection; points out that the relevant policy should be based on scientifically backed risk analysis, supplemented where necessary by reliable risk management based on a precautionary approach;
23. Welcomes the establishment of a unit on risk assessment and calls on the Commission to ensure that adequate and consistent methods of risk assessment are developed and applied;
24. Takes the view that the envisaged unit on risk assessment must work within an institutional system linking up the scientific committees, the product authorization authorities and the coordinated food alert system;
25. Calls on the Commission to take the results of new scientific research immediately into account and to commission long-term investigations; draws attention, moreover, to the importance of prompt and efficient adjustment of existing legislation to new scientific findings;
26. Urges the Commission to develop the form and substance of policy not solely on the basis of scientific understanding and the precautionary principle, but also in response to consumer concern;

*(b) Liability*

27. Calls on the Commission to dispel ambiguities arising in connection with primary liability, including such questions as the extent of farmers' liability or the possibility of persons being liable jointly and severally, if the producer of the product can no longer be identified or it is no longer possible to specify at what point in the production process hygiene provisions were neglected;
28. Calls on the Commission to continue to improve traceability throughout the food chain;
29. Regards it as a fundamental principle that food producers and growers provide scientific evidence that their products pose no risk to consumers' health;
30. Notes that in relation to primary liability, additional information about pre-production inputs used in agriculture (e.g. seeds, plant protection agents, fertilizers, animal feed, etc.) must be available and it must be ensured that the producers of these agricultural primary products accept liability for their products in accordance with Directive 85/374/EEC;
31. Agrees that liability for food safety should be accepted at every stage in the food chain, but insists that each player in that chain is responsible for the quality of the product when it leaves for the next part of the chain. i.e. agricultural producers are responsible for what leaves the farm gate, with total liability if sold directly to the public: however, if distributors, food processors, manufacturers, or retailers, having received raw materials, animal or plant, of the required standard, make errors which lead to a defective product, responsibility should be accepted only back to the point at which rules were broken or risks taken;
32. Calls on the Commission to investigate whether the need exists for trade agreements on the 'Incoterm' model to be applied to primary food products, so as to make transfers of liability clearly identifiable;
33. Stresses that responsibility for the safety and health clearance of food must be differentiated according to areas of responsibility and that every marketer of food should, in principle, be held responsible under criminal and administrative law within his actual sphere of influence;
34. Calls on the Commission to submit a proposal for a general food safety and health requirement which clarifies food manufacturers' liability for product safety;

Tuesday 10 March 1998

35. Calls on the Commission to ensure that all the operators who comply with Community food law in its entirety have access to means of appealing against any action brought against them on the basis of the directive on defective products;

*(c) The 'farm-to-table' approach*

36. Is a firm supporter of the integrated 'farm-to-table' approach and notes that the 'farm-to-table' approach must also result in the release of information about production inputs (e.g. animal feed) and production methods if it is to remain credible and advocates that this approach should provide complete information about production inputs and production methods to regain consumer confidence;

37. Calls on the Commission to implement the integrated 'farm-to-table' principle with specific legislative initiatives on liability and inspection;

38. Calls on the Commission to take the Council to court for disregarding the deadline of 1 January 1995 to decide on the measures required to control salmonella in flocks of layers (hens);

39. Urges the Commission, in the context of the 'farm-to-table' approach, to incorporate environmental protection into food policy as its initial position and sustainable food production as its objective;

40. Calls on the Commission to insist that the directive on biological agriculture must also be extended to animal products;

*(d) Transposition and inspections*

41. Considers that the Commission must make greater use of its inspection function as 'Guardian of the Treaties' and must intervene more rapidly against Member States that fail to comply with their Treaty obligations;

42. Calls on the Member States to incorporate Community law effectively into national law and to ensure that the penalties for infringements of Community law are equal to the penalties laid down in the respective national provisions and are equally effective;

43. Calls for increased financial support from EU funds for organic and sustainable agricultural practices which represent an attractive and healthy alternative to intensive farming for consumers and for the environment;

44. Urges strict regulation of animal feedstuffs at Community level; this applies particularly to the quantitative declaration of ingredients;

45. Recommends that there should be clear regulations and advice on the use and content of artificial inputs to crop production such as pesticides, herbicides and chemical fertilisers to ensure that chemical residues in plant products and in ground and surface water are kept well below the legal maximum levels to ensure consumer health;

46. Believes that animal welfare makes a significant contribution to the quality and safety of animal food products, and therefore animal welfare legislation, including that regarding abattoirs and transport, cannot be considered in isolation from food law as a whole;

47. Believes that there should be strict regulation to prevent the feeding of antibiotics to livestock for prophylactic purposes — where it is not essential — rather than to treat specific veterinary conditions, to ensure that residues of such antibiotics do not spread through the environment and the food chain, undermining the effectiveness of antibiotics to combat bacterial infections in humans;

48. Asks the Commission to review Community legislation on the use of antibiotics in animal feed in order to avoid any use other than for therapeutic purposes;

Tuesday 10 March 1998

49. Recognises that European farmers take pride in the efficient production of some of the best primary food products in the world, which can form the basis of a healthy diet for Europe's citizens, and the need for a clear regulatory framework to maintain and improve existing high standards, not least by encouraging links between all those in the sector and applying clear labelling standards in respect of product origin;
50. Calls on the Member States to improve their compliance with their food-inspection responsibilities, and calls on the Commission, in addition to the internal handbook for food inspectors, to offer continuing-education programmes and workshops at Union level;
51. Calls on the Commission to continue to instruct the Joint Research Centre and/or the CEN to draw up standard sampling plans and testing procedures;
52. Considers that veterinary and phytosanitary regulations, including regular on-the-spot checks in Member States and in third countries exporting animals or animal products to the Community, are a vital component in ensuring the quality and safety of European food;
53. Calls on the Commission to provide appropriate expert assistance for SMEs in particular to understand the HACCP system (hazard analysis and critical control point) in line inter alia with the recommendations of the general hygiene Directive (93/43/EEC);
54. Calls specifically for all food products imported from third countries to be made subject to the same standards as are applied to products from within the European Union and insists that the promotion of international trade in food products must not be at the expense of public health protection, animal welfare and concern for the environment within the European Union;
55. Calls on the Commission to submit a proposal for the consolidation and codification of the labelling Directive, 79/112/EEC, based on the current principle of functional labelling, i.e. that compulsory food labelling must contain the necessary information for product differentiation and product use;
56. With a view to guaranteeing the operation of the internal market and safeguarding human health, the Commission should remedy the shortcomings identified in the application of existing inspection methods to promote more uniform and stringent inspection;
57. Accepts the value of HACCP-type systems, but does not believe that they can be a substitute for clear regulations without a full assessment of their implications and impact particularly on small farmers and food processors;
58. Calls on the Commission to ascertain to what extent the HACCP system can really be applied to SMEs and farms;
59. Recommends improvement in the rule on collection and collation of information on zoonoses, to determine whether or not a zoonosis presents a real problem and requires action appropriate to the particular zoonosis;

*(e) Consumer information*

60. Calls on the Commission, over and above provisions stipulating simple and clear labelling, also to develop new sources of consumer information (e.g. new media);
61. Calls on the Commission, with a view to minimizing the risk of infection being transferred from animals to humans, to facilitate more stringent and faster handling in the Member States of identified infected herds under Directive 92/117/EEC;
62. Calls on the Commission to survey and evaluate existing labelling legislation, and on that basis to submit a proposal for clear, understandable and orderly labelling requirements;

Tuesday 10 March 1998

63. Is in favour of replacing vertical directives with horizontal ones in order to achieve more consistency and clarity in food legislation, but draws attention to the fact that greater consistency must not adversely affect the current high standards of protection and quality which can only be satisfactorily guaranteed by means of legislation designed to deal with specific products;

64. Welcomes the proposal to move away from compound ingredients listing and calls for full ingredients labelling with effective information for the growing numbers suffering from food allergies;

65. Insists that food sold in bulk should be marked in a clear and comprehensible manner for the consumer;

66. Calls on the Commission to come forward with legislation on food claims to ensure, *inter alia*, that food-product health claims are only authorized if they are tested and confirmed by an independent body within the European Union and calls on the Commission also to continue in future to ban advertising claims that a particular food is suitable for treating, curing or preventing disease, though claims regarding nutritional value and healthy diet and their importance to health and/or in reducing the risk of disease should be allowed if they are based on sufficient and recognized scientific findings and if they are tested and confirmed by an independent body within the European Union;

67. Calls on the Commission to facilitate access to a nutritious diet through standardised, comprehensive and clear nutrition labelling across the EU, based on consumer research in order to establish the format that will be most useful to consumers;

68. Supports the intention to review the Nutrition Labelling Directive as soon as possible in order to improve coherence and clarity there;

69. Reaffirms the overriding need for a precautionary approach to the assessment and evaluation of applications for the marketing of GMOs intended to enter the food chain and calls for the development of clear identification of genetically modified foods or ingredients in foods by consistent, comprehensive and informative labelling where they have been approved for use;

70. Views with alarm the fact that the Commission has so far failed to enact implementing provisions to permit the clear and uniform labelling necessary to give practical effect to European Parliament and Council Regulation (EC) No 258/97 concerning novel foods and novel food ingredients (as called for in Parliament's resolution of 12 June 1997 on the subject <sup>(1)</sup>) or to secure agreement to any detailed proposals to label genetically modified soya and maize as required in Article 3 of Commission Regulation (EC) No 1813/97 concerning the compulsory indication on the labelling of certain foodstuffs produced from genetically modified organisms of particulars other than those provided for in Directive 79/112/EEC;

71. In this context, proposes that an effective GMO labelling system should be based on derivation from genetic engineering techniques and not on arbitrary measurements of residues in the final product;

72. Calls for the urgent development of detailed Community criteria for positive labelling of foods and food ingredients produced without genetic engineering, as provided for in Recital 10 of the novel food Regulation and in line with the intended exclusion of the use of genetic engineering from organic agriculture;

### ***The external dimension***

73. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to make every endeavour to bring the current negotiations on the Community's membership of the *Codex Alimentarius* Committee to a successful conclusion;

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 200, 30.6.1997, p. 147.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

74. Notes that the *Codex Alimentarius* does not accept consumer concerns as the basis for setting international standards and calls on the Commission to launch a discussion process on how the Commission's new scientific committees and the *Codex Alimentarius* scientific committees can best coordinate their future activities to ensure that such concerns are taken into account; calls on the Commission also to make every effort to amend the *Codex Alimentarius* decision-making process so as to bring it more into line with the real impact of *Codex* standards since the WTO was established;

75. Calls on the Commission to submit the necessary proposals with a view to making a choice in terms of how subsequent legislation should cope with criteria, other than scientific criteria, that can influence consumer acceptance of foods; draws attention to the need for such criteria to be explicitly incorporated into the greater part of legislation so that the European Union will stand a better chance of making rational policy choices that can hold their own in a global context;

76. Calls on the Commission to actively work for proper democratic control and transparency, as well as increased consumer participation in all stages of *Codex Alimentarius* decision making;

77. Calls on the Commission to forestall any attempts by WTO bodies to call Community food law into question by instructing its scientific committees to develop a full set of arguments based on the precautionary principle;

78. Calls on the Commission and Member States to give priority to consumer safety and to ensure that future WTO trade agreements and negotiations acknowledge the importance of legitimate consumer concerns, including ethical and religious concerns about certain methods of production;

79. Calls on the Commission, in anticipation of the forthcoming renewal of WTO and *Codex Alimentarius* trade agreements, to adopt European standards for the safety, protection and health of the consumer as its decisive underlying principle;

80. Urges the Commission under no circumstances to lift the ban on hormone treated meat, and if necessary as an emergency action also to accept the need to pay possible fines and levies;

81. Calls on the Commission, the Council and the Member States to seek a review of the WTO agreement on health and plant-health measures, in order to affirm that the precautionary principle and the imperatives of health and safety must take precedence over free trade;

82. Calls on the Commission to work towards ensuring proportionally greater consumer involvement within the *Codex Alimentarius* decision making process;

83. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to make their best efforts to ensure the development of criteria that recognize consumer concern as a possible basis for food policy, in addition to scientific understanding and the precautionary principle;

84. Calls on the Commission to review current legislative texts so as to ensure that they clearly affirm that they are based on the precautionary principle and the principle of the precedence of consumer health and safety; calls on the Commission, when submitting proposals for legislation, to incorporate justifications, in particular the precautionary principle and the principle of consumer protection, into the text;

85. Calls on the Commission in anticipation of European Union enlargement, to pay full attention to the acceptance by applicant states of the *acquis communautaire* in the area of food law and of the link between agricultural policy, public health and food policy;

86. Believes checks on third-country food imports must be strictly enforced and extended to include checks on the various production criteria such as hygiene, animal welfare and environmental and social compatibility and on imports of live animals for slaughter;

\*  
\*      \*

87. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission, the Council and the governments of the Member States.

---

Tuesday 10 March 1998

## 7. Euro and public administrations — Euro and tourism — Legal convergence

(a) A4-0061/98

**Resolution on the communication from the Commission on the practical aspects of the introduction of the euro (COM(97)0491 — C4-0524/97) and the Commission working paper entitled 'Preparations for the changeover of public administrations to the euro' (SEC(97)2384 — C4-0025/98)**

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the communication from the Commission (COM(97)0491 — C4-0524/97),
  - having regard to the Commission working paper (SEC(97)2384 — C4-0025/98),
  - having regard to its opinion of 28 November 1996 on the proposal for a Council Regulation (EC) on some provisions relating to the introduction of the euro <sup>(1)</sup>,
  - having regard to its opinion of 28 November 1996 on the proposal for a Council Regulation on the introduction of the euro <sup>(2)</sup>,
  - having regard to the Council resolution of 7 July 1997 on a legal framework for the introduction of the euro <sup>(3)</sup>,
  - having regard to the conclusions of the Madrid European Council of December 1995 concerning the political agreement on the timetable for the introduction of the euro,
  - having regard to the conclusions of the Ecofin Council meetings of 13 October and 17 November 1997,
  - having regard to the decisions taken by the European Monetary Institute concerning the design of future euro banknotes,
  - having regard to the proposal for a Council Regulation on unit values and the technical specifications of euro coins (COM(97)0247 — C4-0340/97 — 97/0154(SYN)) and the decisions already taken by certain Member States on the national sides of euro coins,
  - having regard to the report of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy (A4-0061/98),
- A. whereas preparing citizens of the Member States concerned for the introduction of the euro is an essential step in order to ensure the success of economic and monetary union and, from certain points of view, is almost as important as monetary stability,
- B. whereas it is time for those Member States that have not already done so to begin training, education and information programmes concerning the introduction of the euro and for other Member States to step up their activities in this area; whereas these programmes must be undertaken by the public authorities of the Member States and the trade and distribution sectors on the one hand and the banking and financial sector on the other in close cooperation with the national consumers' associations,
- C. whereas from 1 January 1999 citizens will be able to use the euro to make payments other than cash payments and get used to prices and values in euro before the introduction of banknotes and coins,
- D. bearing in mind that with the monetary union in place banknotes of the participating countries will be the same as today but their real value will no longer be the mark, franc, guilder, lire, peseta or schilling but the corresponding amount in euro,
- E. whereas the date of the introduction of euro banknotes and coins has been fixed at 1 January 2002, as agreed at the Madrid Summit and confirmed by the Ecofin Council on 17 November 1997, and whereas the three-year period (from 1 January 1999 to 1 January 2002) is psychologically necessary to allow the euro to be introduced under satisfactory conditions,

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 380, 16.12.1996, p. 47.

<sup>(2)</sup> OJ C 380, 16.12.1996, p. 50.

<sup>(3)</sup> OJ C 236, 2.8.1997, p. 7.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

- F. whereas the work concerning the technical specifications of future euro banknotes and coins having been concluded, their production will be able to begin in May 1998,
- G. whereas the introduction of the euro may lead to fraud and abuse during the first years and whereas particular attention should therefore be paid to combating forgery and attempts at fraud,
- H. whereas all the economic, political and social players must be fully conscious of the considerable efforts they will have to undertake to ensure that the euro is introduced smoothly and without any economic or psychological upsets,
1. Welcomes the Commission's communication on the practical aspects of the introduction of the euro, bearing in mind the pressing need for decisions, in particular by the public authorities; calls, nevertheless, on the Commission to provide periodic information on the development of the situation in the various Member States and in particular in those which will be able to introduce the euro on 1 January 1999;
  2. Notes that even if the public administrations of most of the Member States concerned have already set up the institutional framework for the introduction of the euro, the time has now come for action. This applies both to the introduction of the euro in the European institutions and to measures by the national authorities to encourage the private sector;
  3. Considers that the Member States concerned must pay particular attention to the conditions under which the euro is introduced and the way it is used for small and medium-sized businesses, immediately after 1 January 1999, in order to avert any risk of their losing competitiveness *vis-à-vis* other undertakings;
  4. Recommends to Member States that they show particular concern towards 'vulnerable' social groups of the population (the elderly, low-income groups, the disabled) after the introduction of the euro;
  5. Considers it necessary that the Member States should unveil their changeover plans as rapidly as possible, and notably submit statements on accounting, reporting and tax declarations in euros in order to give citizens, businesses and government departments the correct and prompt information they need concerning the introduction of the euro, and that the Member States should ensure that these plans are disseminated as widely as possible;
  6. Considers also that the Member States concerned must swiftly adopt the legislation relating to these changeover plans and the relevant technical implementing provisions, for example concerning the arrangements for redenominating public debt in euros, with a constant eye for harmonization; calls on the Commission to make the appropriate recommendations in this respect;
  7. Considers that the Member States concerned should publish the design of the national face of coins as soon as possible;
  8. Recommends to the future Member States of the euro zone, in partnership with the European institutions, that they launch their national information campaigns at the earliest opportunity in the second half of 1998, given that citizens need correct and prompt information on all the practical aspects of the introduction of the euro;
  9. Reminds the Commission and the public authorities of the Member States of the specific role which Members of the European Parliament may play in the euro information campaigns by virtue of their representative status and their European democratic legitimacy, and refers to Article 8 of the Memorandum of understanding concerning information on introduction of the euro, which has been agreed by the Member States, the Commission and Parliament, and which states that the parties, acting together, may define the role of members of parliament;
  10. Supports the Commission's information campaign in the Prince programme on the practical aspects of the euro; believes, however, that the campaign should also draw on the expertise of advertising agencies in Europe in order to foster and disseminate among citizens a feeling of participation, confidence and attachment towards the single currency; calls, therefore, on the Commission to seek the advice of European advertising professionals by convening a meeting of all parties concerned for a round-table discussion of this subject;



Tuesday 10 March 1998

11. Takes the view that dual price display should be optional during the transitional period in order to give markets greater flexibility in finding the optimal solutions which strike a balance between consumers' demands and the needs of shopkeepers in adapting to utilization of the euro; considers nevertheless that professional associations should encourage their members to practise double labelling or carry out operations of this type on a temporary basis;
12. Considers, however, that if dual display fails to catch on properly because it is optional, the public authorities will have to take whatever measures are necessary to make it compulsory in the retailing sector; takes the view, moreover, that a dual display of prices will secure competitive advantages for businesses, but that small and medium-sized enterprises should be assisted in their efforts to provide dual pricing;
13. Considers that the period during which national and euro banknotes and coins are in simultaneous circulation should be reduced to the minimum in order to avoid complications for consumers and to limit the additional costs for business;
14. Considers that the practical aspects of the changeover to the euro concerning relations between workers and employers can best be regulated by mutual agreement between the social partners in the Member States;
15. Considers it indispensable that the principle of free compulsory conversions — whether in bank money or in cash — between the relevant national currency and the euro is secured and that charging is completely transparent;
16. Believes that the commercial costs resulting from conversion transactions between the national currency units of the participating Member States (national currency, non-decimal subdivisions of the euro) will be reduced through the elimination of exchange risks, and that it is the duty of banking and financial institutions, encouraged by their competitive framework, to find commercial formulas to make it possible to minimize the costs to the consumer;
17. Stresses the paramount importance of involving the information technology (IT) sector in the introduction of the euro and calls, therefore, for that industry to facilitate and closely monitor the transition to the euro by developing IT products linked to the use of the euro and anticipating, as far as possible, the technical modifications needed; recommends, furthermore, that these changes be timed to coincide with those due at the millennium;
18. Recommends that the measures being taken to register the euro symbol with the relevant authorities be speeded up and urges manufacturers and retailers of computer equipment to affix the euro symbol as rapidly as possible on the new computer keyboards and printer equipment in order to familiarize the public with this symbol;
19. Considers that the Member States must give their citizens confidence in the new currency by guaranteeing that all criminal acts linked to the introduction of the euro will be punished;
20. Insists on the need to make provision in all Member States forthwith for a sufficient number of educational and training programmes concerning the introduction of the euro tailored to the specific needs of different groups in society, with particular emphasis on practical details;
21. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission and the Council.

---

(b) A4-0078/98

#### **Resolution on the euro and tourism**

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to Rule 148 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the EC Treaty, and in particular Article 3(t) thereof,

Tuesday 10 March 1998

- having regard to its opinions of 28 November 1996 on the proposal for a Council Regulation on some provisions relating to the introduction of the euro <sup>(1)</sup> and the proposal for a Council Regulation on the introduction of the euro <sup>(2)</sup>,
  - having regard to its resolution of 28 November 1996 on the report of the European Monetary Institute on the changeover to the single currency (C4-0559/95) <sup>(3)</sup>,
  - having regard to the study of the Monetary Subcommittee of its Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy on 'the euro and tourism', carried out following the hearing of 21 May 1997,
  - having regard to its document 'Tourism and the 1996 Intergovernmental Conference' (IGC Task Force, PE 166.461, 31 October 1997),
  - having regard to the Commission communication of 1 October 1997 on 'practical aspects of the introduction of the euro' (COM(97)0491),
  - having regard to the Commission Green Paper on 'the role of the Union in the field of tourism' (COM(95)0097),
  - having regard to the Eurostat publication on 'Tourism in Europe', Ref. CA8694230ENC (1994),
  - having regard to the report of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy (A4-0078/98),
- A. whereas Europe is still the most attractive tourism destination accounting for approximately 60% of the world market,
- B. whereas the Union's market share fell by some 10 percentage points between 1975 and 1996 (from 69,2% to 58,7%), and whereas, over the same period, its share of the world total of tourist revenue decreased by approximately 14%,
- C. whereas tourism is one of the most important and dynamic activities at world level and has significant multiplier effects, both upstream and downstream, on economic activity; whereas it is estimated that over the next 10 to 15 years demand in the sector could double worldwide and increase by some 30% in Europe,
- D. whereas the tourism industry is one of the most dynamic in terms of creating jobs and is particularly accessible for women and all those seeking their first job; whereas the employment generated by the sector, which currently accounts for 12,8% of all jobs in the EU (a figure which could rise to some 13% around 2007, creating 1,85 million new jobs), is to a large extent thanks to the labours of small and medium-sized undertakings (SMUs), which account for 95% of enterprises in the sector, some of them being micro-enterprises (employing fewer than ten people),
- E. whereas recent trends at world level tend to justify this optimism, among them being the following factors: the expected improvement in the standard of living of consumers in many regions of the globe; the gradual ageing of the population in the industrialized countries; the impact of the gradual reduction in working time and the corresponding increase in leisure time; the trend to greater political and economic openness in the developing economies, etc.,
- F. whereas other crucial factors include the recent advances in European integration, including the project for the single currency, the internal market, the Schengen agreement and the launching of enlargement negotiations with a substantial number of countries, whose citizens will have additional motivation to travel in the Union in order to become better acquainted with their new partners, benefiting for this purpose from easier mobility,
- G. whereas the single currency and the resulting elimination of currency conversion costs, bank commissions, bureaucratic expenses and other obstacles and anti-efficiency factors which today characterize crossborder payments and transfers — given that almost two-thirds of cash value evaporates purely from the commissions charged for the successive conversion of the Union's currencies — will constitute a major incentive to the mobility of persons, goods and capital within the Union, thus stimulating the development of tourism,

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 380, 16.12.1996, p. 47.

<sup>(2)</sup> OJ C 380, 16.12.1996, p. 50.

<sup>(3)</sup> OJ C 380, 16.12.1996, p. 58.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

- H. whereas, with the introduction of the single currency and the consequent fading of the risks and uncertainties associated with exchange rate variation, business will be facilitated and there will be a more favourable climate for the development of new projects; whereas it is hoped that there will be a substantial increase in investment in the euro zone, in the tourism sector and in the economy in general, thanks to the actions of the Union's citizens and enterprises and, no less importantly, those originating outside the Union, resulting in a significant rise in business-related tourism,
- I. whereas the creation of a single currency, stable and less subject to inflation, will contribute to reinforce Europe as a tourist destination, and will make it much easier to travel and invest within the Union, especially in the euro zone, potentially leading to a substantial increase in tourist numbers, with obvious advantages for the sector and for the EU economy,
- J. whereas the introduction of the European currency and the abolition of border controls between the countries which have signed the Schengen agreement will have a stimulating effect on tourist traffic,
- K. whereas the non-participation of certain Member States from the moment of launching of the group of the euro's founder members, as appears will be the case with the UK, Denmark, Sweden and Greece, does not mean that those countries will not eventually accept the euro or that they will not come to adopt it as an international reserve currency, thus using it in their international exchanges, albeit, as appears obvious, to less advantage in global terms than if they were members of the euro zone; whereas, therefore, there is no reason as things stand to rule out the possibility that tourists will be able to use their euros in those Member States which do not join the euro zone from the beginning,
- L. whereas exchange rate variations obviously have an impact on tourist movements and on the performance of tourism operators; whereas, following the introduction of the single currency, it will no longer be possible to justify relative price differences in terms of factors external to the tourism market proper — e.g. national exchange rate policy — rather than real tourist preferences; whereas this will be to the global benefit of the industry and will have a knock-on effect on operators' prices,
- M. whereas prices will become far more transparent, with a consequent rise in competitive pressure, as members of the public will be able to compare prices directly — at least to some extent — without having to make currency conversions as in the past (something not immediately accessible for all tourists),
- N. whereas this increased transparency will also highlight differences in indirect taxation rates, VAT in particular, which affect the tourism sector,
- O. whereas the travel and tourism market will become more transparent and consequently more attractive with the introduction of the single currency, with a consequent overall improvement in price to performance ratio; whereas, however, this will have a major impact on competition in the sector, calling for a significant effort on the part of operators to adapt to the new commercial framework,
- P. whereas the introduction of the single currency will also entail costs, in view of the nature of the activities concerned and the fact that 95% of enterprises in the sector are SMUs, arising from the need to adapt computer, accounting and other systems, the existence of a dual price system and of two different currencies over the period — preferably as short as possible — when the national currencies and the euro will both be in circulation, and the need to provide suitable staff training and information for tourists,
- Q. whereas congress and business tourism is an expanding market worldwide; whereas the EU is set to gain a large share of this expanding market, particularly following the introduction of the euro which will enhance the EU's competitive advantage in this area,
- R. whereas from 1 January 1999 the principle of 'no compulsion, no prohibition' will apply, meaning that for a three-year period both tourists and enterprises operating within the tourism market may continue to use the national currencies or, at any moment, opt for the euro (even though the latter will not be circulating in the form of notes and coins) for their contracts, accounts, banking transactions, etc.,

Tuesday 10 March 1998

1. Recognizes that tourists will be — from 1 January 1999 — the first and most important group to use and disseminate the euro and to experience the direct advantages of the European currency, with the disappearance of commission charges and of the discrepancy between buying and selling rates;
2. Considers that the euro is potentially a major instrument for decisively improving the present overall trends in the tourism industry, leading to an increase in its market share worldwide;
3. Considers that the tourist industry lives by its good standard of service to customers, and that the transition to the euro will present it with considerable challenges;
4. Considers that those involved in the tourist industry (travel agents, hoteliers, innkeepers, transport firms etc.) make contact with millions of customers daily and can thus play a constructive role as providers of information;
5. Recommends, therefore, that the tourist industry, as a token of its willingness to provide a good service, should show flexibility in meeting customers' wishes in the context of the transition to the euro. Accordingly firms should allow for the fact that some customers will want their bills made out in euros, and will wish to use euros to make non-cash payments, as early as the beginning of 1999;
6. Recommends that the Union and the Member States make use of their external representations to promote the euro among potential tourists, operators sending tourists to the EU and would-be investors;
7. Recommends that the Commission promote the euro with the main hotel chains as an instrument for the security and stability of their investments;
8. Recommends that all organizations in the tourist sector should begin as soon as possible to express their prices in euros; recommends the definition of specific programmes for tourism promotion with a view to preparing for the euro (particularly the adaptation of computer equipment and the purchase of new cash management systems) and, in particular, promoting the euro through tourism; to this end, the Member States and all associations in the sector should begin, as soon as possible, to express their prices in euros; such programmes should include all euro zone members, with special attention to the more remote regions;
9. Recommends that the particularly difficult situation of the tourist industry in the regions bordering on the future euro zone should be relieved by stepping up programmes, particularly Interreg, though not at the expense of undertakings in traditional tourist regions;
10. Recommends that, as a matter of urgency, programmes be defined for aid to staff training and the adaptation of the industry's human resources to the new reality of the single currency, encompassing the various areas affected: dealing with clients, management and accounts, tax matters, marketing and sales personnel, etc;
11. Reaffirms that the above programmes must take into account ecological and sustainable tourism; recommends that information campaigns be launched to promote regional tourism so as to ease the pressure on the environment caused by travel;
12. Recommends that particular importance be attached to providing information for those working in the industry; precise replies to customers' questions about the euro will only be possible where staff have themselves been informed in good time;
13. Recommends that the public information and explanation campaigns spell out the benefits of the euro for tourists, recalling that the success of the single currency projects will be largely dependent on its acceptance by the public; campaigns should, in particular, be targeted on particular groups of citizens, such as older people, young people, the blind and others, who, owing to their specific needs, stand to gain the most from being able to use a single currency for travel and tourism in the euro zone;

Tuesday 10 March 1998

14. Insists that measures must be taken to protect tourists in their capacity as consumers, as many of the goods or services offered by the tourism industry are, by reason of their nature, paid for in advance on the basis of existing information, which means that information and publicity campaigns will be required;
15. Recommends that the tourist industry begin volunteering information and explanations about the euro at an early date; in particular it will be important to allay suspicions that the transfer to the new currency will be used as a smokescreen for unjustified price increases;
16. Recommends that the tourist industry in particular should be chary of rounding prices up since its customers are bound to be very attentive to price changes after the introduction of the euro;
17. Recommends that the national, regional and local authorities take account of the needs of the tourism sector in the process of adaptation to the euro, especially in the field of taxation;
18. Proposes, therefore, that distortions of competition such as the levying by Member States of antiquated special service taxes, which are harmful to tourism, should be rapidly abolished;
19. Recommends that measures be taken to ensure preferential treatment in accounting and fiscal terms, including a shorter amortization period for direct or indirect investment related to the process of introducing the single currency where it is established that it is connected to the introduction of the euro;
20. Calls, in the light of the increased competition to which tourist firms will be subjected, for every effort to be made to set up special finance programmes to help the innumerable small family firms with no access to the capital market make the transition to the euro and fund their future investments;
21. Recommends that measures be taken to harmonize taxation affecting the sector, especially VAT, to ensure that differences in fiscal treatment do not distort competition, and to ensure the highest possible transparency of price mechanisms;
22. Considers that every effort should be made to simplify considerably the VAT regulations for travel agencies, which are complex and hard to understand;
23. Recommends that large companies providing services to tourists and other undertakings involved in the sector (transport, communications, energy, etc) introduce the euro as soon as possible as an official means of payment;
24. Recommends that action be taken as soon as possible on a number of outstanding practical problems;
25. Recommends that, in view of the small size of undertakings in the sector, the period of dual circulation of the euro and the national currencies should be as brief as possible;
26. Recommends that, since the date of introduction has been fixed, tourism operators make the greatest possible use of electronic payment means, the rates for which must be made as attractive as possible given the intensive use which will be made of them and the increased competition;
27. Recommends that the EU institutions should take advantage of the great European tourism events — namely Universal Exhibitions (Lisbon 98 and Hanover 2000), World Football Championship (France 1998), Jubilee 2000 in Rome and the Millennium in London — as exceptional opportunities to promote the euro with the large tourist flows that will be generated towards and within Europe;
28. Recommends that hoteliers opt at an early stage to express their prices in both currencies, particularly for tour operators and travel agents; price lists for the 2001/2002 winter season should as far as possible be based on calculations in euros;

Tuesday 10 March 1998

29. Proposes that the Commission should, from the year 2002, include in its reports on tourism in the EU a chapter on the impact of the euro on tourism levels and investments in the sector;
30. Recommends that travel agencies which work with electronic reservation systems should ascertain in good time when these systems will be able to work in several currencies;
31. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission and Council, and to the governments and parliaments of the Member States.
- 

(c) A4-0070/98

**Resolution on the report of the European Monetary Institute on legal convergence in the Member States of the European Union (as at August 1997) (C4-0560/97)**

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the report of the European Monetary Institute (C4-0560/97),
  - having regard to its resolutions of 28 November 1996 embodying its opinion, pursuant to Article 109j, paragraph 2 of the EC Treaty, on the 1996 convergence decision by the Council, meeting in the composition of the Heads of State or of Government <sup>(1)</sup> and on the impact of monetary policies on the real economy, inflation, interest rates, growth and employment in the third stage of EMU, and the economic function of convergence criteria <sup>(2)</sup>,
  - having regard to its resolutions of 18 June 1996 <sup>(3)</sup> and of 10 June 1997 <sup>(4)</sup> on the 1995 and 1996 annual reports of the European Monetary Institute,
  - having regard to its resolution of 10 June 1997 <sup>(5)</sup> on the European Monetary Institute's report on the Single Monetary Policy in Stage Three — Specification of the operational framework,
  - having regard to the provisions of the Treaty establishing the European Community, in particular Articles 105, 107, 108 and 109j, and to Protocol No 3 on the Statute of the ESCB and of the ECB,
  - having regard to the 1995 and 1996 convergence reports of the European Monetary Institute,
  - having regard to the report of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy (A4-0070/98),
- A. whereas the basic tasks of the ECB and the ESCB are to define and implement the monetary policy of the Community, to conduct foreign exchange operations, to hold and manage official foreign reserves, to promote the smooth operation of payment systems and to contribute to the smooth conduct of the prudential supervision of credit institutions and the stability of the financial system,
- B. mindful of the tasks and obligations of the ECB in relation to the non-participating Member States and their relations with global financial markets and their institutions,
- C. whereas the EC Treaty and the ESCB/ECB Statute do not require harmonization of national legislation but only the removal of incompatibilities between national and European legislation; whereas national peculiarities may therefore continue to exist,

<sup>(1)</sup> OJ C 380, 16.12.1996, p. 56.

<sup>(2)</sup> OJ C 380, 16.12.1996, p. 62.

<sup>(3)</sup> OJ C 198, 8.7.1996, p. 47.

<sup>(4)</sup> OJ C 200, 30.6.1997, p. 32.

<sup>(5)</sup> OJ C 200, 30.6.1997, p. 35.

Tuesday 10 March 1998

- D. whereas, in order to satisfy the requirements laid down in Article 108 of the EC Treaty, the necessary legislative procedures for ensuring the compatibility of national legislation with the Treaty need to be completed at the latest at the date of the establishment of the ESCB,
- E. referring to its previously expressed misgivings about the 'institutional imbalance of the ECB', contained in its abovementioned resolution of 28 November 1996 on the convergence decision,
1. Notes that the ECB and the ESCB have the undisputed joint task of deciding on a uniform European monetary policy, implementing it and reviewing it in the light of economic and social circumstances;
  2. Calls for clarity on the integration of the national central banks into the ESCB and for the precise identification of the tasks which will still be performed by the national central banks;
  3. Calls for an interpretation of the institutional independence of national central banks as integral parts of the ESCB that does not rule out processes of mutual consultation and dialogue with other institutions;
  4. Notes that a dialogue between the national central banks and their political institutions is compatible with the EC Treaty and the ESCB Statute, provided that it does not encroach on the independence of the members of the decision-making bodies of the national central banks and provided that the powers of the ECB, its duty of democratic accountability at Community level and the special status of the President in his capacity as member of its decision-making bodies are respected;
  5. Reiterates its position formulated in its abovementioned resolution of 10 June 1997 on the EMI's report on the Single Monetary Policy in Stage Three that Article 105(1) and Article 2 of the EC Treaty on the promotion of growth, prosperity, employment and stability must constitute the framework for future monetary policy;
  6. Calls for a clear distinction to be made in the EMI report on legal convergence in the Member States of the European Union between compatible and incompatible provisions concerning the tasks of national central banks and, in particular, for a clear definition of the phrase 'impediment to the execution of ESCB-related tasks';
  7. Notes that the EMI has submitted for discussion important preliminary work on the basis of which the future ECB will be able to decide what it views as compatible or incompatible with the EC Treaty under the heading of 'rules on accounting, auditing, capital subscriptions, transfer of foreign reserve assets and monetary income';
  8. Awaits also from the EMI an explanation of the criteria which it intends to employ to assess the compatibility or incompatibility of other 'areas of legislation which are affected by the transition from Stage Two to Stage Three';
  9. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Commission, the Council, the EMI Council, the parliaments of the Member States and the national central banks.
-

Tuesday 10 March 1998

## ATTENDANCE REGISTER

10 March 1998

The following signed:

d'Aboville, Adam, Aelvoet, Ahern, Ahlqvist, Ainardi, Amadeo, Anastassopoulos, d'Ancona, Andersson, André-Léonard, Andrews, Angelilli, Añoberos Trias de Bes, Antony, Anttila, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Arroni, Augias, Avgerinos, Azzolini, Baldarelli, Baldi, Balfe, Banotti, Bardong, Barón Crespo, Barros Moura, Barthet-Mayer, Barton, Barzanti, Bazin, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Berès, Berger, Bertens, Berthu, Bertinotti, Bianco, Billingham, van Bladel, Blak, Blokland, Blot, Böge, Bösch, Bonde, Bontempi, Boogerd-Quaak, Botz, Bourlanges, Bowe, Breyer, Brinkhorst, Buffetaut, Burenstam Linder, Burtone, Cabrol, Caccavale, Caligaris, Camisón Asensio, Campos, Campoy Zueco, Capucho, Carlsson, Carnero González, Carniti, Carrère d'Encausse, Cars, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnède, Castagnetti, Castellina, Caudron, Cederschiöld, Cellai, Chanterie, Chesa, Chichester, Christodoulou, Coates, Cohn-Bendit, Colajanni, Colino Salamanca, Collins Gerard, Collins Kenneth D., Colombo Svevo, Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Corrie, Cox, Crampton, Crawley, Crowley, Cunha, Cunningham, van Dam, D'Andrea, Danesin, Dankert, Darras, Dary, Daskalaki, De Clercq, De Coene, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Giovanni, Dell'Alba, De Melo, Denys, Deprez, Desama, de Vries, Díez de Rivera Icaza, van Dijk, Dillen, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnay, Donnelly Alan John, Donnelly Brendan Patrick, Donner, Duhamel, Dupuis, Ebner, Eisma, Elchlepp, Elles, Elliott, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Eriksson, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Ettl, Evans, Ewing, Fabra Vallés, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Farassino, Fassa, Fayot, Ferber, Féret, Fernández-Albor, Fernández Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Fini, Fitzsimons, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fontana, Ford, Formentini, Fourçans, Fraga Estévez, Friedrich, Frischenschlager, Frutos Gama, Funk, Gahrton, Galeote Quecedo, Gallagher, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garosci, Garot, Garriga Polledo, Gasòliba i Böhm, de Gaulle, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Giansily, Gillis, Gil-Robles Gil-Delgado, Girão Pereira, Glante, Glase, Goepel, Goerens, Görlach, Gollnisch, Gomolka, González Álvarez, González Triviño, Graefe zu Baringdorf, Graenitz, Graziani, Gröner, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, Gutiérrez Díaz, Haarder, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hänsch, Hager, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Hatzidakis, Haug, Hautala, Heinisch, Hendrick, Herman, Hernandez Mollar, Herzog, Hindley, Hoff, Holm, Hoppenstedt, Hory, Howitt, Hughes, Hulthén, Hume, Hyland, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jackson, Janssen van Raay, Jarzembowski, Jensen Lis, Jöns, Jové Peres, Junker, Kaklamanis, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kerr, Kestelijn-Sierens, Killilea, Kindermann, Kinnock, Kittelmann, Klab, Klironomos, Koch, Kofoed, Kokkola, Konrad, Krehl, Kreissl-Dörfler, Kristoffersen, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lage, Laignel, Lambraki, Lambrias, Lang, Lange, Langen, Langenhagen, Lannoye, Larive, Lataillade, Le Gallou, Lehne, Lenz, Leopardi, Le Pen, Leperre-Verrier, Le Rachinel, Lienemann, Liese, Ligabue, Lindeperg, Lindholm, Lindqvist, Linkohr, Löw, Lomas, Lucas Pires, Lüttge, Lulling, Macartney, McCarthy, McCartin, McGowan, McIntosh, McKenna, McMahon, McMillan-Scott, McNally, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Malerba, Malone, Manisco, Mann Erika, Mann Thomas, Manzella, Marin, Marinho, Marinucci, Marset Campos, Martens, Martin David W., Martin Philippe-Armand, Martinez, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Medina Ortega, Megahy, Méndez de Vigo, Mendiluce Pereiro, Mendonça, Miller, Miranda, Miranda de Lage, Mohamed Ali, Mombaur, Monfils, Moniz, Moorhouse, Morán López, Moreau, Morgan, Morris, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Müller, Mulder, Murphy, Musumeci, Mutin, Myller, Napolitano, Nassauer, Needle, Nencini, Newens, Newman, Nicholson, Nordmann, Novo, Novo Belenguer, Oddy, Ojala, Olsson, Oostlander, Orlando, Otila, Paasilinna, Paasio, Pack, Pailier, Paisley, Panagopoulos, Papakyriazis, Parigi, Parodi, Pasty, Peijs, Pérez Royo, Perry, Peter, Pettinari, Pex, Piecyk, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, des Places, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Plumb, Podestà, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pollack, Pomés Ruiz, Pons Grau, Porto, Posselt, Pradier, Pronk, Provan, Puerta, van Putten, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Raschhofer, Rauti, Read, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rehder, Ribeiro, Rinsche, Ripa di Meana, Robles Piquer, Rocard, Rosado Fernandes, de Rose, Roth, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Rovsing, Rübig, Ruffolo, Rynänen, Sainjon, Sakellariou, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Samland, Sandbæk, Santini, Sanz Fernández, Sarlis, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Scapagnini, Scarbonchi, Schäfer, Schaffner, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schlechter, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schnellhardt, Schörling, Schröder, Schroeder, Schulz, Schwaiger, Seal, Secchi, Seillier, Seppänen, Sichrovsky, Sierra González, Simpson, Sindal, Sisó Cruellas, Sjöstedt, Soltwedel-Schäfer, Sonneveld, Sornosa Martínez, Souchet, Soulier, Spaak, Speciale, Spencer, Spiers, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Swoboda, Tajani, Tamino, Tannert, Tappin, Tatarella, Telkämper, Terrón i Cusi, Teverson, Theato, Theonas, Theorin, Thomas, Thors, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Titley, Todini, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Trakatellis, Trizza, Truscott, Tsatsos, Väyrynen, Valdivielso de Cué, Vallvé, Valverde López, Vandemeulebroucke, Vanhecke, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz da Silva, Vecchi, van Velzen W.G., van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Verwaerde, Viceconte, Vinci, Viola, Virgin, Virrankoski, Voggenhuber, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watson, Watts, Weber, Weiler, Wemheuer, West, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiebenga, Wieland, Wiersma, Wijzenbeek, Willockx, Wilson, von Wogau, Wolf, Wurtz, Wynn, Zimmermann



Tuesday 10 March 1998

## ANNEX

## Result of roll-call votes

(+) = For

(−) = Against

(O) = Abstention

## 1. Kuhn report A4-0029/98

## Amendment 61

(+)

**ELDR:** Lindqvist**GUE/NGL:** Coates, Eriksson, Ojala, Seppänen, Sjöstedt**I-EDN:** Bonde, Jensen Lis, Sandbæk**NI:** Antony, Blot, Dillen, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Moretti, Vanhecke**PSE:** Samland**V:** Aelvoet, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber

(−)

**ARE:** Castagnède, Dary, Dupuis, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Weber Jup**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Ryyänänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek**GUE/NGL:** Bertinotti, Carnero González, Castellina, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Pailler, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez**I-EDN:** Berthu, Blokland, Buffetaut, van Dam, Nicholson, Seillier, Souchet**NI:** Amadeo, Cellai, Formentini, Hager, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Bourlanges, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Ferrer, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafrañca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Bontempi, Bowe, Bösch, Campos, Carniti, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola,

Tuesday 10 March 1998

Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Lööw, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Sanz Fernández, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Tannert, Tappin, Theorin, Titley, Tomlinson, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Viceconte

(O)

**GUE/NGL:** González Álvarez, Theonas

**I-EDN:** de Gaulle, de Rose

**NI:** Féret

**PSE:** Rothley

**UPE:** Kaklamani

## 2. Kuhn report A4-0029/98

### Amendment 63

(+)

**ELDR:** Lindqvist, Olsson, Thors

**GUE/NGL:** Coates, Eriksson, Ojala, Seppänen, Sjöstedt

**I-EDN:** Blokland, Bonde, van Dam, Jensen Lis, Sandbæk

**V:** Aelvoet, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber

(—)

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dupuis, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Weber Jup

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Ryyänen, Spaak, Teverson, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijzenbeek

**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Bertinotti, Carnero González, Castellina, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Pailler, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Buffetaut, Nicholson, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Formentini, Hager, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Moretti, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza, Vanhecke

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Bourlanges, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Ferrer, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling,

Tuesday 10 March 1998

McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Røvsing, Rübig, Salafraña Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lööw, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Viceconte

(O)

**GUE/NGL:** González Álvarez, Theonas

**I-EDN:** de Gaulle, de Rose

### 3. Kuhn report A4-0029/98

#### Amendment 62

(+)

**ELDR:** Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cox, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Kestelijn-Sierens, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooi-van Gorsel, Ryyänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Bertinotti, Carnero González, Castellina, Coates, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas

**I-EDN:** Blokland, Bonde, van Dam, Jensen Lis, Sandbæk

**PSE:** Happart

**V:** Aelvoet, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(—)

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dupuis, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Sainjon, Vandemeulebroucke, Weber Jup

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, De Clercq

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Formentini, Hager, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza, Vanhecke

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Ferrer, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fontana, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klab, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Røvsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Löow, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wynn

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Viceconte

(O)

**ELDR:** Kofoed

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Buffetaut, de Gaulle, Nicholson, de Rose, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Moretti

**PSE:** Rothley

**UPE:** Kaklamanis

#### 4. Kuhn report A4-0029/98

##### Amendment 58

(+)

**ELDR:** Lindqvist

**GUE/NGL:** Castellina, Eriksson, Seppänen

**I-EDN:** Bonde, Jensen Lis, Sandbæk

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**NI:** Formentini

**V:** Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(—)

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Sainjon, Vandemeulebroucke, Weber Jup

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Ryyänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijzenbeek

**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Bertinotti, Carnero González, Coates, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Blokland, Buffetaut, van Dam, de Gaulle, Nicholson, de Rose, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Blot, Cellai, Hager, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Ferrer, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fontana, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kelleth-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klauf, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Roving, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezon Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Lööw, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Viceconte

Tuesday 10 March 1998

(O)

**GUE/NGL:** González Álvarez**NI:** Antony, Dillen, Féret, Lang Carl, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Vanhecke**PSE:** Manzella, Rothley**UPE:** Kaklamanis*5. Kuhn report A4-0029/98**Amendment 45*

(+)

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Sainjon, Vandemeulebroucke, Weber Jup**ELDR:** André-Léonard**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Bertinotti, Carnero González, Castellina, Coates, Elmalan, Ephremidis, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas**I-EDN:** Blokland, Bonde, van Dam, Jensen Lis, Sandbæk**NI:** Moretti**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Brok, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Casini Carlo, Castagnetti, Chanterie, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Cunha, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fontana, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Imaz San Miguel, Jarzembowski, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klab, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Pack, Peijs, Pex, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Stenzel, Stevens, Theato, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, Viola, Wieland, von Wogau**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Löw, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyrizias, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann**V:** Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber, Wolf

Tuesday 10 March 1998

(—)

**ELDR:** Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Rynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

**GUE/NGL:** Eriksson, Seppänen, Sjöstedt

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Buffetaut, de Gaulle, de Rose, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Blot, Cellai, Féret, Formentini, Hager, Le Gallou, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza

**PPE:** Argyros, Bébear, Bourlanges, Burenstam Linder, Carlsson, Cederschiöld, Elles, Ferrer, Fourçans, Grossetête, Herman, Ilaskivi, Matikainen-Kallström, Otila, Piha, Soulier, Stasi, Stenmarck, Verwaerde, Virgin

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Viceconte

(O)

**I-EDN:** Nicholson

**NI:** Antony, Dillen, Lang Carl, Le Pen, Vanhecke

**PPE:** Cassidy, Chichester, Corrie, Donnelly Brendan, Jackson, Kellett-Bowman, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Moorhouse, Perry, Provan, Røvsing, Spencer, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Thyssen, van Velzen W.G.

**PSE:** Rothley, Schlechter

#### 6. Kuhn report A4-0029/98

#### Amendment 59

(+)

**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Bertinotti, Carnero González, Castellina, Coates, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Theonas

**I-EDN:** Bonde, Jensen Lis, Sandbæk

**NI:** Antony, Blot, Dillen, Lang Carl, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Vanhecke

**PSE:** d'Ancona

**V:** Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(—)

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Sainjon, Vandemeulebroucke, Weber Jup

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Rynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Blokland, Buffetaut, van Dam, de Gaulle, Nicholson, de Rose, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Formentini, Hager, Moretti, Muscardini, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fontana, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klauf, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rosing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Blak, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Lüttge, Löow, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyrizis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Viceconte

(O)

**NI:** Féret

**PSE:** Happart, Rothley

**UPE:** Kaklamanis

#### 7. Kuhn report A4-0029/98

##### Amendment 60

(+)

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Sainjon, Vandemeulebroucke, Weber Jup

**GUE/NGL:** Bertinotti, Carnero González, Castellina, Coates, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Novo, Ojala, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas

**I-EDN:** Bonde, Jensen Lis, Sandbæk

**PSE:** García Arias, Manzella, Napoletano



Tuesday 10 March 1998

**V:** Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(—)

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooij-van Gorsel, Ryyänänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Blokland, Buffetaut, van Dam, de Gaulle, Nicholson, de Rose, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Formentini, Hager, Lang Carl, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza, Vanhecke

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Boursanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fontana, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klab, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rosing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Blak, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Lööw, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Viceconte

(O)

**NI:** Féret

**PSE:** Happart, van Putten, Rothley

**UPE:** Kaklamanis

Tuesday 10 March 1998

8. Kuhn report A4-0029/98

*Legislative resolution*

(+)

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dell'Alba, Dupuis, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Sainjon, Vandemeulebroucke, Weber Jup

**ELDR:** Thors

**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Bertinotti, Carnero González, Castellina, Coates, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas

**I-EDN:** Blokland, van Dam

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Formentini, Hager, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza

**PPE:** Banotti, Bardong, Bennasar Tous, Bianco, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Casini Carlo, Castagnetti, Chanterie, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Cunha, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Estevan Bolea, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Ferri, Filippi, Fontana, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Graziani, Hatzidakis, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Lambrias, Lucas Pires, Maij-Weggen, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Porto, Pronk, Reding, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Sarlis, Schleicher, Schlüter, Sisó Cruellas, Thyssen, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Viola

**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Blak, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Hulthén, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Lööw, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

**UPE:** Fitzsimons

**V:** Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Vogenhuber, Wolf

(—)

**ELDR:** Caligaris, Monfils, Spaak, Virrankoski, Wijsenbeek

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Bonde, Buffetaut, de Gaulle, Jensen Lis, Nicholson, de Rose, Sandbæk, Seillier, Souchet

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Bébear, Berend, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Carlsson, Cassidy, Cederschiöld, Chichester, Corrie, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Ferrer, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klauf, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Posselt, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rinsche, Rübig, Salafrañca Sánchez-Neyra, Schierhuber, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Tillich, Verwaerde, Wieland, von Wogau

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Arroni, Azzolini, Bazin, van Bladel, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Donnay, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Janssen van Raay, Ligabue, Malerba, Pasty, Rosado Fernandes, Schaffner

(O)

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Lindqvist, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Ryyänen, Teverson, Vallvé, Väyrynen, Wiebenga

**NI:** Antony, Blot, Dillen, Féret, Lang Carl, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Moretti, Vanhecke

**PPE:** Rack, Redondo Jiménez, Schiedermeier, Schnellhardt, Sonneveld, Stenmarck, Virgin

**PSE:** Rothley

**UPE:** Baldi, Caccavale, Daskalaki, Gallagher, Garosci, Hyland, Kaklamanis, Leopardi, Marin, Parodi, Podestà, Santini, Tajani, Viceconte

---

9. Graenitz report A4-0009/98

Amendment 10

(+) )

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Dell'Alba, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Sainjon, Vandemeulebroucke, Weber Jup

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Ryyänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Bertinotti, Carnero González, Castellina, Coates, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Blokland, Buffetaut, van Dam, de Gaulle, Jensen Lis, de Rose, Sandbæk, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Hager, Raschhofer

**PPE:** Bébéar, Decourrière, Fourçans, Funk, Garriga Polledo, Goepel, Grossetête, Kittelmann, Langenhagen, Malangré, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Stasi, Verwaerde

**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfé, Barón Crespo, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Blak, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Hulthén, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Löow, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Todini, Viceconte

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**V:** Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(—)

**ELDR:** De Clercq

**I-EDN:** Nicholson

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Fini, Formentini, Lang Carl, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Moretti, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza, Vanhecke

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Gillis, Glase, Gomolka, Graziani, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Klauf, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

**PSE:** Colino Salamanca

(O)

**ARE:** Castagnède, Dary

**NI:** Féret

**PPE:** Schierhuber

**PSE:** Hänsch

#### 10. Graenitz report A4-0009/98

##### Amendment 11

(+)

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dell'Alba, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Sainjon, Vandemeulebroucke, Weber Jup

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Ryyänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Bertinotti, Carnero González, Castellina, Coates, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pailler, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, de Gaulle, Jensen Lis, Nicholson, de Rose, Sandbæk, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Fini, Formentini, Hager, Lang Carl, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza, Vanhecke

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fontana, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jackson, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

**PSE:** Andersson Jan, Crampton, Kuhne

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Todini, Viceconte

**V:** Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(—)

**NI:** Moretti

**PPE:** Castagnetti, Dimitrakopoulos, Schleicher

**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Blak, Bontempi, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fantuzzi, Fayot, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Hulthén, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Laignel, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Löw, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

(O)

**PSE:** Hänsch, Manzella

Tuesday 10 March 1998

## 11. Graenitz report A4-0009/98

## Amendment 12 (first part)

(+)

**ARE:** Barthelet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dell'Alba, Ewing, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Sainjon, Vandemeulebroucke, Weber Jup

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Lindqvist, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooi-van Gorsel, Ryyänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Bertinotti, Carnero González, Castellina, Coates, Elmalan, Ephremidis, Eriksson, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ojala, Pettinari, Ribeiro, Seppänen, Sierra González, Sjöstedt, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, de Gaulle, Jensen Lis, Nicholson, de Rose, Sandbæk, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Fini, Formentini, Hager, Lang Carl, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza, Vanhecke

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fontana, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klab, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

**PSE:** Ahlqvist, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Blak, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Fayot, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Hulthén, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Löw, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Kaklamanis, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Todini, Viceconte

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**V:** Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(—)

**PSE:** d'Ancona, Ford, Schlechter

(O)

**NI:** Moretti

**PPE:** Langen

**PSE:** Adam

---

*12. Graenitz report A4-0009/98*

*Amendment 12 (second part)*

(—)

**ARE:** Ewing, Macartney

**ELDR:** Lindqvist

**GUE/NGL:** Eriksson, Ojala, Seppänen, Sjöstedt

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Bonde, Buffetaut, de Gaulle, Jensen Lis, de Rose, Sandbæk, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Antony, Blot, Cellai, Dillen, Féret, Fini, Formentini, Hager, Lang Carl, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Muscardini, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza, Vanhecke

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bébéar, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Cassidy, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Chichester, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Corrie, Cunha, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Donnelly Brendan, Ebner, Elles, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Fernández-Albor, Fernandez Martín, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fontana, Fourçans, Fraga Estevez, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar, Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Jackson, Jarzembowski, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klab, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langen, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, McIntosh, McMillan-Scott, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Perry, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schröder, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Spencer, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Stevens, Stewart-Clark, Sturdy, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valdivielso de Cué, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

**PSE:** Andersson Jan

**UPE:** d'Aboville, Andrews, Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Bazin, van Bladel, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Gallagher, Garosci, Giansily, Girão Pereira, Hyland, Janssen van Raay, Kaklamani, Killilea, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Todini, Viceconte

**V:** Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Gahrton, Hautala, Holm, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber, Wolf

(—)

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dell'Alba, González Triviño, Hory, Leperre-Verrier, Pradier, Sainjon, Vandemeulebroucke, Weber Jup

Tuesday 10 March 1998

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Fassa, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Rynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Virrankoski, Väyrynen, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

**GUE/NGL:** Pettinari

**I-EDN:** Blokland, van Dam

**PPE:** Dimitrakopoulos, Schleicher

**PSE:** Adam, Ahlqvist, d'Ancona, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Blak, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, De Giovanni, Denys, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Falconer, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Hulthén, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Laignel, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Löow, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Mutin, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Piecyk, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Rocard, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Sindal, Skinner, Speciale, Spiers, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Theorin, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Couto, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wibe, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

(O)

**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Bertinotti, Carnero González, Coates, Elmalan, Ephremidis, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Herzog, Jové Peres, Manisco, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Moreau, Novo, Ribeiro, Sierra González, Sornosa Martínez, Theonas

**I-EDN:** Nicholson

**NI:** Moretti

---

### 13. Torres Marques report A4-0078/98

#### Resolution

(+)

**ARE:** Barthet-Mayer, Castagnède, Dary, Dell'Alba, Ewing, González Triviño, Leperre-Verrier, Macartney, Pradier, Sainjon, Weber Jup

**ELDR:** André-Léonard, Anttila, Bertens, Boogerd-Quaak, Brinkhorst, Caligaris, Cars, Cox, De Clercq, de Vries, Eisma, Frischenschlager, Gasòliba i Böhm, Goerens, Haarder, Kestelijn-Sierens, Kofoed, Larive, Monfils, Mulder, Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Nordmann, Olsson, Plooi-j-van Gorsel, Rynänen, Spaak, Teverson, Thors, Vallvé, Watson, Wiebenga, Wijsenbeek

**GUE/NGL:** Ainardi, Castellina, Coates, Herzog, Ojala, Pettinari, Sornosa Martínez

**NI:** Amadeo, Angelilli, Cellai, Féret, Hager, Musumeci, Parigi, Raschhofer, Sichrovsky, Tatarella, Trizza

**PPE:** Areitio Toledo, Argyros, Arias Cañete, Banotti, Bardong, Bennasar Tous, Berend, Bianco, Böge, Bourlanges, Brok, Burenstam Linder, Camisón Asensio, Capucho, Carlsson, Casini Carlo, Castagnetti, Cederschiöld, Chanterie, Christodoulou, Colombo Svevo, Cornelissen, Decourrière, De Esteban Martin, De Melo, Deprez, Dimitrakopoulos, Ebner, Escudero, Estevan Bolea, Fabra Vallés, Ferber, Ferrer, Ferri, Filippi, Flemming, Florenz, Fontaine, Fontana, Fourçans, Friedrich, Funk, Galeote Quecedo, García-Margallo y Marfil, Garriga Polledo, Gillis, Glase, Goepel, Gomolka, Graziani, Grosch, Grossetête, Günther, von Habsburg, Habsburg-Lothringen, Hatzidakis, Heinisch, Herman, Hernández Mollar,



Tuesday 10 March 1998

Hoppenstedt, Ilaskivi, Imaz San Miguel, Kellett-Bowman, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Kittelmann, Klaß, Koch, Konrad, Kristoffersen, Lambrias, Langenhagen, Lehne, Lenz, Liese, Lucas Pires, Lulling, McCartin, Maij-Weggen, Malangré, Mann Thomas, Martens, Matikainen-Kallström, Mayer, Mendonça, Mombaur, Moorhouse, Mosiek-Urbahn, Mouskouri, Nassauer, Oomen-Ruijten, Oostlander, Otila, Pack, Peijs, Pex, Piha, Pimenta, Pirker, Poettering, Poggiolini, Pomés Ruiz, Porto, Posselt, Pronk, Provan, Quisthoudt-Rowohl, Rack, Reding, Redondo Jiménez, Rinsche, Robles Piquer, Rovsing, Rübig, Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Sarlis, Schiedermeier, Schierhuber, Schleicher, Schlüter, Schnellhardt, Schwaiger, Secchi, Sisó Cruellas, Sonneveld, Soulier, Stasi, Stenmarck, Stenzel, Theato, Thyssen, Tillich, Tindemans, Trakatellis, Valverde López, Varela Suanzes-Carpegna, Vaz Da Silva, van Velzen W.G., Verwaerde, Viola, Virgin, Wieland, von Wogau

**PSE:** Adam, d'Ancona, Andersson Jan, Aparicio Sánchez, Apolinário, Augias, Avgerinos, Baldarelli, Balfe, Barón Crespo, Barros-Moura, Barton, Barzanti, Berès, Berger, Billingham, Bontempi, Botz, Bowe, Bösch, Cabezón Alonso, Campos, Carniti, Caudron, Colino Salamanca, Collins Kenneth D., Colom i Naval, Corbett, Correia, Crampton, Crawley, Cunningham, Dankert, Darras, David, De Coene, Desama, Díez de Rivera Icaza, Donnelly Alan John, Dührkop Dührkop, Duhamel, Dury, Elchlepp, Elliott, Ettl, Evans, Fantuzzi, Fayot, Ford, García Arias, Garot, Gebhardt, Ghilardotti, Glante, Görlach, Graenitz, Green, Gröner, Hänsch, Hallam, Happart, Hardstaff, Harrison, Haug, Hendrick, Hindley, Hoff, Howitt, Hughes, Hulthén, Hume, Imbeni, Izquierdo Collado, Izquierdo Rojo, Jöns, Junker, Karamanou, Katiforis, Kindermann, Kinnock, Klironomos, Kokkola, Kuckelkorn, Kuhn, Kuhne, Lambraki, Lange, Lienemann, Lindeperg, Linkohr, Lüttge, Löow, McCarthy, McGowan, McMahon, McNally, Malone, Mann Erika, Manzella, Marinucci, Martin David W., Medina Ortega, Megahy, Mendiluce Pereiro, Metten, Miller, Miranda de Lage, Morgan, Morris, Murphy, Myller, Napoletano, Needle, Newens, Newman, Oddy, Paasilinna, Paasio, Panagopoulos, Papakyriazis, Pérez Royo, Peter, Pollack, Pons Grau, van Putten, Randzio-Plath, Rapkay, Rehder, Roth-Behrendt, Rothe, Rothley, Roubatis, Ruffolo, Sakellariou, Samland, Sanz Fernández, Sauquillo Pérez del Arco, Schäfer, Schlechter, Schmid, Schmidbauer, Schulz, Seal, Simpson, Skinner, Speciale, Swoboda, Tannert, Tappin, Terrón i Cusí, Thomas, Titley, Tomlinson, Torres Marques, Truscott, Tsatsos, Van Lancker, Vecchi, van Velzen Wim, Verde i Aldea, Waddington, Waidelich, Walter, Watts, Weiler, Wemheuer, White, Whitehead, Wiersma, Willockx, Wilson, Wynn, Zimmermann

**UPE:** Arroni, Azzolini, Baldi, Caccavale, Carrère d'Encausse, Danesin, Daskalaki, Donnay, Fitzsimons, Garosci, Giansily, Leopardi, Ligabue, Malerba, Marin, Parodi, Pasty, Podestà, Rosado Fernandes, Santini, Schaffner, Tajani, Todini, Viceconte

(—)

**GUE/NGL:** Ephremidis, Eriksson, Seppänen

**I-EDN:** Berthu, Blokland, Bonde, Buffetaut, van Dam, Jensen Lis, Nicholson, Sandbæk, Seillier, Souchet

**NI:** Blot, Dillen, Lang Carl, Le Gallou, Le Pen, Moretti, Vanhecke

**V:** Holm

(O)

**ELDR:** Lindqvist, Virrankoski, Väyrynen

**GUE/NGL:** Bertinotti, Carnero González, González Álvarez, Gutiérrez Díaz, Jové Peres, Miranda, Mohamed Ali, Ribeiro, Sierra González, Theonas

**PPE:** Corrie, Donnelly Brendan, Elles, Jackson, McIntosh, Perry, Schröder, Spencer, Stevens, Sturdy

**PSE:** Ahlqvist, Blak, Sindal, Theorin, Wibe

**V:** Aelvoet, Ahern, Breyer, Cohn-Bendit, van Dijk, Hautala, Kerr, Kreissl-Dörfler, Lannoye, McKenna, Müller, Orlando, Ripa di Meana, Roth, Schroedter, Schörling, Tamino, Telkämper, Voggenhuber, Wolf